



LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

PORTFOLIO COMMITTEES

BUDGET ESTIMATES 2019-2020 Supplementary Questions

Portfolio Committee No. 7 – Planning and Environment

ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT

Hearing: Friday 13 September 2019

Answers due by: Wednesday 9 October 2019

Budget Estimates secretariat
Phone 9230 3067
BudgetEstimates@parliament.nsw.gov.au

ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT

Questions from Ms Cate Faehrmann MLC

Carbon Sequestration Plantings

1. How many national parks currently have tree planting programs for carbon offsetting?
 - (a) How many are scheduled to commence over the next 12 months?
 - (b) How many are scheduled to commence over the next four years?
2. How many hectares of carbon sequestration plantation have been established in NSW national parks?
 - (a) How many hectares will be planted in the next 12 months?
 - (b) How many hectares is anticipated over the next four years?
3. How is the estimated revenue the NSW Government expects from the carbon sequestration plantings over the next decade?
4. What environmental impacts assessment have been conducted in relation to the carbon sequestration program?
 - (a) What public comment and review processes have been conducted?
 - (b) Have any other public processes been conducted?
 - (c) Have the program been subject to review through the park management plan process under the National Parks and Wildlife Act?
5. What funds were allocated to the NPWS to undertake an environmental impact assessment for the carbon sequestration program?
6. What scientific assessments or compliance audits have been undertaken into the carbon forest plantations established to determine the extent of compliance with the nature conservation objects and management principles of the National Parks and Wildlife Act, 1974?
 - (a) Where carbon sequestration plantations demonstrate non-compliance, what remedial works or other intervention will be undertaken to ensure compliance with the Act?
 - (b) What scientific assessments, such as background monitoring of site-specific attributes prior to the commencement of future tree planting programs, will be done to ensure future carbon sequestration plantation programs in national parks achieve habitat restoration?

ANSWER:

1. A total of 11 national parks have tree plantings programs currently in place.
 - (a) Five new tree planting programs are planned to commence in 2019/20.
 - (b) There are no additional proposed sites beyond those referred to in (a).
2. A total of 1,079 hectares of carbon/environmental plantings are currently planted.
 - (a) Approximately 215 hectares.
 - (b) No additional areas are specifically proposed beyond those referred to in (a).
3. Approximately \$1.3 million for the sites currently registered under the Emissions Reduction Fund. The registration of an additional five sites in 2020-21 will result in further revenue of \$350,000 to \$450,000.
4. A Review of Environmental Factors (REF) is prepared for all carbon/environmental planting activities, as required under the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979*.
 - (a) REFs prepared by the National Parks and Wildlife Service are not required to be publicly exhibited. Where there is an identified risk to Aboriginal or historic heritage, a site inspection by representatives of relevant stakeholder groups is undertaken.
 - (b) A media release was distributed by the former Minister for Environment and Heritage in 2016. A webpage and other public education material are currently under development. Several National Parks and Wildlife Regional Advisory Committees have been briefed about the program.
 - (c) Yes. Prior to undertaking individual carbon/environmental planting projects, a comprehensive review of relevant plans of management, statements of interim management intent and other relevant reserve planning documents is undertaken.
5. Nil, this was funded through existing resources.
6. A monitoring and evaluation program is being developed to ascertain whether the carbon/environmental plantings are meeting their conservation objectives. This program will be required to run for a minimum 10 years to allow planted trees to reach a suitable stage of maturity/growth.
 - (a) Careful planning is undertaken prior to implementation to reduce the likelihood of this occurring. Potential remedial works will depend on the nature of the issue, but may

include planting site re-design, further archaeological or environmental assessment, or the exclusion of sensitive sites from planting.

- (b) Environmental/carbon plantings have the dual purposes of habitat augmentation and carbon sequestration. These objectives align with emissions targets under the Commonwealth Government's 'Direct Action Plan' and the conservation objectives for individual reserves.

It is anticipated that carbon/environmental planting activities will augment natural restoration of sites (including improved water and soil quality and other ecosystem services) as tree canopy establishes and leaf litter and other detritus accumulates and reconstitutes as mulch.

St Mary's Woolworths Oil Spill

7. In relation to the underground fuel storage tank contamination at the Woolworths Petrol Station on Forrester Road in St Marys, on the 25th of March 2016, what contaminants and in what quantities were found to be present at the site by the EPA's investigation?
- (a) What quantity of benzene was detected at the site?
- (b) What other BTEX chemicals were detected at the site, and in what quantities?
8. What was the basis for the EPA's determination that no remediation was required?
9. Why did the EPA refuse to share the site contamination report with the landowner?
10. Did the report sent by Woolworths to the EPA in 2009 mention the presence of benzene at the site?

ANSWER:

7. When the EPA assessed the contamination at this site in 2017, it relied on groundwater monitoring reports from Woolworths. This is consistent with the 'polluter pays' principle.
- (a) Monitoring of groundwater sampling results provided to the EPA found the maximum concentration of benzene in groundwater was 28 micrograms/litre.
- (b) In the same set of sampling referred to in 7(a), ethylbenzene was reported at 7 micrograms/litre, toluene at 21 micrograms/litre and xylenes at 36 micrograms/litre.
8. The EPA did not make a determination regarding the requirement for remediation. Based on assessment of the available information, on 12 May 2017, the EPA concluded that it did not

have reason to believe that the contamination at the site was significant enough to warrant EPA regulation under the *Contaminated Land Management Act 1997* due to the following:

- The groundwater contamination arising from the service station operation is localised in extent, to the tank-farm area.
- The petroleum hydrocarbon contamination in groundwater has been adequately delineated, and any further migration is likely to be slow due to hydrogeological conditions and the surrounding soils which are of low permeability.
- The residual contamination on-site can be appropriately managed through appropriate work health and safety (WH&S) practices.
- The concentrations of petroleum hydrocarbons in groundwater sampled from monitoring wells during the recent sampling performed in 2016 are consistent with historical sampling results. The concentrations in the boundary and down-gradient monitoring wells are within the National Environment Protection Measure (NEPM) health-screening levels (HSLs) and appropriate groundwater investigation levels (GILs).
- Based on the concentrations of petroleum hydrocarbons in groundwater reported at the site, there are considered to be no unacceptable risks to human health or ecological receptors.

9. The landowner requested the reports informally from the EPA. Consistent with its procedures under the *Government Information (Public Access) Act 2009* for assessing informal GIPA applications the EPA did not approve the release of information as the owner of the information had objected to the EPA releasing the reports on the grounds of legal proceedings. The EPA recommended at that time that the landowner submit a formal application for the information under the *Government Information (Public Access) Act 2009* to seek the information. No formal GIPA application has been made by the landowner to obtain the reports from the EPA.

10. Yes.

Climate Change

11. What proportion of NSW total electricity use by 2030 will be from renewable sources?
12. Assuming no change in other emissions reduction activities, what proportion is necessary to achieve NSW's aspirational target of net zero emissions by 2050?

- (a) What actions will NSW government take to ensure the target is achieved?
13. How much have emissions from government operations reduced by since the Climate Change Policy Framework was announced in 2017?
14. Given the Government's aspirational long-term objectives of achieving net-zero emissions by 2050, what are NSW's anticipated emissions in:
- (a) 2020?
 - (b) 2025?
 - (c) 2030?
 - (d) 2040?
15. Given the Government's aspirational long-term objectives of achieving net-zero emissions by 2050, what is the projected proportion of emissions by sector/activity in:
- (a) 2020?
 - (b) 2025?
 - (c) 2030?
 - (d) 2040?

ANSWER:

11. The Government is continuing to develop sector plans to outline how the Government will deliver on its 2050 net-zero target.
12. In 2017, the electricity sector contributed 39 per cent to NSW emissions. The NSW Government's aspirational target to achieve net zero emissions by 2050 requires a reduction of emission activities across all sectors.
- (a) In the energy sector the NSW Government is focused on maintaining reliability and affordability so there is an orderly transition from traditional sources of power to renewable energy. The government is planning to set an interim emissions reduction target for 2030 to help achieve net zero emissions by 2050.
13. The NSW Government released its Climate Change Policy Framework in November 2016. It defines the role of the NSW Government in leading by example and saving emissions in government operations. One of the main ways the government is doing this is through the implementation of the Government Resource Efficiency Policy (GREP).

The GREP sets targets for agencies to reduce energy use, install solar panels, purchase more fuel-efficient vehicles and purchase GreenPower. The GREP and its annual progress reports are available at www.environment.nsw.gov.au. The Department estimates NSW Government electricity (excluding trains), LPG and natural gas use contributed to around 1,751,000 tonnes of carbon dioxide equivalent in 2018, which is 2.1 per cent lower than 2016.

14. Australia's emissions projections to 2030 are available at www.environment.gov.au/climate-change/publications/emissions-projections-2018. Currently there are no validated projections for individual jurisdictions in Australia, including NSW.
15. I refer to my response to question 12.

Biodiversity Conservation Trust

16. In relation to the Conservation Tender Expression of Interest assessment process, the BCT uses a biodiversity value score (BVS) methodology to compare bids. Has the BVS methodology been expert-reviewed?
17. The review by the Audit Office found that four of the bids that were nominated by the tender evaluation panel were rejected by the Board. Why were these bids rejected?
 - (a) Why were the three bids not recommended by the tender evaluation panel funded, despite having a lower BVS?
 - (b) What was the explanation for the deviation from the published methodology in the determination of bids?
18. In what other ways has the BCT varied from its published methodology for determining successful bids?
19. The largest proportion of money to date has been invested in the Central West region, however this region has the lowest biodiversity value scores. The BCT Board rejected several agreements in the Northern Inland region with higher BVI values than agreements in the Central West. How do you explain this?
20. How does the BVS methodology ensure that adequate resources are provided to regional and underrepresented landscapes?
21. What is the timeline for the monitoring compliance procedures for conservation agreements?
22. How will you demonstrate net benefit of the conservation investment?

ANSWER:

I am advised that in relation to questions 16 - 22:

16. Yes. The Biodiversity Conservation Trust (BCT) Assessment Metric has been reviewed by the CSIRO.
17. The BCT Board approved BCT management recommendations, which considered, in addition to the panel's considerations, that this tender aimed to protect important habitats on private land in both the northern and southern parts of the tender area. This meant that some bids were unsuccessful.
 - (a) The three bids were recommended by the panel.
 - (b) This tender aimed to protect important habitat on private land in both the northern and southern parts of the tender area.
18. None.
19. The Biodiversity Conservation Investment Strategy (BCIS) guides the BCT's investment in private land conservation by identifying ranked priority investment areas, setting five investment principles, and setting targets for inadequately protected NSW Landscapes and income diversification. Cost-effectiveness is one of the five investment principles guiding the BCT.

To meet these various aims, the BCT may fund agreements with differing Biodiversity Value Scores and value-for-money rankings (BVI) across different regions. The various drivers of BCT investment may lead to variable funding outcomes across regions that are nonetheless consistent with the BCIS's priority investment areas, investment principles and targets.
20. The BCT investment in the Conservation Management Program is guided by the NSW Government's Biodiversity Conservation Investment Strategy (BCIS), which focusses on priority investment areas and conservation assets. The BCT invests in priority NSW Landscapes in the following ways:
 - The BCT's fixed price offer targets investment in under-represented IBRA subregions prioritising those subregions that have the highest concentration of BCIS high priority NSW Landscapes (PIAs 1, 2 and 3).
 - The BCT's conservation tenders are primarily offered within high priority NSW Landscapes (PIAs 1, 2 and 3) and focus on conservation assets listed within the BCIS.

- The BCT's revolving fund targets most of its activity on securing sites within priority NSW landscapes (PIAs 1, 2 and 3).

The BCT Assessment Metric is then used to determine best value for money sites, having regard to site values, duration of agreement, risk and area.

21. The BCT's Compliance Policy is available on the BCT website.
22. The BCT is developing its monitoring, evaluation and reporting framework, which includes reporting against the four targets set in the Biodiversity Conservation Investment Strategy. Outcomes of BCT's programs are publicly available on the BCT website.

The BCT is also establishing a site-based ecological monitoring regime, which will assist to inform evaluation and reporting of ecological outcomes against relevant BCT and government objectives, and to assess return on private land conservation investment.

Waste - Container Deposit Scheme

23. Under the CDS, what proportion of eligible containers are being recovered from the total recyclable waste stream?
 - (a) What is the Government's target for recovery of eligible containers?
 - (b) What is the projected trend?
24. Given that local government kerbside recovery systems, including trucks, fuel, labour, MRF operation and landfill levies, depend on the sale of recyclate, what has been the cost of the CDS to local governments?
 - (a) What has been the overall impact of the CDS on local government recycling programs?
25. What measures are in place to ensure the viability of Council kerbside collection and materials recovery facilities given the increasing diversion of the most valuable recyclate streams?

ANSWER:

23. The most recent data available shows that the recovery rate in the first six months of 2019 was 69 per cent.
 - (a) The recovery of beverage containers aims to reduce the volume of beverage containers in the litter stream. The Government has a goal of reducing the volume of litter in NSW by 40 per cent by 2020. This was a Premier's Priority in 2015 – 2019.

(b) The recovery rate has continued to steadily increase since the scheme commenced. It is anticipated to rise. The results of the 2017-2018 National Litter Index shows we have achieved a 37 per cent reduction in the volume of litter and are on track to meet the target ahead of schedule.

24. The Return and Earn scheme does not impose any direct costs on local government. The scheme is designed to complement the kerbside system by allowing MRF operators to claim containers collected in kerbside bins. These refunds have helped to keep downward pressure on local government waste charges.

(a) Since the start of the scheme, over two billion containers have been redeemed through return points across the state, delivering clean and high-quality materials to be reused or recycled into quality products.

More than 1 billion additional containers have been eligible for refund since the scheme began for containers collected through kerbside recycling, providing revenue for Material Recovery Facility (MRF) operators impacted by China's National Sword policy. The ability for MRFs to claim refunds has helped to keep downward pressure on local government waste charges. Local governments have also been able to negotiate Refund Sharing Agreements with their local MRF to share in these refunds.

25. Prior to the introduction of the scheme, the value of glass collected through kerbside had already fallen considerably and MRFs were already experiencing problems in finding end-markets for glass at that time. The introduction of the China Sword policy had similar impacts on other commodities. The scheme has counteracted these impacts by diverting problematic materials such as glass away from kerbside. The scheme also allows MRF operators to claim the refund on containers collected through kerbside systems, providing them with a new and significant revenue stream.

Waste - Landfill

26. The Draft NSW Waste and Resource Recovery Needs Report 2017-21 sets an ambitious 2021 resource recovery diversion target of 75%. It notes that should the 75% target for resource recovery diversion not be met, NSW will have insufficient existing, planned or approved landfill capacity, and demand for landfill will increase. Given changes to global recycle markets, what contingency landfill sites have been identified?

(a) What planning or assessment work has been conducted to date to determine contingency landfill sites?

(b) What engagement has the Government had with local governments in relation to identified contingency landfill sites?

27. Has the 75% target for resource recovery diversion been revised in light of changes in the global recycle market?

ANSWER:

26. The NSW Government is undertaking the development of a 20-Year Waste Strategy that will examine future infrastructure needs. A key element of the Strategy will involve identifying emerging infrastructure gaps and options to address them so that NSW has adequate infrastructure to collect, process and dispose of the waste we produce in the future.

27. No. The Waste Avoidance and Resource Recovery Strategy 2014-21 is the current waste strategy for NSW. The targets contained within the Strategy are not subject to change.

The NSW Government is undertaking the development of a 20-Year Waste Strategy that will develop a long-term strategic road map for the management of waste in this State. As part of this work, an Expert Reference Panel will be established to assist with the setting of targets under the Strategy, in accordance with section 12 of the *Waste Avoidance and Resource Recovery Act 2001*.

ENERGY

Questions from Mr David Shoebridge MLC

28. Given that the State government's Climate Change Policy Framework targets zero net carbon dioxide emissions by 2050, what have been the actual climate change fund's renewable energy annual expenditures since \$214 million in 2014/15 and what are future allocations for renewable energy?

ANSWER:

This information can be found in the Climate Change Fund annual reports. The Climate Change Fund is investing \$1.4 billion between 2017 and 2022.

29. When will the government's climate change action plans to achieve the 2050 target be released (originally planned to be released in early 2018)?

ANSWER:

The Government has a range of policies to deliver on its net-zero target and is continuing to develop further plans. The Government will release these plans publicly as soon as possible.

Questions from the Hon Mark Buttigieg MLC (on behalf of the NSW Labor Opposition)

Electricity Prices

30. Notwithstanding the privatisation of electricity assets and the slashing of some 5,000 electricity worker jobs over a 5 year period, electricity prices have gone up since the Liberals and Nationals came to power in 2011.
- (a) Can the government explain what they are doing to address high retail prices?
 - (b) Does the government still stand by its pledge that power prices would be lower under a privatised network?
 - (c) Does the government rule out further privatisations?
31. Do you think that this is a market characterised by real competition?

- (a) Do you accept that the unregulated sectors of the electricity market – the generation and retail sectors – are essentially characterised by monopoly pricing behaviour at the cost of higher electricity prices to the NSW consumer?
- (b) Why did your government abolish the regulated price on what retailers should charge?

ANSWER:

30.

- (a) We have taken a range of actions to help bring energy bills down, including:
- providing \$324.5 million per annum in financial support for vulnerable customers
 - establishing and expanding the Energy Switch Program to assist electricity and gas customers to compare offers across all retailers and switch to the best deal
 - committing to a \$179.8 million package of energy efficiency measures to enable households and businesses to use new technology to reduce their energy costs
 - this includes, for example, \$24.5 million for upgrades to more than 20,000 rental homes for energy efficiency lighting, heating and hot water systems, which could save renters up to \$400 a year
 - removing \$7 billion in costs out of the electricity networks through the NSW network reform program
- (b) Yes. The Government's commitment was in relation to network prices, which are lower today than when the network transactions occurred and the network price guarantee continues to be met, as per the Pricing Commissioner's annual reports.
- In addition, the NSW Independent Pricing and Review Tribunal's (IPART) most recent annual review of the performance and competitiveness of the retail electricity and gas markets in 2017/18 found that, since 2013-14 (the last year of price regulation), average electricity bills across NSW have fallen in real terms in line with the net impact of fluctuations in the underlying input costs of electricity.
- (c) The NSW Government does not have any plans to further privatise electricity businesses that are currently owned by the NSW Government.

31. IPART's most recent annual review of the performance and competitiveness of the retail electricity and gas markets found that each of the indicators used to assess competition in the

electricity and gas retail markets were either steady or increased in 2017-18 compared to the previous year.

(a) No.

(b) Removal of regulated retail electricity prices in NSW was informed by a comprehensive review by the Australian Energy Market Commission of the effectiveness of competition in the NSW retail energy market. As part of this review, the Australian Energy Market Commission consulted extensively with households, small business holders, consumer groups and industry. It found that competition was sufficiently developed in the New South Wales electricity market to justify removing retail price regulation.

Prior to the removal of regulated prices in 2014 for electricity, and 2017 for gas, most households and small businesses had already moved off regulated prices and onto a market contract, showing consumers' preferences for the choice and value offered by competition.

Consultants

32. How much has Essential Energy spent on consultants, external advisors and contractors in the last 3 years?

(a) How much has Essential Energy spent on consultants, external advisors and contractors in the last 12 months?

(b) How much of this work was previously done in-house?

33. How much was spent on Essential Energy's transformation project?

(a) Over how many years was this money spent?

(b) Was this project implemented?

ANSWER:

Financial information that Essential Energy is required to disclose can be found in Essential Energy's annual reports or is provided to Treasury.

Senior Managers

34. How much have senior managers or contract employees spent on entertainment on company credit cards in the past 2 years?

(a) How much have senior managers or contract employees spent on alcohol?

ANSWER:

I am advised by Essential Energy that:

34. Essential Energy has clear policies on what employees are able to expense and the appropriate use of credit cards as well as preventative and detective controls, in relation to credit card usage and management across all expenditure classifications.

Employees are required to ensure that all credit card purchases are business related, commercially sound, represent value for money and are appropriately substantiated.

Port Macquarie Re-fit

35. How much did Essential Energy spend on a coffee machine for the Port Macquarie office?
- (a) What was the rationale for this purchase?
 - (b) How much is being spent on the new office fit-out in Port Macquarie?
 - (c) How much of this is being contributed by the landlord?
 - (d) How much directly from Essential Energy's budget?

ANSWER:

I am advised by Essential Energy that:

35. The eight coffee machines to be installed in the Buller Street premises are leased. The cost will be \$1,907 per month over the three year lease – which includes servicing, maintenance and machine replacement if they fail. At the end of the three years, the machines can be returned or updated.

- (a) The purpose of the in-house coffee machines is to encourage utilisation of the collaborative areas, and broader team and employee engagement. Ultimately this leads to increased productivity through a better practice workplace with modern amenities, as well reducing lost time as staff exit the building to purchase coffee outside of the workplace at various locations. Uptake of the Buller Street machines is around 1.5 cups per day per on-site employee - a productivity improvement for Essential Energy in reducing time that would otherwise be spent walking into town to purchase coffees.
- (b) The new office fit-out is costing approximately \$12.1 million less the landlord incentive of up to \$9.5 million. - approximately \$2.6 million.

- (c) The landlord has invested \$6 million on the base structure and amenities upgrades at Buller Street, and will contribute a further amount of up to \$9.5 million to offset the fit-out costs.
- (d) In addition to the \$2.6 million net forecast cost for the fit-out, a further \$1.4 million has been spent on design and project costs including providing alternative premises for employees during the upgrade.

The forecast cost to Essential Energy of this upgrade is therefore approximately \$4 million after the landlord's lease incentive, however, to date costs are coming in below this forecast.

Vegetation tasks

36. How many vegetation tasks have been cancelled by Essential Energy in the last 12 months?
- (a) How many vegetation tasks have been cancelled by Essential Energy in the last three years?
 - (b) How many of these cancelled vegetation tasks were in high risk bushfire zones?
 - (c) Would the government regard this as a safety concern for regional areas, coming up to bushfire season?
 - (d) Can the Government guarantee that none of these vegetation tasks are essential to protecting communities from fires or other accidents?

ANSWER:

I am advised by Essential Energy that:

36. In the most recent rolling 12 months to 31 August 2019, there were 6,626 vegetation tasks cancelled (out of a total of 361,281 tasks). This equates to 1.8%. Of these cancelled tasks, the majority were duplicate tasks. Duplicate tasks can arise when there are overlapping inspections such as during LiDAR and cyclical programs that identify the same tasks, or where data files are incorrectly loaded twice.

- (a)
 - 5,302 cancellations in 2016 (out of over 1,000,000 tasks) or 0.5%
 - 6,306 cancellations in 2017 (out of over 840,000 tasks) or 0.8%
 - 31,861 cancellations in 2018 (out of over 1,500,000 tasks) or 2.1%
- (b)
 - 605 cancellations in P1 bushfire zones in 2016

- 1,057 cancellations in P1 bushfire zones in 2017
- 22,035 cancellations in P1 bushfire zones in 2018

The cancellation of tasks has been thoroughly investigated by an independent third party. That investigation found that tasks had been correctly cancelled in line with current procedures.

- (c) Cancellation of tasks most often occurs when two tasks are created for the same job, the task is loaded incorrectly, or the task is otherwise to be completed separately through a regular maintenance, trimming or initial cut program. As per the background information above, the significant increase in cancelled tasks in high risk bushfire zones in 2018 reflected Essential Energy's focus on ensuring that any high-risk vegetation encroachments were addressed in a timely manner, through supplementing LiDAR patrols with ground-based inspections.
- (d) Essential Energy is committed to sustainably managing its network including clearances of surrounding vegetation consistent with industry standards. Essential Energy is fully committed to achieving the outcomes expected by customers, the public, and the Independent Pricing and Regulatory Tribunal (IPART) consistent with its vegetation management approach and compliance plans. In 2018, Essential Energy delivered a significantly expanded vegetation program focused on high risk bushfire zones consistent with a compliance plan approved by IPART. Essential Energy conducts ongoing vegetation compliance inspections and audits to ensure vegetation management controls are operating effectively.

Staffing and bullying & harassment

37. There have been allegations of bullying and harassment at Essential Energy – do you agree that there is a culture problem at EE?
- (a) Why did the chair of the board (Patricia McKenzie) recently leave Essential?
38. How many of the executive team have electricity experience prior to working with Essential Energy?
- (a) Do you think it's vital that the executive have a good knowledge of the industry to ensure the efficient management of the company?

39. Have Essential Energy done any studies or collated any statistics in relation to mental health issues manifesting among employees and possible causal effects in the context of job insecurity and Essential Energy disciplinary processes?

ANSWER:

I am advised by Essential Energy that:

37. Essential Energy encourages all employees to report any instances of bullying and harassment or other inappropriate behaviour. All such complaints are treated seriously to ensure everyone in the workplace is provided with a safe working environment and is treated with dignity and respect.

In the past 12 months, Essential Energy has received two employee complaints which make allegations of bullying and harassment. Both cases have been subject to investigation and the complaints were found to be unsubstantiated. Appropriate policies and procedures are in place to ensure all employees are aware of their obligations and understand the principles and process for resolving unreasonable and inappropriate workplace behaviours.

- (a) Following a very valuable period of service, Ms McKenzie departed the role of Chair of Essential Energy's Board shortly before she joined the Board of AGL Energy Limited,. It was felt that continuing to act on both Boards might cause potential conflicts over time and Ms McKenzie chose to step down from Essential Energy's Board.

38. The majority of Essential Energy's executive team have prior experience in electricity related industries. Five out of eight executives have either Australian and/or international electricity industry experience, and the remaining three executives (Human Resources, Information Technology, and General Counsel/Company Secretary) provide the leadership team with specialised skills. This combination of diverse skills and experience means that the executive team is well placed to meet the needs of the business now and into the future.

- (a) The role of the executive leadership team, is to carry out the mission, vision and objectives of Essential Energy. It is vital that each executive has the skills and experience to provide leadership, strategic direction and functional expertise across the organisation to achieve this ambition.

39. All Essential Energy employees are provided with access to an Employee Assistance Program (EAP) which provides professional counselling and support, including support for mental health related problems. This is a free and confidential employee service, therefore the organisation does not receive information about individual cases. Reports are provided which

indicate usage numbers and the type of issues e.g. relationship breakdown, drug, alcohol, parenting.

Renewables

40. In Budget Estimates on 31 August 2018 (transcript p23), the former Energy Minister Mr Harwin indicated that over 1,250 megawatts of renewable energy projects were then under construction in NSW.
- (a) How many of those projects have now been completed? Can you name them, their nameplate capacity, type of energy and dollar value? Which ones have firming or storage, how much, and of what kind?
 - (b) How many renewable energy projects are currently under construction in NSW? Can you name them, their nameplate capacity, type of energy and dollar value? Which ones have firming or storage, how much, and of what kind?
41. In that same evidence, the former Energy Minister, Mr Harwin, indicated that over 8,400 megawatts were then seeking approval in the planning system.
- (a) How many have since received planning approval? Can you name them, their nameplate capacity, type of energy and dollar value? Which ones have firming or storage, how much, and of what kind?
 - (b) What was the consent authority for each project?
 - (c) At what stage(s) in the planning system are the other projects? What is the consent authority for each project? Which ones have firming or storage, how much, and of what kind?
42. The former Energy Minister, Mr Harwin, also indicated that over 5,700 megawatts of renewable energy projects already had planning approval.
- (a) What is happening with each of those projects?
 - (b) Is there any intention to move to construction?
 - (c) How many renewable energy projects in total now have planning approval?
 - (d) Can you name them, their nameplate capacity, type of energy and dollar value?
 - (e) Which ones have firming or storage, how much and of what kind?

43. Again, referring to former Energy Minister Harwin’s evidence at last year’s Budget Estimates on 31 August, what has the NSW Government done over the last twelve months to ensure there is the transmission capacity to link these projects to the grid?

ANSWER:

40.

- (a) There were ten renewable energy projects under construction in August 2018, seven of these projects have been completed as of August 2019.

Details of these completed renewable energy projects are as follows:

Project	Capacity (MW)	Type	CAPEX (\$m)	Storage/Firming
Sapphire Wind Farm	270	Wind	588	None
Silverton 1 Wind Farm	200	Wind	500	None
Coleambally Solar Farm	150	Solar PV	210	None
Bodangora Wind Farm	120	Wind	200	None
Crookwell 2 Wind Farm	92	Wind	175	None
Manildra Solar Farm	50	Solar PV	150	None
White Rock Solar Farm	20	Solar PV	45	None

- (b) There are 15 renewable energy projects under construction as at August 2019 with details as follows:

Project	Capacity (MW)	Type	CAPEX (\$m)	Storage / Firming	Storage / Firming Size
Darlington Point Solar Farm	275	Solar PV	407	Battery	100 MWh
Limondale Sun Farm	250	Solar PV	150	No	
Bango Wind Farm	240	Wind	700	No	
Collector Wind Farm	189	Wind	350	No	
Finley Solar Farm	162	Solar PV	170	No	
Crudine Ridge Wind Farm	135	Wind	300	No	

Kyoto Energy Park	113	Hybrid	45	No	
Biala Wind Farm	109	Wind	192	No	
Nevertire Solar Farm	105	Solar PV	194	No	
Metz Solar Farm	100	Solar PV	130	No	
Bomen Solar Farm	100	Solar PV	150	Battery	40MWh
Goonumbla Solar Farm	70	Solar PV	130	Battery	24MWh
Riverina Solar Farm	30	Solar PV	62	No	
Summerhill Solar Farm	5	Solar PV	8	No	
Snowy 2.0 - Exploratory Works	2000	Pumped Hydro	325	Yes	TBC

41.

- (a) There were 19 renewable energy projects that were seeking planning approval in August 2018 that have since received planning approval:

	Type	Capacity (MW)	CAPEX (\$m)	Storage / Firming	Size (MWh)
Snowy 2.0 Stage 1 Exploratory Works	Hydro	2000	4500	Yes	
Yarrabee Solar Farm	Solar PV	900	1200	Battery	70MWh
Darlington Point Solar Farm	Solar PV	275	365	Battery	100MWh
Suntop Solar Farm	Solar PV	220	286	No	
Avonlie Solar Farm	Solar PV	200	250	Battery	10MWh
Sapphire Solar Farm	Solar PV	200	220	Battery	100MWh
Sebastopol Solar Farm	Solar PV	160	160	Battery	144MWh
Gunnedah Solar Farm	Solar PV	155	201	No	
Mulwala Solar Farm	Solar PV	140	130	Battery	40MWh
Bomen Solar Farm	Solar PV	120	150	Battery	40MWh
Orange Grove Solar Farm	Solar PV	110	30	No	

Narrabri South Solar Farm	Solar PV	60	90	No	
Vales Point Solar Farm	Solar PV	55	75	No	
Gregadoo Solar Farm	Solar PV	45	61.5	No	
Wagga Wagga Solar Farm (Terrain)	Solar PV	26	32	No	
Junee Solar Farm	Solar PV	26	29	No	
Kentucky Road solar farm	Solar PV	5	6	No	
Kanowna (Bullarah) Solar Farm	Solar PV	5	6	Battery	20MWh
Summerhill Solar Farm	Solar PV	5	8	No	

(b) This is a matter for the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.

(c) This is a matter for the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.

42.

(a) Of the projects that had received planning approval as at August 2018, a number are under construction, others are due to start construction soon, and others have withdrawn their consent.

(b) This is a matter for the proponents of each project.

(c) As at August 2019, there are 51 renewable energy projects in total that have currently received planning approval but have not commenced construction or operation.

(d) The details of the renewable energy projects that have received planning approval in NSW as at August 2019 are as follows:

Project	Type	Size (MW)	CAPEX (\$m)
Liverpool Range Wind Farm	Wind	960	653
Yarrabee Solar Farm	Solar PV	900	957
Rye Park Wind Farm	Wind	322	527
Coppabella Wind Farm	Wind	285	670
Bluescope Cogeneration Plant	Cogen	225	750
Sunraysia Solar Farm	Solar PV	200	275

Avonlie Solar Farm	Solar PV	200	250
Currawarra Solar Farm	Solar PV	195	294
Sapphire Solar Farm	Solar PV	180	220
Wellington Solar Farm	Solar PV	174	265
Suntop Solar Farm	Solar PV	170	262
Gunnedah Solar Farm	Solar PV	150	206
Capital 2 Wind Farm	Wind	144	180
Mulwala Solar Farm	Solar PV	140	130
Flyers Creek Wind Farm	Wind	160	200
White Rock 2 Wind Farm	Wind	171	350
Hay Sun Farm	Solar PV	110	126
Orange Grove Solar Farm	Solar PV	110	94
Sandigo Solar Farm	Solar PV	100	120
Hillston Sun Farm	Solar PV	85	150
Bogan River Solar Farm	Solar PV	100	300
Wyalong Solar Farm	Solar PV	100	130
Tarleigh Park Solar Farm	Solar PV	90	137
Glen Innes Wind Farm	Wind	90	200
Sebastopol Solar Farm	Solar PV	90	121
Goonumbla Solar Farm	Solar PV	70	130
Narrabri South Solar Farm	Solar PV	60	100
Vales Point Solar Farm	Solar PV	55	117
Capital Solar Farm	Solar PV	50	150
Jemalong Solar PV Farm	Solar PV	50	62.5
Gregadoo Solar Farm	Solar PV	47	62
Gilgandra Solar Farm	Solar PV	40	63

Terrain Bomen Solar Farm	Solar PV	30	29
Walgett Solar Farm	Solar PV	30	55
Conroy's Gap Wind Farm	Wind	30	50
Brocklehurst Solar Farm	Solar PV	29	18
Moama Solar Farm	Solar PV	28	29
Corowa Solar Farm	Solar PV	27	29
Gunnedah Solar Farm	Solar PV	27	18
Leeton Solar Farm	Solar PV	26	24
Junee Solar Farm	Solar PV	26	29
Molong Solar Farm	Solar PV	25	29
Wagga Wagga Solar Farm (Southern Cross)	Solar PV	22	18
Gidginbung Solar Farm	Solar PV	25	28
Taminda Solar Farm	Solar PV	9	8
UNE Solar Farm	Solar PV	8.4	14.2
Kentucky Road solar farm	Solar PV	5	6
Kanowna (Bullarah) Solar Farm	Solar PV	5	6
Moorambilla Solar Farm	Solar PV	5	8
Cessnock Solar Farm	Solar PV	5	10
Lang's Crossing Solar Farm	Solar PV	5	7.5
Total		6190	8667

(e) Of the renewable energy projects that currently have planning approval as at August 2019, the following projects have firming or storage:

Project	Firming / Storage	Size
Yarrabee Solar Farm	Battery	70MWh
Bluescope Cogeneration Plant	Firming	225MW

Avonlie Solar Farm	Battery	10MWh
Currawarra Solar Farm	Battery	44MWh
Sapphire Solar Farm	Battery	100MWh
Wellington Solar Farm	Battery	100MWh
Mulwala Solar Farm	Battery	40MWh
Hay Sun Farm	Battery	29MWh
Sandigo Solar Farm	Battery	40MWh
Wyalong Solar Farm	Battery	50MWh
Tarleigh Park Solar Farm	Battery	16MWh
Sebastopol Solar Farm	Battery	144MWh
Goonumbla Solar Farm	Battery	24MWh
Kanowna (Bullarah) Solar Farm	Battery	20MWh

43. The NSW Transmission Infrastructure Strategy outlines how the NSW Government will support private-sector led investment in transmission and generation. The NSW Transmission Infrastructure Strategy can be found online here:
<https://energy.nsw.gov.au/media/1431/download>.

Going It Alone

- 44. In your CEDA speech in June you indicated that the NSW Government’s policy remains the National Energy Guarantee? If that is correct, what steps are you now taking to implement this policy?
- 45. You have indicated that the NSW Government is prepared to ‘go it alone’ on energy policy, if necessary. At what point would it be necessary? What circumstances?
- 46. Are we not at that point now, given the inability or unwillingness of the Commonwealth Government to develop a coherent energy policy?

ANSWER Q44 - 46:
 The NSW Government continues to support a responsible framework that integrates energy and climate policy and provide certainty to the market. NSW continues to work closely with Energy

Council Ministers from other jurisdictions and the Energy Security Board to develop national energy policy that delivers these outcomes.

Chief Scientist's recommendations on CSG

Questions to Minister Kean

47. Where is the regulatory framework proposed by the Chief Scientist in recommendation 4, to ensure the regulation of the CSG industry is at no cost to NSW taxpayers?
- (a) When was this recommendation implemented?
 - (b) What was the cost of implementing recommendation 4?
 - (c) If this recommendation has been implemented, where in the Budget Papers is the *'annual statement'* provided for in recommendation 4?
48. When and in what form was recommendation 6 carried out?
- (a) What was the cost of implementing recommendation 6?
49. When and in what form was recommendation 7 carried out?
- (a) What was the cost of implementing recommendation 7?
50. When and in what way did the NSW Government carry out the *'target and outcomes focused regulatory system'* with the three key elements outlined in recommendation 8?
- (a) What was the cost of implementing recommendation 8?
51. When did the NSW Government implement recommendation 9 of the Chief Scientist, for a robust and comprehensive policy of appropriate insurance for the CSG industry?
- (a) Where can the documentation for the implementation of recommendation 9 be read?
 - (b) What are the terms of the relevant insurance policy or policies?
 - (c) Are these underwritten by the private insurance market or by government?
 - (d) How many policies of insurance are now in place?
 - (e) What are the premiums that are being charged?
 - (f) When was the scheme of security deposits contained in recommendation 9 implemented?
 - (g) What are the terms of the scheme of security deposits?
 - (h) When was the rehabilitation fund contained in recommendation 9 implemented?
 - (i) What are the terms of the rehabilitation fund?

- (j) What has been the cost to date of implementing recommendation 9? Please answer by referring to each separate part of recommendation 9.
 - (k) If recommendation 9 has not been implemented, when will it be delivered?
52. Where is the Whole-of-Environment Data Repository with each of the features recommended by the Chief Scientist in recommendation 10?
- (a) When was recommendation 10 fully implemented?
 - (b) What has been the cost of implementing recommendation 10 to date?
53. Where is the centralised Risk Management and Prediction Tool for all extractive industries in NSW, with the risk register, database of event histories and the archive of Trigger Action Response Plans recommended by the Chief Scientist in recommendation 11?
- (a) When was recommendation 11 fully implemented?
 - (b) What has been the cost of implementing recommendation 11 to date?
54. When was the expert advisory body on CSG established, as recommended by the Chief Scientist in recommendation 12?
- (a) Who is on the advisory body?
 - (b) When were they appointed?
 - (c) What is the term of office?
 - (d) How were the persons on the body selected?
 - (e) What was the selection criteria?
 - (f) Where and when were the positions advertised?
 - (g) Are those serving on the advisory body remunerated? If so, how much?
 - (h) What work has the advisory body done to date?
 - (i) Where can that work be reviewed?
 - (j) Where are the Annual Statements of the advisory body, as included in recommendation 12?
55. When was the formal mechanism (consisting of five parallel, interacting steps and contained in recommendation 13) implemented?
- (a) Where can the documentation be seen?
 - (b) What has been the cost to date of implementing recommendation 13?

56. When was the mandatory training and certification requirements, contained in recommendation 14, implemented?
- (a) Where can the mandatory training and certification requirements contained in recommendation 14 be read?
 - (b) Are these requirements legislative? What legislation are they made under? If they are not legislative, in what way has the government made them mandatory?
57. When was the plan to manage legacy matters associated with CSG, contained in recommendation 15, implemented?
- (a) Where can this legacy plan be read?
 - (b) What has been the cost to date of developing and implementing this legacy plan?
58. If any of the recommendations of the Chief Scientist on CS have not been implemented, when will they be delivered? Please provide timeframes for each recommendation.

ANSWER:

47. This work is being led by the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment with input from the relevant agencies. It is expected a final implementation report will be delivered this financial year.
48. This is a matter for the Deputy Premier, and Minister for Regional New South Wales, Industry and Trade.
49. The response to recommendation seven is complete. The EPA commenced as lead regulator for compliance and enforcement of all conditions relating to gas (with exception of work health and safety) on 1 July 2015.
- (a) These costs are being examined as part of recommendation four.
50. This is a matter for the Deputy Premier, and Minister for Regional New South Wales, Industry and Trade.
51. The NSW Environment Protection Authority is leading work to ensure a comprehensive system to provide financial protections to cover potential coal seam gas related environmental risk is in place.
52. In 2017, the Government developed a portal for Sharing and Enabling Environmental Data (SEED) as a central location to find data about the environment. SEED contains publicly accessible land, air and water data from NSW Government agencies, and will grow over time

as more and different types of environmental data are added. SEED can be found online here:

<https://www.seed.nsw.gov.au/>

53. There are a number of Risk Management and Prediction Tools being used by agencies in NSW to assess proposals, analyse risk and inform compliance activities. These include risk-based codes of practice, risk-based licencing and planning assessment processes which require applicants to prepare Trigger Action Responses.
54. This is a matter for the Deputy Premier, and Minister for Regional New South Wales, Industry and Trade.
55. This is a matter for the Minister for Water, Property and Housing
56. This is a matter for the Deputy Premier, and Minister for Regional New South Wales, Industry and Trade.
57. This is a matter for the Deputy Premier, and Minister for Regional New South Wales, Industry and Trade.
58. A final implementation report is expected to be delivered this financial year.

Energy switch and rebates

59. How many people have taken up the Self-funded retiree rebate since it became available on July 1?
60. What is the Government's target take-up by the end of the year and are you on track?
61. How much money has the Government spent on promoting the self-funded retiree energy rebate?
62. With reports that some households will see average increases in electricity prices of \$320 for households and \$920 for small businesses in the next year, will the self-funded retiree rebate really help?
63. How did the Government arrive at the subsidy amount?
64. How many people have used the online "one click energy switch?"
65. How many users have switched to lower cost energy plans after using the service?
66. What is the total cost to the Government of managing the "one click energy switch?"
67. Given the Premier herself has said she is "too busy" to sign up for the Energy Switch program, how does the Minister expect working households to do so?

ANSWER:

59. As at 19 September 2019, Service NSW has received 4,528 applications for the self-funded retiree rebate, which is branded as the Seniors Energy Rebate.
60. All individuals who meet the following eligibility criteria can apply for the rebate::
- You are an independent retiree and NSW resident,
 - You have a valid Commonwealth Seniors Health Card, and;
 - You are the account holder, or one of the account holders, named on the electricity bill.
61. To date, Government has spent \$280.57 for Search Engine Marketing for the Seniors Energy Rebate. Additional promotion will commence in November 2019.
62. Unlike the Labor Party the Liberals and Nationals are focused on easing the cost-of-living pressures faced by venerable individuals and households across the state. Of course the NSW Government believes the new Seniors Energy Rebate of \$200 will help make energy more affordable for eligible households. Further, the premise of the question is wrong as the Australian Energy Market Commission's most recent Electricity Price Trends report estimates that electricity prices will fall in New South Wales over the next two years.
63. The NSW Government has reduced the cost of living and cut taxes by hundreds of millions of dollars in the past year through popular programs such as Active and Creative Kids, CTP savings, energy rebates, the Baby Bundle, Stamp Duty concessions, Caravan Registration rebate, Payroll Tax cuts and the Opal Fare cap. The Seniors Energy Rebate works in conjunction with these other cost of living measures.
64. As at 19 September 2019, over 78,228 electricity bill and 10,214 gas bill comparisons have been made for individuals.
65. As at 19 September 2019, over 10,506 customers initiated a change in electricity providers, saving customers \$4.64 million. More than 1,205 households initiated a change in gas providers, saving customers more than \$171,000.
66. This is a matter for the Minister for Customer Service.
67. I refer to my responses to questions 64 and 65.

Self-funded retiree energy rebate

68. Has the Minister been involved in the design and implementation of the self-funded retiree energy rebate?
69. How many people have taken up the Self-funded retiree rebate since it became available on July 1?
70. What is the Government's target take-up by the end of the year and are you on track?
71. How much money has the Government spent on promoting the self-funded retiree energy rebate?
72. With reports that some households will see average increases in electricity prices of \$320 for households and \$920 for small businesses in the next year, will the self-funded retiree rebate really help?

ANSWER:

68. I have been regularly briefed on the design and implementation of the rebate.
69. I refer to my response to question 59.
70. I refer to my response to question 60.
71. I refer to my response to question 61.
72. I refer to my response to question 62.

Ministerial Travel/Meal Allowance

73. How many nights travel were claimed by the Minister during the 2018-19 period?
74. How many nights travel were claimed by the Minister's spouse during the 2018-19 period?
75. What was the total amount of travel allowances claimed by the Minister and their spouse (if applicable) during 2018-19?
76. What is the total amount of meal allowances claimed by the Minister and their spouse (if applicable) during 2018-19?

ANSWER Q73 -76:

In 2018-19, total expenditure by the Ministry on domestic travel was \$1,093,735.

Efficiency dividends

77. What was the forecast efficiency dividend saving for each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio in 2018-19?
78. What is the forecast efficiency dividend saving for each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio in
- (a) 2019-20?
 - (b) 2020-21?
 - (c) 2021-22?
79. What was the total efficiency dividend that was achieved for each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio between 2011-12 and 2018-19 inclusively?

ANSWER Q77 - 79:

Savings from the NSW Government's efficiency dividend are outlined in the Budget Papers.

Ministerial Office Administration

80. How many staff are in your ministerial office?
- (a) What was the average salary for staff members in your office during 2018-19?
 - (b) What is the estimated average salary for a ministerial staffer in your office in 2019-20 based on current appointments?
81. How many iPhone/smart phones are assigned to your staff?
- (a) For each phone, how much was each bill in 2018-19?
 - (b) How many phones have been lost or replaced due to damage in your office?
 - (c) What is the cost of replacing those phones?
82. How many iPads or tablets has DPC assigned to your Ministerial office and to whom have they been issued?
- (a) What was the cost of providing iPads or tablets to your Ministerial Office in 2018-19?
 - (b) How many iPads or tablets have been replaced due to lost or damage in 2018-19?
 - (c) What was the cost of replacing these devices?
83. Has any artwork been purchased or leased for display in your ministerial office in 2018-19?
- (a) What is the cost of this?

84. Have any floral displays or indoor plants or pot plants been hired or leased for display in your ministerial office in 2018-19?
- (a) If so, what was the cost of these items?
85. Have any floral displays or indoor plants or pot plants been purchased for display in your ministerial office in 2018-19?
- (a) If so, what was the cost of these items?
86. What was the total cost of all subscriptions by you and your staff to news services, newspapers, magazines, journals and periodicals (including online services) in 2018-19?
- (a) What are these services/newspapers/magazines/journals/periodicals?
- (b) Who is the subscriber for each of these?
87. What was the total value of all gifts purchased for use by you and your office in 2018-19?
- (a) What were the gifts purchased?
- (b) Who were they gifted to?
88. Do you purchase bottled water or provide water coolers for your office?
- (a) What is the monthly cost of this?
89. How much did your ministerial office spend on hospitality, including catering and beverages, in 2018-19?
90. What non-standard features are fitted to your ministerial vehicle?
- (a) What is the cost of each non-standard feature?
91. What was the total bill for your office in 2018-19 for:
- (a) Taxi hire
- (b) Limousine hire
- (c) Private hire care
- (d) Hire car rental
- (e) Ridesharing services?
92. Were any planes or helicopters chartered by you or your office and paid for with public money in 2018-19?
- (a) If yes, will you please detail each trip, the method of transport and the cost?

93. Have you had media training or speech training?
- (a) If yes, who paid for it?
- (b) If paid by taxpayers, what was the amount paid in 2018-19?

ANSWER:

80. Ministers' Office staff numbers and salary bands are available on the DPC website. Refer to: www.dpc.nsw.gov.au/publications/premiers-and-ministers-staff-numbers/
81. There were 261 smartphones and other mobile devices allocated across the Ministers' IT Network in 2018-2019. The total usage cost of these smart phones and other mobile devices (including iPads) was \$334,630, compared to 2009-10 expenditure of \$434,854 under Labor.
- There were 6 devices lost/stolen across the Ministerial Offices during 2018-2019. The cost of replacing any lost or stolen devices is claimed through the NSW Treasury Managed Fund. Repairs are funded by the Department of Premier and Cabinet, Corporate and Ministerial Services.
82. There were 111 iPads allocated across the Ministers' IT Network in 2018-2019. The cost of replacing any lost or stolen devices is claimed through the NSW Treasury Managed Fund. Repairs are funded by the Department of Premier and Cabinet, Corporate and Ministerial Services.
83. Artwork in Ministers' Offices includes art donated or provided at no cost.
84. Floral arrangements purchased by the Ministry are managed within Ministerial office budgets.
85. Floral arrangements purchased by the Ministry are managed within Ministerial office budgets.
86. Ministers' offices subscribe to a modest number of publications, which are managed within Ministerial office budgets.
87. Gifts are presented to dignitaries during overseas missions and to dignitaries visiting NSW in accordance with established protocol.
88. The Ministry spent \$466 on filtered water for their offices in 2018-19.
89. Expenditure on hospitality across the Ministry totalled \$27,782 in 2018-19, which includes catering for stakeholder meetings and courtesy calls with visiting dignitaries.

90. Ministers, the Leader of the Opposition, other nominated public office holders and certain former office holders are provided with official cars and drivers. During 2018-19, all costs associated with these vehicles were paid from the relevant Ministerial office budget.
91. Expenditure on taxis, hire cars and ride share services in 2018-19 across the Ministry was \$119,179, compared to 2009-10 expenditure of \$175,776 under Labor.
92. Expenditure on charter flights for the Ministry totalled \$83,845 in 2018-19, compared to 2009-10 expenditure of \$281,567 under Labor.
93. No.

Agile Workspaces/Activity Based Working/Hot-desking

94. Have any of your departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies adopted agile working environment/activity based working practices e.g. hot-desking?
- (a) If not, are there plans to introduce activity based working practices in 2019-20?
95. How much have your departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies spent in the roll-out of the agile working environment including laptops, furniture, lockers and other equipment in 2018-19?

ANSWER Q94 - 95:

Accommodation planning for the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment agencies is undertaken in accordance with the Government's accommodation strategy and design guidelines. Agile working environments are being rolled out as appropriate.

Hospitality

96. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:
- (a) How much was spent on hospitality, including catering and beverages, in 2018-19?
- (b) Whether the department, statutory agency and/or other body has coffee machines? And if so:
- i. How many?
 - ii. What was their purchase cost?
 - iii. What is their maintenance cost?
 - iv. Who has access to them?

v. Which staff have access to the machines?

ANSWER:

96. Expenditure on hospitality is limited to official work related purposes with any related staff benefits subject to Fringe Benefits Tax provisions.

The provision and acceptance of gifts, benefits and hospitality is subject to specific policies and agency Codes of Conduct and is strictly monitored.

Labour Hire Firms

97. Do any departments, statutory agency and/or other bodies within your portfolio responsibilities utilise the services of Labour Hire Firms? If yes, please advise in table form for 2018-19:

- (a) The names of the firms utilised
- (b) The total amount paid to each firm engaged
- (c) The average tenure period for an employee provided by a labour hire company
- (d) The longest tenure for an employee provided by a labour hire company
- (e) The duties conducted by employees engaged through a labour hire company
- (f) The office locations of employees engaged through a labour hire company
- (g) The highest hourly or daily rate paid to an employee provided by a labour hire company
- (h) Who authorised the use of labour hire companies?
- (i) Do staff under these labour hire arrangements receive as much training and security clearance as permanent staff?

ANSWER:

97. The Department of Planning, Industry and Environment uses Labour Hire firms, in accordance with NSW Public Service policies to cover temporary vacancies as required. The Department of Planning, Industry and Environment uses Contractor Central who maintains these records.

Stationery

98. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

- (a) What was the cost of stationery for the following financial years:

- i. 2015-16
- ii. 2016-17
- iii. 2017-18
- iv. 2018-2019
- v. 2019-present

(b) What brand of paper is used?

- i. Is this paper Australian made?

ANSWER:

98. Stationery purchases by the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment agencies are made in accordance with the applicable policies and procedures on procurement.

Credit Cards

99. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

(a) How many credit cards are currently on issue for staff?

- i. Please provide a break-down of this information by grade.

(b) What was the value of the largest reported purchase on a credit card for the following financial years:

- i. 2015-16
- ii. 2016-17
- iii. 2017-18
- iv. 2018-2019
- v. 2019-present

(c) What was each largest reported purchase for?

(d) How much interest was paid on amounts outstanding from credit cards for the following financial years:

- i. 2015-16
- ii. 2016-17

- iii. 2017-18
 - iv. 2018-2019
 - v. 2019-present
- (e) How much was paid in late fees on amounts outstanding from credit cards for the following financial years
 - i. 2015-16
 - ii. 2016-17
 - iii. 2017-18
 - iv. 2018-2019
 - v. 2019-present
- (f) What was the largest amount outstanding on a single card at the end of a payment period and what was the card holder's employment grade?
- (g) How many credit cards have been reported lost or stolen?
 - i. What was the cost to replace them?
- (h) How many credit card purchases were deemed to be illegitimate or contrary to agency policy?
 - i. What was the total value of those purchases?
 - ii. How many purchases were asked to be repaid on the basis that they were illegitimate or contrary to agency policy and what was the total value thereof?
 - iii. Were all those amounts actually repaid?
 - iv. If no, how many were not repaid, and what was the total value thereof?
- (i) What was the largest purchase that was deemed illegitimate or contrary to agency policy and asked to be repaid, and what was the cardholder's employment grade?
 - i. What that amount actually repaid, in full?
 - ii. What amount was left unpaid?
- (j) Are any credit cards currently on issue connected to rewards schemes?
 - i. Do staff receive any personal benefit as a result of those reward schemes?
- (k) Can a copy of the staff credit card policy please be provided?

ANSWER:

99. The NSW Government has implemented a PCard program to realise a number of benefits including savings from the use of cards over traditional high cost procure-to-pay processes and the enhanced capability to track and monitor expenditure.

Cards are issued to staff according to business need and are managed in accordance with Treasury Policy TPP 17-09 Use and Management of NSW Government Purchasing Cards.

Staff are prohibited from using official PCards for personal or other unofficial purposes and cards are not connected to reward schemes or any other program that would provide a personal benefit to the cardholder.

All NSW Government card balances are paid within bank payments terms and therefore no late fees or interest charges are incurred.

Media and Public Relations

100. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

- (a) How many media/communications/public relations advisers are employed?
 - i. What is the total salary cost for media/communications/public relations advisers in 2018-19?
- (b) What is the forecast for the current financial year for the number of media/communications/public relations advisers to be employed and their total cost?
- (c) What is the total cost of media monitoring services?
 - i. Please provide a breakdown by department, statutory agency and/or other body.
- (d) Are any media or public relations advisers currently engaged as contractors?
 - i. Who are these contracts with?
 - ii. What is the value of these contracts?
- (e) How much was spent on media or public relations advisors in financial year:
 - i. 2015-16
 - ii. 2016-17
 - iii. 2017-18

iv. 2018-2019

v. 2019-present?

ANSWER:

100. Staff numbers are included in relevant annual reports. Department of Planning, Industry and Environment staff numbers undertaking media or public relations activities are commensurate with need and can go down or up as required.

The Financial Statements, including legal, consulting and any other general costs from third party service providers, are available in annual reports. These are available in accordance with NSW Government Procurement Policy.

Facebook

101. How much did your ministerial office spend on Facebook advertising or sponsored posts in 2018-19?

102. How much did your department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio spend on Facebook advertising or sponsored posts in 2018-19?

ANSWER:

101. My office has not spent taxpayer money has been spent on Facebook advertising or sponsored posts.

102. Where appropriate, social media is used by agencies alongside other forms of advertising as a cost effective medium of communication.

Overseas Trips

103. Were any of your overseas trips in the last financial year paid for in part or in full by using public money?

(a) If so, did any of your relatives or friends accompany you on these trips?

(b) Have you undertaken any official overseas travel that was privately funded?

(c) If so, what was the nature of these trips?

(d) Who paid for these trips?

ANSWER:

103. No.

Department/Agency Travel

104. What was the total expenditure in 2018-19 by departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies within your portfolio on:

- (a) Taxi hire
- (b) Limousine
- (c) Private car hire
- (d) Hire car rental
- (e) Ridesharing services
- (f) Chartered flights?

ANSWER:

104. Agency travel was conducted in accordance with relevant NSW Government policies and guidelines including Treasury Circular TC18-15 and ATO determinations.

Drivers

105. Are any of the senior executives in the relevant department, statutory agency and/or other body provided drivers?

- (a) If so, can you please specify which positions are provided drivers?
- (b) In total, how many drivers are used by senior executives in the department, statutory agency and/or other body?
- (c) What is the total cost of drivers for senior executives in the department, statutory agency and/or other body?

ANSWER:

105. No senior executives in the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment are provided drivers.

Consulting

106. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

- (a) How much was spent in legal costs in 2018-19?

- i. For what specific purposes or matters was legal advice sought?
- (b) Have departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies under your portfolio engaged any consultants to provide the following services or advice in 2018-19:
 - i. Social media
 - ii. Photography
 - iii. Acting training
 - iv. Ergonomics
- (c) What was the cost of these services?
 - i. Social media
 - ii. Photography
 - iii. Acting training
 - iv. Ergonomics

ANSWER:

106. The Financial Statements, including legal, consulting and any other general costs from third party service providers, are available in agency annual reports.

Web Content

107. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:
- (a) What were the top 20 most utilised (by data sent and received) unique domain names accessed this year?
 - (b) What were the top 20 most accessed (by number of times accessed) unique domain names accessed this year?

ANSWER:

107.

- (a) Data sent and received is not tracked as a website metric as this does not provide customer benefit.
- (b) As the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment is a new entity, data has been retrieved from several agencies/departments. However, as some areas are

transitioning into the department and reporting varies, this may impact data availability and quality. However, based on available advice, the top 20 access websites may include:

- nationaparks.nsw.gov.au
- planningportal.nsw.gov.au
- enviornment.nsw.gov.au
- planning.nsw.gov.au
- dpi.nsw.gov.au
- epa.nsw.gov.au
- industry.nsw.gov.au
- rbgsyd.nsw.gov.au
- foodauthority.nsw.gov.au
- darlingharbour.com
- sydneyolympicpark.com.au
- energysaver.nsw.gov.au
- therocks.com
- olg.nsw.gov.au
- petregistry.nsw.gov.au
- liquorandgaming.nsw.gov.au
- centennialparklands.com.au
- forestrycorporation.com.au
- aquaticcentre.com.au
- wildaboutwhales.com.au

Department/Agency Staffing

108. How many redundancies were processed by departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies within your portfolio responsibilities during 2018-19?

(a) Of these redundancies, how many were:

- i. Voluntary?
- ii. Involuntary?

109. What was the total cost of all redundancies?
110. Have any staff who received a redundancy in the last two years undertaken any paid work or provided any paid services for the department, statutory agency and/or other body with which they were formerly employed?
- (a) What was the nature of these works/services?
 - (b) What was the total cost of these works or services?
111. Are any staff formerly employed by your ministerial office now employed by departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies under your portfolio responsibility?
112. How many staff were dismissed from departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies under your portfolio responsibilities in 2018-19?
- (a) What were the reason/s for each dismissal?
113. How much was spent advertising for recruitment for the following financial years:
- (a) 2015-16
 - (b) 2016-17
 - (c) 2017-18
 - (d) 2018-2019
 - (e) 2019-present?

ANSWER Q108 – 112:

Voluntary redundancies are a component for agencies to achieve their efficiency dividends. Redundancy figures can be found in the Annual Report. The Labour Expense Cap introduced in the 2012-13 Budget also continues to give Secretaries as much flexibility as possible to achieve these savings in the most appropriate ways to meet the service requirements of their agencies. Frontline staff such as, nurses, police officers and school teachers and regional employees have been quarantined from this measure.

ANSWER Q113

Advertising expenses can be found in relevant Annual Report.

Smart Phone

114. How many mobile phones are given to staff or board members?
- (a) How many new mobile phones were purchased in the last year?
115. What is the total cost of these phones for the following financial years:
- (a) 2015-16
 - (b) 2016-17
 - (c) 2017-18
 - (d) 2018-2019
 - (e) 2019-present?
116. How many had to be replaced due to damage?
117. How many were reported as lost?
118. How many tablets are given to staff or board members?
- (a) How many new tablets in the last year?
119. What is the total cost of these tablets for the following financial years?
- (a) 2015-16
 - (b) 2016-17
 - (c) 2017-18
 - (d) 2018-2019?
120. How many phones and tablets had to be replaced due to damage?
121. How many were reported as lost?
122. How many people have both a smart phone and a tablet?
- (a) What is the lowest ranked official who has both a work smart phone and tablet?
123. How many staff or board members overspent on their phone or tablet data bill?
- (a) By how much?
 - (b) What was the average cost of data bills for tablets and mobile phones?
 - (c) What was the highest monthly cost?

124. Do the departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies within your portfolio have an iTunes account?
- (a) What was the total expenditure in 2018-19 on iTunes?
 - (b) What applications/subscriptions/services were purchased through iTunes?
125. Do the departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies within your portfolio have a Google Play Store account?
- (a) What was the total expenditure in 2018-19 on through the Google Play Store?
 - (b) What applications/subscriptions/services were purchased through the Google Play Store?

ANSWER Q114 - 125:

IT costs are managed within each agency's budget and in accordance with NSW Government's ICT and procurement policies and frameworks.

Merchant fees

126. Please provide a list of all transactions where customers need to pay a merchant fee on credit and/or debit card payments to a department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio.
127. Please provide the percentage and/or amount of the merchant fees applied to all credit and/or debit card payments/transactions to a department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio.
128. What was the total amount paid in merchant fees on credit and/or debit card payments to departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies within your portfolio in 2018-19?

ANSWER Q126 - 128:

All NSW Government agencies are required to impose surcharges to recoup their merchant interchange fees, pursuant to Treasury Circular TC12/13.

Advertising and Sponsorships

129. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:
- (a) How much was spent on advertising in the following financial years:
 - i. 2015-16
 - ii. 2016-17

iii. 2017-18

iv. 2018-2019?

130. Has your department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio engaged in any corporate sponsorships?

(a) Who were these sponsorships with?

(b) What was the purpose of these sponsorships?

(c) What was the value of these sponsorships, by case and year?

(d) What was the value of these sponsorships in the following financial years:

i. 2015-16

ii. 2016-17

iii. 2017-18

iv. 2018-19?

ANSWER Q129 - 130:

The Financial Statements, including advertising and sponsorship costs, are available in agency annual reports. The NSW Government may use advertising to inform the public of their rights, obligations and entitlements as well as to explain government policies, programs, services and initiatives.

Government advertising is conducted within guidelines outlined in the NSW Government Advertising Handbook. Any sponsorship arrangements are conducted within ICAC principles.

Probity Auditor

131. Has your office or department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio used a Probity Auditor or Probity Advisors, or similar, in the past five years? If so please list the company and/or individual, the project, the engagement dates, and their total remuneration in tabular format.

ANSWER:

131. In accordance with the NSW Procurement Board's Direction (PBD-2013-05), the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment has internal mechanisms in place to ensure that probity considerations are routinely taken into account in its procurement decisions, and the use of external probity advisers and auditors is the exception rather than the rule.

Consultancies including those involving probity advisors valued more than \$50,000 are reported in relevant annual reports.

Energy

132. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio by name, how much electricity did it consume for each of:
- (a) 2014-15?
 - (b) 2015-16?
 - (c) 2016-17?
 - (d) 2017-18?
 - (e) 2018/19?
133. What proportion of the electricity consumed by each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio by name for those years came from renewable sources? Please name each source of energy (coal, solar, wind, etc.) and the proportion of the total electricity used.
134. How much money was spent on electricity for each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio by name in each of the above financial years?
135. What was the name of the energy supplier to each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio by name for those financial years?
136. How much electricity is it estimated that each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio will consume in:
- (a) 2019-20?
 - (b) 2020-21?
 - (c) 2021-22?
137. What proportion of that electricity is it estimated will come from renewable sources, for each year?
138. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio by name, please provide the estimated proportion of energy to be used from each kind of energy (coal, gas, solar, wind etc.)?
139. What is the name of the energy supplier to each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio for each of:

- (a) 2019-20?
- (b) 2020-21?
- (c) 2021-22?

ANSWER Q132 - 139:

Energy purchases by the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment are made in accordance with the applicable policies and procedures on procurement under whole of government Contracts 776 (small sites under 100,000 kwh per annum) and 777.

Under these contracts the following suppliers are mandated:

- 776 – Origin Energy Electricity Limited
- 777 – ERM Power Retail Pty Ltd

The NSW Government Resource Efficiency Policy was introduced in 2014 to reduce the NSW Government’s operating costs and lead by example in increasing the efficiency of the resources it uses.

NSW Government agencies are required to report on energy use under the Government Resource Efficiency Policy. The Department of Planning, Industry and Environment publishes progress reports on compliance with the policy.

General Costs

140. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister’s portfolio please report:

- (a) Any gardening services used for indoor or outdoor pot plants/flowers maintenance?
 - i. Who are the contracts with?
 - ii. How much does each contract cost?
 - iii. How often do they visit?
 - iv. How much was spent on this service in financial year:

- 2015-16
 - 2016-17
 - 2017-18
 - 2018-19?
- (b) Any floral displays or indoor plants or pot plants hired or leased for display in any offices?
- i. Who were the contracts with?
 - ii. How much was each contract cost?
 - iii. How much was spent on this service in financial year:
 - 2015-16
 - 2016-17
 - 2017-18
 - 2018-19?

ANSWER:

140. The Financial Statements, including expenditure on any general costs, are available in an agency's annual report. Plant and related purchases by the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment are made in accordance with the applicable policies and procedures on procurement.

Domestic Violence Leave Policies, Awareness and Usage

141. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:
- (a) A copy of the entity's policy or web link to the entity's domestic violence leave policy;
 - (b) Date of introduction of domestic violence leave into enterprise agreements/contracts of employment, awards as applicable;
 - (c) Whether or not all employees and/or contractors are eligible for domestic violence leave;
 - (d) Number of days of domestic violence leave that have been taken in each financial year since the introduction of such leave;
 - (e) Number of days available for eligible staff to access domestic violence leave in each financial year;

- (f) Number of other personal days of leave that have been taken in each financial year since the introduction of domestic violence leave;
- (g) Number of sick days available for eligible staff to access domestic violence leave in each financial year;
- (h) Whether or not all staff and/or contractors have access to Employee Assistance Programs?
- (i) What training has been undertaken with management and administration for those involved in approving and/or processing domestic violence leave on issues such as?
 - i. Privacy and confidentiality of information about domestic violence
 - ii. Access to emotional, psychological, financial and medical support which may be required

142. Who has provided training on domestic violence in the workplace?

143. What percentage of staff in each agency has undertaken domestic violence training?

144. What efforts have been made to ensure that perpetrators (or their accomplices) within the staffing profile are not able to access personal information of victims in order to identify their location, or other information which may assist in committing domestic violence against them, including changing or accessing records in such a way as to disadvantage them financially or legally?

ANSWER:

141.

- (a) Section 6.18 of the Public Service Industrial Relations Guide provides guidance to staff and management on appropriate strategies for supporting a staff member experiencing domestic violence. This guidance further references Section 84A of the Award (leave for matters arising from domestic violence) and Treasury Circular 19-08 Domestic and Family Violence Workplace Support Policy – Guiding Principles for Agencies. The Department’s Leave Management Policy is available on its Intranet.
- (b) 2009 and amended in 2012 with a new clause Section 84A.
- (c) Domestic Violence leave is covered in the Crown Employees (PS Conditions of Employment) Award which applies across the sector for all employees. Contractors are not eligible for Domestic Violence leave.

- (d) From 1 January 2019, a separate leave type of Domestic & Family Violence Leave was made available as a separate leave type. In 2018-19, there were no reported leave days of this type taken.
- (e) – (g): In accordance with the Award, NSW Government Sector employees are entitled to ten days paid domestic and family violence leave per calendar year. This leave is non-cumulative and can be taken in part-days, single days, or consecutive days. Staff may also utilise all available Family and Community Service Leave, Sick Leave and Carer’s Leave to assist with managing domestic violence circumstances. If this leave is unavailable special leave maybe granted up to five days per calendar year. Data is not available for days of domestic violence leave or days of other personal leave taken, as these are not separately noted when special leave is processed as a single leave category.
- (h) All staff and their immediate family members have access to EAP. Contractors should in the first instance utilise the EAP service provided by their primary employer, if this is not available the DPIE service is made available to them.
- (i) There is currently no cluster wide training targeting domestic violence as the topic. Privacy and Personal Information Protection online training covers privacy.

The Department is currently considering a variety of options with regard to supporting people affected by or managing people affected by domestic violence. Staff may contact Human Resources for support and seek flexible work arrangements. As contractors are not employed by DPIE, where requiring support, DPIE will work with the contractor’s agency to facilitate access to appropriate services to provide the best possible outcome for contractors wellbeing.

- 142. There is currently no cluster wide training targeting domestic violence as the topic. Privacy and Personal Information Protection online training covers privacy. The Department is currently considering a variety of options with regard to supporting people affected by or managing people affected by domestic violence.
- 143. E-learning is made available, however, this is voluntary and the system does not hold nor provide data or statistics on attendance.
- 144. The Department complies with the highest levels of document and privacy management consistent with the *Privacy and Personal Information Act 1998 (NSW)*.

Sexual harassment and Anti-bullying training and awareness programs

145. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

- (a) Date of introduction of sexual harassment and anti-bullying training and awareness programs and a copy of such documentation.
 - i. Whether or not all employees and/or contractors have received such training?
 - ii. Is this course mandatory for all employees/ contractors?
 - iii. How long for each session, how many sessions?
 - iv. Who delivers it?
 - v. Is the program tailored to take into consideration specific needs of LGBTQIA, ATSI and CALD or other at risk groups?
 - How?
- (b) What percentage of staff in each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio have undertaken sexual harassment and anti-bullying training and awareness programs?
- (c) How many complaints have been initiated in relation to:
 - i. Sexual harassment
 - ii. Bullying
 - iii. Workplace violence

ANSWER:

145.

- (a) The Department of Planning, Industry and Environment includes anti-bullying and harassment training as part of the induction process for new staff. The training is interactive, comprising of videos and knowledge quizzes that must be passed with 100 per cent accuracy and takes 30 minutes to complete.
- (b) The Department of Planning, Industry and Environment includes anti-bullying and harassment training as part of the induction process for new staff. The training is interactive, comprising of videos and knowledge quizzes that must be passed with 100 per cent accuracy and takes 30 minutes to complete.

- (c) Complaints of this nature are addressed through the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment's relevant policies and procedures. Not all complaints are raised as a formal complaint and may be addressed informally and directly between the individuals concerned.

Participation of women in Government

146. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

- (a) What number and percentage of women are employed within the department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio?
- (b) What number and percentage of women are employed within the management levels of the department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio?
- (c) What number and percentage of women are employed in the top ten leadership positions of the department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio?
- (d) What strategies does the department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio use to encourage women in to management and leadership positions?
- (e) What is the gender pay gap within your department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio?
- (f) Does the department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio report participation of women figures to Women NSW on a regular basis?

ANSWER:

146.

- (a) – (c): This information is available in each agency's Annual Report.
- (d) All agencies use gender balance on interview panels as well as offering flexible working arrangements to allow better management of work and home commitments. Agencies continue to promote diversity and inclusion strategies which promote a workplace free from social biases of any kind.
- (e) All equivalent positions determined by an objective assessment of their work value are paid the same salary within all agencies. The relevant distribution of women in each classification of work across the sector is reported by the Public Service Commission (PSC) but is also available in the agency's Annual Report.

(f) The workforce profile data collected by the PSC is made available to Women NSW.

Professional Photography

147. How much has been spent on professional photography for the following financial years:

- (a) 2015-16
- (b) 2016-17
- (c) 2017-18
- (d) 2018-2019
- (e) 2019-present?

ANSWER:

147. The Financial Statements, including expenditure on professional photography, are available in agency annual reports.

Unmanned Aerial Services

148. How much has been spent on Unmanned Aerial Services for the following financial years:

- (a) 2015-16
- (b) 2016-17
- (c) 2017-18
- (d) 2018-2019
- (e) 2019-present?

ANSWER:

148. The Financial Statements, including expenditure on unmanned aerial services, are available in agency annual reports.

Seconded Staff

149. How many staff from your department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio have been seconded to your Ministerial Office, for the following financial years:

- (a) 2015-16
- (b) 2016-17
- (c) 2017-18

- (d) 2018-2019
- (e) 2019-present?

150. Please provide their names, their substantive work title, and their seconded work title.

ANSWER Q149 - 150:

NSW Government sector employees may be seconded from agencies to Ministers' offices in accordance with Clause 35 of the Government Sector Employment Regulation 2014.

Consultant Costs

151. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report, the total expenditure on consultants by financial year:

- (a) 2015-16
- (b) 2016-17
- (c) 2017-18
- (d) 2018-2019
- (e) 2019-present?

152. What are names and values of the five most expensive reports produced by consultancies for each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio by financial year:

- (a) 2015-16
- (b) 2016-17
- (c) 2017-18
- (d) 2018-2019
- (e) 2019-present?

ANSWER Q151 - 152:

The Financial Statements, including expenditure on consultants, are available in agency annual reports.

GIPA Questions to the CEOs/ Department Secretaries

153. Since March 30, how many formal GIPAs have your cluster/ department received?

154. Out of the received formal GIPAs, how many have you determined to:

- (a) Grant full access to the information?
- (b) Grant partial access to the information?
- (c) Not grant access to the information?

155. Out of the GIPA where partial information or no information was granted, how many have decided to appeal?

- (a) Out of those who have decided to appeal, how many have decided to use:
 - i. The agency's internal appeals' mechanism?
 - ii. Review by the Information Commissioner?
 - iii. Review by NCAT?
- (b) How many of those GIPAs have been overturned on appeal?
 - i. Internal appeals' mechanism?
 - ii. Review of the Information Commissioner?
 - iii. Review by NCAT?

156. GIPAs that have been granted full or partial access, how many appear on the agency's disclosure log?

- (a) What is the rationale for not putting GIPAs on the agency's disclosure log (excluding GIPAs asking for personal information)?

157. Has any GIPAs that appeared on the agency's disclosure log been taken down?

- (a) For what reason/s?

ANSWER Q153 - 157:

An agency must keep a record that records information about access applications made to the agency that the agency decides by deciding to provide access (to some or all of the information applied for) if the information is information that the agency considers may be of interest to other members of the public.

I do not make decisions on applications under the *Government Information (Public Access) Act 2009*.

All GIPAA data for cluster agencies is available on the IPC website:

<https://www.ipc.nsw.gov.au/information-access/agency-gipa-dashboard/gipa-dashboard>.

ENVIRONMENT

Questions from Mr Justin Field MLC

Narrabri Gas Project

158. On the basis of what advice or research did the Minister make the claim in budget estimates hearings that: "The best technology available to support and firm up renewable energy is, at this stage, gas."
159. Is the Minister aware of public statements by energy company AGL that renewable energy fired with storage is likely to be cheaper given the high price of domestic gas?

ANSWER:

158. The Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO) GenCost 2018 report found that an open cycle gas turbine built in the year 2020 would have a lower capital cost than batteries or pumped hydro of the equivalent scale, which are alternative technologies available to firm up renewable energy.
159. Public comments made by AGL are in the public domain.

Clearing of native vegetation

Please provide the following information for each of the local government areas of Wollongong, Shellharbour, Kiama, Shoalhaven, Eurobodalla and Bega Valley (separately), and based on the most up to date information available:

160. How many hectares of native vegetation are covered by a residential zoning?
161. How many hectares of native vegetation are covered by a commercial or industrial zoning?
162. Since 2010, how many hectares of native vegetation have been cleared for residential development?

ANSWER Q160 - 162:

These questions should be referred to the relevant planning authorities.

Land clearing amnesty

In regards to the Government's announcement on 1 August 2019 that committed to no new land clearing investigations being initiated under the old Native Vegetation Act 2003 after 31 August this

year, a winding back of automatic remediation orders and no penalties for activities that would have been legal under the new Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016:

163. How many investigations under the old Native Vegetation Act 2003 had commenced before the deadline of 31 August 2019?
164. How many investigations have been discontinued as a result of finding that the activities would not have breached the new Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016.
165. How many prosecutions under the old Native Vegetation Act 2003 had commenced before the deadline of 31 August 2019?
166. How many prosecutions have been discontinued as a result of the 1 August announcement?
167. For existing cases of illegal clearing for which investigations are underway under the old Native Vegetation Act 2003, how many have been or are likely to be found to have breached the new Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016?
 - (a) How many hectares of illegal clearing is this likely to apply to?
 - (b) For these cases of illegal clearing, what are the alternatives to remediation orders that will be available to landholders?
168. Will the announcement allow remediation orders already made to be expunged?
 - (a) If yes, what is the process for landholders to seek to have orders expunged?
 - (b) How many hectares of land subject to existing remediation orders could have the order expunged as a result of this announcement?
169. Will the announcement allow previous set-asides as a result of Private Vegetation Plans or other approvals for clearing, allow landholders to seek to modify set-aside provisions if they believe as a result of the introduction of the new Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016 they would not have been required to commit to such set-asides?
170. How many investigations into illegal land clearing under the Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016 have been commenced since that Act came into effect?
171. How many hectares of potential illegal clearing do these investigations apply to?
172. How many prosecutions are underway or have been finalised as a result of investigations under the Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016.

ANSWER:

163. On 31 August 2019 there were 176 open investigations under the *Native Vegetation Act 2003*.
164. Land management activities that required approval under the *Native Vegetation Act 2003* are now regulated under the *Local Land Services Act 2013*, not the *Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016*.
The Department assesses, prioritises and acts on compliance matters in accordance with the Department's compliance policy and the recently announced policy.
165. On 31 August 2019 there were 10 prosecutions proceeding in the Land and Environment Court for offences under the *Native Vegetation Act 2003*.
166. As at 20 September 2019, all prosecutions proceeding in the Land and Environment Court were still being assessed against the new policy announced on 1 August 2019.
167. Land management activities that required approval under the *Native Vegetation Act 2003* are now regulated under the *Local Land Services Act 2013*, not the *Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016*.
As at 20 September 2019, all open investigations under the *Native Vegetation Act 2003* were still being reviewed against the *Local Land Services Act 2013*.
- (a) As all cases are currently under review, this figure cannot be provided.
- (b) The "Policy for resolving investigations under the now repealed *Native Vegetation Act 2003*" states that the Department's preference is to secure agreed environmental outcomes – e.g. conservation of remnant vegetation consistent with the set aside requirements that would have applied under the Code – through mechanisms such as a Conservation Agreement under the *Biodiversity Conservation Act*.
However, if agreement cannot be reached or there are aggravating circumstances, then traditional compliance tools may be applied.
168. For cases where a remediation order is currently under appeal, the case will be assessed against the new policy to determine if an agreed environmental outcome, such as conservation of remnant vegetation, can be secured.
- (a) The Department is reviewing the cases for which a remediation order is currently under appeal.
- (b) The remediation orders currently under appeal cover an area of 1,341 hectares. A remediation order will only be replaced if an alternative outcome, such as conservation of remnant vegetation, can be secured.

169. No.

170. Land management activities that required approval under the *Native Vegetation Act 2003* are now regulated under the *Local Land Services Act 2013*, not the *Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016*.

798 investigations have commenced under the *Local Land Services Act 2013* for alleged unlawful clearing since 25 August 2017.

171. As these are the subject of investigation, is it not appropriate to speculate.

172. Land management activities that required approval under the *Native Vegetation Act 2003* are now regulated under the *Local Land Services Act 2013*, not the *Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016*.

As at 20 September 2019, one prosecution had commenced in court as a result of investigations under the *Local Land Services Act 2013*. Other investigations have resulted in a range of compliance outcomes such as penalty notices, stop work orders and warning letters.

Review of the Land Management (Native Vegetation) Code 2018

In relation to the review of the Land Management (Native Vegetation) Code 2018 being undertaken by the Natural Resources Commission and referred to in the hearing on 13 September 2019 by Mr Wilde:

173. What involvement did the Office of Environment and Heritage (OEH) or Environment, Energy & Science (EES) group have in this review?

174. Who are the three members of the 'external panel' mentioned by Mr Wilde in the hearing and what are their qualifications?

175. What process was undertaken to identify the experts used in the review?

176. What was the trigger for the review and how was this trigger established?

177. What were the terms of reference for the review?

178. What agencies contributed to the review?

179. Will the review report be made public?

180. When will the Government respond to the review?

181. Are there statutory or other requirements that set out what the Minister for Environment must consider before providing concurrence for a new native vegetation code?

ANSWER:

173. Staff from the Environment, Energy and Science Group participated on a working group established by the Natural Resources Commission.
174. Please refer to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces' response to Legislative Council Question on Notice 0456.
175. Please refer to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces' response to Legislative Council Question on Notice 0456.
176. Please refer to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces' response to Legislative Council Question on Notice 0456.
177. Please refer to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces' response to Legislative Council Question on Notice 0456.
178. Please refer to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces' response to Legislative Council Question on Notice 0456.
179. Please refer to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces' response to Legislative Council Question on Notice 0456.
180. Please refer to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces' response to Legislative Council Question on Notice 0456.
181. Section 60T(3) of the Local Land Services Act 2013 requires the Environment Minister to have regard to the principles of ecologically sustainable development (described in section 6 (2) of the Protection of the Environment Administration Act 1991) when considering whether to give concurrence to making a Land Management (native vegetation) Code.

New regional native vegetation codes

Regarding the testimony of Mr Witherdin, Chief Executive of Local Land Services, in Minister Marshall's hearing on 10 September 2019 where he mentioned the development of a "large area code", "pilot projects" and "consultative group":

182. What is/was the level of involvement by Environment, Energy & Science (EES) group/Office of Environment and Heritage in:
 - (a) developing the new regional code/s
 - (b) the pilot program

- (c) the consultative group
- (d) the community panel?

ANSWER:

182.

- (a) The Environment, Energy and Science Group within the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment is aware of the proposed development of the new regional code/s.
- (b) The former Office of Environment and Heritage was aware of the existence of the Walgett pilot.
- (c) None to date.
- (d) None to date.

Local Land Services Act 2013 and Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016 reviews

183. When is a statutory review required under the:

- (a) Local Land Services Act 2013 and regulation
- (b) Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016 and regulation?

184. Is there any other trigger to review the Local Land Services Act 2013 or the Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016 or their respective regulations? Is there any other planned review?

ANSWER:

183.

- (a) This question should be referred to the Minister for Agriculture and Western New South Wales.
- (b) Under section 14.11 of the *Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016*, the Minister is to review the *Biodiversity Conservation Act* as soon as possible after the period of five years from the commencement of a majority of the provisions of the *Biodiversity Conservation Act*. The majority of provisions commenced on 25 August 2017.

The review is to be undertaken in conjunction with the review of the native vegetation land management provisions of the *Local Land Services Act 2013*.

A report on the outcome of the review is to be tabled in each House of Parliament within 12 months after the end of the period of five years.

184. Yes.

Auditor General's 'Managing Native vegetation' report

185. What is the Government doing to implement the findings of the Auditor General's 'Managing Native vegetation' report dated 27 June 2019 as it relates to recommendations specific to the Office of Environment and Heritage, now Environment, Energy & Science?
186. Will each of the recommendations be implemented by Environment, Energy & Science in full and on time (as per the recommended timeline)? If not, why not?

ANSWER:

185. The Departmental response to the Auditor General's recommendations can be found in Appendix one of the Audit Office's report on its website.

In addition, the recently published compliance policy for resolving cases under the Native Vegetation Act 2003 can be found at www.environment.nsw.gov.au/topics/animals-and-plants/native-vegetation/land-management-native-vegetation-compliance-and-enforcement.

186. Recommendations one to four relate to work by Local Land Services, which is outside of the Environment, Energy & Science group.

Recommendation five, relating to implementing a staged release of draft maps for Category 1 - Exempt and Category 2 - Regulated land to the public, will be implemented.

Recommendations six to eight will be implemented by December 2019 as recommended.

Recommendation nine, I have approved that native vegetation data be published annually.

Recommendations 10 and 11 are being implemented by the Biodiversity and Conservation Trust as recommended.

Barwon-Darling Water Sharing Plan - modelling report

187. Was a report prepared by the Office of Environment for the Water Reform Taskforce that compared modelled annual total flows to actual total flows from gauges in the Darling River? If so, will the Government make this report publicly available?

ANSWER:

187. No, the former Office of Environment and Heritage did not prepare a hydrological modelling report about the Darling River for the Water Reform Taskforce.

Old growth remapping – timeline

Regarding the testimony of Dr Keniry in the hearings on 13 September 2019 where he responded to the Hon. Penny Sharpe regarding the timeline of old growth remapping as a result of ‘additional protections’ under the Integrated Forestry Operations Approvals and the ‘first instance of looking at remapping some old-growth forest’ (see page 66 of transcript):

188. When did the NRC first consider remapping old growth forest?
189. Was this a direction of the Premier? If so, what was the specific direction?
190. When were the first pilot trials conducted? When were they reported on?
191. What was the involvement of OEH/EPA/EES in this work

Dr Keniry’s testimony further provided (see page 67 of transcript) that after the pilot trials, there were additional terms of reference:

192. When were these terms of reference provided to the NRC?
193. What were these additional terms?
194. What additional work was conducted by the NRC as a result of these new terms of reference?
195. What was the involvement of OEH/EPA/EES in this work

Dr Keniry’s testimony then provided (see page 67 of transcript) that the NRC was advised from Forestry Corporation ‘that it was in the process of re-looking at its ability to supply its wood supply contracts’:

196. When was this advice received?
197. Was there a justification provided by Forestry Corporation for undertaking this work?
198. What is the scope of this assessment?
199. Will the NRC verify this assessment? If so, how will this be done?

Regarding the testimony of Ms Levy in the hearings on 13 September 2019 where she indicated towards the involvement of environment groups if the old growth remapping work does continue (see page 67 of transcript):

200. What level of involvement will this be? Will environment groups be involved in ground-truthing the methodology?

ANSWER:

188. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.
189. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.
190. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.
191. The NRC engaged the Environment, Energy and Science Group – Remote Sensing and Landscape Science team in the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment to undertake the pilot investigation work. The Environment Protection Authority provided feedback to the NRC on the scope of this work, and its proposed methods and findings.
192. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.
193. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.
194. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.
195. The NRC engaged the Environment Energy and Science Group – Remote Sensing and Landscape Science team to develop and field test the forest reassessment methods. The EPA and parts of Environment, Energy and Science Group provided feedback to the NRC on the scope of this work, and on the draft methods.
196. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.
197. This question should be referred to the Deputy Premier and Minister for Industry and Trade.
198. This question should be referred to the Deputy Premier and Minister for Industry and Trade.
199. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.
200. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.

Old growth forest remapping – Office of Environment and Heritage submission

In regards to a submission titled ‘Submission to the NSW Environment Protection Agency on the Draft Coastal Integrated Forestry Operations Approval Remake’ by the New South Wales Office of Environment and Heritage, Conservation and Regional Delivery Division, North-East Branch, dated 23 July 2018 obtained under freedom of information:

201. Was this submission made on behalf of the Office of Environment and Heritage at the time?

202. Were any directions given to regional branches to enable them to provide individual submissions?
If so, what were these directions?
203. What was the highest level of bureaucrat that approved, or noted, this submission?
204. Was the submission sent to the Minister's office in advance of being submitted?
205. Does the Environment, Energy & Science (EES) group support the content of the submission and does it maintain the concerns raised? If not, how has the view of the EES group changed since July 2018?
206. Have regional branches on the North Coast in the EES group, or previously Office of Environment and Heritage, been consulted on the process to remap old growth forest?
- (a) If so, what is the level of involvement?
- (b) Have any formal submissions been made?

ANSWER:

201. No, this was informal advice provided to the Environmental Protection Authority on their request.
202. The EPA sought informal advice from the former OEH on the draft Coastal IFOA while it was on public exhibition.
203. A Director (SEB 1) from the former OEH provided the informal advice to the EPA.
204. No.
205. Implementation of the Coastal IFOA is Government policy.
206. Yes.
- (a) North East Branch of Biodiversity and Conservation Division provided comments on draft working methods during internal consultation.
- (b) No.

Forestry snapshots

207. When was the 2016/17 Forestry Snapshot report provided to the Forestry Corporation?
208. Has the Forestry Corporation responded to the 2016/17 Forestry Snapshot?
- (a) If yes, when?
209. When will the 2016/17 Forestry Snapshot be published?

210. Has the 2017/18 forestry snapshot been provided to the Forestry Corporation?
- (a) If yes, when?
211. Has the Forestry Corporation responded to the 2017/18 Forestry Snapshot?
- (a) If yes, when?
212. When will the 2016/17 Forestry Snapshot be published?
213. What input does the Forestry Corporation provide into the process of preparing the Forestry Snapshots?

ANSWER:

207. Forestry Corporation has participated through all stages of preparation and review of the 2016/17 Forestry Snapshot.
208. Yes.
- (a) Forestry Corporation has participated through all stages of preparation and review of the 2016/17 Forestry Snapshot.
209. It is my intention to publish the 2016/17 Forestry Snapshot as soon as possible.
- (a) Yes. The EPA sent the guiding template for the 2017/18 Forestry Snapshot to all contributing agencies on 12 June 2019.
- 210.
- (a) Yes. Forestry Corporation provided key content for the 2017/18 Forestry Snapshot on 7 August 2019.
211. Please refer to my response to question 209.
212. Forestry Corporation reports on performance indicators for ecologically sustainable forest management as set out in NSW Forest Agreements. This includes text, data, images and tables on sustainable timber harvesting volumes and wood products, non-wood forest products, pest management, conservation strategies and recreational uses of forests. Forestry Corporation also contributes to updates on achievement of milestones and undertakings in the NSW Forest Agreements and Integrated Forestry Operations Approvals. Forestry Corporation then review drafts of the report for accuracy prior to endorsement of the content by their organisation.

Kosciusko National Park - feral horses

213. What is the timeline for the completion of the survey and assessment of feral horse numbers in Kosciusko National Park?
214. Will the survey results be made public?
215. How many horses are expected to be captured as a result of trapping to be conducted for the remainder of 2019?

ANSWER:

214. Field work for the population survey was completed in May 2019. The assessment will be finalised before the end of 2019 once independent peer review processes are completed.
215. Yes.
216. The final number removed will be influenced by a range of on-ground and weather factors.

PFAS contamination

217. What work has the Environment Protection Authority (EPA) done to reduce, assess and remediate the impacts of PFAS contamination in the Shoalhaven?
218. What work has been undertaken in relation to HMAS Albatross?
219. Has any work been undertaken in relation to HMAS Creswell and impacts on surrounding communities and river systems within the NSW jurisdiction or on the Jervis Bay Marine Park?
220. Has there been any health support, similar to that in Williamstown, provided to communities affected by PFAS from HMAS Creswell?

ANSWER:

217. As part of the NSW PFAS Investigation Program, the EPA has assessed HMAS Albatross, Rural Fire Service's South Nowra training facility. The EPA has also undertaken a biota (fish/oyster) study in the Shoalhaven River and provided precautionary dietary advice to the community. Full details are available on the EPA's website: www.epa.nsw.gov.au/your-environment/contaminated-land/pfas-investigation-program
218. The EPA has continued to pursue the Department of Defence to ensure that PFAS investigations at and around HMAS Albatross are robust. As a result of this work, the Department of Defence released a PFAS Management Area Plan for HMAS Albatross on 17 July 2019.
219. As part of the NSW PFAS Investigation Program, the EPA has undertaken a comprehensive PFAS investigation at HMAS Creswell. Although located in the Jervis Bay Territory, the EPA

has assessed Defence's investigation, provided comments, expertise and support to the ACT Government.

220. The Federal Government Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Cities and Regional Development is responsible for the administration of the Jervis Bay Territory where HMAS Creswell is located. There is an agreement that the ACT Government provides services to the Jervis Bay Territory community.

NSW National Parks System Directions Statement

221. When will the NSW National Parks System Directions Statement be publicly released?

ANSWER:

221. The NSW National Parks System Directions Statement will be released following the release of the conservation strategy.

Biomass

On 29 May 2014 the Sugar Milling Co-Operative Ltd and Cape Byron Management Pty Ltd were given an exemption to the Protection of the Environment Operations Act 1997 (Gazette notice 6 June 2014) to allow them to use native forest biomaterial that had been cleared for other purposes. The exemption required monthly reporting on volume, source and type of native forest used. The exemption applied for 5 years, expiring in May 2019. Regarding this exemption:

222. Is the exemption still in place?
223. Was the monthly reporting as required under the exemption completed?
- (a) If yes, is the reporting publicly available?
 - i. If no, can the reporting be provided?
 - (b) If no, why not?

ANSWER:

222. No.
223. The records of volume, source and type of biomaterial were kept, however, they were not reported on a monthly basis. The EPA is currently considering its position as to the fact that monthly reporting did not occur.
- (a) No.

- i. The records are maintained by Cape Byron Management Pty Ltd. Documents held by Government agencies are subject to the *Government Information (Public Access) Act 2009*. A freedom of information request for any copies of these records held by the EPA would be considered through under the *Government Information (Public Access) Act 2009*.

EES and water questions

224. Broken down by catchment (Gwydir, Macquarie, Lachlan, Murrumbidgee and Murray-Lower Darling), how many gigalitres of Environmental Water Holdings along the Murray-Darling River system were purchased in each year from 2010/11 to 2018/19 and since 1 July 2019? For each catchment:
 - (a) What was the average price realised each year?
225. Broken down by catchment (Gwydir, Macquarie, Lachlan, Murrumbidgee and Murray-Lower Darling), how many gigalitres of Environmental water holdings along the Murray-Darling River system were sold in each year from 2010/11 to 2018/19? For each catchment:
 - (a) What was the average price realised each year?
226. What has happened to the money OEH/DPIE makes from the sale of environmental water allocations? (For example, is the money held for future purchases of environmental water? Is it held within the OEH/DPIE budget for other purposes? Or it is transferred to consolidated revenue?)
227. How much money in total has OEH/DPIE made from sales of environmental water allocations since 2010/11?
228. How much money in total has OEH/DPIE spent on environmental water purchases since 2010/11
229. Why was 15GL of environmental water was sold in 2018/19 in the middle of a drought rather than used to benefit the environment?
230. What was the environmental benefit of selling 15GL of environmental water in 2018/19?
231. What process does the OEH/DPIE use to determine whether to sell water?
232. What factors do OEH/DPIE consider when selling environmental water?
233. Given the average sale price of sold environmental water by OEH/DPIE was at or above the market average for at least each of the proceeding six years, why was the average sale price of

\$349/ML for the 15GL of sold environmental water in 2018/19 significantly less than the market average of about \$420/ML in 2018/19?

234. How does OEH/DPIE ensure they are getting value for money in sales of environmental water?
235. Are sales of environmental water agreed to by the Environmental Water Advisory Groups in each catchment?
236. Who signs off on decisions to sell environmental water?
237. Has DPIE been asked by the government to sell environmental water in the past 2 years? If so what was the nature of the request, when was it made and can you provide a copy of any request to the committee?
238. Has DPIE provided advice to government about the environmental impact of selling 15GL of environment water allocations in 2018/19? If so what was the advice, when was it provided and can you provide a copy of any advice to the committee?

ANSWER:

224. OEH/DPIE purchased water access licences in the Murrumbidgee, and no other catchments, in 2010–2011 and 2011–2012. The amounts purchased were 7.70 GL and 6.82 GL in the two years respectively. OEH/DPIE has not purchased environmental water holdings since 2011–2012.

(a) OEH/DPIE purchased water licences in the Murrumbidgee with an average volume weighted price of:

- \$880/ML in 2010–2011 (7.70 GL)
- \$824/ML in 2011–2012 (6.82 GL)

225. OEH/DPIE has not sold any water licence holdings that have been recovered for environmental purposes.

226. Proceeds from the sale of environmental water allocations are used exclusively for environmental outcomes. Allocations may be sold to:

- contribute to the payment of water use fees associated with water licences (the same costs apply to all water licence holders)
- support small infrastructure projects which enhance delivery of water to important river or wetland sites

- purchase water allocation in another valley or year
- enable carryover of water into future years.

227. OEH/DPIE has generated a net revenue of approximately \$10,350,000 from environmental water allocation sales for the period 2010–2011 to 2018–2019.

228. OEH/DPIE has spent approximately \$1,300,000 on allocation purchases from 2010–2011 to 2018–2019

229. The environmental water was traded with the objective of improving river and wetland health, while contributing to desirable drought relief outcomes for regional communities.

The water trades were assessed against the risk of impacting planned environmental water.

Total environmental water use for 2018–2019 was more than 623 GL. The total volume traded represents 2.4% of this volume and did not compromise environmental watering objectives for the year.

230. Proceeds from the sale of environmental water allocations are used exclusively for environmental outcomes. Some reasons for selling environmental water allocations are outlined in my response to question 226.

231. In determining whether to sell water, DPIE Environment, Energy and Science Group (EES):

- develops and implements the water market trading framework to maximise environmental benefit across the environmental water portfolio
- manages the delivery of water to achieve specific outcomes for native fish, waterbirds, plants or system processes. This includes the development of Annual Environmental Watering Priorities in consultation with the Environmental Water Advisory Groups which outline the needs of river and wetland assets each year
- carefully considers the annual priorities and receives updates on environmental water needs as they change throughout the year.

232. The following factors are considered:

- the environmental outcomes for rivers and wetlands, must be greater than the risk of having less water
- annual and ongoing environmental watering priorities

- forecasts of water use and pumping costs
- water market conditions and outlook
- whether there is a net environmental benefit from trade
- risk of water forfeiture due to account or carryover limits
- potential market impacts from a trade activity
- whether multiple benefits can be achieved through trade.

233. The prices achieved from the sale in 2018–2019 were consistent with the monthly Volume Weighted Average Price in each valley at the point of sale.

234. EES monitors water allocation markets and climate outlooks. Forecasts are then prepared of what revenue is needed based on anticipated environmental water use and planned projects.

235. Each valley-based Environmental Water Advisory Group is closely consulted when compiling and reviewing Annual Environmental Watering Priorities.

236. Approvals are made at the relevant level of delegated authority.

237. On 26 August 2018, the former Minister for the Environment announced the sale of up to 15 GL of environmental water, along with a number of other drought relief measures.

238. Yes, advice was provided.

NPWS bushfire management

239. Given the NPWS strategy for managing bushfires (Living with fire) is set to expire in 2021, what is the timeframe for reviewing and updating this strategy?

(a) Has work on an updated strategy begun?

(b) Has there been any consultation with stakeholders to date? If so, which agencies, organisations or individuals have been consulted?

(c) What will be the consultation process be for the review?

240. How much federal government funding did NPWS receive from the commonwealth government for bushfire management in each of the past 5 years?

241. How much federal government funding is NPWS expecting to receive from the commonwealth government for bushfire management over the forward estimates?

242. Given the expected impacts of climate change, has there been or will there be a review of whether the current NPWS resources, assets and budget for bushfire management are sufficient?
- (a) If so, what was the conclusion of that review? Can a copy of the review be made available to the committee?
- (b) If not, will you commit to such a review?
243. Has there been an assessment of the cost effectiveness of investments in Remote Area Fire Fighting Teams and Remote Area Rapid Response Teams?
- (a) If so, what was the conclusion of this assessment? Can a copy of the review be made available to the committee?
- (b) If not, will you commit to such a review?
- (c) How much has been committed over the forward estimates to fund these teams?
244. Funding for the Enhanced Bushfire Management Program is set to run out by 2022. Will the Government commit to maintaining or increasing this funding beyond 2022?
245. When there is an active bushfire, what level of prioritisation is given to the protection of rainforest, threatened species and/or threatened ecological communities?
246. How is the government ensuring the protection of rainforest, threatened species and/or threatened ecological communities from bushfires?

ANSWER:

239. It is estimated that revision and updating of the strategy will be in the fourth quarter of 2020.
- (a) Yes.
- (b) No; however, NPWS will consult widely as it did in developing the current strategy.
- (c) As per the previous process; NPWS will conduct an internal and external consultative process.
240. No direct funding from the Commonwealth.
241. No direct funding from the Commonwealth
242. The business case for the continuation of NPWS' Enhanced Bushfire Management Program will consider and address these and other issues. In developing the business case, NPWS will consider the evaluation of the current program. It will be informed by reviews of current

practices and will include initiatives to broaden our approach to manage bushfire risk and improve risk management capacity.

(a) See answer to question 242.

(b) See answer to question 242

243. No.

(a) – (b) NPWS rapid aerial response teams (RART) take advantage of a long and strong history of remote area firefighting within the service. NPWS has been very successful in this type of bush firefighting, largely due to this responsive detection and highly experienced suppression capability in remote, rugged and otherwise inaccessible country. NPWS has two key performance indicators (KPIs) for RART – one relating to response time and one measuring containment size of fires. Over the history of the program NPWS has met or exceeded these KPIs except for two years where it achieved marginally under the target percentage.

A cost benefit KPI is also being considered.

(c) The Government has committed \$92 million over five years to 2022 to the Enhanced Bushfire Management Program.

244. The Government will consider a business case for an extension of the Enhanced Bushfire Management Program prior to conclusion of the current program.

245. The first priority in bushfire suppression is the preservation of human life, property, community assets and infrastructure. Other considerations are carefully taken into account if, and when possible, and NPWS endeavours to conserve natural, cultural and community values as a next priority.

246. The NPWS hazard reduction program, which includes both prescribed burning and mechanical hazard reduction, takes these matters into consideration where possible and provided protection of life and property is not compromised. All established parks and reserves are covered by a reserve fire management strategy to reduce the risk of wildfires on parks and these may include strategies to protect particular vegetation, threatened species or ecological communities.

It should be noted, however, that while these strategies can reduce the risk associated with bushfires, under certain extreme fire danger conditions the risk cannot be totally eliminated.

New Coastal Integrated Forestry Operations Approval (IFOA)

247. What rate of koala feed tree retention rate was proposed by the Expert Faunal Panel for the draft coastal IFOA?
248. What is the scientific basis for the tree retention rates for koalas under the new coastal IFOA?
249. What impact will increased logging intensity under the new coastal IFOA have on feed and shelter tree resources for koalas?

ANSWER:

247. The expert fauna panel did not provide specific advice on koala feed tree retention rates.
248. The NSW Government sought advice from the Natural Resources Commission on a suitable koala feed tree retention rate for the coastal IFOA. The science used by the Natural Resources Commission to inform their proposed koala settings for the coastal IFOA is a matter for the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.
249. The Natural Resources Commission is currently overseeing urgent research on how koalas respond to intensive logging practices in State forests on the north coast. This research is part of the NSW Koala Strategy and includes projects assessing:
- nutritional value of koala habitat led by researchers at the Australian National University
 - koala diet and its links to habitat quality led by researchers at the Western Sydney University
 - koala population density using acoustic sensors and DNA led by researchers at the Forest Science Unit in the NSW Department of Primary Industries.

The Natural Resources Commission will provide annual reports on progress and deliver a final report of its findings in early 2021.

Koala Strategy

250. Regarding the “more than 24,000 hectares” of state forests set aside under the Koala Strategy:
- (a) How many koala hubs does this protect?
 - (b) How many hectares are Areas of Regional Koala Significance?
 - (c) What criteria was used to select these 24,000 hectares?

251. Did the former Office of Environment and Heritage provided any advice and/or recommendations to government on the effectiveness of the koala strategy before it was approved?
- (a) If yes, what was this advice? Please provide a copy of all relevant advice for the committee.
252. Has the EES or former Office of Environment and Heritage provided any advice and/or recommendations to government on the effectiveness of the koala strategy since it has been approved?
- (a) If yes, what was this advice? Please provide a copy of all relevant advice for the committee.
253. Did the former Office of Environment and Heritage provide any advice and/or recommendations to government on areas that should be protected under the koala strategy?
- (a) If yes, what was this advice? Please provide a copy of all relevant advice for the committee.
254. Will the NSW Koala Strategy be successful in stabilising and increasing the population of koalas across the state?

ANSWER:

250.

- (a) This data is not available.
- (b) The Areas of Regional Koala Significance (ARKS) data are publicly available on the Koala Habitat Information Base in the NSW Government's SEED portal.
- The areas of State forest that have been transferred/reserved under the NSW Koala Strategy that are within an Area of Regional Koala Significance totals 14,345 ha.
- (c) The NSW Government considered koala habitat quality, koala records at or near the sites, and opportunities to link areas of high-quality habitat, to help secure koala populations and preserve genetic diversity.

251. The NSW Government seeks advice from the Public Service on environmental issues, including the Koala Strategy.

252. The NSW Government is developing an evaluation framework to assess the effectiveness of the NSW Koala Strategy.

253. The former Office of Environment and Heritage provided advice on a range of topics to Government regarding Koalas.

254. The NSW Koala Strategy provides a starting point to achieving a longer-term goal to stabilise and then increase koala numbers, ensuring genetically diverse and viable populations across New South Wales. It identifies a set of actions to be delivered over three years.

As at July 2019, 20 strategy actions were complete or in progress. We will review and determine the next steps required for continuing this work to secure the koala in the wild at the completion of this three-year period.

Landclearing

255. Is it still the case that less than 1% of identified koala habitat on private land in NSW is protected from clearing under the Land management (native vegetation) code?

256. How much mapped koala habitat has been cleared in each of the past 4 years, broken down by cause of clearing?

257. How much koala habitat has been cleared under the code since the Land management (native vegetation) code was introduced?

258. Has the government done any modelling on the expected amount of koala habitat that will be cleared under Land management (native vegetation) code?

(a) If yes, how much is expected to be cleared in the next five years? Please provide a copy of all relevant advice for the committee.

(b) If not, why not?

ANSWER:

255. Clearing under the Land Management (Native Vegetation) Code 2018 is not permitted on land mapped as core koala habitat on the Native Vegetation Regulatory map.

256. This analysis has not been undertaken.

Habitat has varied levels of significance depending on numbers of trees preferred by koalas present and the nature of occupation by koalas. Any analysis would need to consider these site specific factors.

257. This question is a matter for the Minister for Agriculture and Western New South Wales.

258. No.

- (a) Not applicable
- (b) Modelling on the expected amount of koala habitat that may be cleared under the Land Management (Native Vegetation) Code 2018 has not been undertaken. Predictions about where the Code will be utilised are difficult and depend on multiple factors, including both economic and physical. Accordingly any modelling would be based on speculative assumptions and may be inaccurate.

Compliance and enforcement

- 259. How many compliance audits and investigations of FCNSW did the EPA conduct in each of the financial years 2014/15, 2015/16, 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19?
- 260. What was the overall compliance rate for those audits and investigations of FCNSW in each of the financial years 2014/15, 2015/16, 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19?
- 261. How many action plans has the EPA asked FCNSW to provide in relation to breaches in each of the financial years 2014/15, 2015/16, 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19?
- 262. How many code red non compliances has the EPA identified by FCNSW in each of the financial years 2014/15, 2015/16, 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19?
- 263. How many code orange non compliances has the EPA identified by FCNSW in each of the financial years 2014/15, 2015/16, 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19?
- 264. How many code yellow non compliances has the EPA identified by FCNSW in each of the financial years 2014/15, 2015/16, 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19?
- 265. How many non compliances by FCNSW relating to damage to or failure to retain, protect or properly mark trees as required has the EPA identified in each of the financial years 2014/15, 2015/16, 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19?
- 266. How many non compliances by FCNSW relating to conditions relating to koalas has the EPA identified in each of the financial years 2014/15, 2015/16, 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19?
- 267. How many penalty notices has the EPA issued to FCNSW in each of the financial years 2014/15, 2015/16, 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19?
- 268. How many prosecutions has the EPA commenced against FCNSW in each of the financial years 2014/15, 2015/16, 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19?
- 269. What is the total value of the fines that FCNSW has had to pay for compliance breaches in each of the financial years 2014/15, 2015/16, 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19?

270. Is the EPA confident that FCNSW will meet the koala tree retention requirements under the new coastal IFOA?

(a) If yes, what is this confidence based on?

(b) If no, what do you intend to do about it?

ANSWER Q259 - 269:

All Environment Protection Authority (EPA) compliance audit reports are published on its website. Investigations are undertaken as part of the EPA's routine compliance activities. Details of compliance activity in the 2016/17, 2017/18 and 2018/19 financial years have been published on the EPA's website at www.epa.nsw.gov.au/your-environment/native-forestry/native-forestry-nsw-overview/regulating-native-forestry/native-forestry-compliance-update

Details of specific types of non-compliances identified in compliance audits are set out individual EPA audit reports available on the EPA's Forestry Compliance Audit Report Register.

Further information is available in the NSW Forestry Snapshot Reports. A number of reports for the years identified are currently available. It is my intention to make the remaining snapshots available as soon as practicable after they are completed.

In some instances the EPA may not report at the level of specificity on the nature of non-compliances referred to in the question.

ANSWER Q270

All NSW Government bodies are subject to the rule of law and are expected to comply with their legal obligations. The EPA maintains an active compliance and enforcement program to assess if FCNSW are complying with these rules before, during and after forestry operations. The EPA will take necessary regulatory action guided by its Compliance Policy, if any non-compliances are identified.

Questions from the Hon Mark Pearson MLC

National Parks and Wildlife Service activity reports and returns submitted by landholders with non-commercial kangaroo licences.

271. Can the Minister's office provide the details of how many kangaroos have been killed by NSW land holders with non-commercial kangaroo licences for the period:

- (a) 8th August 2018 to the latest figures available
- (b) 1st January 2018 to 7th August 2018
- (c) 2017
- (d) 2016

ANSWER:

271. Not all licence returns have been received for the relevant periods. Answers are provided for licence returns that have been received by the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment. These figures may change as returns are received.

- (a) 279,454 (to 23 September 2019)
- (b) 135,886
- (c) 134,345
- (d) 107,575

Questions from the Hon Mark Buttigieg MLC (on behalf of the NSW Labor Opposition)

Cooks River

272. What role does your Department (DPIE) play in improving the health of the Cooks River?

ANSWER:

272. The role that the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment plays in improving the health of the Cooks River is led by the Minister for Local Government through the development of a Coastal Management Program covering the Cooks River.

While noting the above the NSW Environment Protection Authority (EPA) is contributing to better water quality in the Cooks River by providing its expertise, conducting regulatory activities, and through its involvement in a range of initiatives, including the highly successful Return and Earn scheme and litter reduction grants.

Further, the Environmental Trust offers a number of environmental grant funding opportunities which may support initiatives to improve the Cooks River environment.

Container Deposit Scheme

273. How does DPIE ensure there is no windfall gain to manufacturers as a result of the Container Deposit Scheme when manufacturers are only charged for containers returned yet IPART shows all container prices have risen?

ANSWER:

273. IPART found that the Return and Earn scheme has not had any undue effects on the prices of container beverages or market competition, noting that the price increases attributable to the scheme are consistent with a workably competitive market. In particular, it found that the cost of the scheme invoiced to beverage suppliers was on average 9.3 cents per container over the first year of the scheme. This includes the refund amount and all associated costs for running the scheme. At the same time, IPART found that the cost of beverages to consumers only increased by an average of 7.7 cents. This indicates that beverage suppliers have on average absorbed some of the costs of the scheme rather than passing them on to consumers.

The final IPART report is available at:

<https://www.ipart.nsw.gov.au/Home/Industries/Special-Reviews/Reviews/Container-Deposit-Scheme/Container-Deposit-Scheme-Monitoring>

Koalas

274. What is the current population of wild koalas understood to be in NSW?

275. What was the population estimate of wild koalas in NSW in:

(a) 2015/16

(b) 2016/17

(c) 2017/18

(d) 2018/19

276. Can the Minister please provide a list of identified 'koala hubs' on public land, including location and their approximate area?

277. Can the Minister please provide a list of identified 'koala hubs' on private land, including location and their approximate area?
278. How many 'koala hubs' on public land have been cleared, logged or otherwise impacted since being identified?
279. How many 'koala hubs' on private land have been cleared, logged or otherwise impacted since being identified?
280. Which 'koala hubs' on public land are scheduled for clearing, logging or other impacts in:
- (a) 2019/20
 - (b) 2020/21
 - (c) 2021/22
281. Which 'koala hubs' on private land are scheduled for clearing, logging or other impacts in:
- (a) 2019/20
 - (b) 2020/21
 - (c) 2021/22

ANSWER Q274 - 275:

A 2016 study by Adams-Hosking et al. used expert opinion to estimate there were approximately 36,000 across NSW. This is the most recent estimate of the wild koala population.

ANSWER Q276 – 281:

The Government has developed the first statewide, publicly available Koala Habitat Information Base. It delivers the best available statewide spatial data on koala habitat, likelihood, koala preferred trees and koala sightings for New South Wales. The information base is available at <https://datasets.seed.nsw.gov.au/dataset/koala-habitat-information-base>.

PFAS Contamination

282. Has the Government identified PFAS chemical contamination on sites currently or formerly owned or operated by the state government?
- (a) If so, please provide a list of sites
283. What actions are being taken to identify PFAS contamination emanating from public land or as a result of government activities?

284. Is the Government involved with any PFAS remediation trials?
- (a) If so, please indicate the basis of the trial and the support being offered
285. How many properties contaminated with PFAS chemicals are contained within the government's proposed Special Activation Precinct in Williamstown?
286. How much money has the NSW Government spent on PFAS identification, analysis, monitoring, remediation, and associated capital works in:
- (a) 2015/16
 - (b) 2016/17
 - (c) 2017/18
 - (d) 2018/19
 - (e) The current financial year
287. How many waste disposal sites or similar facilities in NSW are licenced to receive and store PFAS waste?
288. Which businesses hold a licence to receive and store PFAS waste?
289. How many fines have been issued for offences related to PFAS contamination or incorrect storage in:
- (a) 2015
 - (b) 2016
 - (c) 2017
 - (d) 2018
 - (e) 2019
290. How many prosecutions have been initiated for offences related to PFAS contamination or incorrect storage in:
- (a) 2015
 - (b) 2016
 - (c) 2017
 - (d) 2018
 - (e) 2019

291. Has the NSW Government issued any demands to the Commonwealth Government related to PFAS contamination identification, monitoring or remediation?
- (a) If so, for which sites?
292. Has the NSW Government provided the Commonwealth Government any advice whatsoever regarding expected actions related to PFAS contamination identification, monitoring or remediation?
293. Is the NSW Government able to take legal action against the Commonwealth Government regarding the contamination of private land and public waterways outside the boundaries of Commonwealth land?
- (a) If not, what legal principle prevents such action?
294. Hunter Water Corporation suspended the trade waste permit for Truegain in Rutherford in February 2016 following multiple contamination breaches. Following this action by Hunter Water, how many days did it take for the EPA to suspend Truegain's EPA licence?
295. On what date was Truegain's EPA licence revoked?
296. When did the EPA become aware of discharge of PFAS into:
- (a) Fishery Creek, Maitland
- (b) Stoney Creek, Maitland
297. Did the EPA take any action to secure hazardous chemicals stored on-site at Truegain following the revocation of its licence?
- (a) If so, what actions were taken?
298. When did the EPA become aware that chemicals were being discharged from the Truegain site following the revocation of its licence?
299. Does the EPA know where each of the waste chemicals were sourced before being stored at the Truegain facility?
- (a) If not, were any laws or regulations broken with respect to adequate record keeping?
- (b) Were any fines issued or enforcement actions undertaken with respect to inadequate record keeping?
300. When did the EPA first become aware that the source of PFAS chemicals being stored at the Truegain facility were from the former Bradmill/National Textiles site?

301. Why was the decision taken to partner with the former Truegain owners in the clean up of the site, considering the EPA acknowledged their “poor history of compliance with environmental protection legislation” in their licence revocation?
302. What action is the Government taking to monitor and remediate the Bradmill/National Textiles site, considering it is the probable source of PFAS chemicals transported to the Truegain facility?
303. Do hazardous chemicals remain on the Bradmill/National Textiles site?
- (a) If so, what chemicals remain and in what quantity?
304. Is the EPA confident that the Truegain site will no longer leak hazardous chemicals into the surrounding environment?

ANSWER:

282. Yes.

- (a) The Environment Protection Authority (EPA) is undertaking a state-wide investigation program to assess the legacy of PFAS use and contamination across NSW. The EPA has adopted a sector-based assessment approach to potential PFAS containing sites across NSW, guided by the PFAS National Environmental Management Plan. The high priority sites and target sectors are listed on the EPA’s website at: www.epa.nsw.gov.au/your-environment/contaminated-land/pfas-investigation-program

283. See response at question 282 (a).

284. No.

- (a) Not applicable.

285. 48.

286.

- (a) \$5 million.
(b) \$5 million.
(c) \$3.2 million.
(d) \$3.2 million.
(e) \$2.1 million.

287. If PFAS contaminated waste meets the criteria stated in the EPA’s Addendum to the Waste Classification Guidelines (2014) for general solid waste or restricted solid waste, it may be

disposed to landfills lawfully able to accept those waste types, these include landfills licensed by the EPA.

288. Refer to response under question 287.

289.

- (a) None.
- (b) None.
- (c) None.
- (d) None.
- (e) None.

290.

- (a) None.
- (b) None.
- (c) None.
- (d) None.
- (e) None.

291. The EPA has continued to engage with the Commonwealth in relation to PFAS identification, monitoring and remediation, including written correspondence.

- (a) RAAF Base Williamtown, RAAF Base Richmond, RAAF Base Wagga, HMAS Albatross, Blamey Barracks Kapooka, Singleton Lone Pine Barracks, Orchard Hills Munitions Site, Holsworthy Army Base, HMAS Creswell (ACT territory NSW EPA assisting); Sydney Airport, Bankstown Airport and Camden Airport.

These sites are listed on the EPA's website: www.epa.nsw.gov.au/your-environment/contaminated-land/pfas-investigation-program.

292. Yes.

293. No.

- (a) There are limits on the NSW government's ability to take legal action against the Commonwealth Government in relation to contamination linked to Commonwealth land or activities.

294. On 1 April 2016, the EPA suspended Environment Protection Licence no. 7638 held by Truegain Pty Ltd.
295. 5 January 2018
- 296.
- (a) EPA obtained water samples in Fishery Creek, Maitland on 18 July 2018. The water samples were subsequently analysed and PFAS was detected.
 - (b) EPA obtained water samples in Stoney Creek, Maitland on 23 March 2018. The water samples were subsequently analysed and PFAS was detected.
297. Yes.
- (a) Since the revocation of Truegain's licence, the EPA has undertaken a number of investigations, more than 22 site inspections, odour surveys, engaged with local residents, led community drop in sessions and letterbox drops, provided timely precautionary dietary advice to affected residents, regularly updated the information on the EPA website for community access and issued a number of statutory notices.
298. On 21 March 2018, an EPA officer inspecting the premises discovered an overflow from the premises spill containment system into Stoney Creek.
299. No.
- (a) Yes.
 - (b) The EPA revoked Truegain's Environment Protection Licence No 7638 on 5 January 2018. The EPA has issued 18 penalty notices since 2000 and has prosecuted the company twice in the NSW Land and Environment Court. The prosecutions were for water pollution in 2003 and for failing to undertake its licensed activities in a competent manner in 2014.
300. The EPA is not aware of a connection between PFAS at the two sites. The EPA considers the former Bradmill/National Textiles to be a separate source of PFAS contamination in the area.
301. In accordance with the polluter pays principle, the EPA seeks to hold polluters to account for the clean-up of pollution incidents, before expending public funds in a clean-up.
- On 5 June 2017, the EPA issued a clean up notice to the owner requiring removal of liquids from the premises spill containment system to a lawful facility. On 1 September 2017, an EPA

inspection of the premises confirmed the notice had not been complied with and the property owner advised he did not have the funds to comply with the notice.

302. The EPA is not aware of a connection between PFAS at the two sites. The EPA considers the former Bradmill/National Textiles to be a separate source of PFAS contamination in the area. Cleanaway occupy a portion of the former National Textile site and are undertaking a detailed PFAS site investigation. The EPA is assessing and monitoring the investigation as it progresses.
303. The EPA is unaware of hazardous chemicals being stored at the Bradmill/National Textiles.
- (a) Not applicable.
304. The EPA has compelled the owner to clean up the site to ensure it operates properly and efficiently. The EPA is regularly monitoring the progress of the clean up.

Old Grown Forest Remapping

305. Will the Minister support the suspension of the old growth forest remapping process if the Forestry Corporation of NSW is unable to prove a timber supply shortfall?
306. How many sites were involved in the Natural Resources Commission's remapping pilot study?
307. How many supposed old growth forest mapping errors were found by the Natural Resources Commission?
308. How many of these supposed old growth forest mapping errors were due to the Natural Resources Commission identifying evidence of logging activity?

ANSWER:

305. As part of the remake of the Coastal Integrated Forestry Operations Approval, the NSW Government committed to no erosion of environmental values, and no net change to the timber supply. If there is no timber supply shortfall, the old growth reassessment program is not necessary.
306. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.
307. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.
308. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.

National Parks

309. What was the total budget for the National Parks and Wildlife Service in:

- (a) 2015/16
- (b) 2016/17
- (c) 2017/18
- (d) 2018/19
- (e) The current financial year

310. How many FTE staff were employed in the National Parks and Wildlife Service:

- (a) As at 1 July 2015
- (b) As at 1 July 2016
- (c) As at 1 July 2017
- (d) As at 1 July 2018
- (e) As at 1 July 2019

311. How many FTE Park Rangers were employed by the National Parks and Wildlife Service:

- (a) As at 1 July 2015
- (b) As at 1 July 2016
- (c) As at 1 July 2017
- (d) As at 1 July 2018
- (e) As at 1 July 2019

312. How many FTE Field Officers (excluding trainees) were employed by the National Parks and Wildlife Service:

- (a) As at 1 July 2015
- (b) As at 1 July 2016
- (c) As at 1 July 2017
- (d) As at 1 July 2018
- (e) As at 1 July 2019

313. How many Field Officer Trainees were employed by the National Parks and Wildlife Service:

- (a) As at 1 July 2015
- (b) As at 1 July 2016

- (c) As at 1 July 2017
 - (d) As at 1 July 2018
 - (e) As at 1 July 2019
314. How many FTE administration staff were employed by the National Parks and Wildlife Service:
- (a) As at 1 July 2015
 - (b) As at 1 July 2016
 - (c) As at 1 July 2017
 - (d) As at 1 July 2018
 - (e) As at 1 July 2019
315. At the time of the reservation of Murray Valley National Park, there was a legislative requirement under the Act to review the Park and its associated spending and programs. Has that review taken place?
- (a) If yes, when did that review take place?
 - (b) If no, was there legislation passed to avoid the required review?
 - (c) If there was legislation passed to avoid the required review, what was the rationale behind that change?
316. Which businesses received more than \$50,000 in the restructure package following the reservation of Murray Valley National Park?
- (a) What was the purpose of each grant?
317. Under the current thinning trials in the Murray Valley National Park, are individuals or businesses permitted to receive timber for the purposes of sale or production?
318. Is the Government aware of any individuals or businesses receiving timber from the Murray Valley National Park thinning trials for the purposes of sale or production?
- (a) If so, has any action been taken against these individuals or businesses?
319. Does the Government intend on allowing individuals or businesses to receive timber from the Murray Valley National Park thinning trials for the purposes of sale or production?
320. What is the size of the area within the Murray Valley National Park subject to the current thinning trial?

321. What is the maximum volume of timber that could be derived from the areas subject to the thinning trial in Murray Valley National Park?
322. Will the Minister rule out aerial culling of feral horses in Kosciuszko National Park?
323. Current regulations prohibit the use of adaptive e-bikes above 250 watts in NSW national parks. Unfortunately the National Parks and Wildlife Service does not distinguish between general e-bikes and adaptive e-bikes which are used to assist people with disability. Specifically, e-bikes tailored for the safe use of people with disability can be up to 750 watts. Will the Minister review the current regulations and investigate the possibility of allowing adaptive e-bikes above 250 watts in national parks, in order to facilitate greater inclusion and engagement within our national parks estate?
324. Will the Minister and Department investigate the current United States Secretary of the Interior's Order Number 3376 which provides an example of best practice to encourage, increase and facilitate recreational opportunities in national parks for people with disability?

ANSWER:

309. Relevant information on expenditure relating to the management of national parks is outlined in the NSW Government budget papers.

310. I am advised it is difficult to provide precise, comparative figures given the changes in structure and systems that have occurred during the period 2015–present. However, subject to this qualification, the relevant details may be summarised as:

	Month/Year	Total NPWS Staff (FTE)
(a)	July 2015	1,626
(b)	July 2016	1,586
(c)	July 2017	1,511
(d)	July 2018*	1,367
(e)	July 2019	1,639

Excludes: casuals and contractors; as well as employees on external secondment.

* July 2018 represented the busiest period for recruitment activity under the Future NPWS restructure. The FTE figure at this time is therefore not accurate as staff numbers were transitioning with the restructure. For example, at 27 July 2018, staffing levels had risen to 1441 FTE.

This similarly applies to the response to Question 311.

311. I am advised it is difficult to provide precise, comparative figures given the changes in structure and systems that have occurred during the period 2015–present. However, subject to this qualification, the relevant details may be summarised as:

	Month/Year	Ranger Classifications*
(a)	July 2015	225
(b)	July 2016	212
(c)	July 2017	208
(d)	July 2018	200
(e)	July 2019	216

Excludes: casuals and contractors; as well as employees on external secondment.

Includes: Ranger Grade 1/2, Senior Ranger, and from July 2018, Team Leader Ranger (Clerk Grade 9/10).

312. I am advised it is difficult to provide precise, comparative figures given the changes in structure and systems that have occurred during the period 2015–present. However, subject to this qualification, the relevant details may be summarised as:

	Month/year	Field Officers
(a)	July 2015	651
(b)	July 2016	651
(c)	July 2017	639
(d)	July 2018	587
(e)	July 2019	677

Excludes: casuals and contractors; as well as employees on external secondment; and Field Officer Trainee roles. (See: 313 below)

Includes: all field award classifications: Field Officer Base Grade 1/2 – AWU; Field Officer Grade 1/4 – AWU; Field Officer Grade 1/4 - Kos/Gr; Field Officer Grade 1/4 – other; Field Officer Grade 1/4 Kos/GR; Field Officer Grade B3/B4 – other; Field Supervisor Gr 1/2 - Kos/GR; Field Supervisor Gr 1/2 – other; Snr Field Off/SFO Plant Gr1/2 oth; Snr Field Supervisor - Kos/GR; Snr Field Supervisor – other; Field Officer Gen Ops – AWU; Field Officer Base Grade 1/2-Kos/Gr.

313.

	Month/year	Trainees
(a)	July 2015	45
(b)	July 2016	24
(c)	July 2017	Nil
(d)	July 2018	Nil
(e)	July 2019	Nil

Excludes: casuals and contractors; as well as employees on external secondment.

Includes: Field Officer Trainee roles under the Traineeship Classification. This classification was no longer used from July 2017.

314. I am advised it is difficult to provide precise, comparative figures given the changes in structure and systems that have occurred during the period 2015 – present. However, subject to this qualification, the relevant details may be summarised as:

	Month/year	Admin roles
(a)	July 2015	146
(b)	July 2016	131
(c)	July 2017	126
(d)	July 2018	101
(e)	July 2019	139

Excludes: casuals and contractors; as well as employees on external secondment.

Includes roles where duties are predominantly administrative. Roles include: Administration Support Officer; Administrative Support Assistant; Administrative Support Assistant Identified; Business Services Manager; Branch Coordinator; Compliance Admin Assistant; Compliance Admin Officer; Fleet Admin Officer; Digital Strategy Admin Officer; Executive Assistant; NPWS Administration Officer; NPWS Administration Support Officer; Administration & CSA (Ab); Administrative Assistant; Administrative Assistant (Identified); Administrative Assistant (Targeted); NPWS Administration & CSA; NPWS Administration & CSA (Ab); NPWS Administration Assistant; NPWS Administration Officer; Administration Officer; Administration Officer (Ab); Administrative Assistant; Administrative Support Officer; Administrative Support Officer Identified; NPWS Admin & Information Officer; NPWS Administration & Info Officer; NPWS Administration Assistant; NPWS Administration Officer; NPWS Administration Officer (Ab); NPWS Administration Officer Area; NPWS Administration Officer Area; Assistant Branch Coordinator; NPWS Administration Officer; Administrative Coordinator; Executive Coordinator; NPWS Administration Officer Region; Personal Assistant; Senior Branch Officer; Senior Business Officer.

315. I am advised that the spending on all Parks are reviewed from time to time.

(a) Not applicable

316. This information is available online: <https://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/funding-and-support/nsw-environmental-trust/closed-programs/riverina-red-gum-regional-development-grants-awarded-and-project-summaries>

317. Commercial logging is not permitted in national parks. The ecological thinning program undertaken in Murray Valley National Park was a science-based program and did not involve any commercial logging. The residue was disposed of by the NSW Forestry Corporation to local mills.

318. See answer to question 317.

(a) See answer to question 317.

319. See answer to question 317.

320. The ecological thinning trial covered 594 hectares, of which 396 hectares were subject to ecological thinning operations.

321. The ecological thinning trial undertaken in 2016–2017 produced approximately 7500 tonnes of residue.
322. Yes.
323. The National Parks and Wildlife Cycling Policy allows e-bikes up to 250 watts to be used in national parks. This is consistent with the definition and regulation of bicycles in the NSW Road Rules 2014. The question of regulating the use of adaptive e-bikes above 250 watts is a matter for the Minister for Transport and Roads.
324. I want to ensure all individuals no matter their age or ability has access to our National Park network. I am open to any proposal that assists in reaching this goal. However, in NSW, the question of regulating e-bikes above 250 watts is a matter for the Minister for Transport and Roads.

Gosford Dumping

325. Is the EPA aware of illegal landfill/dumping activities on Mangrove Mountain on the Central Coast?
326. What role does the EPA currently have in monitoring the Mangrove Mountain landfill site?
327. When was the last time the EPA conducted water testing in the area of the Mangrove Mountain landfill site?
328. What pollutants were identified in the last water testing in the area of the Mangrove mountain landfill site?

ANSWER:

325. I have been advised the EPA is aware of community reports of illegal dumping on privately-owned land across the Mangrove Mountain area.
326. The EPA is aware of the Mangrove Mountain Landfill, which is a licensed EPA waste facility located at the Mangrove Mountain Golf Club.
- The requirement to undertake environmental monitoring for the Mangrove Mountain landfill is the responsibility of the licensee. The required monitoring is stipulated by the conditions on the environment protection licence.
327. In response to community concerns, the EPA has been routinely engaging the services of Department of Planning, Industry and Environment – Environment, Energy and Science Group to undertake water quality sampling in creeks surrounding the Mangrove Mountain

Landfill. The most recent sampling was conducted on 15 May 2019. On the same date, the EPA collected samples from the stormwater ponds at the landfill.

328. The Environment Energy and Science Group routinely samples surface water for the following:

- Metals - Antimony, arsenic, beryllium, boron, cadmium, calcium, chromium, cobalt, copper, iron, lead, lithium, manganese, molybdenum, nickel, potassium, selenium, silicon, silver, sodium, strontium, sulfur, thallium, titanium, tin, vanadium and zinc.
- Nutrients - Ammonia, oxidised nitrogen NO_x-N, total nitrogen, total phosphorus, reactive phosphorus.
- Physical - Temperature, dissolved oxygen, alkalinity, pH, conductivity, total suspended solids, turbidity.

Sampling results show no indication of any significant impact on the creeks from the landfill.

Air Quality

329. Has a new air quality monitoring station been commissioned near the Riverstone Sewerage Processing Plant, Vineyard, following the decommissioning of the old monitoring station in November 2016?

330. Please provide a list of air quality monitoring stations that have been decommissioned in:

- (a) 2015
- (b) 2016
- (c) 2017
- (d) 2018
- (e) 2019

331. Please provide a list of air quality monitoring stations that have been commissioned in:

- (a) 2015
- (b) 2016
- (c) 2017
- (d) 2018
- (e) 2019

332. Does the Minister agree that nitrogen dioxide, sulphur dioxide and atmospheric ozone are responsible for significant community health impacts in New South Wales, causing asthma, reduced lung function, pre-term and low-weight birth, and cardiorespiratory mortality?
333. What is the current Sulphur Dioxide 24-hour standard under the National Environment Protection Measures?
334. Is the Government aware of any exceedances of the current Sulphur Dioxide 24-hour standard in NSW?
- (a) If so, when and where did those exceedances occur?
335. A proposal to vary the National Environment Protection Measures will be considered by the COAG National Environment Protection Council, following the commissioning of a Regulatory Impact Statement. The Regulatory Impact Statement has proposed varying the Sulphur Dioxide 24-hour standard to 20 parts per billion. Will the Government support this proposal, or will the Government push for greater protections?
336. Is the Minister aware of the criticisms that have been made against the Regulatory Impact Statement's cost-benefit analysis methodology, particularly by the Australia Institute?
337. Has the NSW EPA provided the Minister with advice regarding the proposal to vary the National Environment Protection Measures?
338. Will the Minister meet with independent health experts in the process of determining the NSW Government's position on the National Environment Protection Measure variations?
339. Is the Government aware of any exceedances of Sulphur Dioxide using a 24-hour 20 parts per billion standard in the past ten years?
- (a) If so, when and where did those exceedances occur?
340. Is the Government aware of any exceedances of Sulphur Dioxide using a 24-hour 8 parts per billion standard in the past ten years?
- (a) If so, when and where did those exceedances occur?
341. Will the Government be supporting the Regulatory Impact Statement proposals to vary the National Environmental Protection Measures, or will the Government be proposing its own standards?

ANSWERS:

329. A new air quality monitoring has been commissioned in Rouse Hill to replace the Vineyard monitoring station.

330.

(a) Macarthur (replaced by Campbelltown West).

(b) Vineyard (replaced by Rouse Hill).

(c) None.

(d) None.

(e) Lindfield (replaced by Macquarie Park).

331.

(a) None.

(b) None.

(c) Gunnedah and Narrabri as part of the Regional Centres air quality monitoring network; Macquarie Park and Parramatta North as part of the Sydney air quality monitoring network.

(d) Air quality monitoring station at Armidale and indicative monitor at Werrimull, as part of the rural air quality monitoring network.

(e) Cook and Phillip (Sydney CBD), Rouse Hill as part of the Sydney air quality monitoring network. Bradfield Highway for research monitoring of roadside air quality. Orange as part of the Regional Centres air quality monitoring network. Katoomba and Liverpool south-west air quality for research monitoring.

332. Yes. The NSW Government recognises the potential public health impacts associated with airborne pollutants and has been a leader in driving National Environment Protection (Ambient Air Quality) Measure standards for ozone, nitrogen dioxide and sulfur dioxide. NSW has supported public exhibition of the proposed variation to the National Environment Protection (Ambient Air Quality) Measure standards for ozone, nitrogen dioxide and sulfur dioxide which included an independent health impact assessment of these pollutants. The report is available at <http://nepc.gov.au/nepms/ambient-air-quality/proposed-variation/consultation-2019>.

333. The current 24-hour average sulfur dioxide standard under the National Environment Protection (Ambient Air Quality) Measure is 80 parts per billion.
334. There have been no exceedances of the current sulfur dioxide 24-hour standard in NSW.
- (a) Not applicable
335. The Government will consider the proposal as a member of the COAG National Environment Protection Council.
336. The Government will consider the proposal as a member of the COAG National Environment Protection Council.
337. I regularly receive briefings from the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment including on matters proceeding to Ministerial fora.
338. I meet with independent experts on a range of matters.
339. Yes.
- (a) Muswellbrook air quality monitoring station measured above a 24-hour average 20 parts per billion standard for sulfur dioxide for six days in January 2013, November 2013, February 2016, November 2017, January 2018 and April 2019.
340. Yes.
- (a) Muswellbrook and Stockton have had 193 and 138 exceedances respectively, of the 24-hour 8 parts per billion standard during the past ten years. Singleton has recorded 20 exceedances since sulfur dioxide monitoring commenced in November 2011.
- Date range used: 01/01/2009 to 19/09/2019.
341. The Government will consider the proposal as a member of the COAG National Environment Protection Council.

Walking Tracks in the Illawarra Escarpment State Conservation Area

342. Will the Minister commit to increasing funding to maintain and improve walking tracks in the Illawarra Escarpment State Conservation Area?
- (a) Specifically in relation to the Mt Keira Ring Track?
- (b) In relation to walking tracks in the Illawarra Escarpment State Conservation Area?
343. Is the Minister happy with the current state of disrepair and underdevelopment of the network of walking tracks in the Illawarra Escarpment State Conservation Area?

- (a) Specifically in relation to the Mt Keira Ring Track of which large sections are closed due to the need for maintenance?
 - (b) In relation to the walking tracks available in the Illawarra Escarpment State Conservation Area?
344. Can the Minister provide details of any planned investment that will be to upgrade and maintain the Mt Keira Ring Track
- (a) In 2019-20?
 - (b) In 2020-21?
345. What proportion of the \$25.2 million allocated in this year's budget will be spent on extending, upgrading and improving walking trails and visitor facilities in the Illawarra?
346. What proportion of the \$149.5 million investment over four years announced in this year's budget for improving NSW national parks will be spent on national parks and walking trails in the Illawarra?
347. Will the Minister commit to funding a continuous walking experience along the Illawarra Escarpment State Conservation Area, including:
- (a) a connection with Royal National Park at Otford in the north;
 - (b) a continuous walking trail to Mount Kembla in the South, in line with plans developed by the National Parks and Wildlife Service (The Illawarra Escarpment Walking Track)?

ANSWER:

342. The NSW Government is committed to ensuring the National Parks and Wildlife Service has the required funding available to it.
- (a) The National Parks and Wildlife Service has spent just under \$400,000 since 2016–17 on the Mt Keira Ring Track for geotechnical risk assessments, slope stabilisation and track works. These works are now completed, and the walking track is ready to reopen. National Parks and Wildlife Service staff will continue to undertake maintenance work on the track as required.
 - (b) The NSW Government has announced \$150 million over four years starting in 2019–20 to improve access to national parks, including the upgrade of walking tracks and visitor facilities. The National Parks and Wildlife Service is developing a four-year program for walking tracks in the Illawarra Escarpment.

343.

- (a) The eastern part of the 5 kilometre Mount Keira Ring circuit track was closed to the public following a series of large rockfalls and identification of other large rock fall hazards above the track. The National Parks and Wildlife Service has re-constructed 300 metres of the track away from the landslide, stabilised or removed other hazards and installed new directional signage.
- (b) Over the last 10 years the National Parks and Wildlife Service has invested more than \$1.4 million towards planning and construction of visitor facilities including walking tracks in the Illawarra Escarpment State Conservation Area.

344. The National Parks and Wildlife Service is developing a four-year program for walking tracks in the Illawarra Escarpment.

345. The National Parks and Wildlife Service is currently working with Wollongong City Council to identify priority areas and prepare detailed costings for extending, upgrading and improving walking trails in the Illawarra area. This will be considered when allocating the available budget for improving access to national parks.

346. The National Parks and Wildlife Service is developing a four-year program for walking track in the Illawarra Escarpment.

347.

- (a) A Draft Master Plan for a comprehensive, cross-tenure walking track network on the Illawarra Escarpment has been developed with input from Wollongong City Council, the community and stakeholders. The Master Plan provides a connection with Royal National Park at Otford. The National Parks and Wildlife Service has implemented sections of the draft plan including a 13-kilometre track from Stanwell Park to Austinmer and the Sublime Point track.
- (b) Significant sections of the Illawarra Escarpment are outside the National Parks estate, including on Wollongong City Council and private lands, so a cross-tenure approach is required. The NSW Government recognises there is strong community interest in developing and maintaining walking tracks on the Illawarra Escarpment.

GIPA

348. Since March 30, how many formal GIPAs have your cluster/ department received?

349. Out of the received formal GIPAs, how many have you determined to:

- (a) Grant full access to the information?
- (b) Grant partial access to the information?
- (c) Not grant access to the information?

350. Out of the GIPA where partial information or no information was granted, how many have decided to appeal?

- (a) Out of those who have decided to appeal, how many have decided to use:
 - i. The agency's internal appeals' mechanism?
 - ii. Review by the Information Commissioner?
 - iii. Review by NCAT?
- (b) How many of those GIPAs have been overturned on appeal?
 - i. Internal appeals' mechanism?
 - ii. Review of the Information Commissioner?
 - iii. Review by NCAT?

351. GIPAs that have been granted full or partial access, how many appear on the agency's disclosure log?

- (a) What is the rationale for not putting GIPAs on the agency's disclosure log (excluding GIPAs asking for personal information)?

352. Has any GIPAs that appeared on the agency's disclosure log been taken down?

- (a) For what reason/s?

ANSWER Q348 - 352:

Please refer to my response to questions 153 - 157.

Parliamentary Secretary for the Environment

353. What public affairs and/or public policy is the Parliamentary Secretary for the Environment connected to?

- (a) What special tasks has the parliamentary secretary been asked to provide assistance?
- (b) What duties of the Minister has the parliamentary secretary been asked to provide relief?

354. What activities associated with the public policy/public affairs have been undertaken?

355. What specific Acts or other legislation will the parliamentary secretary role be officially connected?
356. For what matters of public administration will the parliamentary secretary be responsible?
357. In what publication and/or on what website will the activities of the parliamentary secretary be officially recorded?
358. Since their appointment on the 24th April, what are the total number of meetings with stakeholders the parliamentary secretary has had?
359. In terms of those meetings, who did the parliamentary secretary meet with, and what was the topic of discussion?
360. How many times has the parliamentary secretary used DPC's road transport services?
- (a) What duties has the parliamentary secretary been required to perform for each time of use?
361. How much of the Minister's office budget has been spent on supporting the parliamentary secretary?
- (a) Has alternative office accommodation apart from Parliament House been provided to the parliamentary secretary?
- (b) Have extra staff been provided?
- (c) Have other kinds of assistance been provided?
362. Which staff positions within the department have worked with the parliamentary secretary to undertake their duties/ public affairs/ public policy role/s?
363. Since his appointment on April 24, have any departmental staff accompanied the parliamentary secretary to meetings with stakeholders?
364. Has the department been required to prepare/ provide briefing information for the parliamentary secretary prior to any stakeholder meetings and/or in the undertaking of their duty and/or public policy role?

ANSWER Q353 - 364:

Under Section 38C(1) of the *Constitution Act 1902 (NSW)* "a Parliamentary Secretary shall have and may perform such functions as the Premier may, from time to time, determine in respect of him".

The duties of a Parliamentary Secretary are outlined in the Ministers' Office Handbook available on the Department of Premier and Cabinet website. In general terms, where required, a Parliamentary Secretary engages in correspondence, attends events and meetings and acts as a Minister in the Parliament.

A Parliamentary Secretary is appointed to undertake the sorts of tasks which may be delegated without affecting the essential responsibility and authority of a Minister.

Each Parliamentary Secretary must comply with the Ministerial Code of Conduct, as it applies to them.

Carbon Sequestration

365. Is the Government currently supporting any carbon sequestration projects?

- (a) If so, please provide a list of the projects, including their location, means of government support, scale of sequestration, and the status of the project.

366. Is the Government supporting, or has the Government supported, any carbon sequestration research projects?

- (a) If so, please provide a list of the research projects.

ANSWER:

365. Yes.

- (a) There are a range of carbon sequestration projects occurring throughout Government. The Environment, Energy and Science Group within the NSW Department of Planning, Industry and Environment is currently supporting three carbon sequestration projects through direct funding of over \$4 million that will sequester over 100,000 tons of carbon emissions to 2026.

366. Yes.

- (a) The Science Division of the Environment, Energy and Science Group within the NSW Department of Planning, Industry and Environment supports four carbon sequestration PhD research projects:
- High resolution assessment of soil and biomass carbon.
 - Significance of root contribution to soil carbon storage.
 - The significance of dissolved organic carbon (DOC) to deep soil carbon storage.
 - Driving factors of carbon stabilisation in soils.

Coal Ash Dams

367. Which power stations in NSW have operational coal ash dams?

- (a) Are any of those coal ash dams lined?

368. Which coal ash dams in NSW are currently contaminating groundwater?
369. Which coal ash dams in NSW have an operations management plan?
370. Which coal ash dams in NSW have a rehabilitation or closure plan?
371. Are there any coal ash dams in NSW that are no longer operational?
372. How is the Munmorah coal ash dam monitored?
373. Do the EPA licences for Vales Point and Munmorah allow discharge from the coal ash dams into Lake Macquarie?
- (a) If so, are there any restrictions on the amount of heavy metals that are released into Lake Macquarie from the power station?
374. Does the NSW EPA have any regulatory responsibilities under the Protection of the Environment Operations Act 1997 for surface water pollution, groundwater pollution and air pollution from dams in NSW?
375. Did the EPA's audit of coal ash dams in 2017 include any audit of seepage from the dams into groundwater?
- (a) If not, why not?
376. Does the Government hold any bond or impose any obligation on power station operators to rehabilitate coal ash dams on closure of the power station, or to stop groundwater contamination?
377. What is the approximate size of each coal ash dam in NSW?
378. What percentage of coal ash waste produced in NSW annually is recycled?
379. Which power stations in NSW recycle coal ash, and to what extent?
380. Is the Structural integrity of Eraring coal ash dump in question?
- (a) Is yes, what information has been provided to local residents who might be impacted if the dam was to fail, and when was that information relayed to them?
- (b) If no, why was the Myuna Bay Sport and Recreation Centre closed?
381. Does the EPA have any plan to manage or further regulate coal ash waste in the future?

ANSWER:

367. Eraring, Vales Point, Bayswater, Liddell and Mount Piper power stations have operating ash dams.

(a) No.

368. NSW has a robust environmental regulation framework to protect the community and environment from pollution from ash dams including legally enforceable conditions set out in environment protection licences.

The requirements for discharges from coal ash dams include limits on the pollutants that can be discharged and monitoring of surface and groundwater.

369. Vales Point and Eraring have ash dam management plans that cover operation of the ash dams.

Bayswater and Liddell have operation management plans for the Liddell and Bayswater Ash Dams and the Ravensworth Ash Disposal Area.

Mount Piper has an operation environment management plan for the Lamberts North area. The ash dam known as 'Disposal Area 1' operates under the power station environmental management plan.

Wallerawang has an operations environment management plan for the Kerosene Vale Ash Repository and Sawyers Swamp Creek Ash Dam.

370. Vales Point has an ash dam management plan which covers closure and rehabilitation of the Vales Point ash dam.

Eraring has a rehabilitation plan that is under review with the intent of including it in the long-term management strategy for the Eraring ash dam.

Liddell has a rehabilitation plan for the Liddell ash dam.

Bayswater has a rehabilitation plan for Ravensworth Ash Disposal Area. There is currently no rehabilitation management plan for the Bayswater ash dam; however this will form part of the operator's future transition and rehabilitation plans.

Mount Piper's coal ash dams are operational and there is no rehabilitation or closure plan.

A closure and rehabilitation plan is currently being developed for the Wallerawang ash dams.

371. Yes, Munmorah Power Station's Colongra ash dam, Wangi Power Station ash dam, and Wallerawang's Kerosene Vale ash repository and Sawyers Swamp Creek ash dam.

372. The environment protection licence for Munmorah Power Station requires periodic monitoring for a range of pollutants in the discharge from the ash dam and in wet weather discharges to Lake Munmorah.
373. The Munmorah Power Station ash dam does not discharge to Lake Macquarie.
- The environment protection licence for Vales Point Power Station authorises a discharge from the ash dam to Lake Macquarie via the cooling water outlet canal and during wet weather.
- (a) The environment protection licence for Vales Point Power Station does not allow the discharge of heavy metals from the ash dam to Lake Macquarie.
374. The EPA regulates air and water pollution associated with dams if they are on premises carrying out a scheduled activity under the Protection of the Environment Operations Act 1997.
375. The EPA's Environment Compliance Report: Coal ash dams and emplacements (2017) examined activities undertaken at premises in relation to the coal ash dam and/or emplacement and surface water management. Any impacts of the dams or emplacements on groundwater was not included in the scope of the audits.
- (a) The focus of the audit was the Licensee's compliance with the conditions of the environment protection licence to ensure appropriate operation of the facility minimising the potential for partial or catastrophic failure of ash dams/emplacements or otherwise impacting on land and surface water downstream of the dam.
376. The EPA does not currently have any financial assurances established with power station licensees in respect of the closure and rehabilitation of their ash dams.
377. Vales Point ash dam surface area is approximately 525 hectares.
- Eraring ash dam surface area is approximately 250 hectares.
- Liddell ash dam surface area at full supply level is approximately 350 hectares.
- Bayswater ash dam surface area at full supply level is approximately 147 hectares.
- Ravensworth disposal area surface area at full supply level is approximately 52 hectares.
- Mount Piper Disposal Area 1 is approximately 16 million cubic metres, and Lamberts north is approximately 6.9 million cubic metres.

378. Data produced by the Ash Development Association of Australia (ADAA) estimated that approximately 5.936 million tonnes or 47 per cent of coal combustion products generated by Australian power stations in 2018 was beneficially used. The ADAA does not publish disaggregated data.
379. Approximately 21 per cent of ash generated from Vales Point was recycled during 2018/19. Approximately 35 per cent of ash generated from Eraring was recycled in 2018/19. Approximately 87,025 tonnes of Fly Ash, 27,101 tonnes of Bottom Ash and 1,011 cubic metres of cenospheres generated from Bayswater and Liddell were recycled in 2018/19. Small quantities of ash generated by Mount Piper are recycled.
380. This should be referred to the Minister for Water, Property and Housing.
381. The EPA is examining this issue further to ensure that environmental issues associated with power stations are appropriately managed to ensure the protection of the community and the surrounding environment.

EPA Fines, Compliance and Enforcement

382. How many warning letters were issued by the EPA in:
- (a) 2015
 - (b) 2016
 - (c) 2017
 - (d) 2018
 - (e) 2019
383. How many penalty notices were issued by the EPA in:
- (a) 2015
 - (b) 2016
 - (c) 2017
 - (d) 2018
 - (e) 2019
384. How many fines were issued by the NSW EPA in:
- (a) 2015

- (b) 2016
- (c) 2017
- (d) 2018
- (e) 2019

385. What was the fine revenue from fines issued by the NSW EPA in:

- (a) 2015
- (b) 2016
- (c) 2017
- (d) 2018
- (e) 2019

386. How many enforceable undertakings were entered into by the EPA in:

- (a) 2015
- (b) 2016
- (c) 2017
- (d) 2018
- (e) 2019

387. How many prosecutions were launched by the EPA in:

- (a) 2015
- (b) 2016
- (c) 2017
- (d) 2018
- (e) 2019

ANSWER:

382.

- (a) 1,004
- (b) 2,110

(c) 2,971

(d) 5,132

(e) 3,922

383.

(a) 4,487

(b) 9,636

(c) 10,203

(d) 8,235

(e) 5,529

384.

(a) 4,487

(b) 9,636

(c) 10,203

(d) 8,235

(e) 5,529

385.

(a) \$2,226,430

(b) \$4,458,150

(c) \$5,086,390

(d) \$4,086,190

(e) \$2,474,200

386.

(a) 10

(b) 3

(c) 3

(d) 4

(e) 1

387.

(a) 53

(b) 161

(c) 105

(d) 103

(e) 68

Mixed Waste Organic Outputs

388. Has the Government modelled the financial impact on Local Councils of banning the use of Mixed Waste Organic Outputs?
389. Has the Government modelled the increased waste levy revenue as a result of banning the use of Mixed Waste Organic Outputs?
390. Will the Minister review the current ban and work with the waste industry to increase the standard of Mixed Waste Organic Outputs, reduce landfill, and ease cost pressures on Local Councils?

ANSWER:

388. The EPA implemented the Phase 1 Alternative Waste Treatment support package to mitigate the risk of additional financial costs being passed on to councils in the short term, following the October 2018 revocation of resource recovery orders and exemptions relating to Mixed Waste Organic Outputs. The EPA will soon consult on the next phase to help councils and industry move to longer-term, sustainable, resource recovery for household general waste.
389. Waste levy revenue has not increased as a result of the October 2018 revocation of resource recovery orders and exemptions relating to Mixed Waste Organic Outputs. An exemption from the waste levy for Mixed Waste Organic Outputs processed at approved Alternative Waste Treatment facilities is currently in place under clause 21A of the Protection of the Environment Operations (Waste) Regulation 2014.

390. The EPA will continue to set the regulatory policy and make operational decisions about Mixed Waste Organic Outputs in its role as the independent environmental regulator. The EPA is committed to delivering strong, environmentally sound waste management and resource recovery outcomes for NSW. The EPA will soon consult on the next package to help councils and industry move to longer term, sustainable, resource recovery for household general waste, that protects the environment and human health.

Botanic Gardens

391. How are regional botanic gardens funded by the NSW Government?

392. How much funding has been provided to the Royal Botanic Garden in Sydney in:

- (a) 2015/16
- (b) 2016/17
- (c) 2017/18
- (d) 2018/19
- (e) 2019/20

393. How much of the Royal Botanic Garden's budget was passed along to regional botanic gardens in:

- (a) 2015/16
- (b) 2016/17
- (c) 2017/18
- (d) 2018/19
- (e) 2019/20

ANSWER:

391. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.

392. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.

393. This question should be referred to the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces.

Land Clearing Amnesty

394. How many investigations or prosecutions have been abandoned as a result of the Government's recently announced land clearing amnesty?

395. In total, what is the size of land subject to abandoned land clearing investigations or prosecutions as a result of the Government's recently announced land clearing amnesty?

ANSWER:

394. Please refer to my answers to questions 164 and 166.

395. There is no amnesty.

Warragamba Dam Wall Raising

396. Does the Minister support the proposal to raise the Warragamba Dam Wall?

397. Has the Minister reviews the Environmental Impact Statement for the Warragamba Dam Wall Raising project?

398. When will the EIS be released regarding the Warragamba Dam Wall Raising project?

399. Regarding the Warragamba Dam Wall Raising project, how many formal draft Environmental Impact Statements were authored before the final was submitted?

ANSWER Q396 - 399:

While The Hawkesbury-Nepean Valley Flood Risk Management Strategy recommends raising the Warragamba Dam wall by 14 metres to reduce flood risk to communities in the valley, the final decision to raise the wall has not yet been taken and will only take place after financial, environment and cultural assessments have concluded.

The NSW Government is committed to the completion of the Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) and Final Business Case to fully assess the project on its merits.

Biodiversity Offset Scheme

400. How many sites does the NSW Government own which currently carry biodiversity offset credits?

401. Which government agencies currently hold biodiversity offset credits?

402. How much revenue did the Government make from the sale of biodiversity offset credits, by agency, in:

(a) 2015/16

(b) 2016/17

(c) 2017/18

(d) 2018/19

(e) 2019/20

ANSWER:

400. 14.

401. The following agencies hold biodiversity offset credits:

- Roads and Maritime Services
- Transport for NSW
- Hunter Water Corporation
- Biodiversity Conservation Trust
- Office of Strategic Lands
- Sydney Water
- Waste Assets Management Corporation

402.

- (a) \$3,658,975
- (b) \$2,156,110
- (c) \$875,941
- (d) \$0
- (e) \$787,776 (as at September 2019)

Ministerial Office

403. What is the budget for Minister Matt Kean's ministerial office in 2019/20?

404. What is the number of FTE staff positions in Minister Matt Kean's ministerial office as of 17 September 2019?

405. What are the position titles for all staff positions in Minister Matt Kean's ministerial office as of 17 September 2019?

ANSWER Q403 - 405:

Ministers' Office staff numbers are available on the DPC website. Refer to:
www.dpc.nsw.gov.au/publications/premiers-and-ministers-staff-numbers

Wastewater Treatment Plants

406. How many wastewater treatment plants in NSW are legally allowed to pump untreated sewerage into waterways or the ocean?
407. Please provide a list of wastewater treatment plants in NSW that are legally allowed to pump untreated sewerage into waterways or the ocean.
408. Is the Government aware of any wastewater treatment plants in NSW which have discharged untreated sewerage into waterways or the ocean against their operating licence?
- (a) If so, what action was taken in each instance?

ANSWER:

406. None.

407. Please refer to my response to question 406.

408.

- (a) Please refer to my response to question 406.

Where the requirements of an environment protection licence are not met, the EPA uses its Compliance Policy to determine the appropriate regulatory action with consideration for a range of factors, including the seriousness of the incident, action taken by the licensee to mitigate impacts and the necessary actions required to achieve the best environmental outcome.

Ministerial Travel/Meal Allowance

409. How many nights travel were claimed by the Minister during the 2018-19 period?
410. How many nights travel were claimed by the Minister's spouse during the 2018-19 period?
411. What was the total amount of travel allowances claimed by the Minister and their spouse (if applicable) during 2018-19?
412. What is the total amount of meal allowances claimed by the Minister and their spouse (if applicable) during 2018-19?

ANSWER Q409 - 412:

Please refer to my answer to questions 73 to 76.

Efficiency dividends

413. What was the forecast efficiency dividend saving for each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio in 2018-19?
414. What is the forecast efficiency dividend saving for each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio in
- (a) 2019-20?
 - (b) 2020-21?
 - (c) 2021-22?
415. What was the total efficiency dividend that was achieved for each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio between 2011-12 and 2018-19 inclusively?

ANSWER Q413 - 415:

Please refer to my answer to questions 77 to 79.

Ministerial Office Administration

416. How many staff are in your ministerial office?
- (a) What was the average salary for staff members in your office during 2018-19?
 - (b) What is the estimated average salary for a ministerial staffer in your office in 2019-20 based on current appointments?
417. How many iPhone/smart phones are assigned to your staff?
- (a) For each phone, how much was each bill in 2018-19?
 - (b) How many phones have been lost or replaced due to damage in your office?
 - (c) What is the cost of replacing those phones?
418. How many iPads or tablets has DPC assigned to your Ministerial office and to whom have they been issued?
- (a) What was the cost of providing iPads or tablets to your Ministerial Office in 2018-19?
 - (b) How many iPads or tablets have been replaced due to lost or damage in 2018-19?
 - (c) What was the cost of replacing these devices?

419. Has any artwork been purchased or leased for display in your ministerial office in 2018-19?
- (a) What is the cost of this?
420. Have any floral displays or indoor plants or pot plants been hired or leased for display in your ministerial office in 2018-19?
- (a) If so, what was the cost of these items?
421. Have any floral displays or indoor plants or pot plants been purchased for display in your ministerial office in 2018-19?
- (a) If so, what was the cost of these items?
422. What was the total cost of all subscriptions by you and your staff to news services, newspapers, magazines, journals and periodicals (including online services) in 2018-19?
- (a) What are these services/newspapers/magazines/journals/periodicals?
 - (b) Who is the subscriber for each of these?
423. What was the total value of all gifts purchased for use by you and your office in 2018-19?
- (a) What were the gifts purchased?
 - (b) Who were they gifted to?
424. Do you purchase bottled water or provide water coolers for your office?
- (a) What is the monthly cost of this?
425. How much did your ministerial office spend on hospitality, including catering and beverages, in 2018-19?
426. What non-standard features are fitted to your ministerial vehicle?
- (a) What is the cost of each non-standard feature?
427. What was the total bill for your office in 2018-19 for:
- (a) Taxi hire
 - (b) Limousine hire
 - (c) Private hire care
 - (d) Hire car rental
 - (e) Ridesharing services?

428. Were any planes or helicopters chartered by you or your office and paid for with public money in 2018-19?

(a) If yes, will you please detail each trip, the method of transport and the cost?

429. Have you had media training or speech training?

(a) If yes, who paid for it?

(b) If paid by taxpayers, what was the amount paid in 2018-19?

ANSWER Q416 - 429:

Please refer to my answers to questions 80 – 93.

Agile Workspaces/Activity Based Working/Hot-desking

430. Have any of your departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies adopted agile working environment/activity based working practices e.g. hot-desking?

(a) If not, are there plans to introduce activity based working practices in 2019-20?

431. How much have your departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies spent in the roll-out of the agile working environment including laptops, furniture, lockers and other equipment in 2018-19?

ANSWER Q430 - 431:

Please refer to my answer to questions 94 – 95.

Hospitality

432. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

(a) How much was spent on hospitality, including catering and beverages, in 2018-19?

(b) Whether the department, statutory agency and/or other body has coffee machines? And if so:

i. How many?

ii. What was their purchase cost?

iii. What is their maintenance cost?

iv. Who has access to them?

v. Which staff have access to the machines?

ANSWER:

432. Please refer to my answer to question 96.

Labour Hire Firms

433. Do any departments, statutory agency and/or other bodies within your portfolio responsibilities utilise the services of Labour Hire Firms? If yes, please advise in table form for 2018-19:

- (a) The names of the firms utilised
- (b) The total amount paid to each firm engaged
- (c) The average tenure period for an employee provided by a labour hire company
- (d) The longest tenure for an employee provided by a labour hire company
- (e) The duties conducted by employees engaged through a labour hire company
- (f) The office locations of employees engaged through a labour hire company
- (g) The highest hourly or daily rate paid to an employee provided by a labour hire company
- (h) Who authorised the use of labour hire companies?
- (i) Do staff under these labour hire arrangements receive as much training and security clearance as permanent staff?

ANSWER:

433. Please refer to my answer to question 97.

Stationery

434. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

- (a) What was the cost of stationery for the following financial years:
 - i. 2015-16
 - ii. 2016-17
 - iii. 2017-18
 - iv. 2018-2019
 - v. 2019-present
- (b) What brand of paper is used?

- i. Is this paper Australian made?

ANSWER:

434. Please refer to my answer to question 98.

Credit Cards

435. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

- (a) How many credit cards are currently on issue for staff?
- i. Please provide a break-down of this information by grade.
- (b) What was the value of the largest reported purchase on a credit card for the following financial years:
- i. 2015-16
- ii. 2016-17
- iii. 2017-18
- iv. 2018-2019
- v. 2019-present
- (c) What was each largest reported purchase for?
- (d) How much interest was paid on amounts outstanding from credit cards for the following financial years:
- i. 2015-16
- ii. 2016-17
- iii. 2017-18
- iv. 2018-2019
- v. 2019-present
- (e) How much was paid in late fees on amounts outstanding from credit cards for the following financial years
- i. 2015-16
- ii. 2016-17
- iii. 2017-18

- iv. 2018-2019
 - v. 2019-present
- (f) What was the largest amount outstanding on a single card at the end of a payment period and what was the card holder's employment grade?
 - (g) How many credit cards have been reported lost or stolen?
 - i. What was the cost to replace them?
 - (h) How many credit card purchases were deemed to be illegitimate or contrary to agency policy?
 - i. What was the total value of those purchases?
 - ii. How many purchases were asked to be repaid on the basis that they were illegitimate or contrary to agency policy and what was the total value thereof?
 - iii. Were all those amounts actually repaid?
 - iv. If no, how many were not repaid, and what was the total value thereof?
 - (i) What was the largest purchase that was deemed illegitimate or contrary to agency policy and asked to be repaid, and what was the cardholder's employment grade?
 - i. What that amount actually repaid, in full?
 - ii. What amount was left unpaid?
 - (j) Are any credit cards currently on issue connected to rewards schemes?
 - i. Do staff receive any personal benefit as a result of those reward schemes?
 - (k) Can a copy of the staff credit card policy please be provided?

ANSWER:

435. Please refer to my answer to question 99.

Media and Public Relations

436. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

- (a) How many media/communications/public relations advisers are employed?
 - i. What is the total salary cost for media/communications/public relations advisers in 2018-19?

- (b) What is the forecast for the current financial year for the number of media/communications/public relations advisers to be employed and their total cost?
- (c) What is the total cost of media monitoring services?
 - i. Please provide a breakdown by department, statutory agency and/or other body.
- (d) Are any media or public relations advisers currently engaged as contractors?
 - i. Who are these contracts with?
 - ii. What is the value of these contracts?
- (e) How much was spent on media or public relations advisors in financial year:
 - i. 2015-16
 - ii. 2016-17
 - iii. 2017-18
 - iv. 2018-2019
 - v. 2019-present?

ANSWER:

436. Please refer to my answer to question 100.

Facebook

437. How much did your ministerial office spend on Facebook advertising or sponsored posts in 2018-19?

438. How much did your department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio spend on Facebook advertising or sponsored posts in 2018-19?

ANSWER Q437 - 438:

Please refer to my answers to questions 101 - 102.

Overseas Trips

439. Were any of your overseas trips in the last financial year paid for in part or in full by using public money?

- (a) If so, did any of your relatives or friends accompany you on these trips?
- (b) Have you undertaken any official overseas travel that was privately funded?
- (c) If so, what was the nature of these trips?

(d) Who paid for these trips?

ANSWER:

439. Please refer to my answer to question 103.

Department/Agency Travel

440. What was the total expenditure in 2018-19 by departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies within your portfolio on:

- (a) Taxi hire
- (b) Limousine
- (c) Private car hire
- (d) Hire car rental
- (e) Ridesharing services
- (f) Chartered flights?

ANSWER:

440. Please refer to my answer to question 104.

Drivers

441. Are any of the senior executives in the relevant department, statutory agency and/or other body provided drivers?

- (a) If so, can you please specify which positions are provided drivers?
- (b) In total, how many drivers are used by senior executives in the department, statutory agency and/or other body?
- (c) What is the total cost of drivers for senior executives in the department, statutory agency and/or other body?

ANSWER:

441. Please refer to my answer to question 105.

Consulting

442. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

- (a) How much was spent in legal costs in 2018-19?
- i. For what specific purposes or matters was legal advice sought?
- (b) Have departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies under your portfolio engaged any consultants to provide the following services or advice in 2018-19:
- i. Social media
 - ii. Photography
 - iii. Acting training
 - iv. Ergonomics
- (c) What was the cost of these services?
- i. Social media
 - ii. Photography
 - iii. Acting training
 - iv. Ergonomics

ANSWER:

442. Please refer to my answer to question 106.

Web Content

443. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

- (a) What were the top 20 most utilised (by data sent and received) unique domain names accessed this year?
- (b) What were the top 20 most accessed (by number of times accessed) unique domain names accessed this year?

ANSWER:

443. Please refer to my answer to question 107.

Department/Agency Staffing

444. How many redundancies were processed by departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies within your portfolio responsibilities during 2018-19?

- (a) Of these redundancies, how many were:

- i. Voluntary?
- ii. Involuntary?

445. What was the total cost of all redundancies?

446. Have any staff who received a redundancy in the last two years undertaken any paid work or provided any paid services for the department, statutory agency and/or other body with which they were formerly employed?

- (a) What was the nature of these works/services?
- (b) What was the total cost of these works or services?

447. Are any staff formerly employed by your ministerial office now employed by departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies under your portfolio responsibility?

448. How many staff were dismissed from departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies under your portfolio responsibilities in 2018-19?

- (a) What were the reason/s for each dismissal?

449. How much was spent advertising for recruitment for the following financial years:

- (a) 2015-16
- (b) 2016-17
- (c) 2017-18
- (d) 2018-2019
- (e) 2019-present?

ANSWER Q444 - 448:

Please refer to my answers to questions 108 – 112.

ANSWER Q449

Please refer to my answer to question 113.

Smart Phone

450. How many mobile phones are given to staff or board members?

- (a) How many new mobile phones were purchased in the last year?

451. What is the total cost of these phones for the following financial years:

- (a) 2015-16

- (b) 2016-17
 - (c) 2017-18
 - (d) 2018-2019
 - (e) 2019-present?
452. How many had to be replaced due to damage?
453. How many were reported as lost?
454. How many tablets are given to staff or board members?
- (a) How many new tablets in the last year?
455. What is the total cost of these tablets for the following financial years?
- (a) 2015-16
 - (b) 2016-17
 - (c) 2017-18
 - (d) 2018-2019?
456. How many phones and tablets had to be replaced due to damage?
457. How many were reported as lost?
458. How many people have both a smart phone and a tablet?
- (a) What is the lowest ranked official who has both a work smart phone and tablet?
459. How many staff or board members overspent on their phone or tablet data bill?
- (a) By how much?
 - (b) What was the average cost of data bills for tablets and mobile phones?
 - (c) What was the highest monthly cost?
460. Do the departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies within your portfolio have an iTunes account?
- (a) What was the total expenditure in 2018-19 on iTunes?
 - (b) What applications/subscriptions/services were purchased through iTunes?
461. Do the departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies within your portfolio have a Google Play Store account?

- (a) What was the total expenditure in 2018-19 on through the Google Play Store?
- (b) What applications/subscriptions/services were purchased through the Google Play Store?

ANSWER Q450 - 461:

Please refer to my answer to questions 114 - 125.

Merchant fees

- 462. Please provide a list of all transactions where customers need to pay a merchant fee on credit and/or debit card payments to a department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio.
- 463. Please provide the percentage and/or amount of the merchant fees applied to all credit and/or debit card payments/transactions to a department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio.
- 464. What was the total amount paid in merchant fees on credit and/or debit card payments to departments, statutory agencies and/or other bodies within your portfolio in 2018-19?

ANSWER Q462 - 464:

Please refer to my answer to questions 126 - 128.

Advertising and Sponsorships

- 465. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:
 - (a) How much was spent on advertising in the following financial years:
 - i. 2015-16
 - ii. 2016-17
 - iii. 2017-18
 - iv. 2018-2019?
- 466. Has your department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio engaged in any corporate sponsorships?
 - (a) Who were these sponsorships with?
 - (b) What was the purpose of these sponsorships?
 - (c) What was the value of these sponsorships, by case and year?

(d) What was the value of these sponsorships in the following financial years:

i. 2015-16

ii. 2016-17

iii. 2017-18

iv. 2018-19?

ANSWER Q465 - 466:

Please refer to my answer to questions 129 - 130.

Probity Auditor

467. Has your office or department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio used a Probity Auditor or Probity Advisors, or similar, in the past five years? If so please list the company and/or individual, the project, the engagement dates, and their total remuneration in tabular format.

ANSWER:

467. Please refer to my answer to question 131.

Energy

468. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio by name, how much electricity did it consume for each of:

(a) 2014-15?

(b) 2015-16?

(c) 2016-17?

(d) 2017-18?

(e) 2018/19?

469. What proportion of the electricity consumed by each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio by name for those years came from renewable sources? Please name each source of energy (coal, solar, wind, etc.) and the proportion of the total electricity used.

470. How much money was spent on electricity for each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio by name in each of the above financial years?

471. What was the name of the energy supplier to each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio by name for those financial years?
472. How much electricity is it estimated that each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio will consume in:
- (a) 2019-20?
 - (b) 2020-21?
 - (c) 2021-22?
473. What proportion of that electricity is it estimated will come from renewable sources, for each year?
474. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio by name, please provide the estimated proportion of energy to be used from each kind of energy (coal, gas, solar, wind etc.)?
475. What is the name of the energy supplier to each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio for each of:
- (a) 2019-20?
 - (b) 2020-21?
 - (c) 2021-22?

ANSWER Q468 - 475:

Please refer to my answer to questions 132 - 139.

General Costs

476. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:
- (a) Any gardening services used for indoor or outdoor pot plants/flowers maintenance?
 - i. Who are the contracts with?
 - ii. How much does each contract cost?
 - iii. How often do they visit?
 - iv. How much was spent on this service in financial year:

- 2015-16
 - 2016-17
 - 2017-18
 - 2018-19?
- (b) Any floral displays or indoor plants or pot plants hired or leased for display in any offices?
- i. Who were the contracts with?
 - ii. How much was each contract cost?
 - iii. How much was spent on this service in financial year:
 - 2015-16
 - 2016-17
 - 2017-18
 - 2018-19?

ANSWERS:

476. Please refer to my answer to question 140.

Domestic Violence Leave Policies, Awareness and Usage

477. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

- (a) A copy of the entity's policy or web link to the entity's domestic violence leave policy;
- (b) Date of introduction of domestic violence leave into enterprise agreements/contracts of employment, awards as applicable;
- (c) Whether or not all employees and/or contractors are eligible for domestic violence leave;
- (d) Number of days of domestic violence leave that have been taken in each financial year since the introduction of such leave;
- (e) Number of days available for eligible staff to access domestic violence leave in each financial year;
- (f) Number of other personal days of leave that have been taken in each financial year since the introduction of domestic violence leave;

- (g) Number of sick days available for eligible staff to access domestic violence leave in each financial year;
- (h) Whether or not all staff and/or contractors have access to Employee Assistance Programs?
- (i) What training has been undertaken with management and administration for those involved in approving and/or processing domestic violence leave on issues such as?
 - i. Privacy and confidentiality of information about domestic violence
 - ii. Access to emotional, psychological, financial and medical support which may be required

478. Who has provided training on domestic violence in the workplace?

479. What percentage of staff in each agency has undertaken domestic violence training?

480. What efforts have been made to ensure that perpetrators (or their accomplices) within the staffing profile are not able to access personal information of victims in order to identify their location, or other information which may assist in committing domestic violence against them, including changing or accessing records in such a way as to disadvantage them financially or legally?

ANSWER Q477 – 480:

Please refer to my responses to questions 141 – 144.

Sexual harassment and Anti-bullying training and awareness programs

481. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

- (a) Date of introduction of sexual harassment and anti-bullying training and awareness programs and a copy of such documentation.
 - i. Whether or not all employees and/or contractors have received such training?
 - ii. Is this course mandatory for all employees/ contractors?
 - iii. How long for each session, how many sessions?
 - iv. Who delivers it?
 - v. Is the program tailored to take into consideration specific needs of LGBTQIA, ATSI and CALD or other at risk groups?

- How?
- (b) What percentage of staff in each department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio have undertaken sexual harassment and anti- bullying training and awareness programs?
- (c) How many complaints have been initiated in relation to:
- i. Sexual harassment
 - ii. Bullying
 - iii. Workplace violence

ANSWER:

481. Please refer to my answer to question 145.

Participation of women in Government

482. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report:

- (a) What number and percentage of women are employed within the department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio?
- (b) What number and percentage of women are employed within the management levels of the department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio?
- (c) What number and percentage of women are employed in the top ten leadership positions of the department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio?
- (d) What strategies does the department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio use to encourage women in to management and leadership positions?
- (e) What is the gender pay gap within your department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio?
- (f) Does the department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio report participation of women figures to Women NSW on a regular basis?

ANSWER:

482. Please refer to my answer to question 146.

Professional Photography

483. How much has been spent on professional photography for the following financial years:

- (a) 2015-16
- (b) 2016-17
- (c) 2017-18
- (d) 2018-2019
- (e) 2019-present?

ANSWER:

483. Please refer to my answer to question 147.

Unmanned Aerial Services

484. How much has been spent on Unmanned Aerial Services for the following financial years:

- (a) 2015-16
- (b) 2016-17
- (c) 2017-18
- (d) 2018-2019
- (e) 2019-present?

ANSWER:

484. Please refer to my answer to question 148.

Seconded Staff

485. How many staff from your department, statutory agency and/or other body within your portfolio have been seconded to your Ministerial Office, for the following financial years:

- (a) 2015-16
- (b) 2016-17
- (c) 2017-18
- (d) 2018-2019
- (e) 2019-present?

486. Please provide their names, their substantive work title, and their seconded work title.

ANSWER Q485 - 486:

Please refer to my answer to questions 149–150.

Consultant Costs

487. For each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio please report, the total expenditure on consultants by financial year:

- (a) 2015-16
- (b) 2016-17
- (c) 2017-18
- (d) 2018-2019
- (e) 2019-present?

488. What are names and values of the five most expensive reports produced by consultancies for each department, statutory agency and/or other body in the Minister's portfolio by financial year:

- (a) 2015-16
- (b) 2016-17
- (c) 2017-18
- (d) 2018-2019
- (e) 2019-present?

ANSWER 487 - 488:

Please refer to my answer to questions 151–152.

GIPA Questions to the CEOs/ Department Secretaries

489. Since March 30, how many formal GIPAs have your cluster/ department received?

490. Out of the received formal GIPAs, how many have you determined to:

- (a) Grant full access to the information?
- (b) Grant partial access to the information?
- (c) Not grant access to the information?

491. Out of the GIPA where partial information or no information was granted, how many have decided to appeal?

- (a) Out of those who have decided to appeal, how many have decided to use:
 - i. The agency's internal appeals' mechanism?
 - ii. Review by the Information Commissioner?

iii. Review by NCAT?

(b) How many of those GIPAs have been overturned on appeal?

i. Internal appeals' mechanism?

ii. Review of the Information Commissioner?

iii. Review by NCAT?

492. GIPAs that have been granted full or partial access, how many appear on the agency's disclosure log?

(a) What is the rationale for not putting GIPAs on the agency's disclosure log (excluding GIPAs asking for personal information)?

493. Has any GIPAs that appeared on the agency's disclosure log been taken down?

(a) For what reason/s?

ANSWER 489 - 493:

Please refer to my answer to questions 153–157.