

Budget Estimates

Portfolio Committee No 1 – Premier and Finance

JOBS, INVESTMENT, TOURISM AND WESTERN SYDNEY, INDUSTRY AND TRADE

Wednesday, 27 October 2021

PRESENT

The Hon. Stuart Ayres,
Minister for Jobs, Investment, Tourism and Western Sydney,
Minister for Industry and Trade

QUESTIONS ON NOTICE

Questions on Notice

TRANSCRIPT PAGE	QUESTION
p. 2	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Of course, I respect that, Dr Hill. How many new agreements of a non-binding nature have we entered into since 30 June 2020?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: Beyond the 18?</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Yes.</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: You can talk to that, Dr Hill.</p> <p>Dr HILL: A further 10.</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: On notice, can we get the list?</p> <p>Dr HILL: Absolutely, and it is available on our website as well I believe, but I would be very happy to give you the list.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u></p> <p>Further to the 18 non-binding commitments entered into with Foundation Partners, non-binding commitments have been entered into with:</p> <p>Quickstep Technologies Romar Engineering FedEx ABB Sims Metal University of Technology, Sydney NEC Nepean Engineering Daikin Defence Materials Technology Centre</p>
p. 3	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Of those additional 10, how many of them are Western Sydney businesses?</p> <p>Dr HILL: There are a number. Quickstep would be one. Romar Engineering is another example that comes to mind. I am happy to check on that and, when we provide the list, we can give that information too.</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: I appreciate that, Dr Hill.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u></p> <p>Each organisation with which the WPCA has entered a non-binding commitment has expressed an interest in supporting the growth and development of the Western Parkland City.</p> <p>A number of organisations with which the WPCA has non-binding commitments already have a presence in Western Sydney. These include Quickstep Technologies, Romar Engineering and Nepean Engineering.</p>
p. 3-4	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Okay, great. Is that land contaminated?</p> <p>Dr HILL: A contamination analysis which we have undertaken recently shows that there is a very low risk of contamination. We cannot remove any risk of contamination until we have done more thorough analysis, but it is, by any assessment we have undertaken, a low risk.</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Great. What is it contaminated with?</p> <p>Dr HILL: I would have to take that on notice. There is a detailed analysis of this, and I would have to take the full details on notice, but the risk is very low.</p>

	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> Detailed site investigations will determine the nature and extent of any contamination.</p>
p. 4	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Are we having to remediate the site? Dr HILL: A minor level of remediation has been anticipated. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: What is the cost of it? Dr HILL: I would have to take that on notice, but it is a modest amount of money and it has been factored into our calculations.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> The actual cost of remediation will be determined based on detailed site investigations.</p>
p. 4	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Did we pursue the option of the Commonwealth paying that \$10 million to remediate? Dr HILL: Yes, we did. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Did the Commonwealth refuse to pay? Dr HILL: We have negotiated with them a shared approach to remediating the site, and that has been factored into the cost of the land. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: So how much of the \$10 million are we paying and how much are they paying? Dr HILL: I would have to take that on notice.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> The estimated cost of remediation was reflected in the purchase price.</p>
p. 5	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Okay. Thank you. What is the current FTE authority? Dr HILL: Ninety-five. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Ninety-five. As of 30 June 2020 it was 29, was it not? Dr HILL: That is my understanding, yes. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: That is what your annual report also says. Dr HILL: That is right. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: We have hired an additional 65 people—that is correct? Dr HILL: That is right. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: As FTE, how many people actually work there? Dr HILL: In terms of full-time employment? The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Yes. Dr HILL: It would be half of that. So in the order of 50, but I can give you the latest— The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: How can you be of FTE half of 95? Dr HILL: Sorry? In terms of headcount? The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Headcount—what is the headcount? Dr HILL: So the headcount—full-time equivalent is 95 people. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Yes, but how many people make up that 95 FTE? Dr HILL: I do not have that information in terms of that, but I am happy to take that on notice.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> As at 30 June 2021, WPCA had a headcount of 55 employees.</p>
p. 6-7	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Was he terminated under section 38 of the Government Sector Employment Act? Mr STUART AYRES: I would have to take that on notice. I cannot recall—</p>

	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Can I put it to you—and Dr Hill might be able to help here—was he terminated under section 38 of the Government Sector Employment Act?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I will have to take that on notice. I do not remember the exact details.</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: That is fine, but I am asking Dr Hill as well, if you would permit her to provide a potential response too, Minister. That would have triggered a payment to him circa \$400,000. So I am interested did he receive a payment under the Government Sector Employment Act?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I will take that on notice. His contract arrangements would have been with the secretary of the Treasury at the time, where the organisation was located in the administration of government orders. But, without being able to recall that, I do not want to provide information that is inaccurate to the Committee so I will take—</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Did you sanction the change in leadership?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: We made very clear that we wanted to undertake an expansion of what this authority was doing. We sought the leadership we required for that expansion. We also wanted at the time for Sam to continue in his role. He played an important leadership role in the establishment of the Western City and Aerotropolis Authority. He had done a lot of very good work around investment attraction—</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Indeed, but that is not the question. The question is: Did you sanction the change of leadership?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: Yes.</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Therefore, when you sanctioned the change of leadership, were you told whether or not he was being terminated under section 38?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: No. I think I have already made it clear the intention was to have Sam stay and continue.</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: That is not the question. The question is: Were you told that he was being terminated under and entitled to a section 38 payment?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I will have to take that on notice.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> This question is best referred to the Secretary of NSW Treasury.</p>
p. 7	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: I appreciate that. Minister, what process was used to select Dr Hill as the authority's new CEO?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I think we undertook a recruitment process in line with Treasury guidelines, but I can go back and check that and take some of that on notice.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> This question is best referred to the Secretary of NSW Treasury.</p>
p. 8	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Has anyone at the authority or the commission ever accused you of using abusive, insulting or offensive language or comments?</p> <p>Dr HILL: Firstly, may I say that I take such matters very seriously. As my conduct has shown to date, certainly I abide by the public sector values of integrity, trust, service and accountability, and I believe my activities to date have proven that. But that is a matter that I do not think is appropriate to discuss at this stage and I am happy to take it on notice.</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: I accept that if you wish to take it on notice, you can.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> It has been confirmed by the Secretary of the Department of Premier and Cabinet at the Premier's Budget Estimates hearing that there was an independent investigation undertaken into allegations made against the CEO of the Western Parkland City Authority.</p>

	<p>This independent investigation involved the interviewing of witnesses and detailed assessment of evidence.</p> <p>All claims made against Dr Hill were found to be unsubstantiated.</p>
p. 11	<p>The Hon. MARK LATHAM: Right. We have heard a fair bit recently about benefit-cost ratio [BCR]. What was it for this Badgerys Creek to St Marys Metro? Mr STUART AYRES: I do not recall what the BCR is. I would have to take that on notice.</p>
	<p>RESPONSE This question is most appropriately referred to the Minister for Transport and Roads.</p>
p. 11	<p>The Hon. MARK LATHAM: But there must have been other rail lines. You mentioned another five that high a higher benefit-cost ratio. Mr STUART AYRES: Well, I do not think that they would have all had a higher benefit-cost ratio. The Hon. MARK LATHAM: You only need one. Was there one? Mr STUART AYRES: I do not know. I would have to go back, and I would have to seek information. The Hon. MARK LATHAM: Will you take that on notice? Mr STUART AYRES: I am happy to take that on notice and ask Transport.</p>
	<p>RESPONSE This question is most appropriately referred to the Minister for Transport and Roads.</p>
p. 14	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Dr Hill, just to be very clear again, between March and June did any staff member of the authority make complaints about your behaviour? Dr HILL: No complaints had been made to me about my behaviour. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: To the authority? Dr HILL: That is a matter that I cannot speak to but I am happy to take on notice to clarify that.</p>
	<p>RESPONSE It has been confirmed by the Secretary of the Department of Premier and Cabinet at the Premier’s Budget Estimates hearing that there was an independent investigation undertaken into allegations made against the CEO of the Western Parkland City Authority.</p> <p>This independent investigation involved the interviewing of witnesses and detailed assessment of evidence.</p> <p>All claims made against Dr Hill were found to be unsubstantiated.</p>
p. 15	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Okay, then I will ask you a separate question. Has the authority appointed a probity firm known as Intrique to investigate you? Dr HILL: My understanding is that I should take that on notice because it is not something that I can confirm as to how a firm—that firm—was appointed.</p>
	<p>RESPONSE It has been confirmed by the Secretary of the Department of Premier and Cabinet at the Premier’s Budget Estimates hearing that there was an independent investigation undertaken into allegations made against the CEO of the Western Parkland City Authority.</p> <p>This independent investigation involved the interviewing of witnesses and detailed assessment of evidence.</p>

	<p>All claims made against Dr Hill were found to be unsubstantiated.</p> <p>Dr Hill had no involvement in the selection or procurement of the organisation which undertook the independent review.</p>
p. 15	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Did that report also then suggest that the independent investigation recommend that you consider training or mentoring relating to your personal communication style when meeting with staff and in addressing staff who attend board meetings?</p> <p>Dr HILL: I will take that on notice.</p>
	<p>RESPONSE</p> <p>It has been confirmed by the Secretary of the Department of Premier and Cabinet at the Premier's Budget Estimates hearing that there was an independent investigation undertaken into allegations made against the CEO of the Western Parkland City Authority.</p> <p>This independent investigation involved the interviewing of witnesses and detailed assessment of evidence.</p> <p>All claims made against Dr Hill were found to be unsubstantiated.</p> <p>More broadly, the Western Parkland City Authority has an ongoing program of people and culture initiatives and considers all suggestions and observations made about how the organisation can continually improve. This includes considering the results of the annual People Matter Employee Survey (PMES).</p>
p. 15	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Did the outcome of that investigation also say that there needed to be a workplace cultural assessment utilising staff surveys to evaluate the emotions and attitudes of staff and how the leadership and management team of the authority are viewed?</p> <p>Dr HILL: Again, I do not have any of that information that you have before you, so I will take that on notice.</p>
	<p>RESPONSE</p> <p>It has been confirmed by the Secretary of the Department of Premier and Cabinet at the Premier's Budget Estimates hearing that there was an independent investigation undertaken into allegations made against the CEO of the Western Parkland City Authority.</p> <p>This independent investigation involved the interviewing of witnesses and detailed assessment of evidence.</p> <p>All claims made against Dr Hill were found to be unsubstantiated.</p> <p>More broadly, the Western Parkland City Authority has an active program of people and culture initiatives and considers all suggestions and observations made about how the organisation can continually improve. This includes considering the results of the annual People Matter Employee Survey (PMES).</p>
p. 15	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Did it also say that the authority and/or perhaps you should consider face-to-face refresher training for the code of conduct that includes a focus on core values?</p> <p>Dr HILL: I will say the same: I will take that on notice.</p>
	<p>RESPONSE</p> <p>It has been confirmed by the Secretary of the Department of Premier and Cabinet at the Premier's Budget Estimates hearing that there was an independent</p>

	<p>investigation undertaken into allegations made against the CEO of the Western Parkland City Authority.</p> <p>This independent investigation involved the interviewing of witnesses and detailed assessment of evidence.</p> <p>All claims made against Dr Hill were found to be unsubstantiated.</p> <p>More broadly, the Western Parkland City Authority has an active program of people and culture initiatives and considers all suggestions and observations made about how the organisation can continually improve. This includes considering the results of the annual People Matter Employee Survey (PMES).</p>
p. 16	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Thank you. The final one I wish to put to you, Dr Hill, is did the outcome of that investigation that you just referred to also suggest that the authority consider introducing a whistleblower hotline for people to make anonymous complaints?</p> <p>Dr HILL: Again, I am happy to take that on notice.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u></p> <p>It has been confirmed by the Secretary of the Department of Premier and Cabinet at the Premier’s Budget Estimates hearing that there was an independent investigation undertaken into allegations made against the CEO of the Western Parkland City Authority.</p> <p>This independent investigation involved the interviewing of witnesses and detailed assessment of evidence.</p> <p>All claims made against Dr Hill were found to be unsubstantiated.</p> <p>More broadly, the Western Parkland City Authority has an active program of people and culture initiatives and considers all suggestions and observations made about how the organisation can continually improve. This includes considering the results of the annual People Matter Employee Survey (PMES).</p>
p. 16	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Dr Hill, was your board apprised of the fact, to the best of your knowledge, that there was an investigation underway into you?</p> <p>Dr HILL: I do not think it is appropriate I talk on behalf of my board. I will take that on notice.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u></p> <p>It has been confirmed by the Secretary of the Department of Premier and Cabinet at the Premier’s Budget Estimates hearing that there was an independent investigation undertaken into allegations made against the CEO of the Western Parkland City Authority.</p> <p>This independent investigation involved the interviewing of witnesses and detailed assessment of evidence.</p> <p>All claims made against Dr Hill were found to be unsubstantiated.</p>
p. 16	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Dr Hill, has anyone, to the best of your knowledge, ever complained directly to the board about your behaviour?</p> <p>Dr HILL: I do not think it is appropriate I speak on behalf of the board. I will take that on notice.</p>

	<p><u>RESPONSE</u></p> <p>It has been confirmed by the Secretary of the Department of Premier and Cabinet at the Premier’s Budget Estimates hearing that there was an independent investigation undertaken into allegations made against the CEO of the Western Parkland City Authority.</p> <p>This independent investigation involved the interviewing of witnesses and detailed assessment of evidence.</p> <p>All claims made against Dr Hill were found to be unsubstantiated.</p>
p. 17	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: You say you insisted that it take place by Mr Reardon?</p> <p>Dr HILL: I insisted that there was an independent and a fair process.</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: As opposed to who else would have otherwise undertaken the investigation.</p> <p>The Hon. CATHERINE CUSACK: As opposed to this, I would say.</p> <p>Dr HILL: I am not able to say. I was not involved in that.</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: And you made that request directly to Mr Reardon?</p> <p>Dr HILL: To relevant people in my organisation who advised me of the situation. But I am happy to take that on notice. I did not speak directly to Tim Reardon.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u></p> <p>It has been confirmed by the Secretary of the Department of Premier and Cabinet at the Premier’s Budget Estimates hearing that there was an independent investigation undertaken into allegations made against the CEO of the Western Parkland City Authority.</p> <p>This independent investigation involved the interviewing of witnesses and detailed assessment of evidence.</p> <p>All claims made against Dr Hill were found to be unsubstantiated.</p> <p>Dr Hill had no involvement in the selection or procurement of the organisation which undertook the independent review.</p>
p. 18	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: On that question then, Dr Hill, why have there been six changes to the leadership team—at least six changes to the leadership team—in the last 12 months?</p> <p>Dr HILL: As the Minister explained, we have expanded our remit. We have focused the organisation on delivery outcomes and we have also been working to employ more permanent people in the organisation. A number of those people that you refer to were not permanent employees, they were contractors. So we have been looking to secure a strong leadership group of permanent employees.</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: I will get to the issue of contractors, but of that six, was it your decision or theirs for them to leave? Do you want me to give you the names?</p> <p>Dr HILL: If you would like to run through their names—</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: We have gone through Mr Sangster, but we have got Kara Giltinan. We have got Troy Harvey. We have got Thomas Kwok. We have got Tim Spencer and Michael Bullen.</p> <p>Dr HILL: There were a range of reasons there. Some have taken long service leave. Others have decided to move on. Others were contractors.</p> <p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: On notice, do you wish to provide further detail?</p> <p>Dr HILL: I think it is only appropriate that I take that on notice.</p>

	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> For reasons of privacy, it is not appropriate for detail to be provided regarding the individual circumstances of former WPCA staff</p>
p. 18	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Okay, thank you very much. Were any of them entitled to any form of a termination payout? Dr HILL: I will take that on notice. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Were any of them paid a termination payout, as the second part of that question? Dr HILL: I will take that on notice.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> For reasons of privacy, it is not appropriate for detail to be provided regarding the individual circumstances of former WPCA staff.</p>
p. 19	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Dr Hill, you made reference earlier to contractor costs. For the year ending June 2020 you spent \$3.38 million on contractors. Do you have an updated figure for the last financial year? Dr HILL: I will take that on notice.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> Contractor costs for the 2020-21 financial year are disclosed in the Western Parkland City Authority's 2020-21 Annual Report.</p>
p. 20	<p>The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Then where is the money for WestInvest actually coming from? Do you know? Mr STUART AYRES: I will take that question on notice.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> The Government has approved an envelope of \$5 billion for WestInvest to support investment in economic, social, and green infrastructure projects in Western Sydney. The Government will direct the \$823 million in transfer duty from the sale of WestConnex to WestInvest. The Government will fund the remaining projects as they are approved from the consolidated fund.</p>
p. 20-21	<p>Ms ABIGAIL BOYD: I understand that in the last three years there have been quite a few concerns raised by the community in relation to safety. In the first year that the event was run, a flying tyre hit two spectators, who were taken to hospital. There were people leaning out over the track to take selfies. In the second year there was car debris flying over fences. In the third year fans gained access to the track during racing. In a letter to residents the Parliamentary Secretary for Regional Tourism and Hospitality stated that the Newcastle 500 is required to meet safety criteria specified by Motorsport Australia, but Motorsport Australia's Track Operators Safety Guide requires fences to be at least six metres away from the track edge. If you have been to Newcastle, and I am sure you have, you will know that many of those houses around the track are actually within that six metres. If you were to put a fence six metres away from the road, you would be in their properties. It is just not possible to meet those safety standards. Are you comfortable that the race can be run safely in Newcastle? Mr STUART AYRES: I am aware that there have been a number of those incidents that you have referred to. I think there is an obligation on behalf of the event proponent to meet the safety guidelines or safety requirements that are put in place. I am working on the assumption that that is what they have done. That does not mean that there are not incidents that are unforeseeable, but you do want to try and minimise the opportunity for those things to take place. I would need to take on notice about how they have performed against the track standard requirements. It is a street circuit. I am happy to do that and provide that information back to you. Ms ABIGAIL BOYD: Thank you. I would really like to know how it is possible under the Motorsport Australia's Track Operators Safety Guide in particular, if you could take that on notice.</p>

	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> Supercars Australia must work with all relevant agencies to continuously review and develop operational plans for the Newcastle 500 based on learnings.</p> <p>Destination NSW requires that Supercars Australia meets the safety requirements specified by Motorsport Australia and the Federation Internationale de l'Automobile, the national and international motor racing governing bodies.</p> <p>Motorsport Australia has certified the Newcastle 500 track in each year of operation/.</p>
p. 21	<p>Ms ABIGAIL BOYD: Two things there: We have previously had breaches of those fences at these events, which is part of the safety concerns I stated before. Also I understand there are 2,000 residents who actually live within the event area. They are already within the bounds of the event. Are you going to require all of them to be double vaccinated?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I have not seen the specific COVID safety plan for this event. I would need to consult that.</p> <p>Ms ABIGAIL BOYD: Perhaps you could. There are many young children and elderly people in that area who are very concerned about the idea of unvaccinated people wandering around during that event.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> Supercars Australia must ensure its events are compliant with any Public Health Order in place at the time of the event.</p> <p>Supercars Australia will prepare in due course a COVID Safety Plan for the Newcastle 500 event that meets the requirements of the relevant Public Health Order.</p>
p. 21	<p>Ms ABIGAIL BOYD: I understand—people coming from outside who are not residents who are wandering around inside the event. Could you tell me the total cost to New South Wales taxpayers of the Newcastle 500?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I do not have that information available to me. It is a contract that exists with Destination NSW. I can take that on notice.</p> <p>Ms ABIGAIL BOYD: If you could, including capital, ongoing and in-kind costs.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> Newcastle 500 involves multiple stakeholders across Government and the private sector. In addition, the major events sector is a highly competitive environment that drives significant economic benefit to host destinations. Consequently, the NSW Government's investment in events, including the Newcastle 500, is commercial in confidence.</p>
p. 22	<p>Ms ABIGAIL BOYD: That attendance reporting from Supercars and the tourism expenditure that was extrapolated from that reporting has been used to justify the public funding for the Newcastle 500. Clearly, it is in your interest to know whether or not that has been exaggerated or whether those numbers are correct.</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I am not going to speak for what Supercars has put in its annual report. What Destination NSW will do is it will conduct an assessment on an event based on visitor metrics, and then it will assess against numbers that have been presented. At the end of the contract term, we will assess the performance of that project and determine whether we want to either renew that contract based on its performance or perhaps we may want to allocate resources to a different priority. That would normally happen at the end of the contract period.</p> <p>Ms ABIGAIL BOYD: Would you independently review those figures that they are presenting to you?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I will take that on notice around what work Destination NSW do there.</p> <p>Ms ABIGAIL BOYD: Thank you. If you could let us know whether that exaggerated reporting led to them getting an increase in funding, that would be useful as well.</p>

	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> Questions relating to statements made by Supercars Australia in its Annual Report should be directed to Supercars Australia.</p> <p>Destination NSW undertakes its own evaluation of all event investments based on visitation and economic benefit to the region in line with NSW Treasury requirements.</p> <p>Taking into account the cancellation of the 2020 Newcastle 500 due to the COVID-19 pandemic, the Newcastle 500 is on track to meet its projected visitation targets and contribution to the NSW visitor economy.</p>
p. 24	<p>Mr JUSTIN FIELD: I apologise for cutting you off, Mr Draper. I have limited time. I went through it with the Minister. I am not asking for the likely cost of acquitting the offsets that will be required. I am prepared to accept that there might be changes based on the planning approval that you have to factor in. But you have a net present value in here that is based on four different elements combined: A, plus B, plus C, minus D equals net present value. There must be a figure for the provisional allowance for environmental offset costs or otherwise you could not have worked out a net present value of \$1.075 billion. What is the provisional allowance for environmental offset costs that was used to come up with that net present value figure?</p> <p>Mr DRAPER: I may have spoken over to you too, so apologies for that. The best answer I can give to you today is that the costs that the economists who have done this calculation have included is based on the offsets and the credits that will be required, which is set out in quite a comprehensive detail in the EIS. The methodology for calculating those has been done with both Commonwealth and State regulatory agencies. But the dollar figure you are looking for, I will have to take that on notice and come back to you on that.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> The actual cost of offsets will depend on the finalisation of the Biodiversity Offset Strategy, which will be prepared in consultation with the NSW and Australian governments and informed by any conditions of approval. For the purposes of estimating relative costs of options, it is correct that a provisional amount was included in calculations, sufficient to address the biodiversity impacts documented in the EIS. However, as the EIS and planning consent process are inputs to the final Biodiversity Offsets Strategy, it is premature to publicly report cost estimates.</p>
p. 24	<p>Mr JUSTIN FIELD: Okay, I appreciate that, but I will not keep my hopes up. Continually through your media statements in the past couple of years about the dam, and it has been restated in the EIS, there is a suggestion that the Warragamba Dam raising would result in substantial reduction in flood damage costs. The figure that is used is 75 per cent. Am I right that that 75 per cent reduction in damage costs is based on modelling done by the Insurance Council of Australia?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: The Insurance Council may have been involved; I am not entirely sure. In fact, because I cannot remember all of the details around that figure, I will take that on notice. I am not thinking that the Insurance Council has been engaged in the creation of the EIS, so I do not think that is likely. But, so I can provide you with a more accurate answer, I will that on notice.</p> <p>Mr JUSTIN FIELD: If you could, because there is no explanation in the EIS on how that figure was arrived at. If you could explain the documentation on the models that came up with that figure, that will be useful.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> The industry standard method used by flood risk managers, emergency planners and actuaries/flood insurers is an average annual damage (AAD) assessment.</p>

	<p>The AAD calculation is a long-term average, and is assessed for the full range of representative flood events with probabilities of 1 in 5 chance per year up to the worst possible flood, known as the probable maximum flood (PMF).</p> <p>The AAD assessments are important for relative comparisons of different mitigation options with the existing average annual damages. This is the standard method for determining the benefits of a benefit: cost ratio.</p> <p>In 2015, economic assessment consultants to the Hawkesbury-Nepean Valley Flood Management Taskforce calculated the reduction in the AADs for the 14-metre raising of Warragamba Dam to be 76% in 2015, and 75% in 2041.</p> <p>The Insurance Council of Australia conducted an independent preliminary analysis on the potential impact of 2 unidentified mitigation options – one of which was raising Warragamba Dam by 14 metres.</p> <p>The Council’s analysis found that there would be a 76% reduction in AAD for the option of raising Warragamba Dam by 14 metres. This work was not undertaken specifically for the Environmental Impact Statement, but for the earlier work of the taskforce.</p> <p>The AADs were reassessed in 2021 to inform the Environmental Impact Statement. This assessment confirmed the earlier findings.</p>
p. 26	<p>The Hon. PETER PRIMROSE: So there are no scoping studies or planning documents for western Sydney rail freight and particularly for the Western Sydney International Airport?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: If they exist, Transport would be doing those. I am only aware of the work that has already been consulted on publicly.</p> <p>The Hon. PETER PRIMROSE: Given your role, I thought that would have been something you would have been intimately aware of.</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: They may well be doing some work around freight that I have not seen at this stage, but what I am aware of is the work that we have released publicly around freight rail corridors.</p> <p>The Hon. PETER PRIMROSE: Can I ask if you could take on notice any—if there are any—publicly available studies, other than the one that I have referred to, that relate to freight?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: Yes, within my portfolio, I can look for that. The Hon.</p> <p>PETER PRIMROSE: Yes, or maybe studies within government that have been publicly released?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: Yes.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u></p> <p>This question is most appropriately referred to the Minister for Transport and Roads.</p>
p. 27	<p>The Hon. PETER PRIMROSE: That is very nice and very good, but when will freight, according to Infrastructure Australia’s concerns, actually start running? When is it actually going to be constructed? You said the last time a corridor was reserved was 1952. Presumably we will not have to wait half a century for this one. There is no plan at the moment and no indicative timetable for rail freight?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: No, freight rail is covered off in the Future Transport 2056 document.</p> <p>The Hon. PETER PRIMROSE: So what is the timetable?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I cannot remember the dates in that document. I can take it on notice for you. It is also publicly available.</p> <p>The Hon. PETER PRIMROSE: A decade?</p>

	<p>Mr STUART AYRES: I am not going to comment on it; I do not have that information in front of me. I will take it on notice.</p> <p>The Hon. PETER PRIMROSE: May I ask, through you, do any of your officers here have an idea of the timetable?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I think it is appropriate. We do have Transport 2056. It is a document that is a longer-term plan for transport solutions in Sydney and it is publicly available. I cannot recall the time frames that are associated with freight rail. What I have explained to you is that we have done corridor reservations to start to connect to where those key hubs are, which has been highlighted by Infrastructure Australia in the document that you have just referred to. We have taken those steps. I will happily take the time frames on notice so that I can refer to the 2056 document.</p> <p>The Hon. PETER PRIMROSE: So you do not know and it will be some time in the future.</p> <p>The Hon. BEN FRANKLIN: He will be taking it on notice, which is fair enough.</p>																					
	<p>RESPONSE</p> <p>This question is most appropriately referred to the Minister for Transport and Roads.</p> <p>Future Transport 2056 is available at https://future.transport.nsw.gov.au/future-transport-strategy</p>																					
p. 28	<p>The Hon. PETER PRIMROSE: Okay. Who are the State Government's stakeholder representatives on the Local Jobs and Skills Taskforce?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I am not familiar with that. I will take that on notice.</p>																					
	<p>RESPONSE</p> <p>The Local Jobs and Skills Taskforce is an initiative of the Commonwealth Department of Education, Skills and Employment (DESE). The membership of Local Jobs and Skills Taskforces is published on the DESE website at https://www.dese.gov.au/local-jobs-program/employment-facilitators. Membership of the Taskforces is on the invitation of DESE and subject to change. The members from NSW government agencies current as at 9 November 2021 are listed below.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>DESE Employment Region (NSW)</th> <th>NSW Government Agency</th> <th>NSW Representative Name</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Capital Region</td> <td>Department of Regional NSW</td> <td>Laura Hartley</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Central West</td> <td>N/A</td> <td>No NSW representative</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Far West Orana (includes Broken Hill)</td> <td>Department of Regional NSW</td> <td>Meredith Harrison</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Far West Orana (includes Broken Hill)</td> <td>Transport for NSW</td> <td>Maxine Greenfield</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hunter</td> <td>NSW Department of Education - Training Services NSW</td> <td>Liana Nadalin</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hunter</td> <td>Department of Regional NSW</td> <td>Evan Steverson</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	DESE Employment Region (NSW)	NSW Government Agency	NSW Representative Name	Capital Region	Department of Regional NSW	Laura Hartley	Central West	N/A	No NSW representative	Far West Orana (includes Broken Hill)	Department of Regional NSW	Meredith Harrison	Far West Orana (includes Broken Hill)	Transport for NSW	Maxine Greenfield	Hunter	NSW Department of Education - Training Services NSW	Liana Nadalin	Hunter	Department of Regional NSW	Evan Steverson
DESE Employment Region (NSW)	NSW Government Agency	NSW Representative Name																				
Capital Region	Department of Regional NSW	Laura Hartley																				
Central West	N/A	No NSW representative																				
Far West Orana (includes Broken Hill)	Department of Regional NSW	Meredith Harrison																				
Far West Orana (includes Broken Hill)	Transport for NSW	Maxine Greenfield																				
Hunter	NSW Department of Education - Training Services NSW	Liana Nadalin																				
Hunter	Department of Regional NSW	Evan Steverson																				

	Illawarra South Coast	Department of Regional NSW	Anthony Body
	Illawarra South Coast	Department of Regional NSW	Nyssa Murray
	Mid North Coast	Department of Regional NSW	Louise McMeeking
	Murray Riverina	Department of Regional NSW	Louise Conibear
	New England and North West	NSW Department of Education - Training Services NSW	Bronwyn Cocking
	New England and North West	Department of Regional NSW	Craig Jenkins
	North Coast	Destination NSW	Michael Thurston
	Sydney East Metro	NSW Department of Education - Training Services NSW	Peter O'Doherty
	Sydney Greater West	NSW Department of Education - Training Services NSW	Glen Gallagher
	Sydney Greater West	Transport for NSW - Sydney Metro	Sarah Bettison
	Sydney North and West	NSW Department of Education - Training Services NSW	Petrina Waddell
	Sydney South West	NSW Department of Education - Training Services NSW	Robert MacMaster
p. 28	<p>The Hon. PETER PRIMROSE: Okay. The Government is represented on the Local Jobs and Skills Taskforce and, by your answer. I can only assume that your office has no involvement in this program that is occurring in western Sydney. Is that correct?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: To the best of my knowledge, but I will take that on notice as well.</p>		
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u></p> <p>The Local Jobs and Skills Taskforce is an initiative of the Commonwealth Department of Education, Skills and Employment (DESE). The membership of the Sydney Greater West region Local Jobs and Skills Taskforces is listed on the DESE website at https://www.dese.gov.au/local-jobs-program/employment-facilitators/sydney-greater-west. Membership of the Taskforces is on the invitation of DESE and subject to change. The current representatives from NSW government agencies are listed below.</p> <p>NSW Department of Education - Training Services NSW - Glen Gallagher Transport for NSW - Sydney Metro - Sarah Bettison</p> <p>Training Services NSW works closely with Investment NSW and the Western Parkland City Authority on skills and workforce development matters in Western Sydney.</p>		

p. 29	<p>The Hon. PETER PRIMROSE: What are your predictions for the need for workers in the healthcare and social assistance categories in each of these LGAs over the next decade?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I have got no doubt that it will increase.</p> <p>The Hon. PETER PRIMROSE: Do you have predictions?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I do not have them available but I can take workforce data on notice and provide it to you.</p>																																																																																							
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u></p> <p>The need for healthcare and social assistance workers in the Western Parkland City LGAs is projected to increase. Estimated increases in the number of workers are shown in the table below.</p> <p>This projection is based on macroeconomic modelling undertaken in 2019 so does not account for any impacts of COVID-19 on population forecasts. Updated forecasts from the employment model will be available in early 2022.</p> <p>Projections for <i>Healthcare and Social Assistance</i> employment (by Place of Work) for the Western Parkland City LGAs are provided below, as well as the increase in employment compared with 2016.</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="440 869 1481 1518"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Western Parkland City region Travel Zone/LGA</th> <th colspan="4"></th> <th colspan="3">Increase in employment from 2016</th> </tr> <tr> <th>2016</th> <th>2021</th> <th>2026</th> <th>2031</th> <th>2021</th> <th>2026</th> <th>2031</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Blue Mountains</td> <td>3,899</td> <td>3,941</td> <td>3,949</td> <td>4,050</td> <td>42</td> <td>50</td> <td>151</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Camden</td> <td>2,925</td> <td>3,899</td> <td>4,961</td> <td>5,796</td> <td>974</td> <td>2,036</td> <td>2,870</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Campbelltown (NSW)</td> <td>8,066</td> <td>9,836</td> <td>10,984</td> <td>12,452</td> <td>1,770</td> <td>2,919</td> <td>4,386</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Fairfield</td> <td>6,784</td> <td>8,255</td> <td>9,299</td> <td>10,509</td> <td>1,471</td> <td>2,515</td> <td>3,726</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hawkesbury</td> <td>3,105</td> <td>3,938</td> <td>4,505</td> <td>5,186</td> <td>832</td> <td>1,399</td> <td>2,081</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Liverpool</td> <td>12,818</td> <td>16,583</td> <td>18,975</td> <td>22,273</td> <td>3,766</td> <td>6,157</td> <td>9,455</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Penrith</td> <td>11,442</td> <td>13,955</td> <td>15,574</td> <td>17,868</td> <td>2,513</td> <td>4,132</td> <td>6,426</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Wollondilly</td> <td>887</td> <td>1,087</td> <td>1,269</td> <td>1,612</td> <td>200</td> <td>382</td> <td>725</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td>49,926</td> <td>61,495</td> <td>69,515</td> <td>79,745</td> <td>11,569</td> <td>19,590</td> <td>29,820</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>*The results are for Travel Zones. TZs are closely aligned with LGA boundaries. Source: DPIE and TfNSW.</p>	Western Parkland City region Travel Zone/LGA					Increase in employment from 2016			2016	2021	2026	2031	2021	2026	2031	Blue Mountains	3,899	3,941	3,949	4,050	42	50	151	Camden	2,925	3,899	4,961	5,796	974	2,036	2,870	Campbelltown (NSW)	8,066	9,836	10,984	12,452	1,770	2,919	4,386	Fairfield	6,784	8,255	9,299	10,509	1,471	2,515	3,726	Hawkesbury	3,105	3,938	4,505	5,186	832	1,399	2,081	Liverpool	12,818	16,583	18,975	22,273	3,766	6,157	9,455	Penrith	11,442	13,955	15,574	17,868	2,513	4,132	6,426	Wollondilly	887	1,087	1,269	1,612	200	382	725	Total	49,926	61,495	69,515	79,745	11,569	19,590	29,820
Western Parkland City region Travel Zone/LGA					Increase in employment from 2016																																																																																			
	2016	2021	2026	2031	2021	2026	2031																																																																																	
Blue Mountains	3,899	3,941	3,949	4,050	42	50	151																																																																																	
Camden	2,925	3,899	4,961	5,796	974	2,036	2,870																																																																																	
Campbelltown (NSW)	8,066	9,836	10,984	12,452	1,770	2,919	4,386																																																																																	
Fairfield	6,784	8,255	9,299	10,509	1,471	2,515	3,726																																																																																	
Hawkesbury	3,105	3,938	4,505	5,186	832	1,399	2,081																																																																																	
Liverpool	12,818	16,583	18,975	22,273	3,766	6,157	9,455																																																																																	
Penrith	11,442	13,955	15,574	17,868	2,513	4,132	6,426																																																																																	
Wollondilly	887	1,087	1,269	1,612	200	382	725																																																																																	
Total	49,926	61,495	69,515	79,745	11,569	19,590	29,820																																																																																	
p. 29	<p>The Hon. PETER PRIMROSE: May I ask then specifically if you will take on notice the question: What are the predicted numbers of those who will be employed in the healthcare and social assistance category over each of the next five years by each of the eight LGAs in the western Sydney district catchment area?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: If that information is available, I will provide it on notice.</p>																																																																																							
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u></p> <p>Projections for <i>Healthcare and Social Assistance</i> employment (by Place of Work) for the Western Parkland City LGAs are provided below.</p> <p>Western Parkland City region</p>																																																																																							

Travel Zone /LGA*	2016	2021	2026	2031
Blue Mountains	3,899	3,941	3,949	4,050
Camden	2,925	3,899	4,961	5,796
Campbelltown (NSW)	8,066	9,836	10,984	12,452
Fairfield	6,784	8,255	9,299	10,509
Hawkesbury	3,105	3,938	4,505	5,186
Liverpool	12,818	16,583	18,975	22,273
Penrith	11,442	13,955	15,574	17,868
Wollondilly	887	1,087	1,269	1,612
Total	49,926	61,495	69,515	79,745

*The results are for Travel Zones. TZs are closely aligned with LGA boundaries.
Source: DPIE and TfNSW

The projections are based on macroeconomic modelling undertaken in 2019. The projections are due to be updated in early 2022. The 2022 projections will account for changes in population growth due to COVID-19.

p. 30

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Yes. Are they all open? Ms BROWN: Not all of them, no. We are putting staff—for example, Frankfurt and Paris are going to be spoke locations and they will be open by the end of the year. I can run through all the other examples—
The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: If you just take that on notice and provide to the Committee a list of all of them, their current status and when they intend to be opened, that would be very useful.
Mr STUART AYRES: Yes, we can do that.
Ms BROWN: For completeness, I did that at the last hearing. So I will just re-provide that answer.
The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: So nothing else has opened since then. Is that what you are telling me?
Ms BROWN: Yes.
The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: That makes it easier.
Ms BROWN: Let me take that on notice though.
The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: An update it, even if it is the same information, that would be very helpful.
Ms BROWN: Thank you

RESPONSE

The table below has been updated since the last response to the same QoN in August 2021. Delays to some timeframes are due to factors beyond the control of Investment NSW, including the COVID-19 pandemic.

<u>Office</u>	<u>Status</u>
REGION: NORTH ASIA	
Tokyo (Hub)	Operational (currently operating through Austrade) STIC commenced July 2021 Independent office to be opened by March 2022

Seoul (Spoke)	Operational
REGION: UK, EU and ISRAEL	
London (Hub)	Operational AG appointed in October 2021
Frankfurt (Spoke)	March 2022 (delays due to Austrade's ability to accommodate us in their office)
Paris (Spoke)	March 2022 (delays due to Austrade's ability to accommodate us in their office)
REGION: ASEAN	
Singapore (Hub)	Operational (currently operating through Austrade) STIC to be appointed November 2021 Independent office to be opened by December 2021
Ho Chi Minh City (Spoke)	Operational
Jakarta (Spoke)	Operational
Kuala Lumpur (Spoke)	February 2022
REGION: AMERICAS	
New York (Hub)	STIC to be appointed early 2022 Independent Hub Office to be opened in early 2022
San Francisco (Spoke)	Operational
Washington (Spoke)	February 2022
Santiago (Spoke)	February 2022
Toronto (Spoke)	July 2022
REGION: India and the Middle East	
Mumbai (Hub)	Operational STIC to be appointed November 2021
Bangalore (Spoke)	February 2022
Abu Dhabi (Spoke)	Operational
Dubai (open for 12 months for Dubai Export) (Spoke)	Operational
REGION: Greater China	
Shanghai (Hub)	Operational STIC to be appointed early 2022
Guangzhou (Spoke)	Operational

	Hong Kong (Spoke)	July 2022														
	Beijing (Spoke)	July 2022														
	*All spoke offices other than Guangzhou, San Francisco and Abu Dhabi are based within Austrade offices.															
p. 30-31	<p>Mr STUART AYRES: Sorry, just on the reference point that Ms Brown just made around China, we have not decided whether we will need to go back to market. We just have not had a chance, literally.</p> <p>The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: But you might.</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I would describe that as in the early stages of the recruitment process.</p> <p>The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: That is all early stages, so that does not give me much. Again, I am happy for you to do it on notice to provide when you expect them to be actually appointed?</p> <p>Ms BROWN: Certainly.</p>															
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Office</th> <th>Recruitment status</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Tokyo</td> <td>In July 2021, Michael Newman was appointed as Senior Trade and Investment Commissioner for North Asia (Tokyo). He will be based in Tokyo and take office in January 2022.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>London</td> <td>In October 2021, Mr Stephen Cartwright OAM was announced as the Agent-General for NSW and Senior Trade and Investment Commissioner for NSW in Europe and Israel. He will be based in London, UK and take office in January 2022.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Singapore</td> <td>The STIC Singapore recruitment is in the final stages of contract negotiations and an appointment is likely in November 2021.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>New York</td> <td>The STIC New York recruitment is underway and an appointment is likely to be made in early 2022.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Mumbai</td> <td>The STIC Mumbai recruitment is in the final stages of contract negotiations and an appointment is likely in November 2021.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Shanghai</td> <td>The STIC Shanghai recruitment is underway and an appointment is likely to be made in early 2022.</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		Office	Recruitment status	Tokyo	In July 2021, Michael Newman was appointed as Senior Trade and Investment Commissioner for North Asia (Tokyo). He will be based in Tokyo and take office in January 2022.	London	In October 2021, Mr Stephen Cartwright OAM was announced as the Agent-General for NSW and Senior Trade and Investment Commissioner for NSW in Europe and Israel. He will be based in London, UK and take office in January 2022.	Singapore	The STIC Singapore recruitment is in the final stages of contract negotiations and an appointment is likely in November 2021.	New York	The STIC New York recruitment is underway and an appointment is likely to be made in early 2022.	Mumbai	The STIC Mumbai recruitment is in the final stages of contract negotiations and an appointment is likely in November 2021.	Shanghai	The STIC Shanghai recruitment is underway and an appointment is likely to be made in early 2022.
Office	Recruitment status															
Tokyo	In July 2021, Michael Newman was appointed as Senior Trade and Investment Commissioner for North Asia (Tokyo). He will be based in Tokyo and take office in January 2022.															
London	In October 2021, Mr Stephen Cartwright OAM was announced as the Agent-General for NSW and Senior Trade and Investment Commissioner for NSW in Europe and Israel. He will be based in London, UK and take office in January 2022.															
Singapore	The STIC Singapore recruitment is in the final stages of contract negotiations and an appointment is likely in November 2021.															
New York	The STIC New York recruitment is underway and an appointment is likely to be made in early 2022.															
Mumbai	The STIC Mumbai recruitment is in the final stages of contract negotiations and an appointment is likely in November 2021.															
Shanghai	The STIC Shanghai recruitment is underway and an appointment is likely to be made in early 2022.															
p. 31	<p>The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: We might have to come back to that. I am interested in when these offices open and understanding what the budget will be allocated for each of these offices, particularly in relation to functions but in a whole range of ways. Are you able to give us an idea about what the budget is for these offices— the budget that is not accommodation and those things? I want to know how much you will be spending on functions and those kinds of things. Can you tell us what is attached to those?</p> <p>Ms BROWN: What I can say is that the budget is \$128.9 million to expand the international network. I will have to take on notice whether or not we have a breakdown between office accommodation and things like industry events and connection and networking activities.</p> <p>The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: We would really like a breakdown. We have asked these questions on notice. That information has not been provided and we have been referred to the annual report, and all we get is that global figure. We are looking for a breakdown by office of as many of the different aspects of that budget.</p>															

	Ms BROWN: Let me take that on notice.
	RESPONSE The total actual spend for the offshore offices for the FY 2020/21 was \$5,272,000. See Attachment C for detailed breakdown. Note a hyphen indicates that the spend was less than \$1000.
p. 36	The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Does the Agent-General to London have a bigger budget than the other officers? Mr STUART AYRES: I will take the budget breakdown on notice— The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: I think we are getting that. Mr STUART AYRES: —but I do not think there would be a substantial difference. It would depend on the size of the office that they are running
	RESPONSE The budget for the UK, Europe and Israel region, managed by the Agent-General, is the largest budget of our six regions (see response to Supplementary question below on international office budgets). Budget allocation by region is based on several factors including (but not limited to) the number of staff and salary costs, office establishment and maintenance costs including offices leases and fitout, the in-country costs of doing business, marketing and events, and exchange rates.
p. 36-37	The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Okay. I am talking about the NSW Trade and Investment Action Plan 2017-18, which set a target to grow 15,000 investment-related jobs per annum by 2020. Are you able to tell me how many investment-related jobs were created as a result of that? Mr STUART AYRES: What I can tell you is that there were 250,000 jobs created over that four-year period in New South Wales. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: That is not my question. Mr STUART AYRES: No, no. I am saying— The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Look, this is a very specific set of questions. You had a strategy that had a lot of targets in it. There is no information available about whether any of those targets were met, or indeed even what happened to them. If you have met them, great, but you have not told anyone about it. Mr STUART AYRES: I will take on notice and provide you with any information that reports back against that target
	RESPONSE See answer to QoN on p. 37-38 of the transcript.
p. 37	The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: There was another target that said that you would have over 16,000 small and medium-sized enterprises [SMEs] exporting from New South Wales by 2020. Can you give us an update on that? Does Ms Brown have information on this? Mr STUART AYRES: I will take that on notice again. That will just be a factual number. We can provide that to you on notice.
	RESPONSE See answer to QoN on p. 37-38 of the transcript.
p. 37	The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: That would be terrific. There was another target set to grow exports from food and fibre from \$7.4 billion to \$10 billion by 2020. Can you also let us know what the actual final figures were for that? Mr STUART AYRES: Yes.

	<p>RESPONSE See answer to QoN on p. 37-38 of the transcript.</p>				
p. 37-38	<p>Ms BELL: When you talk about the Global NSW Strategy, do you refer to the strategy that was prepared by the Government in 2019? There were no targets attached to that. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Yes, that is right. That is my information. So there are no targets attached to that? Ms BELL: That is correct. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Right. And there are no internal targets? Ms BELL: It is more a framework which the Government would operate in as we moved forward at the time. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Right. So you had a strategy that had targets; we do not know whether you met them. You have got a new strategy— Ms BELL: No. My answer is actually that we have met the large majority of them, and we can give you a full breakdown of those targets from 2017-18 on notice. Mr STUART AYRES: I am not sure whether you heard it, but Ms Bell confirmed that we had created 16,000 SMEs. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: I heard the one. I want to hear all of them. As I said, we just have not been provided with the information. Mr STUART AYRES: I am more than happy to provide those on notice. The Global NSW strategy was the strategy that was about demonstrating an expanded footprint with the expansion of the New South Wales overseas network to be able to support businesses exporting to additional markets and also attract more investment into New South Wales.</p>				
	<p>RESPONSE Most targets set within the <i>NSW Trade and Investment Action Plan 2017-18</i> (the “Action Plan”) were met or were on track to be met prior to the Covid-19 pandemic, as detailed in the table below. The four-year Action Plan was scheduled to conclude in 2020-21.</p> <p>The COVID-19 pandemic resulted in a rapid deterioration and significant challenges in the global trade and investment environment, which meant that the Action Plan targets for 2020 were no longer realistic.</p> <p>The Action Plan, and associated governance arrangements, was superseded by the <i>Global NSW Strategy</i> in 2019. The Global NSW strategy provides a more holistic whole-of-government approach to the delivery and resourcing of our economic development agenda, including trade and investment. The <i>Global NSW Strategy</i> can be found here: https://www.global.nsw.gov.au/sites/default/files/2021-05/Global%20NSW%20Brochure.pdf.</p> <p>In response to Covid-19 impacts and the significant disruption to the global trade environment since March 2020, Investment NSW developed the <i>NSW Trade Statement</i>, aligned to the Global NSW Strategy, to reset trade actions and targets. The actions and targets in the <i>NSW Trade Statement</i> will be reported on annually.</p> <p>A summary of targets with the latest data available follows:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="443 1839 1481 2009"> <thead> <tr> <th data-bbox="443 1839 699 1877">Target</th> <th data-bbox="699 1839 1481 1877">Status</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td data-bbox="443 1877 699 2009">Investment Attraction - Grow investment from \$4.3 billion to \$8</td> <td data-bbox="699 1877 1481 2009">Target not met</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Target	Status	Investment Attraction - Grow investment from \$4.3 billion to \$8	Target not met
Target	Status				
Investment Attraction - Grow investment from \$4.3 billion to \$8	Target not met				

	<p>billion by 2020 – Focussing efforts on promoting the strengths of NSW to investors and facilitate high level investment in areas of interest.</p>	<p>Independent data sourced from FDI Markets, provides a total investment growth for the period 2017-2020 from \$4.3 billion to \$22.7 billion. This is presented as:</p> <p>CY2018 - \$6.959 billion CY2019 - \$6.787 billion CY2020 - \$4.657 billion</p> <p>Investment NSW facilitates specific investments into NSW, but does not control or manage the total levels of investment into the State. Notably for 2020, macro economic factors such as the impact of the bushfires, Covid-19 Pandemic and changes in policy settings regarding Chinese investment will understandably have influenced total investment value for that year</p> <p>#Data is sourced from 'FDI Markets'. FDI Markets sources data from a team of in-house analysts' daily searches of Financial Times newswires and internal information sources, media sources, including all of the world's top business sources, project data from over 2,000 industry organisations and investment agencies and data purchased from market research and publication companies. Each project identified is cross-referenced against multiple sources, with primary focus on direct company sources.</p> <p>The Australian Bureau of Statistics provides Foreign Direct Investment data at the national level only and does not break it up by State.</p>
	<p>Jobs Growth - Create 15,000 investment related jobs per annum by 2020.</p>	<p>Target not met</p> <p>Independent data sourced from FDI Markets, provides a total job creation for the period 2017-2020 of 28,086 jobs. This is presented as:</p> <p>CY2018 – 9,693 jobs CY2019 – 12,087 jobs CY2020 – 6,306 jobs</p> <p>The average jobs increase per calendar year 2017-20 is 9,362 jobs /year.</p> <p>It should be noted that this data relates to direct FTE with no specific data available to quantify the number of indirect jobs created arising from these investments.</p> <p>Investment NSW facilitates specific investments into NSW, but does not control or manage the total levels of investment into the State, or the resultant jobs arising. Notably for 2020, macro economic factors such as the impact of the bushfires, Covid-19 Pandemic and changes in policy settings regarding Chinese investment will understandably have influenced the total number of jobs created as directly aligned with aforementioned investment values noted earlier that significantly exceeded the intended target.</p> <p>#Data sourced from 'FDI Markets'. FDI Markets sources data from a team of in-house analysts' daily searches of Financial Times newswires and internal information sources, media sources, including all of the world's top business sources, project data from over 2,000 industry organisations and investment agencies and data purchased from market research and publication companies. Each project</p>

	<p>identified is cross-referenced against multiple sources, with primary focus on direct company sources</p> <p>The Australian Bureau of Statistics provides Foreign Direct Investment data at the national level only and does not break it up by State</p>
<p>Grow exports of food and fibre from \$7.4 billion (2015-16) to \$10 billion by 2020.</p>	<p>Target not met.</p> <p>Food and fibre exports from NSW in 2019: \$7,285m</p> <p>Food and fibre exports from NSW in 2020: \$6,858m</p> <p><i>*Note that cotton exports are not included in NSW exports data as they are confidential and not published at the state level by ABS due to the concentrated nature of the industry.</i></p> <p><i>(Source: ABS, Catalogues No. 5368 and 5302)</i></p> <p>Many factors have impacted food and fibre production in NSW and export values in recent years. Years of prolonged drought, followed by devastating bushfires, continuing trade tensions, the COVID-19 pandemic, ongoing supply chain issues, increased production costs and fluctuating export pricing have all contributed to 2019 and 2020 expectations not being met.</p>
<p>Grow financial services exports from \$3.2 billion (2015-16) to \$4.5 billion by 2020.</p>	<p>Target not met.</p> <p>Financial services exports from NSW in 2019: \$3,458m</p> <p>Financial services exports from NSW in 2020: \$3,347m</p> <p><i>(Source: ABS, Catalogues No. 5368 and 5302)</i></p> <p>Financial Services export targets were not met because the Covid-19 pandemic, international travel ban and border closures severely hampered service exports and led to financial technology (Fintech) exports replacing traditional financial services exports.</p>
<p>Grow the international education sector from \$7.2 billion (2015-16) to \$9 billion by 2020. Return market share of international education in NSW to 38.9%.</p>	<p>Target met.</p> <p>International education exports from NSW in 2019: \$14,585m</p> <p>International education exports from NSW in 2020: \$11,452m</p> <p><i>(Source: ABS, Catalogues No. 5360 and 5302)</i></p> <p>The market share of international education in NSW was 46% in 2019 and 38% in 2020.</p> <p><i>(Source: Department of Education, Skills and Employment https://internationaleducation.gov.au/research/international-student-data/Pages/InternationalStudentData2021.aspx)</i></p> <p>Covid-19 and border closures has had a significant impact on the sector and its performance in 2020.</p>
<p>Double MedTech exports to Asia from \$362 million to \$620 million by 2020 and maintain our global position as a top five FinTech market.</p>	<p>Target met.</p> <p>Total Medical technology and instrument exports from NSW were \$1.1 billion in 2019-20. Product specific export data by state is not available by export destination. However, our top three export markets for all merchandise goods are in Asia: Japan, China, and the Republic of Korea.</p>

		<p>(Source: ABS, Catalogues No. 5368 and 5302)</p> <p>NSW / Sydney has not maintained its global position as a top five FinTech Market. Sydney’s global Fintech ranking has continued to hover between 10 and 13 over the last four years according to “Findexable”. Table 1 shows Sydney’s global position by years.</p> <p>Sydney Fintech global ranking 2018 - 2021</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="715 468 1465 598"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>2018</th> <th>2019</th> <th>2020</th> <th>2021</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Sydney</td> <td>13</td> <td>10</td> <td>13</td> <td>11</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Melbourne</td> <td></td> <td>19</td> <td>32</td> <td>25</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Source: The Global Fintech Ranking report by Findexable (commonly used data source for fintech ranking)</p>		2018	2019	2020	2021	Sydney	13	10	13	11	Melbourne		19	32	25
	2018	2019	2020	2021													
Sydney	13	10	13	11													
Melbourne		19	32	25													
	<p>Have over 16,000 SMEs exporting and have NSW businesses exporting \$80 billion worth of goods and services by 2020.</p>	<p>Target met.</p> <p>In 2018-19 (latest data available) there were a total of 14,871 merchandise (goods) exporters in NSW. NSW had the largest number of merchandise (goods) exporters in Australia – 26% of the 56,772 exporting businesses.</p> <p>Across Australia 61% exporting businesses are small enterprises and a further 27% are medium enterprises (88%). A further breakdown of this data is not available at the state level.</p> <p>(Source: https://www.abs.gov.au/statistics/economy/international-trade/characteristics-australian-exporters/latest-release)</p> <p>Data on the number of service exporters is not available by state, but NSW service exports were valued at \$39.8 billion in 2019-2020. Key service exports include international education, tourism, and professional and financial services.</p> <p>(Source: ABS Catalogue 5368).</p> <p>Small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) make up 97.5% of all enterprises in NSW.</p> <p>(Source: Small Business Counts: Small business in the Australian economy, Australian Government Small Business and Family Enterprise Ombudsman, July 2019)</p> <p>Goods and services exports from NSW in 2019: \$101,788m Goods and services exports from NSW in 2020: \$84,640m (Source: ABS, Catalogue No.5368 and 5302 Table 21.)</p>															
	<p>Grow overnight visitor expenditure from \$26.2 billion to \$36.6 billion by 2020</p>	<p>Target not met.</p> <p>Prior to the COVID-19 pandemic, domestic and international visitors contributed \$38.1 billion in Gross State Product and supported 296,000 jobs and over 107,000 businesses in NSW. With overnight visitor expenditure at record levels of \$35 billion in 2019, NSW was on track to achieve the 2020 target and on a steady trajectory to 2030. The COVID-19 pandemic has disrupted this trajectory significantly. This has prompted the NSW Government to revisit its strategic planning for the sector, including a refresh of its 2030 Visitor Economy Industry Action Plan.</p>															

p. 38	<p>The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: I understand. I am going to come to that. So you will provide all of that information for us on notice. I want to go back to asking some more questions about the trade offices and the way in which they operate. I suppose it is coming back to putting things on notice. We are very keen to understand how the expenses operate for these trade offices and whether there are a number of things that are included in the budget. Thank you,</p> <p>Ms Brown; you said that you would provide some information to us on notice. I particularly want to understand the budget for catering, the budget for flowers, the budget for hospitality, the budget for limousines—</p> <p>The Hon. CATHERINE CUSACK: Penny.</p> <p>The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: If you knew the excess of which some of these—why the original agent-general was closed down in 1993, you would understand why we are asking that.</p> <p>The Hon. CATHERINE CUSACK: It was actually the Carr Government that started re-establishing these positions.</p> <p>The CHAIR: Order! We are not having this debate. The question is to the Minister. The Hon. Penny Sharpe can finish the question, and then we will hear from the Minister.</p> <p>The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: I thank Ms Brown. She said that she was going to provide it, but I want to be specific about it because—</p> <p>The Hon. CATHERINE CUSACK: The budget for flowers? Are you serious?</p> <p>The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Yes, I am serious. I think taxpayers want to know how much they are spending on flowers in our trade offices. I do not think that is an unreasonable question.</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I am happy to provide the information that is available on notice. The one thing I would point out here is that this is an expansion of a network, so many of these offices have not been established. Where we have had officers operating, in a lot of cases they have been operating as an embedded person in existing Austrade arrangements. I just want to be clear.</p> <p>The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: That is okay. If you do not have a budget for the new ones, that is fine. But you have got the existing ones, which I am also asking about.</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: Yes.</p> <p>The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: I am particularly interested in entertainment and entertainment reimbursement, gifts, wellbeing programs, fitness programs, parking and parking fines.</p> <p>The Hon. CATHERINE CUSACK: Parking fines?</p> <p>The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Yes. If there is a trade commissioner who has got a bunch of parking fines that they expect the New South Wales taxpayer to pay for, I do not think that is an unreasonable thing.</p>
	<p><u>RESPONSE</u> As provided above – details in Attachment C.</p>
p. 44	<p>Mr JUSTIN FIELD: I think there are some forecasts for some of that, but have you or Infrastructure NSW staff discussed potential funding assistance for the project with any Commonwealth official or agency?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: Yes, we have written to the Commonwealth indicating that this is a project that the New South Wales Government would like to proceed on and we would like to talk to them about the prospect of them funding parts of the dam. That is correct.</p> <p>Mr JUSTIN FIELD: When did you write to them?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I do not know the exact date. It was some time in the recent months.</p> <p>Mr JUSTIN FIELD: Can you provide that letter?</p> <p>Mr STUART AYRES: I will take on notice whether I would provide you that correspondence.</p>

	<p>Mr JUSTIN FIELD: Why would you not provide it? Mr STUART AYRES: I said I would take it on notice.</p>
	<p>RESPONSE The NSW Government has written to the Australian Government in relation to a co-contribution of funds for the proposed Warragamba Dam wall raising project.</p>
p. 44-45	<p>Mr JUSTIN FIELD: Do you recall how much money you were asking for? Mr STUART AYRES: We have not had a discussion with the Commonwealth about what their funding contribution would be at this stage, only that we would like to talk to them about a funding contribution. Mr JUSTIN FIELD: Who within the Commonwealth was it sent to? Mr STUART AYRES: I would have to check the exact person that we wrote the letter to. Mr JUSTIN FIELD: Mr Draper, do you know who that letter went to? The Hon. BEN FRANKLIN: Point of order: He is taking it on notice. Mr STUART AYRES: Yes. Mr JUSTIN FIELD: I am just assisting the Minister because we may be able to shortcut this. He has to write an answer to it— The CHAIR: The Minister has taken it on notice and that is fine. Mr Draper has been asked a question and he is entitled to answer it. Mr STUART AYRES: Sorry, my recollection is—but I want to go back and check because there have been some portfolio changes in the Commonwealth Government—that I wrote to Michael McCormack, I think, as the head of the department of regional development or whatever the title is, but I will go back and confirm who I wrote to.</p>
	<p>RESPONSE See previous response.</p>
p. 45	<p>The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Minister, the most recent Destination NSW annual report says that there are no Aboriginal or Torres Strait Islander people working for Destination NSW. Does that remain the case? Mr STUART AYRES: I will take that on notice. I do not know every single employee within Destination NSW, but I will take that on notice and come back to you. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: The reason that I am asking is obviously there is an Aboriginal tourism plan. I am very interested in the engagement of First Nations people within that but concerned that if there still remain no Aboriginal people working in Destination NSW— Mr STUART AYRES: Yes. I do not want to project an answer here, so I will take it on notice.</p>
	<p>RESPONSE Demographic data is sourced from information that is voluntarily provided by ongoing employees. There are ongoing employees who identify as Aboriginal or Torres Strait Islander People.</p>

FY2020/21 Actual spends

Numbers in AUD '000

Offshore Office	Accomodation	Gifts/Entertainments/Hospitality/Catering	Events/Networking/Marketing activities	Flowers	Limousines	Parking	Parking fines
Shanghai	\$ 298	\$ 13	\$ 9	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 4	\$ -
Guangzhou	\$ 111	\$ 2	\$ 31	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 3	\$ -
Abu Dhabi	\$ 77	\$ -	\$ 1	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
San Francisco	\$ 16	\$ -	\$ 35	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Mumbai	\$ 154	\$ -	\$ 18	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
London	\$ 152	\$ 3	\$ 200	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Tokyo	\$ 59	\$ 1	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Ho Chi Minh City	\$ 10	\$ 0	\$ 28	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Seoul	\$ 23	\$ 4	\$ 33	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Singapore	\$ 14	\$ 0	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
TOTAL	\$ 914	\$ 24	\$ 353	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 7	\$ -

Wellbing programs	Fitness Programs	Other expenses	Salaries and Wages	Total
\$ -	\$ -	\$ 124	\$ 110	\$ 558
\$ -	\$ -	\$ 276	\$ 488	\$ 910
\$ -	\$ -	\$ 292	\$ 284	\$ 654
\$ -	\$ -	\$ 150	\$ 439	\$ 640
\$ -	\$ -	\$ 94	\$ 337	\$ 602
\$ -	\$ -	\$ 123	\$ 254	\$ 732
\$ -	\$ -	\$ 174	\$ 378	\$ 612
\$ -	\$ -	\$ 45	\$ 33	\$ 115
\$ -	\$ -	\$ 91	\$ 142	\$ 294
\$ -	\$ -	\$ 73	\$ 68	\$ 155
\$ -	\$ -	\$ 1,442	\$ 2,532	\$ 5,272