

**BUDGET ESTIMATES 2019**  
**MINISTER FOR SKILLS AND TERTIARY EDUCATION**  
**QUESTIONS TAKEN ON NOTICE DURING THE HEARING**

---

**Page No. 2 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Minister, I assume you have read the recent Workforce Skills Survey report released by the New South Wales Business Chamber?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I am aware of it.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Have you been briefed on that report?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I had a quick briefing on it, amongst many things.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Did you notice the huge increase in skills shortages this year?

Dr GEOFF LEE: Yes, I think that is right across.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Do you remember the number?

Dr GEOFF LEE: No, I will take that on notice.

**ANSWER**

Refer to figures reported in the NSW Business Chamber *Workforce Skills Survey 2019*.

**Page No. 2 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: I have limited time so I will stop you. I agree with your sentiments that we need to encourage more students to undertake VET education, but this is not happening in a vacuum. This is happening in the context of your government increasing fees by 20 per cent and slashing staff. This is not just purely a societal affect; this is also a direct consequence of your government's decisions. How are you addressing skills shortages in the fibrous plastering skills trade?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take that question on notice unless the secretary or deputy secretary would like to add anything.

Ms O'LOUGHLIN: What I would add is that under our Smart and Skills Program, which is administered by Training Services NSW, we have funding for occupations and skills on the skills list. That skills list includes the skills that are in shortage across New South Wales. I could take on notice if the one you have asked about is on the skills list.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: I can tell you that it is on the 457 temporary work (skilled) visa list—fibrous plastering. If you do not have the information at hand about where it is being offered I can tell you that only two TAFEs offer it—Albury and Maitland. Minister, what is your reflection on that?

Dr GEOFF LEE: Certainly there are skills shortages right across different industries, whether it is construction, manufacturing, service industries—many different industries. We have something like, off the top of my head, 600 courses on the Smart and Skilled list that we actually fund. We have invested significant amounts—something like \$2.3 billion—in the Skills budget in New South Wales this year. We acknowledge that we must develop a comprehensive approach to how we target the right skills and the skills shortages. Let me assure you that TAFE is part of that solution.

**ANSWER**

The nationally accredited vocational education and training (VET) qualifications for plastering are on the NSW Skills List (*Certificate III in Solid Plastering* and *Certificate III in Wall and Ceiling Lining*). This means the course cost is heavily subsidised and is fee-free when undertaken as an apprenticeship. NSW also offers fee-free pre-apprenticeships and pre-traineeships for school leavers.

### **Page No. 3 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: How are you addressing skills shortages in the fibrous plastering skills trade?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take that question on notice unless the secretary or deputy secretary would like to add anything.

Ms O'LOUGHLIN: What I would add is that under our Smart and Skills Program, which is administered by Training Services NSW, we have funding for occupations and skills on the skills list. That skills list includes the skills that are in shortage across New South Wales. I could take on notice if the one you have asked about is on the skills list.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: I can tell you that it is on the 457 temporary work (skilled) visa list—fibrous plastering. If you do not have the information at hand about where it is being offered I can tell you that only two TAFEs offer it—Albury and Maitland. Minister, what is your reflection on that?

Dr GEOFF LEE: Certainly there are skills shortages right across different industries, whether it is construction, manufacturing, service industries—many different industries. We have something like, off the top of my head, 600 courses on the Smart and Skilled list that we actually fund. We have invested significant amounts—something like \$2.3 billion—in the Skills budget in New South Wales this year. We acknowledge that we must develop a comprehensive approach to how we target the right skills and the skills shortages. Let me assure you that TAFE is part of that solution.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: TAFE is a key part of the solution.

Dr GEOFF LEE: Absolutely, I agree with you, and I am more than happy to look at individual cases. It is great to see that TAFE is actually delivering in two sections, that it delivers some 1,200 courses across 130 different campuses right across the State. Certainly we would be more than happy to take individual cases on notice and get back to the Committee.

### **ANSWER**

I am advised that TAFE NSW currently delivers Certificate III in Wall and Ceiling Lining, which includes fibrous plastering, at our Maitland (North Region), Orange (West Region) and Lidcombe (Western Sydney) campuses.

I am further advised that the national training package for the Certificate III in Wall and Ceiling Lining is currently being updated and that TAFE NSW, through the Infrastructure, Energy and Construction SkillsPoint, is working closely with industry to ensure that future training needs in fibrous plastering will be met.

**Page No. 4 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Let me move on and talk about the wall and floor tiling trade. Do you know how many TAFEs in New South Wales offer that one?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take that on notice, unless the Deputy Secretary or Managing Director of TAFE

Ms PENTON: Given the nature of that particular trade, I will take that question on notice so that we can provide accurate information to the Committee.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that currently seven TAFE NSW campuses offer wall and floor tiling trade.

**Page No. 5 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Thank you very much, Mr Chair. Minister, this particular report said that the demand for construction trades is well above the national average in New South Wales. The national average is 4.5 per cent. The survey results are 6.8 per cent. We have two key skill shortages that we are bringing people in from overseas to fill but TAFE is not training our local kids. What is your answer to that?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I am very proud to say that New South Wales is doing exceedingly well in terms of its construction industry. I think that is largely due to the \$93 billion of infrastructure that New South Wales is delivering over the next four years through projects like WestConnex and others like that. We also have the Infrastructure Skills Legacy Program, which has allowed the opportunity for over 5,000, nearly 6,000 people to get their first taste of work in the construction industry. It is—

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Minister, we will get to trade work on government projects later in questioning. What I am asking is how you are addressing these specific skill shortages in TAFE.

Dr GEOFF LEE: As I said before—and I will hand it over to the secretary or to the acting managing director, Kerry Penton, in a second—there are 100,000 free apprenticeships that we are rolling out over the next four years. From memory, over 23,000 apprentices have taken up the free apprenticeships around that. I am more than happy to get the exact number if my colleagues have it. Certainly the 70,000 traineeships as of 1 January are very important and the 30,000 mature age places will be very—

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government currently funds 122 apprenticeship qualifications under its Smart and Skilled program.

From 1 July 2018, the Fee Free Apprenticeships Initiative has removed the student fees for eligible students undertaking these apprenticeship qualifications, with 100,000 fee-free apprenticeships available over a four year period until 2022.

Of the 25,151 fee-free apprenticeships taken up (as of 13 September 2019) since the introduction of the initiative, construction related qualifications have made up the majority of these.

**Page No. 6 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: —because we have plenty of time with the public servants this afternoon. Minister, how many of the 100,000 free places will be offered in fibrous plastering and wall and floor tiling?

Dr GEOFF LEE: Certainly as the secretary explained, this is a demand-driven system.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Okay. Why don't you just take that on notice and why don't you tell me then how many of them will be offered—

Dr GEOFF LEE: No, I was trying to answer the question.

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government does not set numbers on how many places will be offered in a specific apprenticeship qualifications. The numbers of students taking up fee-free places in the areas of fibrous plastering and wall and floor tiling are dependent on demand.

**Page No. 10 – The Hon. MARK LATHAM**

The CHAIR: Can we come to this question of the ASQA audits? Because there is a single registered training organisation [RTO] registration system in place, they do not do the full 130 audits, do they? They just do a sample?

Ms PENTON: That is correct.

The CHAIR: Is that limited in itself?

Ms PENTON: Because the whole system is regulated from an ASQA perspective—it is the national regulator—and that is absolutely focused on consistency of quality across the sector, audits that are undertaken are, by and large, samples and they happen periodically.

The CHAIR: How many sites will they visit in New South Wales each year?

Ms PENTON: From a TAFE NSW perspective, before we transition to one TAFE and bring all of our 12 RTOs together, it happened on a cyclical basis approximately every five years but I will get that exact data.

**ANSWER**

Whilst the number of audits and locations are a matter for ASQA, I am advised that in the most recent re-registration audit, completed in September 2019, ASQA audited 31 different courses delivered by TAFE NSW. I am further advised that following this audit, TAFE NSW received a 7 year renewal from ASQA, the maximum renewal possible.

**Page No. 10 - The Hon. MARK LATHAM**

**The CHAIR:** So in 2018 how many courses would have been suspended because ASQA found them to be substandard?

**Ms PENTON:** I would have to take that question on notice.

**The CHAIR:** Can you do that for the last five years, if the data is available?

**Ms PENTON:** I would have to take that question on notice.

**ANSWER**

For the period 2014-2018, ASQA suspended three TAFE NSW courses. I am further advised that there are currently no courses at TAFE NSW suspended by ASQA.



**Page No. 11 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Minister, how many fee-free places have been taken up this year?

Dr GEOFF LEE: In terms of the apprenticeships?

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: You have talked about a number of different programs?

Dr GEOFF LEE: Yes, 100,000—

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: You have talked about a number of different programs, a number of different—

The Hon. SCOTT FARLOW: The Minister is attempting to answer your question.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: He asked a question back to me.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: They are helping each other while he is waiting to get the note, Wes.

The Hon. WES FANG: I didn't say anything; it was Scott.

The CHAIR: The Minister has the floor.

Dr GEOFF LEE: If it is on the skills list the apprenticeships will be fee-free. The total number also depends on how many employers are willing to take them on. I will take it on notice for the exact number. I do not want to mislead anyone. I will take it on notice is probably the best way to do it rather than mislead you.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Is it on track is the question?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I would assume so, yes.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Assume? Guess?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I have said I will take it on notice.

**ANSWER**

As of 24 September 2019, there have been 18,947 fee-free apprenticeships taken up since 1 January 2019.

The program commenced on 1 July 2018.

## QUESTION No. 10

### Page No. 12 - 13 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: In light of that, you appear to be very well briefed on CLCs. Can you tell me how many students are currently enrolled in the Quirindi CLC?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take that on notice, unless Ms Penton has a number.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to tell me how many students were enrolled at Quirindi TAFE college before the CLC was opened?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take that on notice.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: What about Tenterfield CLC? How many students are enrolled at Tenterfield CLC?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take that on notice.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to tell us how many students were enrolled at Tenterfield TAFE college before the CLC was opened?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take that on notice too. I just want to get you the right figure, that is all.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to provide us details of how many students are currently enrolled in the eight Connected Learning Centres in New South Wales?

Dr GEOFF LEE: Certainly I will take that on notice. That is the 14 centres you are talking about?

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Fourteen.

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take that on notice, to give you an exact figure.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: How many courses are offered at each centre? Are you able to provide details on that?

Dr GEOFF LEE: Again, I will take that on notice. That is probably best, unless Ms Penton would like to elaborate on that?

Ms PENTON: Certainly the design of the courses and the number of courses have increased over time. We have to give the exact course list but there are examples where we will increase the range of courses at some centres by 25 per cent. Some of them are in the early stages and are just being built, others are more mature. We are certainly sharing those learnings across the CLCs.

## ANSWER

I am advised that information on enrolments is available in the TAFE annual report, which can be found at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/about-tafensw/annual-report>. I am further advised that on opening of many Connected Learning Centre sites, twice as many courses were available to local students than had been previously available in those communities.

**Page No. 14 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Minister, you are confident that facilities available at CLCs are up to standard? Can you guarantee that all CLCs have toilets, for example?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I would assume every CLC has a toilet but I am more than happy to—it is an unusual question. I would assume that as part of their build—

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: As I understand it, in Dapto they do not—

Dr GEOFF LEE: —and their development application [DA] and their building application [BA]. I am more than happy to look at that but when you build a building, normal council compliance—you have access to toilets, you have access for people with special needs, you would have running water, you would have electricity.

**ANSWER**

The Dapto Access Point is not a CLC. I am advised that the Dapto Access Point has toilet access for both students and staff.

**Page No. 14 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Minister, how many teachers are employed on a full-time basis at a CLC in New South Wales? What is the staffing model?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take that on notice.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: You are not briefed on that one?

Ms PENTON: It varies across the State, depending on the location.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Is there a staffing formula for CLCs?

Ms PENTON: Staffing formulas? In the development of the CLCs we have looked at the workforce model for them but also considering that they are based at existing campuses. Some of them are refits of existing campuses as well. So all of our campuses have an existing workforce. Where there are new ones we are obviously adding staff for those as well in communities where we have not had campuses based previously. I can take that question on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that the location and number of teachers varies across CLCs. For all new CLCs, the teaching profile is determined by the course profile and enables TAFE NSW to bring specialist teachers into each location.

**Page No. 15 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: I do. I have a question about Certificate IV in Ageing Support which I understand is offered at Ultimo TAFE and has a very specific requirement in terms of face-to-face. Then at Singleton CLC that standard is substantially different. Do you have details of that?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take it on notice and get back to you.

Mr SCOTT: Can I add, it is a different mode of delivery. That is the way it has been designed. We have ongoing issues and challenges that have existed for decades now about access to high quality higher education, technical and further education and vocational education for students in regional areas. If you look at the data you will see that participation rates over decades now have been lower in higher education, vocational education and TAFE for students in rural and regional settings than they have been in metropolitan areas. I think one of the great opportunities that comes with digital technology and access to fast broadband is to help students overcome the tyranny of distance. That will mean different modes of delivery. One of the things that these CLCs provide with digital enhanced and flexible learning is access for students in regional communities and it provides access to great teachers wherever those teachers may be. They may not be in every town or regional centre and you may need to beam them in, which is what this technology allows us to do. CLCs are complemented by mobile training units and these provide the physical resources to deliver high quality, practical hands-on training alongside digitally enabled and face-to-face learning. It is a different mode. If your question is: Are connected learning centres different and is the mode of delivery different? Yes, but there are real upsides that come with that opportunity and that is why they have been created, that is why they have been expanded, that is why the Minister has opened a few and that is why TAFE will continue to monitor the impact of these CLCs over time to see whether, in fact, as the Minister says, it is an important complement to the traditional offerings.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: The line of questioning is about whether participants in courses in rural and regional areas through CLCs are getting a substandard course compared to what is provided in the urban context. Coming back to the question about Certificate IV in ageing, this is background to the question: 20 hours of face-to-face if you do it in Ultimo but in Singleton it is attend the CLC on every second Wednesday from 3.00 p.m. to 5.00 p.m. It is clearly a different standard. The same course but a different standard in terms of the expectations and quality of learning that is being provided. What do you say to that, Minister?

Dr GEOFF LEE: What you described, can you read it out again? Twenty hours face-to-face?

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Twenty hours face-to-face 9.00 a.m. to 4.00 p.m. in Ultimo and at Singleton every second Wednesday 3.00 p.m. to 5.00 p.m.

Dr GEOFF LEE: You are asserting that it is 20 hours of face-to-face over what period? Is that per week or month?

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Your weekly timetable.

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will get back to you about that with the specific details of courses. Can I say that Ms Penton was highlighting the need for quality assurance and common standards across the State delivering any Certificate IV. Each certificate has a requirement. The way it is delivered may be slightly different but there are common standards across all our Certificate IVs in any particular issue. I am more than happy to get back to you about it.

Ms PENTON: Without further detail, if it is 20 hours a week at Ultimo it might be full-time study for those particular students. Many of our students also study part-time because they are working at the same time as well. We will take that question on notice and provide additional information to the Committee to compare the two delivery modes.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that TAFE NSW determines the amount of training provided to each learner by considering the existing skills, knowledge and experience of the learner and the mode of delivery.

I understand that the Certificate IV in Ageing Support delivered in Singleton and Ultimo both provide students with high quality learning and follow the same Unit of Competency packaging rules. The amount of face-to-face training required to achieve learning outcomes at the two locations takes into consideration the existing skills, knowledge and experience of the targeted student cohorts.

I am further advised that the Certificate IV in Ageing Support at Ultimo campus is a full time course for international and domestic learners, many of whom have no or limited previous industry experience, whilst the Certificate IV in Ageing Support at Singleton Connected Learning Centre is a part time blended delivery course for learners who are existing workers in the industry and have completed a Certificate III in Individual Support.

**Page No. 15 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Minister, are any students with disability involved at CLCs?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I would initially say yes but I will take that on notice. I do not want to mislead.

TAFE on average has one out of 11 students that have identified with a special need. You would assume that ratio would continue through the CLCs because they are just part of the community.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are there onsite support services provided for students with a disability at a CLC?

**ANSWER**

I am advised that students with a disability are enrolled at CLCs. TAFE NSW provides support and reasonable adjustments to students with a disability in line with requirements under the *Disability Discrimination Act 1992* (Cth) including on-site pre-enrolment and vocational support, note taking and assistive technology as required.

**Page No. 17, 18 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: The commitment your Government gave was eight new TAFE campuses. Are you delivering eight new TAFE campuses or are you delivering eight new connected learning centres?

Dr GEOFF LEE: We are delivering eight new connected learning centres, which are TAFE facilities run by TAFE.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I will put this to you: The promises your Government made were misleading when it said there were eight new TAFE campuses, because it is not delivering that, it is delivering eight new connected learning centres. What do you say?

Dr GEOFF LEE: We are delivering eight new connected learning centres, which are TAFE-run facilities.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: What was the rationale for the choice of these new regional connected learning centres? What was the study? Where was the report that identified where they should happen?

Dr GEOFF LEE: Obviously, as Minister for the past 23 weeks, clearly the rationale and the election commitments were done before my time. I am more than happy to take that question on notice.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Perhaps Mr Scott can help.

Dr GEOFF LEE: Mr Scott, you may talk about the reasons why.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Like it or lump it, Minister, you are responsible for what happened before you, though.

The CHAIR: No, let us hear from Mr Scott.

Mr SCOTT: I would add, but I do not want to be churlish, that TAFE joined the Education portfolio after the election as well. But let me give a little more detail. The commitment is clear: The commitment was to invest \$62 million to allow students likely to access State TAFE's statewide network of campuses and courses. That is what it talked about—connecting students to TAFE's statewide network of campuses and courses, which is, of course, what these connected learning centres are all about. There it is in the commitment with the dollar figures. We can go through them. I am happy to go through them. There is going to be one at Batemans Bay, one at Nambucca Heads, one at Nelson Bay, Byron Bay, Cobar, Hay, Jindabyne and West Wyalong.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Point of order: I take a point of order on the question. My question was: What was the study? What was the detailed planning that was relied upon to choose the eight regional campuses—not a list?

The CHAIR: The difficulty we have is that neither the Minister nor the senior official was involved in this portfolio area when this was undertaken.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Rather than an unrelated answer—

The CHAIR: They will take it on notice and give us an answer, and hunt down the culprits.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that strategic planning for new facilities considers a range of factors including student demand, community needs, industry growth, and local economic development.

I am further advised that CLC locations were selected on the basis of expanding the TAFE NSW footprint in areas without a TAFE presence, population growth in identified areas, and the identified skills needs of those areas.



**Page No. 19 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Minister, the TAFE budget in 2015-2016 was, in nominal dollars, \$1.991 billion. The TAFE budget in this financial year, not adjusted for inflation, in nominal dollars is \$1.85 billion less than it was in 2015-2016. How is that addressing a skills shortage?

Dr GEOFF LEE: What we have to do is be very careful that we use every dollar of taxpayers' money to actually address the skills shortages. That is why the Smart and Skilled Program, the Government's policy of looking at critical skills shortages across a whole range of courses that our skills list provides, and looking at those skills, so we must use every single dollar effectively. What we want to do, for instance, for those 100,000 fee-free apprenticeships and I understand—I was passed a note—that the uptake so far has been 23,000, and you asked that before, so we are roughly tracking on the right number of 100,000, so that is over four years. But certainly we must use every dollar properly. I think it is about efficiently using that so that is what the one TAFE reform is about: It is about reducing those back-end costs, the avoidable costs, so that we can actually have those frontline staff—our teachers.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Can you provide the figure on notice about what the real reduction, adjusted for inflation, has been—the real reduction between 2015-2016 and the current year budget? Can you provide that on notice?

Dr GEOFF LEE: All the figures are available in the annual reports and the budget papers.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: This is budget estimates, Minister. We want to know and I think the community has a right for you to give the answer to what the reduction is, adjusted for inflation, between 2015-2016 and your current budget. Will you do that?

Dr GEOFF LEE: All that information is available in the budget papers.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: What is it? They are not available in the budget papers. They are not available from the budget papers, Minister. They are not in the budget papers. Will you provide the answer?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I refer you back to the budget papers and the TAFE annual reports.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: They are not in the budget papers, Minister.

The CHAIR: I think the point is if the material is not in the budget papers you can take it on notice and provide the information to the committee.

Dr GEOFF LEE: Yes.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that TAFE NSW has an expenditure budget of \$1.85 billion in the 2019/20 financial year, an increase of 3.1% increase on the 2018/19 Budget. Further information on total TAFE NSW expenditure is available in the Budget Papers that can be found at:

[www.budget.nsw.gov.au](http://www.budget.nsw.gov.au)

**Page No. 20 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: How much State Government money went to VET providers that are not TAFE?

Dr GEOFF LEE: Other registered training organisations [RTOs]?

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Yes, other Vocational Education and Training.

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take that on notice. I want to get you the exact figure. I told you TAFE gets 80 per cent. I think it is an increase in last year. I think it is a 3.1 per cent increase over the previous year. But certainly for the exact number in terms of the other 361 RTOs, I think it is probably best if I get the right number to give to the committee.

**ANSWER**

During fiscal year 2018-19, private providers reported student activity to the value of \$243m within the Smart and Skilled program.

The CHAIR: Can I address a question about skills shortages and the best way of meeting them? Is it possible for governments to spend a lot more money on TAFE, but not address skills shortage because there is a huge wastage rate—people with non-completion? Victoria recently had shocking statistics to show that only 30 per cent of the students there gained a qualification—a 70 per cent non-completion rate. What are the comparable statistics in New South Wales?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will defer to Kerry Penton probably, or the secretary, in terms of that. Let me assure you—you highlight a good point—it is not just about the quantum that we enrol in the course, it is about the quantum that we actually get out the other door.

The CHAIR: Yes, who completes it—the outcomes.

Dr GEOFF LEE: And as a past educator, I know one of our key metrics was to reduce attrition in year 1 because we know that if you get through year 1 you are probably going to get through your course. The difficulties I see in the VET sector is that we ask people to do apprenticeships. They are 16 or 17 years old, they may start an apprenticeship—I was in the landscaping industry—and they may think, "I like the outdoors life", but then they get a year into it and go, "Hang on, it is really hot and really cold and really wet and rainy", and they want to leave and do something else, maybe in an office, and are not suitable for that career. We are dealing with an area of peoples decision-making that is changing rapidly in their formative years, and I think you are exactly right: The attrition rate, keeping them in the programs, is so important to actually gain the maximum—

The CHAIR: Yes, how are we going with that, Kerry?

Ms PENTON: From a completion rate, it does vary across levels of qualification, as the Minister said.

The CHAIR: But the 130 colleges—what is the comparable New South Wales statistic?

Ms PENTON: I would have to take that question on notice in order to provide you with an accurate—

The CHAIR: What was the general stat you were going to provide? Is that your answer: that it varies across qualifications?

Ms PENTON: It does vary between qualifications and between student cohorts.

The CHAIR: But you can get us the exact number?

Ms PENTON: We will provide that information for the Committee.

## **ANSWER**

I am advised that NCVER's Total VET completion rates for TAFE NSW in 2017 was 52.6 per cent (projected for Certificate I and above). This is an increase from 2016, where NCVER's Total VET completion rates for TAFE NSW was 48.1 per cent (projected for Certificate I and above).

## Page No. 21 - The Hon MARK LATHAM

The CHAIR: What steps are being taken to improve measurement of TAFE and private RTO student outcomes in the building sector, especially those obtaining qualifications through recognised prior learning pathways?

Dr GEOFF LEE: We have a strong and robust framework for ongoing assessment in terms of our Training Services NSW and the 362 RTOs they fund, of which TAFE is one. I will ask Ms O'Loughlin to maybe detail some of those, but additionally we have Australian Skills Quality Authority [ASQA] reporting and monitoring and compliance requirements, which are significantly—

The CHAIR: Specifically, have the officials, departments and authorities said, "Look, there is a problem clearly with the standard of work in these apartment towers. Does it relate to the types of skills that we are producing in the building sector as vocational education providers in New South Wales, and can we examine that and, if there is a problem, how are we fixing it?"

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: You must have heard employers saying, "There is a certificate, but they haven't got the skills."

The CHAIR: Yes, "They don't know what they are doing."

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: You must have heard that.

The CHAIR: It is not a long bow; I think there is a direct linkage here. I am trying to get information on whether it is under examination and what solutions are being put in place.

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will let Ms O'Loughlin answer that in a second, but whenever there is a problem and there are complaints, those complaints are investigated. They are looked at to see whether there is a systemic problem. Of course, you often hear anecdotal evidence that someone got a certificate and they should not have got a certificate. But where there are systemic problems and we hear complaints—

The CHAIR: Yes, but this is a high-profile, specific industry problem that we are all very worried about. Has it been examined in terms of the skills quality, and what are we doing about it? Ms O'Loughlin?

Ms O'LOUGHLIN: In terms of the specific question going to the problems at the moment in the construction industry and buildings, I would have to take that on notice. I do not know if there has been an investigation into the skills quality for those builds.

## ANSWER

The NSW Department of Education conducts performance monitoring of all RTOs with a Smart and Skilled contract to ensure that they meet quality requirements.

Construction qualifications have been identified as high risk qualifications so they are monitored more frequently.

The system for developing and updating national qualifications is industry-led with Industry Reference Committees (IRCs) responsible for the training packages and qualifications in their industry sector. Every year, the IRCs identify new, emerging and changing skills needs and training package updates needed in their industry through Industry Skills Forecasts and Proposed Schedules of Work.

**Page No. 24 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Minister, I note that there is an acting managing director. How many managing directors or acting managing directors have you had in TAFE over the past two years?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I have been Minister for 23 weeks and I have had one acting managing director, who is very competent. I just want to say thank you very much, Kerry, for stepping up. Very good. And Caralee McLiesh as a managing director.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: And before?

Dr GEOFF LEE: She was a fantastic part of Treasury. Highly reputable in Treasury. I think it is fantastic that in TAFE we have people—

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: I will bring you back, Minister. The question was about numbers. It is two acting managing directors? How long has it been?

Dr GEOFF LEE: Under the last 23 weeks.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: And when do you expect to fill this vacancy?

Mr SCOTT: No, only one acting director.

Dr GEOFF LEE: One, sorry.

The CHAIR: One acting?

Mr SCOTT: One acting. Can I clarify? Ms McLiesh was the managing director of TAFE when the Minister took over the portfolio. I think we should acknowledge not only the tremendous job that she did but also the very important job that she was awarded, and that was to be the treasury secretary for New Zealand. She has now left to take up that role. We congratulate her on that. It is an outstanding job and a tribute not only to her long service in NSW Treasury but also to her distinguished stewardship of New South Wales TAFE. Now Ms Penton has taken over as acting managing director as we seek to fill the role.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: And when will that be?

Mr SCOTT: The position has been advertised. I understand that applications have closed. Then we will proceed with the recruitment process and finally the appointment is made by the Governor under the Technical and Further Education Commission Act. That process is well underway. In the interim, Ms Penton is doing an outstanding job. She has 30 years experience in TAFE and has the wider respect of her executive team.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: And you have got an acting chief delivery officer, is that correct? How many of those has TAFE had over the last two years?

Dr GEOFF LEE: Is that a question for me or—

Mr SCOTT: We do have an acting chief delivery officer, because Ms Penton was the chief delivery officer. She is already working 100 hours a week as TAFE acting manager and we thought it was inappropriate for her to keep her other job at the same time so of course we want someone acting.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: So what about the other delivery officers in the regions? How many of those are in acting positions?

Mr SCOTT: We can take that on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that information on senior executives at TAFE NSW is available in the TAFE Annual Report available at: <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/corporate/annual-report>.

**Page No. 25 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Mr Shoebridge referred to the 20 per cent reduction in student numbers. How does that reconcile with an increase in the number of staff? Is that a result of a change in the staffing mix in favour of more casual and temporary staff? Is that how that change in the workload is being managed?

Dr GEOFF LEE: What we are saying is there has been a 6.8 per cent increase in full-time equivalents.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: But not in permanent staff, is it?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take that on notice in terms of numbers, unless Ms Penton would like to talk about the exact numbers. But I will take that on notice.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Would Ms Penton like to talk about the exact numbers? Do you have those numbers?

Ms PENTON: I will take that question on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that on preliminary figures for June 2019, there were 5,827 full-time equivalent teachers, an increase of 6.8% over the previous year. Final figures will be available in the 2018-19 Annual Report. I am also advised that further information on TAFE NSW staff numbers are included in the TAFE NSW Annual Reports available at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/corporate/annual-report>.

**Page No. 26 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Minister, can you tell me why there has been a 16.7 per cent increase in the number of injury claims last year?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take that on notice, unless Ms Penton has any advice on the OHS injuries?

Ms PENTON: Certainly, safety in TAFE NSW is a high priority and we carefully track all of the statistics that we have with respect to injury and those things.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: That is a big increase, though, isn't it, in one financial year?

Ms PENTON: I would like to take the question on notice, but I will also note that, by way of—

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: It is derived straight from the annual report.

Ms PENTON: Yes.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Some 250 claims in 2016-2017, up to 300 claims in 2017-2018.

Ms PENTON: We look at the trend data overtime. Certainly, under the old—

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: You have no idea what is driving that?

Mr SCOTT: Can I add? I know from my discussions with Ms Penton and I know from my time attending TAFE board meetings that there is an absolute blitz and focus in TAFE on work health and safety, and the safety and wellbeing of students, teachers and anyone who is engaged with TAFE. At the commencement of every meeting there is a safety share, which puts on the agenda, early on, the priority of safety. There has been a strong push throughout the organisation to increase reporting to make it clear that if there is an incident or a near miss we expect for that to be reported through and for that to be documented. We note the figures this year. As Ms Penton said, what is most significant will be the long-term trend of that, given the focus on safety that has come to bear under Ms McLiesh and Ms Penton. The Chair of the TAFE board is very strong on this as well. We want to make sure that everyone goes home feeling even better, fitter and healthier than when they arrived at the college. That is the aim. Let us monitor the figures over time and we want to see improvement.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Is part of this increase being driven by psychological injuries, stress-related?

Ms PENTON: Again, I would want to be giving you detailed figures, so I will take that question on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that preliminary information there were 264 work health and safety claims in the 2018/19 financial year. Final figures will be available in the 2018-19 Annual Report. Further information on Work, Health and Safety matters is available in the TAFE annual report available at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/corporate/annual-report>.

**Page No. 26 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: On 30 April 2018 TAFE NSW recruitment sent an invitation to an information session on 8 May. According to the invitation the information session would provide participants with details of how to become a part-time casual teacher with TAFE. How many people attended this information session? Are you aware of this? This is the Calling All Tradies.

Dr GEOFF LEE: Can I say that you have highlighted an important issue in TAFE, and its management of its staff and qualified staff to teach. You will see that we need more qualified people in some disciplines or some areas of expertise.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you aware of the numbers, Minister?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will certainly take that on notice in terms of the numbers if you have any specific examples you want me to find out about. Can I suggest to you that one of the areas that we are trying to do is develop pools of qualified people who are able to teach in our system because we know our teachers are the most important asset we have in TAFE. They are the ones who provide that world-class training and, as a former TAFE teacher, and, in fact my father was a TAFE teacher—

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: I suppose I am trying to get to the detail of whether this particular program was successful.

Dr GEOFF LEE: I am more than happy to take that on notice.

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government is focused on ensuring that there are more frontline TAFE teachers and has undertaken several initiatives to attract new teachers to TAFE NSW, including the Calling All Tradies program. I am advised that on preliminary figures for June 2019, there were 5,827 full-time equivalent teachers at TAFE NSW, an increase of 6.8% over the previous year. Final figures will be available in the 2018-19 Annual Report.



**Page No. 27 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Minister, what is the current proportion of teaching staff in TAFE that is casual and what is the current proportion that is permanent?

Dr GEOFF LEE: As I said, staff is the most important part of our business with our students. As a past teacher I know that we need to focus on—

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Minister, I have only 6½ half minutes. It was a simple question about the proportion that is casual and the proportion that is permanent. If you do not know, you can take it on notice.

Dr GEOFF LEE: I will take it on notice if I can, and ask Ms Penton to do that as well.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Could you provide the same for support staff?

Dr GEOFF LEE: Yes.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: As Mr Scott said earlier, getting a historical view of this is important. Can you give us what the changes have been over the past three years—the figures for the past three years?

Dr GEOFF LEE: I am happy to see if they are available. I would assume they would have been in annual reports.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that on preliminary figures for June 2019, there were 5,827 full-time equivalent teachers, an increase of 6.8% over the previous year. Final figures will be available in the 2018-19 Annual Report. I am also advised that further information on TAFE NSW staff numbers are included in the TAFE NSW Annual Reports available at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/corporate/annual-report>.

**Page No. 28 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

The CHAIR: This system of universities becoming judge and jury comes out of the United States. Have the Minister and the officials examined the circumstances in the US, particularly The Hunting Ground project, where a young African American man had a large part of his career and life opportunities destroyed by false allegations that were made at Harvard Law School. They were subsequently condemned by 19 Harvard law professors, including Charles Ogletree, who is not a conservative and was the mentor of Barack Obama.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Mr Chair, I am going to take a point of order.

The CHAIR: Are those practices that have come from the United States being monitored for their impact in Australia?

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Point of order—

The Hon. WES FANG: The Chair asked a question.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I am taking a point of order on the question. It is outside the terms of reference of this inquiry to be asking about US universities. It is well outside the budget estimates and it is not fair—

The CHAIR: No, it is not because The Hunting Ground project came to Australia and funded the Australian Human Rights Commission inquiry—

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I have taken a point of order.

The CHAIR: —that has led to the laws and practices that I am talking about.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I would ask you to rule on my point of order.

The CHAIR: If you knew the facts, you would know the linkage. The question is entirely valid, as I have just explained.

Mr SCOTT: We will take that on notice.

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government is not monitoring practices from the United States for their impact in Australia.

**Page No. 31 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: We associate ourselves with the Chair's comments and thank the department for the work they are doing. This is every parent's, every family's worst nightmare as they send their child to school. I want to ask some data questions around private providers. If you do not have the information you can take it on notice. In 2018 how many students were enrolled in private providers in New South Wales?

Mr SCOTT: You said your questions were going to be on TAFE. Are you referring to private providers in the Smart and Skilled division?

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Rather than dealing with the tragic circumstances of what we were discussing earlier, more generally around TAFE.

Mr SCOTT: Under the Smart and Skilled program, as it operates by the government, TAFE provides the majority of programs but there are private providers as well. I suppose I was just seeking clarification. Are you asking about private providers who are operating under the Smart and Skilled program?

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: I am asking how many private providers are operating in New South Wales in total. Perhaps if you could provide a break down as to how many within the Smart and Skilled program and how many outside that would be helpful as well.

Mr SCOTT: Ms O'Loughlin will be able to help us with the registered training providers who are operating through Smart and Skilled.

Ms O'LOUGHLIN: Under the Smart and Skilled program there are 362 contracted registered training organisations, one of which is TAFE—because it is one TAFE. So there are 361 private providers and that would include community providers.

Mr SCOTT: They are the community providers who under Smart and Skilled have delivery agreements with us. There are many times more than that who do not have a contract with Smart and Skilled.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Can you tell me how many complaints were received for the 361 providers? Mr SCOTT: We will take that on notice.

**ANSWER**

In 2018, Training Services NSW recorded 15 complaints against private providers.

**Page No. 32 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Where did you get your figure of 3,000 RTOs in New South Wales from?

Mr SCOTT: I have got it in my briefing note. I will check and find the source of that for you—footnotes are not exhaustive.

**ANSWER**

The source was <https://training.gov.au/> data.

**Page No. 32 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: I want to ask you about any plans to sell off TAFE facilities or TAFE land. This has been reported in the media. The Sydney Morning Herald said that 27 TAFE sites were going to be sold in 2015-16.

Mr SCOTT: Can I ask when they wrote that?

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: In 2015.

Mr SCOTT: Are you saying it was an incorrect article?

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: No, I am wondering how many of those 27 listed have been shutdown?

Mr SCOTT: If you can table a copy of the article we can provide you with that detail.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Yes, I can grab that out of my notes. If you could tell me how many TAFE sites have been sold since 2015?

Mr SCOTT: Yes. We will take that on notice.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Can you tell me how many have been partially sold?

Mr SCOTT: We will take that on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that there are no current approved TAFE NSW divestments apart from where surplus land is required for a government program or giving effect to the NSW Government Community Use Policy. This currently includes local road projects in Wagga Wagga and Dapto.

**Page No. 32 - 33 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Is Chullora going to be sold?

Mr SCOTT: There is no detailed plans or approvals for the selling of the Chullora site. I am sure the Chullora site will, as all the TAFE sites do, form part of the 20-year infrastructure strategy.

There is currently no approved plans to sell the Chullora site.

Ms PENTON: The facility is ageing. We have a range of campuses in that part of the region and ensuring that we have fit-for-purpose facilities that meet the training requirements is my understanding. I was not party to the decision of the day and could provide more information on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that there are no current plans to sell the Chullora site.

**Page No. 34 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Has any campus that was listed for shutdown in 2015 been replaced by a connected learning centre?

Ms PENTON: I will have to take that question on notice, given it was 2015 and I was not managing director at the time.

Mr SCOTT: As we said, we would like to look at the list and we can come back to you on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that TAFE NSW has delivered 14 Connected Learning Centres since 2015, including Coonabarabran, Glen Innes, Quirindi, Tenterfield, Corowa, Deniliquin, Narrandera, Singleton, Grenfell, Bega, Yamba, Bourke, Murwillumbah and Scone. I am also advised that no campus has been sold as a result of the construction of a CLC.

**Page No. 34 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS:**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Is the proposal to build an ambulance superstation on the Randwick TAFE site still proceeding?

Mr SCOTT: I will check that. I am advised that an ambulance superstation is being developed at Randwick and part of that has been an intra-government transfer of a portion of the TAFE NSW site to NSW Health. My advice is that it will have absolutely no impact on the core operations of that Randwick campus. No classrooms have been affected and no training takes place on that land of the Randwick campus. The proximity of the ambulance superstation will create opportunities clearly for collaboration and training. I think it represents a pretty good example of prudent optimisation of a government-owned asset to the benefit of Health and to no detriment to TAFE. That is my advice.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Will a car park be built on that site?

Mr SCOTT: I will have to take that on notice. I do not have advice about that.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: What consultation and consideration has taken place, given the impact of the decision on students and staff at TAFE?

Mr SCOTT: As I said, my advice is that there is no impact on the core business of TAFE, no classrooms have been affected and no training takes place at that part of the site.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Will there be a payment for the land?

Mr SCOTT: I will take that on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that the transfer of ownership of a portion of TAFE NSW Randwick Campus to NSW Health will have no impact on the core business of TAFE NSW. No classrooms are affected and no training takes place on that area of land of the Randwick Campus.

I am further advised that NSW Health is paying market value for the acquisition of the site to TAFE NSW.



**Page No. 34 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: How much was spent by TAFE on consultancy in the last financial year

Ms PENTON: It is approximately \$500,000. I will check my notes.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: What was the scope of that work?

Mr SCOTT: There were a number of reviews and advisory work, standard kind of consultancy work.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Can you provide more specific details on notice?

Mr SCOTT: Yes, certainly.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Do you have any more specific details Ms Penton?

Ms PENTON: No, I will provide that additional advice on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that in the 2018/19 Financial Year, TAFE NSW spent \$528,766 (ex-GST) on consultancy fees.

**Page No. 37 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: The review of last year's budget has seen a \$230 million shortfall in sales of goods and services below the target. What is the explanation for that, or do we just note it?

Mr SCOTT: We will take the detail on notice.

.....

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Do you have no explanation to hand for any part of that quarter of a billion dollar shortfall?

Mr SCOTT: I am happy to confirm that we have an increase of 3.1 per cent in the total funding available to TAFE, and that now is a budget figure of \$1.85 billion based on the 2018-19 forecasts. In addition, there is another \$137.2 million of capital expenditure for TAFE in the 2019-20 year. I am happy to take further details of that on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that information on revenue is available in the financial statements that are included in the TAFE NSW annual report which is available at:

<https://www.tafensw.edu.au/corporate/annual-report>.

## Page No. 38 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I have reviewed the annual report. There are 12 senior executives referenced in the annual report. TAFE employs a significantly larger number of senior executives who receive salaries greater than the band one senior executive rate, which is \$178,850—or was as at the time of the last annual report. It employs vastly more than 12 senior executives who receive remuneration greater than that band one amount, does it not?

Ms PENTON: I would have to take that question on notice, given that it was the 2017 period that you were speaking of.

Extract Part 2:

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: So am I to understand the way TAFE constructs these reports is unless a senior executive reports directly to the managing director they are not being reported as senior executive members or senior executive staff in the annual report?

Ms PENTON: That is my understanding, but I am certainly happy to take that question on notice and provide additional information.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: And could I ask you to take on notice how it is you say that complies with the reporting obligations that TAFE has for senior executives?

Ms PENTON: I would certainly be happy to.

The CHAIR: I think a reporting discrepancy has been identified there. The Committee would appreciate a serious examination of the particular matter that has been raised.

Mr SCOTT: We will take that on notice. Yes.

## ANSWER

I am advised that **Senior Executive** is defined in section 3, Annual Report (Statutory Bodies) Regulation 2015 (ARSBR). The relevant section for TAFE NSW is category (e), “a member of **the executive staff** of a body who is employed by that body and is not employed in the Public Service.”

I am further advised that TAFE NSW reports this as our Executive Leadership Team, which consists of the Managing Director and the Executives that report directly to the Managing Director. I further understand that TAFE have consistently taken this approach in recent years.

Ms PENTON: Yes, certainly, Mr Secretary, building on this broader policy framework and how you actually take that down to the grassroots level. Certainly from a TAFE perspective, and in my experience our campuses are working collaboratively on a daily basis with schools on the ground and building those relationships. The sorts of programs we offer in a really practical sense for kids are things like Taste of TAFE programs where they come in—it is done in consultation with the school—and we pick particular program areas where there are local jobs available. They come in and listen to our teachers about the courses that are on offer, the careers that are available. There is also a broader range of programs through our youth engagement strategy, which again is a collaboration at the local level between our TAFEs and schools on the ground where particularly young people at risk of disengaging with education come, as part of their weekly program, into TAFE for practical training, to engage them as early as possible to ensure that they stay in school. Certainly our early data indicates that it is those sorts of things that make the biggest difference.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: How much funding has been allocated for this type of program and school support?

Ms PENTON: I will take that question on notice, and provide that information and data to you.

## **ANSWER**

The Youth Engagement Strategy program is funded from the Community Service Obligation as part of TAFE NSW's overall budget. School students can also access TAFE NSW via the Department of Education funded EVET program.

**Page No. 42 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM:**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Can you tell me how many students are starting a subject in TAFE as part of their HSC?

Ms PENTON: We offer those programs through what is known as the external vocational education and training contract, and again I will take that question on notice so I can provide you with that data.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to provide locational data as well around that?

Ms PENTON: Yes, we certainly can.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Particularly how many students are studying the HSC at TAFE?

Ms PENTON: Yes, certainly.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Can you tell me at how many locations across New South Wales students can study their HSC at TAFE?

Ms PENTON: I would have to take the absolute number on notice

Extract Part 2:

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Ms Penton, I think you misunderstood my question. My question was: Students studying their HSC at TAFE, the actual HSC?

Ms PENTON: Yes, we will take that one on notice for you, certainly.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that information on enrolments is available in the TAFE NSW annual report available at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/corporate/annual-report>.

**Page No. 42 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to provide information about school-based apprenticeships and traineeships?

Mr SCOTT: Yes.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: The numbers around that?

Ms PENTON: Yes.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: And what pre-apprenticeship courses are offered and where those courses are offered?

Ms PENTON: Most certainly we can provide that.

**ANSWER**

I am advised the numbers for school-based traineeships and apprenticeships as of 4 September 2019 are:

	<b>Total</b>
Students undertaking school-based traineeships	2,726
Students undertaking school-based apprenticeships	790

The Targeted Priorities Prevocational Part Qualification (TPPPQ) Program - Pre-Apprenticeship Training Delivery Suburbs and Target Industry in 2018/2019 FY are provided in the below table:

<b>Pre Apprenticeship courses</b>	<b>Locations</b>
Manufacturing	Airds, Bomaderry, Campbelltown, Chatswood, Dubbo, Wagga Wagga, Granville, Wollongong, Orange, Rutherford, Tuggerah, Tumut, Unanderra, Woonona
Construction	Auburn, Ballina, Bathurst, Baulkham Hills, Bombira, Bonnyrigg, Broadmeadow, Chatswood, Coffs Harbour, Coonamble, Dubbo, Inverell, Wollongong, Oak Flats, Orange, Purfleet, Singleton, Tighes Hill, Wyong
Property and Business Services	Auburn, Minto
Transport and Storage	Albury, Artarmon, Auburn, Broadway, Campbelltown, Caringbah, Emu Plains, Granville, Hornsby, Jannali, Lidcombe, Mudgee, Parramatta, Quakers Hill, Rockdale, Rooty Hill, Tuggerah, Ultimo, Wagga Wagga, Wetherill Park, Wollongong
Agriculture, Forestry and Fishing	Bathurst
Electricity, Gas and Water Supply	Bomaderry, Gynea, Ingleburn, Kogarah, Rutherford, Wagga Wagga, Wollongong
Personal and other Services	Chatswood, Kingswood, Tuggerah
Communication Services	Homebush, Liverpool, Parramatta
Education	Inverell, Parramatta
Accommodation, Cafes and Restaurants	Kandos, Pyrmont
Mining	Mudgee
Health and Community Services	Tamworth

**Page No. 42 – 43 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: I want to ask about community service obligation funding. Are you able to tell me how much is provided in the budget for the community service obligation funding?

Ms PENTON: I would say is approximately \$150 million, but we will confirm that number exactly for you

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: I would also appreciate that amount for the previous three financial years as well?

Ms PENTON: Yes, certainly.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to indicate off the top of your head whether that is an increase or decrease on last year's budget?

Ms PENTON: I would not be able to give you that exact number; not off the top of my head, no.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: That will be evident from the figures? You are happy to provide that on notice?

Ms PENTON: It will be when we provide them to you, most certainly.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that the Community Service Obligation is part of the overall budget for TAFE NSW. I am further advised that the TAFE NSW expenditure budget for the 2019/20 financial year is \$1.85 billion, a 3.1% increase on the 2018/19 Budget.

**Page No. 44, 45 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

Ms PENTON: From a campus closure, we have not been having campus closures from that perspective. Where we have, if there is a shift in a course, for example. The secretary is quite right. In some of our very small communities—and I will use the example of Hay, where the whole demographic of those communities are changing; a more ageing population requiring different skills and different needs—our courses have to vary over time. So it is often more of a shift of courses that we can offer and, under the traditional role of face-to-face full-time that we would have experienced 20 years ago, having 20 students in Hay who want to do the same thing is really challenging.

The educational response around online learning, distance learning and connected learning is our way of looking at using the technology for the benefits of people—to provide a broader range when it is only three people who might want to do accounting in Hay and we can still connect them to that learning. And also to connect them to an expert teacher, which is the other challenge in some of those smaller communities.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Just following on from that about the locational decision-making matrix that might be used to decide where you place a Connected Learning Centre, is that informed by any formal policy document? Are there specific parameters that are set out somewhere?

Mr SCOTT: I think we took this question on notice this morning.

Ms PENTON: We can provide that information it.

Mr SCOTT: We will take it on notice again.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: This is about what is underpinning the decision-making.

Mr SCOTT: Yes, I think we took that on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that strategic planning for new facilities considers a range of factors including student demand, community needs, industry growth, and local economic development.

I am further advised that CLC locations were selected on the basis of expanding the TAFE NSW footprint in areas without a TAFE presence, population growth in identified areas, and the identified skills needs of those areas.



**Page No. 45 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: What are the locational criteria and what is the policy document that is the foundation for decision-making around the Country University Centres?

Mr SCOTT: Again, I am happy to come back and take that on notice.

**ANSWER**

The agreement with Country Universities Centre Limited (CUCL) is governed by a funding deed. Negotiations are underway for a phase two funding agreement.

CUCL consider the following criteria for a new location:

- a. Council and community support
- b. Location a minimum 50km from an existing university campus
- c. Location unlikely to attract future university campuses due to small populations
- d. Cost per student projections
  - CUCL obtains the number of external and mixed modal students in the postcode from the federal Department of Education, then project likely student numbers. CUCL then estimate the cost per student of operating the Centres over the first five years based on operational budgets.
- e. CUCL score the following factors related to success on a scale of 1 to 5 across locations:
  - Population
  - Equity
  - Good facility
  - Density of surrounding area
  - Eagerness of community
  - Connectivity to high speed internet
  - Access to alternative higher education
  - Local Government participation.

A community's proposal for a CUC in their area is submitted to the CUC Investment Committee which then advises the CUC Board. Recommendations are made by the CUC Board to the NSW Government, which gives the final approval on locations.

**Page No. 45 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Can you just expand on that? You said you are doing research into students from regional areas with identical ATARs.

Mr SCOTT: Yes, I can. This has happened as part of our rural and remote strategy in the Department of Education. Some of the people who talk to me—and going to Australia's educational performance over time— suggest that the debate and the discussion under-emphasises the challenge of educational outcomes in rural and remote areas, and that really the divide in educational outcomes from young people in metropolitan areas and regional and rural settings is stark and is not closing. One of the things we have been looking at is what the pathways are for young people. It is quite stark at those ATAR points—I think of 75 and 85— what the gap is of students and taking that ATAR, which clearly gets them into university, and actually going to a university. We are now trying to do more digging as to what those factors are. A key to high education performance is high expectations and familial expectations, also familial responsibilities and what your peers and cohort are doing. Those are all things we are looking at.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: If you can provide us a differential at each of those points, on notice, that would be fine.

Mr SCOTT: Yes, I am happy to provide that.

**ANSWER**

Internal data, based on 2015 university enrolments, shows that for students with ATARs over 75, 59% of regional students will transition to university in the following year compared to 83% of metropolitan students.

For students with ATARs over 85, 61% of regional students will transition to university compared to 84% of metropolitan students.

The gap between metropolitan and regional students is consistent over a five year period (2010-2015).

**Page No. 46 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Does anybody in the department track the very incomplete data that comes out of the Workplace Gender Equality Agency, federally, on insecure employment?

Mr SCOTT: As far as universities go?

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Yes.

Mr SCOTT: I will take that on notice but I do not believe so.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Given the WGEA data does not include the total or even the average number of employees employed over the reporting period but just those employees from April to May—and that inadequacy of the data is what prompted the Victorian Government to seek proper data—will your department review what Victoria does to see if we can get some accurate data for universities in secure employment?

Mr SCOTT: I am happy to say that our higher education team will look at what has taken place in Victoria.

**ANSWER**

No.

**Page No. 47 - 48 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Mr Scott, how many TAFE NSW teachers were required to undertake the update of Certificate IV in training and assessment in 2019?

Mr SCOTT: Ms Penton can speak to this.

Ms PENTON: Certainly the most recent upgrade was a requirement from a regulatory perspective set right across the sector for all RTOs and specifically for those teaching staff that did not have the two units of competence that were specific to that requirement, all of our educational staff were required to gain that qualification.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I know that history which is why I am asking you how many TAFE NSW teachers were required to undertake the update.

Ms PENTON: I will get those figures.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: While you are doing that I will put the next series of questions that probably relate to the same data. What was the cost to TAFE NSW to deliver the course units for those updates and what was the cost to TAFE NSW to reimburse teachers for the cost of completion of those course units for the update at training providers other than TAFE NSW?

Mr SCOTT: We will take the detail on notice, Mr Shoebridge, if we may. It was a big effort from TAFE. Yes, that was a requirement; yes, there was a deadline. Our staff made that deadline. Can I say, the New South Wales Teachers Federation and unions have been supportive of staff in achieving their compliance with new standards. I appreciate that this was a new or a fresh requirement for many and significant work was entailed to reach this standard.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that TAFE NSW teachers were required to update their training and assessment qualification as a result of the change in the national qualification. The cost to TAFE NSW to deliver the units to TAFE NSW teachers, together with reimbursing fees to teachers, was approximately \$2 million.

**Page No. 48 & 49 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE and The Hon MARK LATHAM**

The CHAIR: Coming back to the question of university governance. I come back to the point in the 1981 university establishment Acts about not discriminating against students on the basis of political affiliation, views or beliefs. Is there any precedent for a student in New South Wales who sought assistance in this space, having exhausted all their appeal and argumentative rights at the university?

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Isn't university governance the very point about which you took a point of order on me?

The Hon. WES FANG: You are not the chair.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I will take the point of order. If it is good for the goose, it is good for the gander. You took a point of order on me from the chair about university governance and now you are going down that exact same path.

The CHAIR: I will rule on this and say in this debate I am not the goose. That is putting forward a false equivalence. My memory is that Mr Shoebidge raised the matter asking New South Wales to do what Victoria did even though New South Wales had no statutory requirement to do such thing.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Your rationale was because—

The CHAIR: What I have done is very different in the goose-gander space in that I have cited from New South Wales laws a requirement for the 11 universities in this State to comply with the statutory requirement. I will read it out:

A person must not, because of his or her religious or political affiliations, views or beliefs, be denied admission as a student of the University or be ineligible to hold office in, to graduate from or to enjoy any benefit, advantage or privilege of the University.

That is the law in New South Wales, unlike the question of insecure work. Insecure work is an important issue, but it is not in the law governing what universities do in this State. The provision I have read out is the law, and I am asking is there any precedent for students, having exhausted all their appeal rights at the university, seeking that law to be enforced via State Government avenues?

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I take it I lost that point of order.

The CHAIR: I am ruling against the point of order for the reasons I have outlined.

Mr SCOTT: Not to my knowledge, Mr Chair, but I am happy to take that on notice and review.

CONTINUED PAGE 49 - The CHAIR: Could you provide some advice on what a student would do in the circumstance? Because I do have a constituent at a Sydney university who has put the matter to me where they believe, having exhausted all their university appeal rights, they would be seeking relief or some sort of ruling from the State Government under this provision.

Mr SCOTT: Let me take advice, almost like legal advice, on what would be the State's response to such a submission.

**ANSWER**

Public universities in NSW are essentially autonomous institutions under their enabling legislation, with full control over their administrative and academic affairs. This includes the investigation and resolution of claims of discrimination and misconduct. Each university is overseen by an independent governing body, including student and staff representatives, in order to ensure robust governance.

If a student believes that they have experienced discrimination on the basis of their religious or political affiliation, views or beliefs, they should first seek to resolve these issues through the university's internal complaints procedure.

If a student is unsatisfied with the outcome of this procedure, they may decide to submit a complaint to the NSW Ombudsman's Office or the Tertiary Education Quality and Standards Agency (TEQSA), depending on the nature of their concern.

The Ombudsman has jurisdiction to investigate complaints made about the conduct of NSW public universities. TEQSA is the regulator for the higher education sector, and is empowered to investigate complaints about a university's compliance with the Higher Education Standards Framework (HES Framework). The HES Framework requires universities to uphold standards for diversity and equity, as well as wellbeing and safety.

If a student feels that their treatment constitutes ethno-religious discrimination under the *Anti-Discrimination Act 1977*, they may also submit a complaint to the Anti-Discrimination Board of NSW.

The Department of Education is not aware of any legal cases brought through the university enabling acts to challenge religious or political discrimination. Should such a situation arise, a student could seek legal advice on the availability of injunctive or other relief.

**Page No. 49 – The Hon. MARK LATHAM**

The CHAIR: It is unconscious bias; it is not really to do with workplace safety. It is an interesting concept because it is unconscious, nobody really knows what that means.

Mr SCOTT: During the operational workplace. I am aware of unconscious bias training being used around recruitment and performance management issues and the like, but let's take some detail on the specifics of the course.

The CHAIR: If you take that on notice and answer why this was thought necessary and particularly the feedback from staff? In my experience, particularly with local government staff who have to do these courses, they walk out more confused than when they started. If you have any feedback on unconscious bias—the voices in our heads, as they are sometimes described—we would also like to have that.

Ms PENTON: Certainly.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that unconscious bias awareness training was delivered to 200 staff as part of broader Diversity and Inclusion priorities. The training uses case studies to highlight the different types of biases, what prompts bias, and the impacts of bias on fair and balanced decision making. I am further advised that feedback provided by staff was positive with the training described as practical.

**Page No. 49 - 50 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: The question is: How many scholarship were allocated out of the 200,000 scholarships that were part of the \$48 million fund under the Government's announcement for the period 2015 to 2018?

Mr SCOTT: I will have to take that on notice.

Ms PENTON: It is a detailed question.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Can you also tell me how much did that work out to be per recipient?

Ms PENTON: We can provide that information. I will take the question on notice, with your concurrence.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: According to the TAFE NSW website, the average total course fee can range from \$4,210 to \$15,340 per semester. My question is really about whether the scholarships are a meaningful contribution? Are you able to provide a comment on that?

Ms PENTON: Certainly what I can say is the policy around this, and the ability for students to seek exemptions is quite extensive. The range of parameters for those exemptions is extensive as well. There is a range of areas whether they are welfare recipients and a number of other areas do contribute to that. The proportion of

TAFE NSW students paying fees is actually proportionately low. I will be comfortable to take that question on notice and provide that information to the committee.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: What happened to the money that was allocated, but not distributed?

Mr SCOTT: We will take that on notice.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to provide, and I am assuming on notice as well, the locational detail and the courses of study for those students who accessed those scholarships?

Ms PENTON: Given the time period you have provided, we will take that question on notice and make that information available, yes.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to provide how much total funding was allocated for this commitment?

Mr SCOTT: Yes, we will take that on notice.

**ANSWER**

For the period 2015 – 2018, the NSW Government provided 47,228 fee-free scholarships to TAFE NSW students. The scholarship value per student varies depending on the qualification undertaken. Scholarships to TAFE NSW students comprise a portion of the total scholarships provided.

A total of \$48 million was allocated in the budget for this commitment.

Unused funds for this program were repurposed or redirected to fund other initiatives and programs during the period.

Fee free scholarships have been awarded in the following regions:

- Sydney
- Central West
- Southern Highlands and Shoalhaven
- Capital Region
- Newcastle and Lake Macquarie
- Hunter Valley excl. Newcastle



- New England and North West
- Richmond - Tweed
- Coffs Harbour - Grafton
- Far West and Orana
- Central Coast
- Mid North Coast
- Illawarra
- Riverina
- Murray

Fee free scholarships have been awarded to students in the following qualifications:

- Certificate I in Access to Vocational Pathways
- Certificate I in Information, Digital Media and Technology
- Certificate I in Skills for Vocational Pathways
- Certificate II in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Cultural Arts
- Certificate II in Aeroskills
- Certificate II in Agriculture
- Certificate II in Animal Studies
- Certificate II in Applied Fashion Design and Technology
- Certificate II in Automotive Body Repair Technology
- Certificate II in Automotive Electrical Technology
- Certificate II in Automotive Servicing Technology
- Certificate II in Aviation (Flight Operations)
- Certificate II in Aviation (Ground Operations and Service)
- Certificate II in Aviation Transport Protection (Passenger and Non-Passenger Screener)
- Certificate II in Aviation Transport Protection (Passenger/Non-Passenger Screener)
- Certificate II in Business
- Certificate II in Civil Construction
- Certificate II in Cleaning
- Certificate II in Cleaning Operations
- Certificate II in Clothing Production (Intermediate)
- Certificate II in Community Pharmacy
- Certificate II in Community Services
- Certificate II in Computer Assembly and Repair
- Certificate II in Conservation and Land Management
- Certificate II in Construction
- Certificate II in Construction Pathways
- Certificate II in Customer Engagement
- Certificate II in Driving Operations
- Certificate II in Electronics
- Certificate II in Electrotechnology (Career Start)
- Certificate II in Engineering
- Certificate II in Engineering - Production Technology
- Certificate II in Floristry (Assistant)
- Certificate II in Food Processing
- Certificate II in Furnishing

- Certificate II in Furniture Making
- Certificate II in Furniture Removal
- Certificate II in Hairdressing
- Certificate II in Health Support Services
- Certificate II in Horticulture
- Certificate II in Hospitality
- Certificate II in Information, Digital Media and Technology
- Certificate II in Kitchen Operations
- Certificate II in Landscaping
- Certificate II in Logistics
- Certificate II in Maritime Operations (Coxswain Grade 1 Near Coastal)
- Certificate II in Maritime Operations (Marine Engine Driver Grade 3 Near Coastal)
- Certificate II in Meat Processing (Abattoirs)
- Certificate II in Motorsport Technology
- Certificate II in Music
- Certificate II in Music Industry
- Certificate II in Nail Technology
- Certificate II in Outdoor Power Equipment Technology
- Certificate II in Outdoor Recreation
- Certificate II in Parks and Gardens
- Certificate II in Printing and Graphic Arts (General)
- Certificate II in Production Horticulture
- Certificate II in Production Nursery
- Certificate II in Public Safety (Firefighting Operations)
- Certificate II in Racing (Stablehand)
- Certificate II in Resources and Infrastructure Work Preparation
- Certificate II in Retail Baking Assistance
- Certificate II in Retail Cosmetics
- Certificate II in Retail Make-Up and Skin Care
- Certificate II in Retail Services
- Certificate II in Rural Operations
- Certificate II in Salon Assistant
- Certificate II in Security Assembly and Set-up
- Certificate II in Shearing
- Certificate II in Skills for Work and Vocational Pathways
- Certificate II in Surface Extraction Operations
- Certificate II in Technical Security
- Certificate II in Telecommunications Technology
- Certificate II in Tourism
- Certificate II in Warehousing Operations
- Certificate II in Waste Management
- Certificate II in Wool Handling
- Certificate III in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Cultural Arts
- Certificate III in Aboriginal and/or Torres Strait Islander Primary Health Care
- Certificate III in Aboriginal or Torres Strait Islander Cultural Arts

- Certificate III in Accounts Administration
- Certificate III in Active Volunteering
- Certificate III in Aged Care
- Certificate III in Agricultural Mechanical Technology
- Certificate III in Agriculture
- Certificate III in Air-conditioning and Refrigeration
- Certificate III in Allied Health Assistance
- Certificate III in Animal Studies
- Certificate III in Animal Technology
- Certificate III in Appliance Service
- Certificate III in Applied Fashion Design and Technology
- Certificate III in Aquaculture
- Certificate III in Aquatics and Community Recreation
- Certificate III in Arboriculture
- Certificate III in Arts Administration
- Certificate III in Asian Cookery
- Certificate III in Automotive Administration
- Certificate III in Automotive and Marine Trimming Technology
- Certificate III in Automotive Body Repair Technology
- Certificate III in Automotive Electrical Technology
- Certificate III in Automotive Manufacturing Technical Operations - Bus, Truck and Trailer
- Certificate III in Automotive Refinishing Technology
- Certificate III in Automotive Sales
- Certificate III in Aviation (Cabin Crew)
- Certificate III in Aviation (Flight Operations)
- Certificate III in Aviation (Ground Operations and Service)
- Certificate III in Aviation (Remote Pilot - Visual Line of Sight)
- Certificate III in Baking
- Certificate III in Barbering
- Certificate III in Beauty Services
- Certificate III in Beekeeping
- Certificate III in Bread Baking
- Certificate III in Bricklaying/Blocklaying
- Certificate III in Business
- Certificate III in Business Administration
- Certificate III in Business Administration (Education)
- Certificate III in Business Administration (Legal)
- Certificate III in Business Administration (Medical)
- Certificate III in Business to Business Sales
- Certificate III in Cabinet Making
- Certificate III in Cake and Pastry
- Certificate III in Captive Animals
- Certificate III in Carpentry
- Certificate III in Carpentry and Joinery
- Certificate III in Catering Operations

- Certificate III in Civil Construction
- Certificate III in Civil Construction Plant Operations
- Certificate III in Cleaning Operations
- Certificate III in Clothing Production
- Certificate III in Commercial Cookery
- Certificate III in Community Dance, Theatre and Events
- Certificate III in Community Pharmacy
- Certificate III in Community Services
- Certificate III in Community Services Work
- Certificate III in Companion Animal Services
- Certificate III in Computer Systems Equipment
- Certificate III in Concreting
- Certificate III in Conservation and Land Management
- Certificate III in Construction Waterproofing
- Certificate III in Customer Engagement
- Certificate III in Demolition
- Certificate III in Dental Assisting
- Certificate III in Design Fundamentals
- Certificate III in Disability
- Certificate III in Driving Operations
- Certificate III in Early Childhood Education and Care
- Certificate III in Education Support
- Certificate III in Electronics and Communications
- Certificate III in Electrotechnology Electrician
- Certificate III in Engineering - Fabrication Trade
- Certificate III in Engineering - Mechanical Trade
- Certificate III in Engineering - Technical
- Certificate III in Events
- Certificate III in Farriery
- Certificate III in Feedlot Operations
- Certificate III in Financial Services
- Certificate III in Fire Protection
- Certificate III in Fitness
- Certificate III in Flooring Technology
- Certificate III in Floristry
- Certificate III in Food Processing
- Certificate III in Formwork/Falsework
- Certificate III in Furniture Making
- Certificate III in General Insurance
- Certificate III in Glass and Glazing
- Certificate III in Guiding
- Certificate III in Hairdressing
- Certificate III in Health Administration
- Certificate III in Health Services Assistance
- Certificate III in Health Support Services

- Certificate III in Heavy Commercial Vehicle Mechanical Technology
- Certificate III in Holiday Parks and Resorts
- Certificate III in Home and Community Care
- Certificate III in Horse Breeding
- Certificate III in Horticulture
- Certificate III in Hospital/Health Services Pharmacy Support
- Certificate III in Hospitality
- Certificate III in Indigenous Land Management
- Certificate III in Individual Support
- Certificate III in Information and Cultural Services
- Certificate III in Information, Digital Media and Technology
- Certificate III in International Freight Forwarding (Operator)
- Certificate III in Jewellery Manufacture
- Certificate III in Joinery
- Certificate III in Laboratory Skills
- Certificate III in Landscape Construction
- Certificate III in Laundry Operations
- Certificate III in Library and Information Services
- Certificate III in Light Vehicle Mechanical Technology
- Certificate III in Live Production and Services
- Certificate III in Locksmithing
- Certificate III in Logistics
- Certificate III in Make-Up
- Certificate III in Manufacturing Technology
- Certificate III in Marine Mechanical Technology
- Certificate III in Maritime Operations (Integrated Rating)
- Certificate III in Maritime Operations (Marine Engine Driver Grade 2 Near Coastal)
- Certificate III in Maritime Operations (Master up to 24 metres Near Coastal)
- Certificate III in Meat Processing (Retail Butcher)
- Certificate III in Meat Processing (Slaughtering)
- Certificate III in Meat Processing (Smallgoods - Manufacture)
- Certificate III in Media
- Certificate III in Micro Business Operations
- Certificate III in Millinery
- Certificate III in Mobile Crane Operations
- Certificate III in Motorcycle Mechanical Technology
- Certificate III in Music
- Certificate III in Music Business
- Certificate III in Music Industry
- Certificate III in Nail Technology
- Certificate III in Natural Area Restoration
- Certificate III in Nutrition and Dietetic Assistance
- Certificate III in Outdoor Power Equipment Technology
- Certificate III in Outdoor Recreation
- Certificate III in Painting and Decorating

- Certificate III in Parks and Gardens
- Certificate III in Pathology
- Certificate III in Pathology Assistance
- Certificate III in Pathology Collection
- Certificate III in Patisserie
- Certificate III in Performance Horse
- Certificate III in Permaculture
- Certificate III in Pest Management
- Certificate III in Pet Grooming
- Certificate III in Plumbing
- Certificate III in Process Manufacturing
- Certificate III in Production Horticulture
- Certificate III in Production Nursery
- Certificate III in Property Services (Agency)
- Certificate III in Racing (Advanced Stablehand)
- Certificate III in Racing (Trackrider)
- Certificate III in Racing Services (Racing Administration)
- Certificate III in Recreational Vehicle Manufacture
- Certificate III in Recreational Vehicle Service and Repair
- Certificate III in Retail
- Certificate III in Retail Baking (Bread)
- Certificate III in Retail Baking (Cake and Pastry)
- Certificate III in Retail Baking (Combined)
- Certificate III in Retail Operations
- Certificate III in Retail Supervision
- Certificate III in Rigging
- Certificate III in Roof Plumbing
- Certificate III in Roof Tiling
- Certificate III in Rural Operations
- Certificate III in Scaffolding
- Certificate III in Screen and Media
- Certificate III in Security Equipment
- Certificate III in Shopfitting
- Certificate III in Signage
- Certificate III in Signs and Graphics
- Certificate III in Sport and Recreation
- Certificate III in Sport Coaching
- Certificate III in Sports Turf Management
- Certificate III in Sterilisation Services
- Certificate III in Stonemasonry (Monumental/Installation)
- Certificate III in Surface Preparation and Coating Application
- Certificate III in Surveying and Spatial Information Services
- Certificate III in Swimming Pool and Spa Service
- Certificate III in Technical Production
- Certificate III in Telecommunications

- Certificate III in Telecommunications Cabling
- Certificate III in Telecommunications Technology
- Certificate III in Tourism
- Certificate III in Travel
- Certificate III in Underground Coal Operations
- Certificate III in Upholstery
- Certificate III in Urban Pest Management
- Certificate III in Wall and Ceiling Lining
- Certificate III in Wall and Floor Tiling
- Certificate III in Warehousing Operations
- Certificate III in Work Health and Safety
- Certificate IV in Accounting
- Certificate IV in Accounting and Bookkeeping
- Certificate IV in Advertising
- Certificate IV in Aeroskills (Avionics)
- Certificate IV in Aeroskills (Mechanical)
- Certificate IV in Aged Care
- Certificate IV in Ageing Support
- Certificate IV in Agriculture
- Certificate IV in Alcohol and Other Drugs
- Certificate IV in Allied Health Assistance
- Certificate IV in Arts Administration
- Certificate IV in Banking Services
- Certificate IV in Beauty Therapy
- Certificate IV in Bookkeeping
- Certificate IV in Building and Construction (Building)
- Certificate IV in Business
- Certificate IV in Business (Governance)
- Certificate IV in Business Administration
- Certificate IV in Business Sales
- Certificate IV in Civil Construction Design
- Certificate IV in Commercial Cookery
- Certificate IV in Community Development
- Certificate IV in Community Pharmacy
- Certificate IV in Community Pharmacy Dispensary
- Certificate IV in Community Services
- Certificate IV in Community Services Work
- Certificate IV in Companion Animal Services
- Certificate IV in Competitive Systems and Practices
- Certificate IV in Conservation and Land Management
- Certificate IV in Customer Engagement
- Certificate IV in Demolition
- Certificate IV in Dental Assisting
- Certificate IV in Design
- Certificate IV in Digital and Interactive Games

- Certificate IV in Digital Media Technologies
- Certificate IV in Disability
- Certificate IV in Driving Operations
- Certificate IV in Education Support
- Certificate IV in Employment Services
- Certificate IV in Engineering
- Certificate IV in Engineering Drafting
- Certificate IV in Finance and Mortgage Broking
- Certificate IV in Financial Services
- Certificate IV in Fitness
- Certificate IV in Floristry
- Certificate IV in Food Science and Technology
- Certificate IV in Frontline Management
- Certificate IV in Furniture Design and Technology
- Certificate IV in Government
- Certificate IV in Guiding
- Certificate IV in Health Administration
- Certificate IV in Home and Community Care
- Certificate IV in Horticulture
- Certificate IV in Hospitality
- Certificate IV in Human Resources
- Certificate IV in Industrial Electronics and Control
- Certificate IV in Information Technology
- Certificate IV in Information Technology Networking
- Certificate IV in Information Technology Support
- Certificate IV in Interactive Digital Media
- Certificate IV in Interior Decoration
- Certificate IV in International Freight Forwarding (Senior Operator)
- Certificate IV in International Trade
- Certificate IV in Kitchen and Bathroom Design
- Certificate IV in Laboratory Techniques
- Certificate IV in Leadership and Management
- Certificate IV in Legal Services
- Certificate IV in Leisure and Health
- Certificate IV in Library and Information Services
- Certificate IV in Library, Information and Cultural Services
- Certificate IV in Local Government (Regulatory Services)
- Certificate IV in Logistics
- Certificate IV in Manufacturing Technology
- Certificate IV in Maritime Operations (Master up to 35 metres Near Coastal)
- Certificate IV in Marketing
- Certificate IV in Marketing and Communication
- Certificate IV in Massage Therapy
- Certificate IV in Massage Therapy Practice
- Certificate IV in Medical Practice Assisting



- Certificate IV in Mental Health
- Certificate IV in Mental Health Peer Work
- Certificate IV in Music Industry
- Certificate IV in NatHERS Assessment
- Certificate IV in New Small Business
- Certificate IV in Optical Dispensing
- Certificate IV in Organic Farming
- Certificate IV in Outdoor Recreation
- Certificate IV in Patisserie
- Certificate IV in Permaculture
- Certificate IV in Photography and Photo Imaging
- Certificate IV in Plumbing and Services
- Certificate IV in Procurement and Contracting
- Certificate IV in Programming
- Certificate IV in Project Management Practice
- Certificate IV in Property Services (Operations)
- Certificate IV in Property Services (Real Estate)
- Certificate IV in Purchasing
- Certificate IV in Racing (Racehorse Trainer)
- Certificate IV in Retail Management
- Certificate IV in School Age Education and Care
- Certificate IV in Screen and Media
- Certificate IV in Seafood Industry Sales and Distribution
- Certificate IV in Small Business Management
- Certificate IV in Social Housing
- Certificate IV in Sound Production
- Certificate IV in Spatial Information Services
- Certificate IV in Strata Community Management
- Certificate IV in Surveying
- Certificate IV in Telecommunications Engineering Technology
- Certificate IV in Telecommunications Networks Technology
- Certificate IV in Training and Assessment
- Certificate IV in Travel and Tourism
- Certificate IV in Veterinary Nursing
- Certificate IV in Warehousing Operations
- Certificate IV in Web-Based Technologies
- Certificate IV in Wool Classing
- Certificate IV in Work Health and Safety
- Certificate IV in Youth Work
- Cyber Security
- Employment and Training
- English for Academic Purposes
- English for Further Study
- Enterprise and Career Skills
- Foundation English Language Skills

- Foundations for Vocational and Further Study
- Fundamental English for Speakers of Other Languages
- Further Study Skills
- General Education for Adults
- General Education for Adults (Introductory)
- Horse Industry Practice (Performance Horse)
- Pathways to Further Study
- Permaculture
- Preparation for Work and Training
- Routine English for Speakers of Other Languages
- Routine English Language Skills
- Skills for Career Pathways
- Skills for Work and Study
- Skills for Work and Training
- Skills for Work and Training in the Community Sector
- Study Skills
- Vocational and Study Pathways
- Access to Work and Training
- Access to Work and Training (Introductory)
- Advanced English for Further Study
- Auslan
- Basic English for Speakers of Other Languages
- Basic English Language Skills
- Career Advancement
- Career Preparation

**Page No. 50 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Can you say how many have been provided thus far?

Mr SCOTT: I think the Minister referenced that this morning.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Yes, we have already asked that question.

Mr SCOTT: The Minister said 23,000 this morning.

Ms O'LOUGHLIN: The traineeships start on 1 January next year.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to specify what course areas are being targeted?

Mr SCOTT: We can come back to you with detail on that, yes.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Is there a published list of the 70,000 fee-free courses, whatever the number is, of fee-free courses?

Mr SCOTT: We can come back to you. We can give you the detail.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to identify how many of the courses will meet a skills shortage as identified on the Department of Skills 457 visa list?

Mr SCOTT: Yes, we can do the correlation back to 457, as you identified earlier.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to provide details on the eligibility criteria for students?

Mr SCOTT: Yes.

Ms PENTON: Yes, we can.

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government currently funds 459 traineeship qualifications under its Smart and Skilled program. From 1 January 2020, the Fee Free Traineeships Initiative will remove the student fees for eligible students undertaking these traineeship qualifications. Of these, 84 are linked to occupations on the 482 visa (successor of the 457 visa) short-term skills occupations list.

The 482 visa is administered by the Commonwealth Government. Skills shortages identified in its list may not be relevant to NSW's skills needs.

Further, of the 215 occupations currently on the 482 visa short-term skills occupations list, 119 of them are linked to a higher education pathway.

**Page No. 52 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Where you have a specific storehouse, do you have a tool store person who maintains every site where there is a storage area for tools?

Ms PENTON: It varies across the State, depending on the size and scale of the facility.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: How does that affect access to the tools?

Ms PENTON: As I indicated, all of our practical training areas are, by their nature, a simulated work environment, so when you have students who are undertaking this training it is important for us to ensure that they can behave and be accountable in our training facilities in the same way that they would be in a workplace.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: But access to the tools is critical to the delivery of the course, so you would need to guarantee that the tools are available. Is that right?

Mr SCOTT: Is there a specific—?

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Yes, there is a specific case. In Tighes Hill I am advised that there are just over 200 students enrolled in either the first, second or third year units in air-conditioning and refrigeration, and they do not have access to their tools when the course is actually being delivered.

Mr SCOTT: And where is this?

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Tighes Hill. The tool store person is not available in the evening when the course is delivered.

Mr SCOTT: We will take that on notice and find out what is happening there.

**ANSWER**

A tool store person is not available during evening air-conditioning and refrigeration classes at TAFE NSW Newcastle Campus (Tighes Hill). Evening classes are predominately attended by industry tradespersons. A fully equipped trolley is prepared as per training requirements prior to class and the equipment is accessed by the students under teacher supervision, then returned to the trolley for storage the following morning. A tool store person is available during day classes when apprentices predominately attend.

**Page No. 53 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Mr Scott, have you had any conversations about the utilisation of TAFE locations for future country university centres?

Mr SCOTT: No, I have not.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Ms Penton, have you?

Ms PENTON: Certainly we have a Country Universities Centre based on our Goulburn campus, for example, and that was in one of the early tranches. There have been approaches, depending on the community and where they are looking at, with respect to TAFE campuses.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Are you aware of any others?

Ms PENTON: Not that are in negotiation at this particular point in time, but I can take that question on notice and provide additional information.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that TAFE NSW is not in negotiations regarding future utilisation of TAFE NSW facilities for Country Universities Centres.

**Page No. 53 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Thanks very much, Mr Scott. I turn now to questions of students with disability in TAFE. How many students with disability are currently enrolled in TAFE NSW courses?

Mr SCOTT: I have a percentage here, and I can give you a few figures. It says 11.4 per cent of TAFE NSW's total enrolments are by a student with disability.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: And how many staff members are employed to develop individual learning programs for those students?

Mr SCOTT: We can take that on notice.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Okay. If you can tell me how many TAFE disability services and careers counsellors are employed by TAFE NSW?

Mr SCOTT: Yes, we can take that on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that information on TAFE NSW staff numbers are included in the TAFE NSW Annual Reports available at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/corporate/annual-report>.

**Page No. 54 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Mr Scott, I am told that the funding for students with disability is 15 per cent of all students with disability. Is that correct?

Mr SCOTT: I do not have that figure in front of me. I am happy to look at that on notice.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Okay. And if you can tell me how often the funding is delivered and whether it is annually or during another period?

Mr SCOTT: Of course.

**ANSWER**

Providers are paid a loading of 15 per cent on top of the qualification price for training that is delivered to a student with a disability. Providers receive funding, including loadings, as students progress through their training.

**Page No. 54 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Can you tell me how many students with disability dropped out of their course early in the past financial year?

Mr SCOTT: Let us take that on notice.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: And the financial year before that?

Mr SCOTT: If we can have that data, we will provide that for sure.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Excellent. And if you could give me the dropout rate for Aboriginal or Torres Strait Islander students and how that compares with the general student population?

Mr SCOTT: Yes. I am happy to provide that data.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: If you could give me those dropout rates.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that information on completion rates at TAFE NSW are available in the TAFE NSW annual report which can be found at: <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/about-tafensw/annual-report>.



**Page No. 54 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Mr Scott, I think you took a series of questions on notice just then from Ms Houssos. Can I ask you in that same stretch of data, not only for the percentage of students with a disability, but also for the number of students with a disability?

Mr SCOTT: Yes.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: You said it was 11.4 per cent. Do you know what the number is?

Mr SCOTT: No, I did not have the number in front of me. I had the percentage. But we can take that on notice.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: And can we have that over two years, including the percentage and the number?

Mr SCOTT: Yes.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: And could we also have over two years the numbers of specialist educational staff? I think Ms Houssos asked you about the current numbers, but could we have the numbers over the past two years?

Mr SCOTT: Yes.

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW is proud to be a provider of choice for students that have a disability and students from an Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander background. I am advised that 11.4 per cent of students at TAFE NSW have a disability and 8.8 per cent are from an Aboriginal Torres Strait Islander background. Further information on staffing and enrolments is available in the TAFE NSW annual report at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/about-tafensw/annual-report>

**Page No. 55 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: As well, you gave some evidence about—and I think the Minister might have earlier—the community service obligations [CSOs]. Did I understand it correctly that it is currently \$150 million?

Mr SCOTT: I have been told the figure is \$150 million, yes.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Do you know how that has tracked over the past five years?

Mr SCOTT: No. That was asked earlier. We put that on notice earlier. We will come back and provide that answer.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Sorry, I missed that.

Mr SCOTT: No, that is fine. We will put that on notice.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Just over the past five years, how that has tracked?

Mr SCOTT: Yes, sure.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: And can you provide a breakdown on how the CSO is allocated as well?

Ms PENTON: Yes, we can. We would be happy to take that on notice, yes.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: All right. Thank you.

Ms PENTON: It is a combination of the provision of services as well as the provision of programs, so we can provide that data.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Yes. I think you have effectively answered much of this in your last answer to Ms Houssos, but TAFE NSW has a legislative requirement to provide accessible training across New South Wales for all and specifically for people facing disadvantage. If you could provide us on notice some detail about how you are satisfying that statutory obligation?

Mr SCOTT: Yes.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that the Community Service Obligation is part of the overall budget for TAFE NSW. I am further advised that the TAFE NSW expenditure budget for the 2019/20 financial year is \$1.85 billion, a 3.1% increase on the 2018/19 Budget.

**Page No. 56 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: The reason I am asking you about the assumptions is that previously the education department has made some disastrous assumptions about student numbers, and shut and sold a whole— not on your watch, Mr Scott, so far as I know—series of public schools in the city, the land was sold off and now we are scrabbling to make good. Can you give us some detail on notice about what assumptions are underpinning this 20-year infrastructure strategy in terms of student numbers, in terms of the ratio of face to face as opposed to online students, geographic coverage and what, if any, financial assumptions underline the strategy? Is there a financial element to it insofar as the portfolio needs to make a cash-positive return to TAFE or not?

Mr SCOTT: I am happy to provide more detail on the assumptions that will underpin the planning work. I am not sure when we will be in a position to do that. It might well be that that is very much part of the report as it lands.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that TAFE NSW will consider macro and micro-economic data to assess the demand for courses over the next 20 years and the capacity to service this demand as part of the 20 year Infrastructure Strategy.

**Page No. 57 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Mr Scott, what is the average cost now for a Certificate III course at TAFE?

Mr SCOTT: The average cost we may have to take on notice.

Ms PENTON: The average cost we would take on notice. It does vary. If it is a Certificate III, for example, as an apprenticeship there are rules around those depending on eligibility for fee free if someone is on a benefit where they are able to access the qualification for free. The average cost, we will take it on notice.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Perhaps you could give me the average cost or more ranged data.

Mr SCOTT: Mr Shoebridge, it might be best to give you a range in criteria because an average will not give great insight.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I suppose the average cost before those deductions are done and then perhaps some insight into the extent to which those deductions apply across the board. That would be useful.

Ms PENTON: Yes. That would be useful information

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: I am going to ask the same for Certificate IV courses as well.

Mr SCOTT: Yes. Happy to do it.

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government is proud to have rolled out 100,000 fee free apprenticeships over four years from 1 July 2018, with 70,000 fee free traineeships over four years to commence from 1 January. Eligible students in these programs do not pay a fee. Additionally the NSW Government provides fee-exemptions, scholarships and concessions to a variety of eligible students, including Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander, students with a disability, students that are receiving welfare benefits or are dependents of those receiving welfare benefits and those aged 15-30 that have been or are currently in out-of-home care. Should a student not be eligible for the above support, under Smart and Skilled, the student fees range from \$880 to \$3,960 for a Certificate III qualification and \$1,500 to \$4,960 for a Certificate IV qualification on the NSW Skills List.

**Page No. 57 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: What has been the change in staff numbers in TAFE—and I am talking here full-time equivalents—between 2011 to now?

Mr SCOTT: What we can do is give you the latest staffing figures and we can go back and look at the history, but I am advised on preliminary figures for June this year we have an increase of 6.8 per cent of full-time equivalent teachers over the previous year. I appreciate the question was going back on that, but what we are seeing is an uptake in the past financial year of 6.8 per cent of equivalent full-time teachers.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Right, but the balance will be taken on notice?

Mr SCOTT: Yes.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that information on TAFE NSW staff numbers are included in the Annual Reports available at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/corporate/annual-report>.

**Page No. 57-58 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: In the past two years what courses have been discontinued in regional and remote areas? Are you able to provide us data on that?

Ms PENTON: We will take that question on notice and look at the data that is available, and provide it to the committee.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: And if you could provide the reasons why that course was discontinued, whether it was a demand or availability of teaching staff, whatever the reason was?

Ms PENTON: Yes.

Mr SCOTT: Yes. And there will be good reasons. Student demand changes and TAFE needs to be responsive to those demand changes.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: And can you provide data on the percentage of courses offered at regional TAFE campuses that are offered face to face versus those that are not?

Ms PENTON: Face to face versus other delivery methods in regional New South Wales?

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Regional New South Wales, yes. Are you able to specifically explain the process for non-face to face in regional areas? What do the other delivery methods look like in terms of the student experience?

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to tell me how many campuses in regional areas allow for course progression on the same campus? I am happy for you to take that on notice.

Ms PENTON: I take that on notice. That is a complex question that you have asked, given the range of programs and the size and scale of the campuses.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Do you have any data on how many graduates from regional and remote areas improve their employment status within six months of completing a course with TAFE?

Ms PENTON: I would consider that would be within the NCVR data and our other data so we will take a question on notice and provide that material.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Do you have results from the feasibility study into regional relocation services undertaken by PricewaterhouseCoopers in the 2017-2018 financial year?

Ms PENTON: I would take that question on notice, not being the managing director of the data.

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW is proud of its delivery in regional areas, including the opening of 14 Connected Learning Sites since 2017. Further information on TAFE NSW regional delivery is available in the TAFE NSW annual report which can be found at:  
<https://www.tafensw.edu.au/corporate/annual-report>.

**Page No. 58 - 59 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: I am going to come back to the Calling All Tradies initiative.

The Hon. WES FANG: Brilliant initiative.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: We were talking earlier about the information session on 8 May. Are you able to provide—happy for you to take these on notice—how many people applied to be part-time casual teachers after attending the information session?

Ms PENTON: Yes we will provide that question on notice.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: And how many people were approved as part-time casual teachers through this recruitment campaign?

Ms PENTON: Yes. We will provide the data on notice for you.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: And what sort of areas did they come from, what trade backgrounds?

Ms PENTON: Trade background? Yes, certainly, we can correlate that.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: And can you tell us how much time passed on average between this information session and the commencement of part-time teaching for participants?

Ms PENTON: We should be able to track that information. We will look at our data and see what is available for you.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: And how many people currently are still employed as TAFE teachers as a result of this initiative.

Ms PENTON: Yes. We will provide that. We will be able to track them through our SAP system for you.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Was this requirement specifically communicated to the applicants?

Ms PENTON: I believe so, unless there is information to the contrary.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Can you advise what the total cost of this Calling All Tradies campaign was?

Mr SCOTT: Yes, we took that on notice this morning.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Did we? Okay. What was the initial target for recruitment in terms of numbers? How many people were you trying to recruit?

Ms PENTON: This was a new initiative for TAFE NSW, given that these are some of the areas where we do have skills shortages and growth in demand. We have looked at a range of different attraction mechanisms for people to enter into TAFE teaching and obviously to give back to their industries, particularly those more experienced in the latter part of their career, but we can provide that to you on notice.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Can you also provide detail of what consultation you undertook prior to commencing this initiative with stakeholders, including industry and unions?

Ms PENTON: Yes, we can provide information.

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government is focused on ensuring that there are more frontline TAFE teachers and has undertaken several initiatives to attract new teachers to TAFE NSW, including the Calling All Tradies program. I am advised that on preliminary figures for June 2019, there were 5,827 full-time equivalent teachers at TAFE NSW, an increase of 6.8% over the previous year. Final figures will be available in the 2018-19 Annual Report.

**Page No. 59 - 60 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: I was asking about dropout rates earlier.

Mr SCOTT: Yes, sure.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Can you give me—and you may need to do this on notice—the total number of dropout rates of students undertaking Certificate IV courses?

Mr SCOTT: We will track the data of completion rates and from that we will be able to see who has completed and who has not completed.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that information on completion rates at TAFE NSW are available in the TAFE NSW annual report which can be found at: <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/about-tafensw/annual-report>.



**Page No. 60 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: You may have already taken this on notice, but I was wondering if you are able to provide data not only on full-time equivalent, but head count for total staff and have that broken down by institutes?

Mr SCOTT: Yes, we should have that detail.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you also able to provide that data in relation to employment status, that is, are they permanent or casual?

Mr SCOTT: Yes, we can track all that detail.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that on preliminary figures for June 2019, there were 5,827 full-time equivalent teachers, an increase of 6.8% over the previous year. Final figures will be available in the 2018-19 Annual Report. I am also advised that further information on TAFE NSW staff numbers are included in the TAFE NSW Annual Reports available at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/corporate/annual-report>.

**Page No. 60 - 61 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM and Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: I am not sure if I asked this question about staff on some form of leave or as a result of stress. Did you provide information about that or the number of staff?

The CHAIR: No, I do not think we have had stress yet.

Mr SCOTT: I think we may have.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: I asked about psychological injuries.

Mr SCOTT: Yes, that is right.

The CHAIR: There are many categories of stress in the modern environment.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: There are. It is very stressful.

Mr SCOTT: We were talking earlier about—

The CHAIR: We had students who can't handle the word "fail". That was stressful.

Mr SCOTT: We certainly covered that, I remember, Mr Chair. We talked earlier about our work health and safety commitment. We have seen that increase. That was identified, but we have also said that we put a real focus on it. We are happy to provide a breakdown of categories of work health and safety incidents that will take into account the things you raise.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you also able to provide information about the amount of money paid in settlements in relation to stress-related claims, psychological injuries?

Mr SCOTT: I will need to take advice on that.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: The total quantum, not individual settlements?

Mr SCOTT: You will find that settlements are often—

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Confidential?

Mr SCOTT: Yes, they will be confidential by nature and by agreement. In aggregate we should be able to provide it.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to provide information about how many permanent staff have exited TAFE since 2015, broken down for each financial year since 2015?

Extract 2:

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Apart from retirement, what is the main reason people are choosing to leave TAFE?

Ms PENTON: We would have to get that data and make it available to you.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that information on Work, Health and Safety matters is available in the TAFE annual report available at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/corporate/annual-report>.

**Page No. 61 - 62 - The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM**

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: I ask about Gunnedah and Tamworth. Both those TAFE colleges introduced a Certificate IV in programming for the first time, is that correct?

Mr SCOTT: There are a lot of courses and a lot of colleges. We will have to take that on notice.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Are you able to provide information on how many students enrolled at each campus in this course?

Mr SCOTT: We could go to the website, but that would take unnecessary time.

Ms PENTON: We will take the question on notice and provide the data.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: And are you able to provide information about whether the course is delivered in person or online?

Mr SCOTT: Yes. You said programming?

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: Certificate IV in programming?

Mr SCOTT: Of course I would put it to you that the vast majority of programming courses offered around the world are now offered online, so we are happy to provide the detail, but if there is a premise to your question that somehow that is inferior, I would say of programming, of all areas this is an area—

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: I don't think there is a premise in that.

Mr SCOTT: I just wanted to make sure there wasn't, but I just say that on programming, there are a lot of programming courses that are delivered online.

The CHAIR: It might be a question directed at the paucity of people who took up the course?

Mr SCOTT: Yes, I accept that, Mr Chair.

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: The cost to complete the course apparently was \$9,540. How many students are not eligible for any government subsidy?

Ms PENTON: We will take that question on notice.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: How many students from Gunnedah could afford that?

The Hon. ANTHONY D'ADAM: And what was the average cost for students enrolled in Certificate IV in programming in both Gunnedah and Tamworth campuses? I am advised that in Gunnedah and Tamworth shire the number of people employed in information, media and telecommunications has been in decline in both these areas. Are you able to provide information about why TAFE picked these sites for this course?

Mr SCOTT: Yes.

Ms PENTON: It would be dependent on the delivery mode of course.

Mr SCOTT: Yes.

**ANSWER**

ICT40515 Certificate IV in Programming was offered at TAFE NSW Tamworth and Gunnedah for the first time in Semester 2 2019. Delivery for this course is through connected learning consisting of two video-conference sessions each week to bring together students from across TAFE NSW West Region. I am advised that all current enrolled students were eligible for Government subsidised training for this course, and that in addition to the subsidised price, all students were eligible for the Jobs of Tomorrow Scholarship under the NSW Government's Smart and Skilled Program.

**Page No. 62 - 63 - The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS**

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: I am interested to come back to this question of universities and how they interact with the New South Wales Government.

Mr SCOTT: Yes.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: Is it predominantly through the Department of Education. Would you characterise it as that?

Mr SCOTT: Yes, so we have a couple of things. We have a higher education division that reports through to Ms O'Loughlin. It was formerly in the Department of Education. That is where we get those areas identified earlier that have ministerial responsibilities, which go to the governing structures, ministerial appointees to boards, some land issues and other by-law issues and the like. We would have people in Ms O'Loughlin's area who look after higher education and provide advice in those areas.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: But it is specifically on those areas, it is not a broader—

Mr SCOTT: As I said earlier, the key policy settings for higher education belong with the Federal Government. It provides the funding and there is a Federal Minister who is responsible for higher education. On the matters that we have discussed—we were discussing Confucius earlier and other matters like that—it is Minister Tehan, the Federal Minister, who is talked most about in national education partnerships to make sure they comply with Australian laws, education quality standards and academic freedoms. Over the history of Federation, certainly in the last 50 or 60 years, all the key policy decisions that really oversee higher education, have been in the purview of the Federal Minister and the Commonwealth Government, because fundamentally it provides the funding, the research grants and all that supporting infrastructure. But there are things that we are doing in New South Wales. For example, we created the waratah grants—a grant mechanism for when we aggregate State government grant money and allocate it to universities. That is an initiative but really the scope for us is limited, it is fair to say.

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: I would be interested if you could provide some more information on notice about the waratah grants.

Mr SCOTT: Would you like information now on the waratah grants?

The Hon. COURTNEY HOUSSOS: I just have a couple of other questions, so perhaps we could come back to it.

Mr SCOTT: I am happy to do that.

**ANSWER**

In 2018 the NSW Government established the Waratah Research Network Government Forum (the Network) to strategically engage with the NSW university sector.

The Network is chaired by NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer, Professor Hugh Durrant-Whyte. The Deputy Secretary of Skills and Higher Education is Deputy Chair. Senior officials from each cluster are represented. An invitation to the Chair of the NSW Deputy Vice-Chancellors – Research Committee is extended for each meeting.

The Network has examined ways in which the NSW Government sector currently engages in research and development activity, both with the university sector and as part of Government activity. The Network will identify priority research projects with interagency strategic relevance.

The Waratah initiative is funded by the NSW Government, with \$7.5 million budgeted until 2022. Most of this budget is for the Waratah Grants strategic research fund, which will fund the priority research projects. The aim of the initiative is to help the NSW university sector to deliver more high-impact research for the people and communities of NSW.

**Page No. 64 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Mr Scott, I asked you some questions about the total staff numbers in TAFE —2011 to now. Could I ask you to provide the same information—and, perhaps if we just pick a data point, maybe 30 June 2011 compared to 30 June 2019—the same for TAFE New South Wales teaching positions?

Mr SCOTT: Yes.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: And for educational support positions and for corporate positions?

Mr SCOTT: Yes, we will take that on notice.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that on preliminary figures for June 2019, there were 5,827 full-time equivalent teachers, an increase of 6.8% over the previous year. Final figures will be available in the 2018-19 Annual Report. I am also advised that further information on TAFE NSW staff numbers are included in the TAFE NSW Annual Reports available at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/corporate/annual-report>.

**Page No. 64 - Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE**

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: If it would assist, I am more than happy to provide you with a series of reports and fairly small initiatives in that area. Given TAFE's obligation that we spoke about earlier, especially to provide access for disadvantaged people and for access across New South Wales, what, if any, courses does TAFE offer for, perhaps one of the most basic things to get a job, which is driver licences?

Ms PENTON: In my experience over time, TAFE NSW has offered a range of support in this area— more in the area of readiness for sitting the test. From time to time there is interaction with learner driving itself. If I could take the opportunity to take the question on notice, we can provide you with data and the types of programs that we are currently offering. Certainly, in my experience, we have become involved with it from time to time and I understand the value of it.

Mr DAVID SHOEBRIDGE: Yes and to be clear, I am asking beyond just sitting the test—it is also getting the points and passing the course and, for many—particularly young Aboriginal people, young people leaving care—access to the motor vehicle, to get the 120 hours up. What initiatives are in place and what opportunities does TAFE see?

Mr SCOTT: We will take that on notice, we understand the question.

**ANSWER**

I am advised that TAFE NSW has the following initiatives in place to prepare disadvantaged people for a drivers licence:

- A course in *Foundation Skills for Learner Drivers* which improves literacy, numeracy and digital technology skills to enable learners to pass the NSW Driver Knowledge Test and develop confidence to participate in formal education.
- A *Statement in Safer Drivers* course which is designed to improve the safety of young learner drivers, including people leaving care, as they progress to a provisional licence and drive unsupervised.  
The course improves levels of safe driving by focusing on how to manage road safety risks, increasing current driving skills and acquiring new skills.  
Participation in the course entitles a learner driver to a 20 hour reduction on the 120 log book hours requirement.
- A *Statement in RMS Safer Drivers* course delivered in partnership with the Roads and Maritime Services to assist Aboriginal and other disadvantaged people with gaining and keeping their drivers licence.
- A *Statement in Aboriginal Learner Driver* which builds the capacity of Aboriginal people to successfully engage and obtain a NSW Learner Driver's licence to increase employment opportunities.
- A part qualification in *Getting your L's* which is targeted towards learners from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds and includes literacy required for the driver licence process, such as vocabulary, signs and idiomatic language. Delivery of this part qualification at TAFE NSW Sutherland Campus is conducted in partnership with Gynea Tradies Club for low cost progression driving lessons in a car funded by the Tradies Club.

TAFE NSW will continue to provide opportunities to disadvantaged people to assist them to gain education and skills they need to join the workforce.