



The Hon Andrew Constance MP
Minister for Transport and Infrastructure

Rebecca Main
Director, Committees
NSW Parliament
6 Macquarie Street, Sydney

Dear Ms Main,

I refer to your correspondence on behalf of the Portfolio Committee No. 5 seeking further detailed answers for certain questions on notice and supplementary questions.

Please find attached further information.

Yours sincerely,

THE HON ANDREW CONSTANCE MP

Question 7

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Just two weeks ago, Transport for NSW came before the Parliament and said that the CBD light rail would open to passengers at the latest in March 2020. Can you assure us that that remains the opening date for the CBD light rail?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: This project will transform Sydney when it opens. We know how much light rail is loved, because you only need to look at the inner west light rail project to see that commuters love light rail. Along the way, we have had to, on an ongoing basis, put pressure on Acciona to get a wriggle on in terms of the work that they are doing in relation to the project. The last program in terms of the advice from ALTRAC, as the public private partnership [PPP] company, is March 2020. That advice has gone out publicly. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: When did ALTRAC provide you with that advice? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will have to take that on notice, but the key point out of it is that there have been ongoing commercial negotiations between us and ALTRAC in relation to the program. They have made a clear statement in relation to that date and as to, also, the dates that they will remove the barriers to allow the city to breathe.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to my response to supplementary question 163.

Question 8

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: When was the last time you caught a CountryLink train?
Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will think about that and come back to you.

Answer

I am advised:

I am a regular user of public transport. CountryLink ceased operations on 30 June 2013. I have nothing further to add.

Question 10

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Has the Government undertaken any modelling as to the cost of removing or reducing station access fees for both airport stations? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will take that on notice, but a lot of work is done in relation to modelling right across the transport network.

Answer

I am advised:

Paying the Access Fee at the airport stations would cost the NSW Government in the order of \$1.5 billion over the next twelve years.

Question 16

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: But you do accept that even if we just want to look at the last two months, the Western line, Richmond line, Liverpool line, Leppington line and South line are still not meeting the benchmarks? Mr COLLINS: I do not know

what figures you have. I can take the question on notice and give you figures right up to this morning's peak to give you the accurate figure. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: No, I can look on the website. Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: It is at 99.7 per cent, to help you out.

Answer

I am advised:

On 31 August, the peak punctuality was 99.7 per cent. I have nothing further to add.

Question 17

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: I am very aware of that. Would you be able to provide to the Committee the costs of overtime paid broken down by month in relation to Sydney Trains? Mr COLLINS: I am sure we can provide information— The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: You can do it on notice. Mr COLLINS: —on notice, but obviously the important thing is to understand which parts do you want to know; every single bit of overtime? The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: However much information you want to provide me with is very welcome. I want to know the overtime of train drivers and guards, I want to know the overtime of maintenance staff, broken down by months since the new timetable has been in place. Mr COLLINS: I certainly can provide that on notice. Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Happy to. Here to help.

Answer

I am advised:

I have nothing further to add.

Question 18

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: What is the budget for the development of the final business case for the Metro West?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: We can take that on notice

Answer

I am advised:

This information is available in the NSW Budget papers.

Question 26

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Transport for NSW has acquired 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia, for the purpose of providing depot, maintenance and stabling facilities for the Parramatta Light Rail, has it not? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will have to check the exact home address of the facilities in Camellia. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Is Mr Staples in a position to answer? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will have to check the exact status of that acquisition, given the significant number of acquisitions we are making to build public transport infrastructure in the city because when the Labor Party was in government nothing was done. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Can Mr Staples or any other official confirm that Transport for NSW has acquired 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia for the purpose of providing depot, maintenance and stabling facilities for the Parramatta Light Rail? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: As I said, we will take on notice the exact property acquisition status. But we are going to

need stabling facilities in Camellia. You are on the money there; you have uncovered something. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: On what date was 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia, acquired? Mr STAPLES: We will have to take that question on notice once we confirm that that is the property to which you are referring.

Answer

I am advised:

Valuations are determined in accordance with the Land Acquisition (Just Terms Compensation) Act 1991.

Question 27

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Sure. What was the acquisition cost of 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia? Mr STAPLES: To the extent we can make that available, we will provide that information as part of the response to the question on notice. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Was it \$53.5 million? Mr STAPLES: I think I have answered that question. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: From whom was it acquired? Mr STAPLES: We are yet to confirm the address. Once we have gone through the process of confirming the address, which we obviously can, we can confirm the ownership.

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Was it acquired from a property developer?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Are you inferring something?

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: No, I am asking you directly.

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: There is no inference. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Was it acquired from a property developer? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I think we are going to check the property address you are asking about, and we have indicated that we will check its acquisition status. We are happy to come back to the Committee, being mindful of the commercial nature of this issue.

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: In an out-of-session meeting of the Finance and Investment Committee convened on 13 May 2016, the committee authorised the purchase of the site for \$53.5 million, did it not? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I said we would take that question on notice. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Perhaps Mr Staples can confirm that. He was on that committee. Mr STAPLES: Yes, I am on the Finance and Investment Committee of Transport for NSW. At the time you refer to I was quite focused on the delivery of Sydney metro program. But I think we need to go back to the original question on notice, which is to confirm the property address. On the premise of that we can provide the details the member wants in relation to other aspects.

Answer

I am advised:

Valuations are determined in accordance with the Land Acquisition (Just Terms Compensation) Act 1991.

Question 28

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: I will ask the question again: 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia, is contaminated, is it not? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Through you if I may, Mr Chair. May I answer the question? The CHAIR: Yes, certainly. Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I indicated that we are unaware of the exact location of the street

address to which Mr Mookhey is referring. We will endeavour to come back to the Committee in relation to that property. That answer stands for every other line of questions about this matter.

Answer

I am advised:

Valuations are determined in accordance with the Land Acquisition (Just Terms Compensation) Act 1991.

Question 29

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: As I said, we will take the questions about the address to which you have referred on notice. We have a significant process around property acquisitions through Transport for NSW. We will take any questions in relation to this property on notice. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: In May you awarded Venture a \$121 million contract to clean up 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia. You issued a press release about it; it is on the Transport for NSW website. That is true, is it not, Mr Staples? Mr STAPLES: I am happy to go and confirm that. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: So clarifying that there was a \$121 million contract to remediate 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia, might settle this issue of whether or not you bought the property. I can only presume that you would not have issued a press release announcing that you were paying to clean it up if you had not bought it. Mr STAPLES: As we said, we will confirm—it was the first question you asked—whether or not that property was part of the Camellia site. We will confirm that and then we are able to confirm the other aspects of the question you have asked. I think we need to be clear around valuations and processes that there is clearly a process that we go through when we acquire sites. That is complicated by legacy contamination. It is something that all of us have to deal with on many sites. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Indeed, particularly on Camellia. Mr STAPLES: I have had to confront that on many occasions on projects. We have a job to clean those up. That is factored in to the acquisition price at the time. As part of the negotiation there is an independent valuation process that is undertaken for the sites, as a general approach. I am very confident that we will have documentation to support what we have done in that area. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Thank you, Mr Staples. I look forward to seeing it. Minister, do you wish to take this opportunity to explain how we have managed to go from the developer paying to clean up the site to the taxpayers paying \$121 million to clean up the site in the span of one year? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I stand by my first answer. I will go and check the address.

Answer

I am advised:

Valuations are determined in accordance with the Land Acquisition (Just Terms Compensation) Act 1991.

Question 33

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: I turn to Newcastle buses. Changes to Newcastle bus timetables have been controversial, and I understand there has been a review of the network. Has that review been completed? Mr TROUGHTON: The review has been completed. We have asked Keolis Downer to keep engaging with the community and

reviewing how the network is functioning. As you are aware, with the new network we have the fast and direct services that service key parts of Newcastle. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Has the review been publicly released? If not, is it going to be publicly released? Mr TROUGHTON: I think the changes that are planned have been publicly released, and certainly they will be. We need to tell people, and trip planners and the like will be available. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: As you know there was a loud community outcry as a result of change to the buses and then there was a review to take on board, hopefully, the concerns of the community. You said the review is complete. Is that document going to be released to the public? Mr TROUGHTON: I think it already has been released. I will take on notice to confirm.

Answer

I am advised:
Information is available on the Newcastle Transport website.

Question 36

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: That would be great. Minister, will you be able to provide the Committee with the figures in relation to the number of jobs that will need to be cut in the agency as a result of the efficiency dividend job cuts. I am happy for you to do that as individual jobs and/or equivalent full-time [EFT]. Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Sure, I am happy to do that. I am happy to provide you any response in terms of question on notice, but I would make the observation that we are growing our bus drivers, we are growing our train drivers, and we are growing our captains on the harbour fleet. We are constantly investing in frontline services and frontline staff. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Thanks. I wonder how many jobs are going to be lost as a result of the efficiency dividend. Minister, it is my understanding that transport is by far the largest employer of contingency labour in New South Wales. The figures that I am aware of are that approximately \$350 million is spent on contingency labour. Can you confirm that? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I am happy to take that on notice.

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Can anyone else confirm that? Mr Staples?

Mr STAPLES: We do have a number of contingent labour workforce within the organisation. We tend to use those where we have short-term needs or changes in our operating requirements. We bring those people in to fill those gaps. I do not have an exact dollar figure on how much we spend. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Would you be able to provide the numbers, preferably for individuals and EFT? The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: By a labour-hire firm. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: By a labour-hire firm. Are you able to provide those figures to the Committee? It is a large number and we are trying to understand how big it is. Preferably if you can provide it over the past three years. Mr STAPLES: Are you saying that you have the number already?

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: No, I am asking you to provide the number. Mr

STAPLES: Yes, but I think I took the question on notice.

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Supplementary Questions

Question 27

What is the peak capacity per hour in terms of passengers the Airport Link line currently?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 28

What is the maximum capacity per hour on the Airport Link line once the maximum number of trains are added to the line?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 115

Have contract bus drivers been hired from interstate to work on the Inner West bus routes?

Answer

I am advised:

Transport for NSW is confident that there are sufficient drivers. Staffing is a matter for the operator.

Question 118

How many bus stops have been removed from Surry Hills, Redfern, Newtown, Enmore, Stanmore, Petersham and Camperdown in the past year?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 121

How many bus services will be removed or reduced as a result of the implementation of the light rail?

Answer

I am advised:
This information is available in the CBD South East Light Rail Environmental Impact Statement.

Question 139

How many Opal Card Top Up Machines have been installed since 31 July 2017?

Answer

I am advised:

This information is available on the Opal website.

Question 147

How much has been paid to King & Wood Mallesons for work on the CBD light rail in each of the years 2012-2018?

Answer

I am advised:

Legal Panel services billing by agency is available in the NSW Government Legal Services Panel Annual Report on the Department of Justice website.

Question 148

How much has been paid for legal services provided for the CBD light rail in each of the years 2012-2018?

Answer

I am advised:

Information regarding legal services provided for the CBD light rail project has been released under GIPA and is available in the Transport for NSW Disclosure log on Transport for NSW's website.

Question 163

At the Legislative Council Inquiry into the CBD Light Rail, Stephen Troughton of Transport for NSW said that the "current completion date of the project is March 2020" and that Transport for NSW was trying "to bring that forward to a completion date around December 2019." Can you confirm that Transport for NSW has now been advised that the completion date has not been brought forward but has in fact been delayed and is now the end of May 2020?

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to Mr Troughton's further evidence to the light rail inquiry on 4 October 2018, and to my public statements on this matter.

Question 164

Can you confirm that in seeking approval for a liquidity facility for ALTRAC you told the Treasurer that the facility was needed to avoid ALTRAC's insolvency?

Answer

Question 165

Can you confirm that the arrangement involves NSW guaranteeing a \$500 million loan by ALTRAC?

(a) If so, what is the expiry date of the guarantee / when must the loan be repaid?

Answer

I am advised:

Question 166

Did you ever intend to disclose the existence of this secret arrangement?

(a) If so, when?

Answer

I am advised:

Question 167

Have you ever previously sought the Treasurer's agreement to have NSW guarantee commercial loans for private companies?

(a) If so, which companies were involved and were your applications to the Treasurer successful?

Answer

I am advised:

Question 168

What private sector banks are lending interim funds to the ALTRAC light rail partnership?

Answer

I am advised:

Question 169

What is the value of interim funds lent by private sector banks to the ALTRAC light rail partnership?

Answer

I am advised:

Question 170

Why was the guarantee provided for funds lent to the ALTRAC Light Rail partnership?

Answer

(164) - (170) I am advised:

These matters were canvassed at the inquiry into the CBD and South East Light Rail.

Question 175

How much was Lee Lin Chin paid for her involvement in the advertising campaign to support the closure of the Chatswood to Epping line?

Answer

I am advised:

\$70,000.00

Question 176

What is the total cost of the advertising campaign around the Chatswood to Epping line closure?

Answer

I am advised:

The contract is available on the eTendering website.

Question 184

What is the worst rail line for peak punctuality in 2018?

Answer

I am advised:

This information is available on the Transport for NSW website.

Question 194

How many train drivers employed by Sydney and NSW Trains have been recruited from 1 February 2018 to now?

Question 195

How many train drivers employed by Sydney and NSW Trains have exited from 1 February 2018 to now?

Question 196

What is the total number of train drivers employed by Sydney and NSW Trains as of now?

Answer

I am advised:

(194) - (196) There are sufficient train drivers to operate the timetable. Information regarding train drivers is published annually in the Public Service Commission's Workforce Profile report.

Question 205

Does the Government have any plans to remove train guards from intercity trains?

Answer

I am advised:

The trains travelling to the Central Coast, Newcastle, Blue Mountains and the South Coast would each have two staff to ensure passenger safety. That includes the driver and a guard or customer service worker.

Question 206

Does the Government have any plans to remove train guards from Sydney trains?

Answer

I am advised:

There are no current plans to remove train guards from Sydney Trains.

Question 212

What is the total number of cases in which Transport for NSW is a party to a court proceeding?

Answer

I am advised:

Matters to which TfNSW is a party are a matter of public record.

Question 216

Is the Minister aware of the devastating impact the cuts to bus services on Beaumont Street, Hamilton have had on local businesses?

Question 217

Is the Minister aware that local businesses have closed down due to the downturn created by the cuts to bus services?

(216) and (217) Answer

I am advised:

The new bus network increases the number of weekly services in the Hamilton area.

The only service which travelled along Beaumont Street as part of the previous network was route 201.

An analysis of Opal data showed over 85 per cent of customers in the Hamilton area used bus stops on Tudor and Donald Street, and that customers who accessed Beaumont Street regularly came from beyond the suburbs that were previously serviced by route 201.

The new network reflects this with increased services from across the Newcastle Transport area into Hamilton.

Question 293

What was the acquisition cost of 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia?

Question 294

From whom was it acquired?

Question 295

Was it acquired from a property developer?

Question 296

Did the Finance and Investment Committee of Transport for NSW approved \$30 million-plus GST to acquire 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia, in March 2015?

Question 297

The developer who sold Transport for NSW the site bought it for \$26.5 million. Is that correct?

Question 298

In an out-of-session meeting of the Finance and Investment Committee convened on 13 May 2016, the committee authorised the purchase of the site for \$53.5 million, did it not?

Question 299

Why did TFNSW buy the site for \$53.5 million when the developer paid \$26 million just months earlier?

Question 300

Was the property at 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia, is contaminated at the time of purchase?

Question 301

At the same meeting of the Finance and Investment Committee at which \$30 million was approved to buy the site in 2015, the committee imposed a condition that the seller of the land would have to pay for the clean-up. That is correct, is it not?

Question 302

When Transport for NSW bought the site for \$53.5 million, in addition to handing the developer a \$26 million windfall, Transport for NSW agreed that taxpayers would pay for the clean-up, did it not?

Answer

I am advised:

(293) - (302) Valuations are determined in accordance with the Land Acquisition (Just Terms Compensation) Act 1991.

Question 316

Has the Illawarra-Shoalhaven Future Transport Plan been finalised?

(a) If not, why not?

(b) If yes, when will it be made publicly available?

Answer

I am advised:

This information is available on the Future Transport website.

Question 317

Since the new Sydney Trains timetable was introduced in November last year, on how many occasions have there been disruptions on the network caused by preventable maintenance issues?

Question 318

What benchmarks are used to determine if the level of disruptions caused by preventable maintenance issues is acceptable for:

(a) track maintenance

(b) fleet maintenance?

Answer

I am advised:

(317) - (318) The NSW Government invests significant funds each year to ensure the ongoing safety and reliability of rail services. Sydney Trains' spend on maintenance has increased from \$1.1 billion in 2011-12 to \$1.3 billion in 2017-18.

Question 322

How many FTE staff were employed in 2016/17 for:

(a) track maintenance

(b) fleet maintenance?

Answer

I am advised:

I have nothing further to add.

Question 323

How many FTE staff were employed in 2017/18 for:
(a) track maintenance
(b) fleet maintenance?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 324

How many FTE staff were employed in 2018/19 for:
(a) track maintenance
(b) fleet maintenance?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 328

What specific plans are in place to attract the highly skilled workforce required to Dubbo?

Answer

I am advised:
TfNSW has developed a collaborative approach to jobs and skills for the Regional Rail Fleet Project. To support this, TfNSW has convened a Jobs, Skills and Industry Participation (JSIP) Advisory Group comprising federal, state and local government agencies

Question 362

How many nights' travel were claimed by the Minister during the 2017-18 period?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 363

How many nights' travel were claimed by the Minister's spouse during the 2017-18 period?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 364

What was the total amount of travel allowances claimed by the Minister and their spouse (if applicable) during 2017-18?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 365

What is the total amount of meal allowances claimed by the Minister and their spouse (if applicable) during 2017-18?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 369

Has any artwork been purchased or leased for display in your ministerial office in 2017-18?

(a) What is the cost of this?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 370

Have any floral displays or indoor plants or pot plants been hired or leased for display in your ministerial office in 2017-18?

(a) If so, what was the cost of these items?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 371

Have any floral displays or indoor plants or pot plants been purchased for display in your ministerial office in 2017-18?

(a) If so, what was the cost of these items?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 373

What was the total value of all gifts purchased for use by you and your office in 2017-18?

- (a) What were the gifts purchased?
i. Who were they gifted to?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 381

How much did your Department/agency spend on hospitality, including catering and beverages, in 2017-18?

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.

Question 382

Do any Departments/agencies within your portfolio responsibilities utilise the services of Labour Hire Firms?

- (a) If yes, please advise in table form for 2017-18:
- i. The names of the firms utilised
 - ii. The total amount paid to each firm engaged
 - iii. The a

Answer

I am advised:
I have nothing further to add.