

**PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE NO. 6 – TRANSPORT – QUESTIONS ON NOTICE
30 MAY 2022**

QoN01 – Transcript Page 7

The CHAIR: Mr Allaway, perhaps you could advise. Has there been a delay because of the storage requirement?

PETER ALLAWAY: I would have to take that on notice, particularly around the specifics of the storage elements. But, of course, with the Mariyung fleet there were a number of delays, one of them including the COVID period as well, which has compounded the overall delay time line. It is not specific to that particular element, but I would have to look at the specifics of that particular part about the storage and take it on notice, unless Mr Merrick has any detail on that.

DALE MERRICK: We have had trains arrive as late as the last fortnight. The trains continue to arrive as planned. We are working through those storage issues.

ANSWER

I am advised:

I refer to the response provided by Mr Merrick in the hearing.

QoN02 – Transcript Page 7

The CHAIR: Have there been any additional costs under the contract as a result of not being able to store the trains? Let me put this again: Has there been any additional cost to the Government because of contractual terms with the provider of the fleet because of the delays in actually putting these trains on the track?

DALE MERRICK: I couldn't say with certainty, but I am happy to take that on notice to get those numbers if there has been the outcome you are describing.

ANSWER

I am advised:

The delays are estimated to cost around \$18 million per month including prolongation costs, supplier's contractual entitlements and lost value in ongoing maintenance payments.

QoN03 – Transcript Page 9

The CHAIR: So would it be fair to say there are two types of costs, then? There are the costs for the trains or the carriages that have already been delivered that will now need to be modified, as opposed to the ones that are yet to be manufactured and delivered. Are they different costs? Would you expect the built-in costs of the newly manufactured carriages to be cheaper?

HOWARD COLLINS: I can't say for certain because obviously that is an issue we might have to take on notice. But if I explain in general terms, we believe that the modifications of those units which are here in New South Wales will be done at Kangy Angy by RailConnect staff following, obviously, a lot of design work and testing. Whether the other trains, which are currently in manufacture, would be modified at the factory or whether they will arrive and be modified is something I can't tell you at this stage.

ANSWER

I am advised:

Transport for NSW is working closely with the supplier to develop a cost-effective delivery strategy, including consideration around modification of trains that are already delivered, and the trains that are currently in production overseas.

QoN04 – Transcript Page 11

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: This might be for you, Mr Sharp. What was the total final cost of the new intercity fleet given the ongoing maintenance budget for these?

ROB SHARP: If you're looking at the whole-of-life cost—

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: Yes

ROB SHARP: —I'd have to take that on notice. The budget for the actual acquisition was \$2.8 billion.

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: The whole-of-life?

ROB SHARP: Yes, I'd have to take that on notice.

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: There have been, as I understand it, 56 additional carriages purchased on top of the original contract. Were they at the same price as the original contract or was there a variation on price on the—

ROB SHARP: I'd have to take that on notice in regards to that latest acquisition.

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: If you're taking that on notice, it would be nice to know if there was an increase in price—just what that was per carriage.

ROB SHARP: We'll revert with that information.

ANSWER

I am advised:

The capital cost, which included all carriages, enabling works and building the new maintenance facility at Kangy Angy is \$2.8 billion.

QoN05 – Transcript Page 11

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: Okay. As a part of the rectifications, as I understand it and you have been talking through these today, there are quite a number of those. I think you spoke about the security cameras. One of the issues is these things operate in a range of different weather conditions. The testing of these in a range of different weather conditions—predominantly wet weather at the moment in Sydney, but it can also get quite hot in Sydney—has that work been undertaken? When you say that the CCTVs are the best, for instance, Mr Collins, have they been tested in the quite diverse weather conditions that they are going to be exposed on the Sydney and the outer metropolitan lines?

HOWARD COLLINS: Yes. I'm talking in general of rolling stock commissioning, which I've been involved in in quite a few fleets. I would imagine—and, again, we could probably provide on notice—that significant testing happens within the manufacturing plant. In fact, I think in the manufacturing plant they have a test track and they are able to operate these trains at high speed on different conditions. Certainly, prior to the protective industrial action, a number of these trains have

been out on the network, operating and testing under various conditions. Certainly, they are a very good train. They have certainly operated well. The great thing about modern technology, as we know from our mobile phones, is that you start off with a very grainy picture when we first started putting in CCTV, which in my day was in the eighties, and when you get to this modern technology it certainly provides excellent quality. There are obviously occasions where things don't work or there is an obstruction or sunlight, but the advantage with cameras pointing in each direction on each car is that you get an opportunity for examining the best view at the time.

ROB SHARP: I will ask Mr Merrick to comment on that as well. We have done extensive testing in the commissioning stage here in Australia.

DALE MERRICK: Thanks, Secretary, and thanks for the question. I can speak more broadly about what the train offers. In the current configuration as accredited, this train has next-generation safety features but also customer features. The safety features include sensitive doorage technology for obstructions, the traction interlocking for all the doors, and the CCTV is significant in that there are 40 external cameras on this train. So every car has two cameras on each side. What that does, compared to today, is it affords the guard and the driver a full view of the platform in the train interface. Most importantly, it provides a triangulated response to that interface in all conditions. For those curved platforms and for those parts of the network that are exposed to weather conditions, as has been stated, the CCTV quality is really good, and it has been proven over that testing and commissioning phase.

ANSWER

I am advised:

Extensive testing, commissioning and operational readiness activities have been completed on the Maryung trains, including the CCTV system, as part of the verification and validation phase.

Performance issues identified during initial testing in wet weather and low lighting conditions were addressed through a combination of design improvements to the cameras as well as station lighting upgrades to ensure appropriate ambient lighting conditions.

QoN06 - Transcript Page 14

The Hon. JOHN GRAHAM: I want to turn to the safety concerns. As my colleague was asking, the concerns that have been raised, without making a judgement about them, are, if there was an incident—if someone fell between the gap between the platform and the train, for example—you might not be able to see it directly, perhaps through CCTV, and you might not be able to hear it, given the conditions. How often is this happening? How often are passengers falling between the gap in the Greater Sydney train network?

ROB SHARP: I would have to take that on notice, but I will pass to Mr Longland to comment specifically on that risk in the Sydney network.

MATT LONGLAND: Thanks, Mr Sharp. The platform-train interface is obviously a very important factor in customers boarding trains and ensuring that they are clear of the doors or that they are not actually in between the gap between the platform

and the train. Parts of our network are very old, and we are dealing with things like curved platforms. The geometry of modern railways and having—

The Hon. JOHN GRAHAM: Mr Longland, I have caught a train before. How often is this happening?

MATT LONGLAND: I would have to take that on notice to get the details. It is not a regular occurrence, but it is certainly something that all of our staff are trained to manage and to look out for, whether they are platform staff, whether they are guards or whether they are drivers.

The Hon. JOHN GRAHAM: I'm going to quote to you—when you say it's not a regular occurrence—from a transport document: "Removing the gap between trains and our platforms remains an important and complex challenge, with an average of five people falling between the gaps on the Greater Sydney trains network every week." Is that accurate, Mr Longland? That sounds pretty regular.

MATT LONGLAND: Thank you for the follow-up. I would need to see the document you are referring to and understand the context in which it was written and when it was written. But, as I said, it is a key safety consideration, managing the interface between the platform and the train.

The Hon. JOHN GRAHAM: This is the future transport draft strategy, which says there's a person falling between the gap once every workday. Is that an accurate statement? This is your own document.

MATT LONGLAND: I would need to take that on notice and confirm that.

ANSWER

I am advised:

In the almost ten months between 1 July 2021 and 22 May 2022, 153 incidents were recorded across the Sydney Trains network where a person fell between a train and a platform. Notably, of these incidents, only three resulted in a customer falling through the gap and onto the tracks.

It is understood that the figure quoted by the Hon. John Graham MLC related to incidents prior to June 2020.

QoN07 – Transcript Page 16

The CHAIR: Sorry. When I'm talking about storage costs and that \$1 million, I thought we just got to the point where we agreed that the \$1 million included the physical kind of—the cost of storage, being the staff, the security and the maintenance.

ROB SHARP: Not the maintenance.

The CHAIR: So the \$1 million is just for staff and security.

ROB SHARP: It's for storage costs. To get a full breakdown I would have to take that on notice but it's the costs of physically parking them and protecting them. Then there is a separate contractual commitment around maintaining those train sets. There is quite a large number of them here. The maintenance costs associated with that are part of that \$30 million. It's over and above the storage—a different costs centre.

The CHAIR: Fine. So staff and security is \$1 million at the moment and we wouldn't expect that to change markedly unless there was a need to start housing these carriages somewhere else, for example, with the manufacturer. So it's \$1 million at

the moment. Then you have the maintenance amount. Can you tell me at the moment how much that maintenance cost is?

ROB SHARP: No, I can't tell you that. I would have to take it on notice. It's bundled up into other numbers, which I don't have here. We would have to take on notice what the actual maintenance cost is at the moment but the \$30 million includes a forecast into the future of what that might be.

ANSWER

I am advised:

The capital cost, which includes the carriages, enabling works and building the new maintenance facility at Kangy Angy is \$2.8 billion.

The cost of managing additional storage and security of the trains is approximately \$800,000 per month.

QoN08 – Transcript Page 20-21

The Hon. JOHN GRAHAM: Yes. Understood. Can you confirm that, given the recent inflation figures, that at least six Sydney toll roads on 1 July will have their tolls increased by double the normal amount—that is, rather than going up 1 per cent per annum they'll go up by more than double that—2 or 2.1 per cent?

ROB SHARP: I'm aware that the toll prices on the Hills M2, M5 South-West, Eastern Distributor, Cross City Tunnel and Lane Cove will have revised tolling prices on 1 April based on their existing contracts.

The Hon. JOHN GRAHAM: That would be more than double.

ROB SHARP: I'd have to take on notice the specific percentage and how that applies on those particular road pieces of infrastructure.

The Hon. JOHN GRAHAM: You're not disagreeing with the fact that it will be more than double, but you'll take it on notice.

ROB SHARP: Yes. I don't know what that number is. I know it kicks in on 1 April. I just don't have the details provided in my notes so I'll have to come back to you on it.

ANSWER

I am advised:

Information in relation to toll pricing is available via <https://www.nsw.gov.au/driving-boating-and-transport/tolling/toll-costs-by-road>.

Customers are able to calculate their tolls using <https://roads-waterways.transport.nsw.gov.au/sydney-motorways/toll-calculator/index.html>

QoN09 - Transcript Page 22

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: I want to go to the procurement of the rolling stock then for the three projects. The CBD and south-west metro, has the procurement process finalised? Is the rolling stock all locked in and ready?

ROB SHARP: I would have to take that on notice with the Metro team. We don't have a Metro representative here today, so some of this detail I will have to take on notice, sorry.

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: Can you also do the same thing then for the western airport metro?

ROB SHARP: Yes.

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: And the Parramatta Light Rail stage two?

ROB SHARP: This is for the rolling stock?

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: Yes, for the rolling stock. I just want to know which ones or what portions of that rolling stock are being constructed within New South Wales.

ROB SHARP: I will take that on notice.

ANSWER

I am advised:

The Stations, Systems, Trains and Operations and Maintenance Package for the Sydney Metro – Western Sydney Airport project is expected to be awarded at the end of 2022. The procurement process includes the manufacturing, commissioning, operations and maintenance of trains.

The approach for constructing the trains will be unique to each organisation bidding for the Package. Further details will become available following the contract award at the end of 2022. Sydney Metro requires that various aspects of testing and commissioning of the trains, once constructed, will be undertaken in this State.

The procurement process for the new Sydney Metro City and Southwest trains has been finalised. 23 new trains have been ordered, 14 of which have been received and are undergoing testing at the Sydney Metro Trains Facility in Rouse Hill.

The new trains for Sydney Metro City and Southwest will be combined with the existing metro trains on the Metro North West Line to form an integrated operating fleet.

Local manufacturing opportunities are being investigated for the Parramatta Light Rail Stage 2 Final Business Case. Transport for NSW has commenced engagement across industry, including light rail vehicle manufacturers in order to understand their capacity and capability to provide rolling stock locally.

QoN10 - Transcript Page 22

ROB SHARP: We were also concerned, given in Parramatta Light Rail stage one there were a lot of utilities and contamination sites, and we were wanting to ensure that we had further visibility of that. The budget for this year included \$50 million, which was allocated for geotech works. A lot of those works are underway, and that is informing the actual cost that we need to put into that business case.

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: Has that refreshment exercise gone out to tender?

ROB SHARP: It went through our normal tender processes some 12 months ago.

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: Who was successful?

ROB SHARP: I would have to take that on notice. I am not sure which geotech firm was successful on that.

ANSWER

I am advised:

Contract award notices for the Parramatta Light Rail Stage 2 utilities and geotechnical investigations are publicly available on the NSW e-tendering website.

QoN11 - Transcript Page 24

The CHAIR: Basically I want to understand what the costs of ticketing and fair infrastructure are, based on how much we take in as revenue from fares. What is the percentage of fare revenue that is effectively spent on the infrastructure—on Opal and even things like enforcement of fines for people who haven't paid? Do you have that sort of data?

ROB SHARP: Not handy, but we will take that on notice. The Opal system is a legacy system. There are quite specific costs associated with maintaining that, and at some point we will need to look to actually move to a new revenue system. The costs of that are not just for collecting the dollars. A lot of this is actually around understanding the flow of passengers, and it is quite critical in terms of understanding exactly where capacity needs to be deployed and how you schedule. So that information data collecting is a really critical part of it. Having said that, the payment systems themselves are changing globally, and if you do want to actually have fares, then you need to utilise that technology. There will be a business case that is presented, and we will look at that. The current Opal system has been in place for many, many years so the costs are depreciated and spread. If you are after an annual cost, it will be a case of going through the various accounts that relate to that and pulling that information out. So I'll have to take that on notice.

ANSWER

I am advised:

Opal related revenue, including fares and fines, is used to fund the public transport services provided by the Transport cluster, including Sydney Trains and NSW Trainlink.

QoN12 - Transcript Page 25

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: With regard to the fare-free days, have you been able to interrogate the data that was collected via the tap-on, tap-off process for—I guess what I'm after is the usage each day on the buses and light rail et cetera.

ROB SHARP: We have that data.

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: Are you able to provide that breakdown on notice?

HOWARD COLLINS: We certainly can, Mr Veitch. Obviously we saw a huge uptake of light rail and ferry trips. We saw they were very popular. I certainly visited a number of sites. That was good to see.

...

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: That would be good. I think you also took on notice, Mr Collins, the breakdown by system type. Is it possible by each day?

ANSWER

I am advised:

The table below represents the daily data collected via the Opal tap-on/tap-off system during the 12-day fare-free period over Easter 2022. One trip consists of a tap-on/tap-off combination. The trips are broken down by mode and include the Sydney, Blue Mountains, Central Coast, Hunter and Illawarra regions.

Number of daily trips by mode – Fare-free period						
Date	Bus	Ferry	Light rail	Metro	Train	All Modes
14/04/2022	502,660	38,426	87,798	54,891	726,608	1,410,383
15/04/2022	224,607	66,576	69,920	28,060	453,682	842,845
16/04/2022	321,263	62,112	79,371	41,649	536,081	1,040,476
17/04/2022	221,504	68,603	73,209	28,263	443,972	835,551
18/04/2022	267,134	60,591	65,556	36,068	465,748	895,097
19/04/2022	480,928	46,843	80,602	48,851	687,711	1,344,935
20/04/2022	511,178	56,275	90,770	55,370	734,618	1,448,211
21/04/2022	507,992	42,036	81,535	56,312	724,580	1,412,455
22/04/2022	474,600	32,270	79,427	51,201	675,152	1,312,650
23/04/2022	355,594	52,151	78,551	42,897	489,667	1,018,860
24/04/2022	289,592	54,102	74,000	39,660	431,110	888,464
25/04/2022	242,047	51,996	64,520	33,519	423,028	815,110
12-Day Fare-Free Total	4,399,099	631,981	925,259	516,741	6,791,957	13,265,037

QoN13 – Transcript Page 28

The Hon. MICK VEITCH: I have one last question before I hand over to my colleague. Are you able to provide on notice what the KPIs are?

HOWARD COLLINS: I would say that I will provide what I can, but obviously you understand that many of these are commercial in confidence and negotiated with the contractor. I will take that on notice and if I can provide some indication of—but they are the very straightforward measures.

ANSWER

I am advised:

The Key Performance Indicators for the Ferry System Contract between Transport for NSW and Transdev Sydney Ferries are publicly available on the Transport for NSW website.

QoN14 - Transcript Page 28

The Hon. JOHN GRAHAM: I might cover some of the ground we have just covered to tidy up a few of those issues. Firstly, thank you for your answers relating to the Opal system. In relation to the cost of re-coding for the fare-free days, was there a cost and was that something where we actually had to pay Cubic in order to make that?

ROB SHARP: My understanding is no. We were able to use the system parameters to provide that. I think on that occasion, no. If you are looking at some new fare type or, "Let's do a particular discount on an off peak," that type of thing is quite expensive and very challenging to do. But no, I am not aware of it. I will take it on notice, but I do not think there was a direct cost.

ANSWER

I am advised:

Costs between Transport for NSW and Cubic Transportation Systems are commercial in confidence and cannot be disclosed.

QoN15 - Transcript Page 28

The Hon. JOHN GRAHAM: —... The other thing that would be really helpful is to understand how much this was able to boost transport into the CBD. Particularly given all of the discussion about the fate of the CBD at the moment, could you distinguish between activity in the CBD and outside of the CBD? That would also be helpful.

HOWARD COLLINS: Yes, thanks for the question. We will do what we can. That is quite complex. I will see what is available. Unlike other systems, which have a zonal system, this is on end-to-end trip data. But I can assure you, Mr Graham, if you were in the area at the time it did feel like the CBD was very busy and people had made journeys which they do not normally make. It was also good to see that people had made trips to the Blue Mountains and the Central Coast during that period of time.

The Hon. JOHN GRAHAM: I will leave it in your hands as to the way that you are able to distinguish that, but I think it is a reasonable question to ask you to tell us what you can about how much of that was in the Blue Mountains and how much of it was in the city. Thank you. So that is on notice. Again, Mr Sharp, you have taken on notice the question about discussions with Treasury and whether there was supplementation or perhaps not in this instance. If there was, could you take on notice the quantum of that as well? I think you are nodding for Hansard.

ANSWER

I am advised:

Due to the differing school holiday dates and travel patterns following the COVID-19 pandemic and associated Public Health Orders, it is not possible to conduct an effective comparison of the entire fare-free period. The table below reflects the average daily CBD/non-CBD public transport trips data collected via the Opal tap on/off system during the Easter long weekend, which is comparable to the same period in 2021.

Average number of daily trips into the CBD/non-CBD – Easter long weekend period			
Area	2021 (comparative period last year)	2022 (current)	Percentage change of trips (current vs. comparative period last year)
Sydney CBD	216,796	265,359	22 per cent
Sydney non- CBD	518,160	551,844	7 per cent

QoN16 - Transcript Page 28

The Hon. JOHN GRAHAM: I want to return to that question about the south-west metro rail and this discussion where Minister Elliott said, "Look, we may need to stage the delivery of this rail." The Government has been very up-front about the cost pressures on construction in general. This might lead to staging and rolling out this metro line in two stages. That has been the view the Government has put. You are today, I think—and this is why you want to come back to it—putting evidence that even if this is broken into two stages it won't mean delay of the delivery, even of that western. Is that correct?

ROB SHARP: Yes. My understanding is it will still deliver in 2024. If there is a specific detail you need I will need to take it on notice and go back to the metro team. My understanding is it is still delivering in 2024. The last stage, which is the complex stage, is that bit out to the airport. We could get the rest of the metro up to Bankstown up and running. That could open up a lot earlier, which would be beneficial to the public. But in terms of the latest details, I would have to take that on notice with metro specifically.

The Hon. JOHN GRAHAM: If you can take that specific date on notice. I think you are saying that even if this is staged, the entire project will be up and running by 2024.

ROB SHARP: That's my understanding, correct.

ANSWER

I am advised:

I refer to the response provided by the Secretary in the hearing.