

Questions taken on Notice

Question 1

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Thank you, Chair. Minister, the National Cycling Participation Survey 2017 shows that New South Wales has the lowest rate of cycling in the country. There has been a significant decrease in cycling participation in New South Wales since 2011. As transport Minister, how do you explain this?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Since coming to office, this Government has invested close to a quarter of a billion dollars in active transport. We are supporting communities across the State to deliver a program of pretty much shovel-ready works that local councils have brought forward with the objective, as you have stated, of getting more people participating in either walking or riding cycles. There are some tremendous projects in the list. I am happy to provide that list to the Committee. We are going to continue to invest in active transport because it is about healthy communities and delivering great outcomes. Projects, particularly in regional areas where traditionally they have not had that support, are really important, and we will continue to encourage councils to bring forward shovel-ready projects to get on with the job. In terms of the inner city, I am very keen to make sure that with every major investment we make in terms of our major infrastructure projects we also combine and integrate active transport, be it cycling or walking.

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Do you know how much of that quarter of a billion of dollars is spent on separated cycle infrastructure?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: It is a combination. It is largely shared pathways and—

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Do you have a figure though?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: We can get you the specifics in relation to cycling infrastructure.

Question 2

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: What about the targets for increasing cycling participation; what are they?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Again, as Ms Prendergast has alluded to, we work with local councils trying to cater for some of those infrastructure gaps. But at the same time, having mandated targets of trying to encourage people to walk and cycle when it is a joint initiative and responsibility across local and State governments, is something which we all need to work on. We have a plan, as Ms Prendergast alluded to, and we are happy to provide you with a copy of that. The key element in all of this, my expectation around this infrastructure is it has to integrate into public transport.

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Surely as the Minister for Transport it is your responsibility to set cycling targets for this State. Are you suggesting it is local government's responsibility or Roads responsibility?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I am suggesting it is a joint responsibility.

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Have we had cycling targets in the past?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I would have to go back and have a look at what the previous government did regarding cycling targets. The key element out of this, I can assure you, is we want to be able to support those who cycle and those who walk. We want them to do it safely and we want to be able to spread the funding right across New South Wales, particularly those country communities who missed out previously.

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Cycling, as I understand it, is decreasing.

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I am not sure that is the case. In the inner-city areas it is certainly not the case.

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: My first question was that the last national cycling participation survey found it is decreasing sharply in New South Wales and we have heard that quite a few people say the reason why is because the roads are quite unsafe and they think there is not enough cycling infrastructure. Cycling rates are decreasing; the Government is not setting a target to increase cycling participation. Is the New South Wales Government taking cycling as a legitimate form of transport seriously and doing everything it can to increase cycling on our roads and ensure that cyclists are safe?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Again, as I made the point in my opening remarks, close to a quarter of a billion dollars has gone in from this Government since we have been elected. We have also made available infrastructure funding through Restart NSW to bolster that. We will keep focused on making sure that our cycling community is safe. I will go back and have a look at the exact numbers and I am happy to give you an answer on notice.

Answer

I am advised:

(1) - (2) I refer you to my response to supplementary question 10.

Question 3

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Given that the Government has recognised, as you are saying, that cycling is a legitimate mode of transport, including for commuters in its regional district and transport plans, how much funding has been allocated to inner-city and metro cycling infrastructure and which projects have been funded?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Again, there is a raft of projects. I am happy to give you the breakdown on some of those projects, such as Sutherland to Cronulla.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to my response to supplementary question 4.

Question 4

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: What is the average number of passengers travelling during peak hour on the line currently?

Mr COLLINS: I will take the actual number on notice, but we have seen extra loading on those trains increase by 30 or 40 per cent in the last two years alone.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to my response to supplementary question 29.

Question 5

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Minister, part of Sydney Airport's master plan is the ground transport development plan overview, and pretty much the only time that public transport is mentioned there is in a little paragraph. Everything else is about roads connecting cars to the airport. However, it does say that Sydney Airport continues to advocate for improved public transport to the airport, including additional buses and reducing station access fees. How is that going? Is its advocacy falling on deaf ears?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: No. There are investments happening.

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Particularly in terms of reducing the station access fees and direct buses to the airport.

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will absolutely give you the increase in the number of services. I do not have that number offhand in terms of the airport line,

Answer

I am advised:

NSW Government is working hard to deliver an integrated transport system that meets the needs of customers now and in the future. A new timetable was introduced on 26 November 2017 as part of Stage 1 of the NSW Government's \$1.5 billion More Trains, More Services program. The new timetable delivers up to 1,500 new train services across the network. These extra services are needed to address significant patronage growth on public transport and particularly on the Sydney Trains network.

The NSW Government has also announced an additional \$880 million towards Stage 2 of the More Trains, More Services program to simplify and modernise the rail network, creating high capacity, turn up and go services for many customers. The program will use world-class technology to transform the network and provide customers with more services, faster travel times and improved reliability. The program will prepare the network to deliver more services for the T8 Airport Line, including a potential 80% increase at the International, Domestic, Mascot and Green Square stations during the morning peak, as well as extra services from Revesby and Campbelltown in south west Sydney.

Question 6

The CHAIR: Before I hand over to the Hon. Daniel Mookhey for his 20 minutes, I will use the Chair's prerogative to slip one in. Minister, during the debate and the eventual assent to the light rail bill for Newcastle, one of the conditions placed on the Government was that it would provide a business case for the westward extension of that line and that the Premier at the time had the money to do it. Are you able to provide the Committee with a copy of the business plan? I realise that you may take this question on notice, so if you are not able to provide that business plan when do you think you could do that for us?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I thank you for your question and your support in the Parliament in relation to that project.

The CHAIR: It was conditional on that.

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: That is true. Anybody who has visited Newcastle lately will see what has transpired into an incredible project. The civil work on light rail will be completed in the next month or so.

We will have trains being tested and then commissioned for revenue service in the first quarter of next year, so it will be very exciting. The CHAIR: I look forward to an invitation to come and inspect the works.

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Hopefully, you will be able to bring your surfboard and you can put it on the light rail.

Mr SCOT MacDONALD: I would like that.

The CHAIR: A lot of people would like to see that.

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: In all seriousness, one of the key elements of this is that this is the first stage of what will need to be an extension to the west. The

question we have been asking internally is: What is the best way to do that? There has been some commissioning of consulting work in relation to the number of routes and the best way to build it before we inform the strategic business case. I am happy to provide you with the documentation that has been completed up until now in relation to that. I am hopeful that the department will be able to get you that strategic business case development work by the end of the year. That is what is happening at the moment.

Answer

I am advised:

This document is considered Cabinet-in-Confidence.

Question 7

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Just two weeks ago, Transport for NSW came before the Parliament and said that the CBD light rail would open to passengers at the latest in March 2020. Can you assure us that that remains the opening date for the CBD light rail?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: This project will transform Sydney when it opens. We know how much light rail is loved, because you only need to look at the inner west light rail project to see that commuters love light rail. Along the way, we have had to, on an ongoing basis, put pressure on Acciona to get a wriggle on in terms of the work that they are doing in relation to the project. The last program in terms of the advice from ALTRAC, as the public private partnership [PPP] company, is March 2020. That advice has gone out publicly. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: When did ALTRAC provide you with that advice? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will have to take that on notice, but the key point out of it is that there have been ongoing commercial negotiations between us and ALTRAC in relation to the program. They have made a clear statement in relation to that date and as to, also, the dates that they will remove the barriers to allow the city to breathe.

Answer

I am advised:

In April 2018, Transport for NSW advised me that; ALTRAC had revised the date for completion to March 2020, that Transport for NSW had rejected the program as ALTRAC had not adequately considered options to mitigate delays, and that Transport for NSW would continue to work with ALTRAC to bring forward completion to 2019.

Question 8

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: When was the last time you caught a CountryLink train?
Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will think about that and come back to you.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to my response to supplementary question 269.

Question 9

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: I refer again to the Sydney Airport rail link. What has your response been to Sydney Airport apparently advocating for reduced station access fees to encourage more people to use those trains? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE:

First, patronage is up. There is very clear evidence of that, particularly given that we have had to add 200 services during non-peak times. We are doubling the frequency and people are using the train line. Obviously the station access fee, which applies to the stations at the airport, was part of a PPP arrangement that allowed the infrastructure to be built. That said, we have added great value in terms of Opal by having caps in place. We will continue to incentivise people on the airport line. Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: I understand that those are for people who use the train line. What are the caps? Are they more than once a week? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: We have both daily and weekly caps across the network. Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: What about for the airport? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will have to provide the specifics on notice. One of the key things is that there is no suggestion that there has been a drop-off in patronage on that line, given the fact that we have had to add 200 services a week.

Answer

I am advised:

This information is publicly available.

Question 10

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Has the Government undertaken any modelling as to the cost of removing or reducing station access fees for both airport stations? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will take that on notice, but a lot of work is done in relation to modelling right across the transport network.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to my response to supplementary question 32.

Question 11

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: What about the revenue that the Government has received over the past four years from the station access fee on the rail link. Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: We invest that back into growing our services. I just spoke of the— Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Do you have the details of how much that is? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Yes. I am happy to provide that, but the key point is that we have had a massive increase in the growth of services, and we use those funds to grow our services.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to my response to supplementary question 31.

Question 12

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: On to a different topic—safety on trains. I understand that about 200 fires occur each year on trains and at stations across Sydney's rail network. Is this figure correct? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will hand over to Howard in relation to that assertion. Mr COLLINS: I will take on notice the actual figure.

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Have there been any fires on trains or at stations over the last two or four years? Mr COLLINS: Occasionally, some of our customers decide to ignite fires on our trains. The good news is that our trains have a number of facilities.

The most modern ones have fire detection equipment facilities. The materials we use are fire resistant. Guards are on hand to assist with that. We have an extensive CCTV network. I cannot think, in the last three or four months, that we have had a fire on a train that has affected the railway. There are occasions when people do those things. Generally, they are about other people importing that risk. Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: So you are not sure whether there have been any on trains, in tunnels or in underground stations. Mr COLLINS: I will take that on notice. We have an extensive record of every incident on the network. I certainly do not want to mislead anyone by not including the facts, but I will get back to you.

Answer

I am advised:

The safety of customers and staff is always our highest priority. Since 2016 Sydney Trains has been proactively improving fire safety at Town Hall and has upgraded fire detection and alarm systems, replaced the sprinkler system, enhanced lighting and exit signage, and installed a smoke exhaust system throughout the concourse. There is also an ongoing program to reduce the risk of fire in tunnels, such as upgrading tunnel cables, removing rubbish in tunnels, and conducting regular maintenance inspections. Thanks to continued improvements made to our train fleet, there have been very few instances of fire on-board trains since we came to government as a result of the Liberal-National government's record investment in infrastructure.

Question 13

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: How much has been invested in fire safety improvements since the Transport for NSW 2015 Fire and Life Safety report, which I understand identified some alarming safety risks at Town Hall station? Mr COLLINS: I will take on notice the actual amount,

Answer

I am advised:

The safety of customers and staff is always our highest priority. All necessary funding regarding any safety upgrades required at Town Hall Station has and will continue to be provided by the NSW Government. The NSW Government has allocated \$1.5 billion in this years budget to continue to maintain Sydney Trains and NSW TrainLink Intercity networks.

Question 14

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Have any of the recommendations from the 2015 report not been implemented, that you are aware of? Mr COLLINS: Some of them are significant in nature and— Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Which ones are they? Mr COLLINS: Again, we can give you on notice the progress reports that we have, but everything is on program and up to date. We are obviously working through that extensive program. I use Town Hall station most days, and it is still being upgraded and modernised not just to do with the fire safety works but also with the improvements we are making to a very busy station. That includes removal of materials and upgrading some of the CCTV systems. I am very happy to give you on notice the report and updated progress.

Answer

I am advised:

The safety of customers and staff is always the highest priority to the NSW Government. Sydney Trains is committed to implementing all 15 recommendations. Six out of the 15 recommendations have been completed with full certification received. The balance will be completed over the coming years, as agreed by Fire and Rescue NSW and the City of Sydney Council. With regards to the outstanding recommendations, there are appropriate procedures in place to ensure customers and staff are not impacted and the majority of outstanding items relate to ongoing asset protection.

Question 15

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: When was the last time evacuation training occurred at Town Hall station? Mr COLLINS: We do that on a very regular basis. Sometimes an evacuation exercise takes place because we have to carry out that exercise. We have refreshed and recently done an extensive evacuation process for a lot of our mainline stations like Central, Town Hall, Wynyard. I will take on notice the actual date of the last one, but it is a regular occurrence.

Answer

I am advised:

The safety and security of customers and staff is the number one priority of the NSW Government. Station evacuation training is completed regularly. Full station evacuation training was last conducted in the evening at Town Hall station on 7 and 14 April 2018 (following the final train service) with all team members not on leave.

Question 16

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: But you do accept that even if we just want to look at the last two months, the Western line, Richmond line, Liverpool line, Leppington line and South line are still not meeting the benchmarks? Mr COLLINS: I do not know what figures you have. I can take the question on notice and give you figures right up to this morning's peak to give you the accurate figure. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: No, I can look on the website. Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: It is at 99.7 per cent, to help you out.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to the response given at the hearing.

Question 17

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: I am very aware of that. Would you be able to provide to the Committee the costs of overtime paid broken down by month in relation to Sydney Trains? Mr COLLINS: I am sure we can provide information— The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: You can do it on notice. Mr COLLINS: —on notice, but obviously the important thing is to understand which parts do you want to know; every single bit of overtime? The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: However much information you want to provide me with is very welcome. I want to know the overtime of train drivers and guards, I want to know the overtime of maintenance staff, broken down by months since the new timetable has been in place. Mr COLLINS: I certainly can provide that on notice. Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Happy to. Here to help.

Answer

I am advised:

Sydney Trains is a 365 day, 24 hours a day operation. Operational staff work overtime from time to time for infrastructure upgrades, repairs and maintenance work that can only be done outside operating hours and on weekends so services operate normally for peak period customers. Overtime for operational staff is often a more cost efficient way of rostering around specific peaks.

Question 18

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: What is the budget for the development of the final business case for the Metro West?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: We can take that on notice

Answer

I am advised:

This information is publicly available.

Question 19

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Minister, how many children use public transport, particularly the rail line, in New South Wales each week? Mr ANDREW

CONSTANCE: I can get you the exact numbers.

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Does anybody know what percentage, roughly? Mr

ANDREW CONSTANCE: In terms of school kids across the whole network, or just on trains? Mr STAPLES: We will take it on notice.

Answer

I am advised:

Opal Data by card type is available on the TfNSW website.

Question 20

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: They are two advertising campaigns; gambling advertisements for the TAB and alcohol advertisements for Jack Daniels. Are you aware that these types of advertisements are being displayed quite extensively at train stations on the rail network, Minister? These documents show two big advertising campaigns: one for the TAB, so gambling ads; and one for Jack Daniels; so alcohol ads. Were you aware that these types of ads are being run in train stations quite extensively on the rail network, Minister? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE:

There is an advertising policy in place. I do remember The Greens sneaking an ad in there at one point and we had to get it taken off. The point I make is that there is an advertising policy in place. Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Do you think that is

appropriate? Like ads on television, there are regulations for alcohol and gambling ads not to be displayed during times that children will probably be watching television, which is a certain period in the morning and a certain period in the

afternoon and evening. These ads stay up the whole time. So do you think it is appropriate that the train and transport system is advertising alcohol and gambling to such an extent with schoolchildren walking past those ads every single day during the school week? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: As I said, there is an advertising

policy in place, and we have advertising for a lot of industries across our community at all points. The key point I would make in relation to this is that I would expect transport to be sensitive to the needs of our community, and the point out of it is that

we have this policy in place. Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: That is the policy, but you have just been made aware that gambling and alcohol are being advertised quite prominently, as you can see, at train stations with students and children walking past them everyday. We have standards for advertising, for good reason, at a national level in terms of television. Now that you have been made aware that these advertisements are in the stations, which you have responsibility for, will you at least commit to having a look at that policy to see whether it is appropriate? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: As I said, there is an advertising policy in place. I will check the number of complaints we have had in relation to these ads, but the key point is that people are exposed to advertising right across our community. Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Minister, we are talking about children. Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Children and adults alike are exposed to advertising across the community. Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Will you take on notice a question in terms of the amount of complaints you have received? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Sure.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to my response to supplementary question 100.

Question 21

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: At least you are aware of it now. Regarding Newcastle light rail, why were small businesses in Newcastle who were impacted by the light rail construction, including restaurants, cafes and other hospitality operators, not provided with a rent relief scheme similar to those impacted in Sydney? Mr

ANDREW CONSTANCE: The answer to that is quite simple. The delays in the construction zones on the CBD light rail are extensive and I took a decision alongside the CBD Coordinator General in this regard to be able to provide rental assistance to those businesses where there has been a prolonged delay in terms of the construction zones. As a project, Newcastle has been phenomenal in terms of its delivery. Pleasingly, over the next couple of months we will see civil works completed and we will have passenger rail supporting those businesses. The other point that I would make is that typically, in terms of this type of infrastructure and this type of passenger transport, businesses thrive once the work is complete. They have not experienced the extensive delays that the CBD in Sydney has, and that is the reason why we have taken that decision. Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: I understand some businesses have closed, though. Is that correct? Do you have the number of businesses and shopfronts that have become vacated since the project has begun?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: In Newcastle? Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: In Newcastle. This is all Newcastle. Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will have to take that question on notice in terms of the number,

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Minister, can you tell me approximately the number of businesses that have had to close or shopfronts that have been vacated since the project has gone ahead? You said that there are a number. I am not sure if someone around the table can answer this. Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: We have not seen the mass closure of businesses. We might have a small number that have been affected, and I am happy to take that on notice. I think one of the elements to this is that not only will I provide you with that information but I will also provide you the information in relation to the number of businesses that have opened.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to my response to supplementary question 245.

Question 22

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: This activation of precincts, I am not sure how successful it is for all the businesses along the route that have been affected, given that there is a class action against the Government by those businesses. How many Newcastle businesses have joined the class action to date? Do you have that figure? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: As I indicated, this matter is before a court and I will not provide running commentary on it. Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: The number of businesses is not. Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Again, it will be a matter for the person who has brought the class action to answer that question, because we simply do not know. Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Therefore, a lot of businesses must be feeling a fair bit of pain in Newcastle if they are launching a class action, surely? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: The project is not late. I am not convinced that anyone from Newcastle has joined the class action. You are implying that businesses in Newcastle have joined the class action. I have not seen any evidence of that. In fact, the Newcastle businesses are now seeing barriers pulled away, the city breathing, and soon they will see passenger rail services supporting their city. I think also it is fair to say that if we have seen over 30 businesses open in Newcastle, that is a success story. Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Are those 30 businesses around the Newcastle light rail precinct, or is that for all of Newcastle? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will get you the exact numbers.

Answer

I am advised:

The Revitalising Newcastle team maintains regular direct contact with businesses on Hunter Street and has generated activity to support businesses in the city as Newcastle undergoes an unprecedented transformation period. Local engagement managers and business advisors have been available to provide businesses with personalised advice and assistance. The NSW Small Business Commissioner, through its relationship with the Hunter Business Chamber and Newcastle Now Business Improvement Association, was engaged to assist small businesses through this period of change.

Question 23

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: How much money does Transport for NSW receive from gambling and alcohol advertising? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: As I have said, there is a policy in place. I am normally happy to provide anything on notice about that. Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Can you provide those figures to me on notice? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Yes.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to my response to supplementary question 86 to 100.

Question 24

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: Minister, are there any plans to electrify the train line between Kiama and Bomaderry? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: No. Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: There has not been any study of the cost of electrifying the line? Mr

ANDREW CONSTANCE: Electrification is a fairly extensive exercise; it would not matter if it was through the Macarthur region or the region to which you refer. At this stage, the Government has no plans to electrify those lines. Ms CATE
FAEHRMANN: Has the Government done any feasibility or cost studies? Mr
ANDREW CONSTANCE: I would have to take that on notice in terms of any studies that might have been undertaken in that regard.

Answer

I am advised:
This information is publicly available.

Question 25

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: How many coal trains currently use the Illawarra line daily?
Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I do not know if Mr Collins has that number off the top of his head. I am sure it is the type of question that we could come back to the committee— Mr COLLINS: I am afraid I do not, Minister. But we have, on average, 140 freight trains using the metropolitan railway network—that is the Sydney Trains 812-kilometre electrified network. Most of those coal trains come down from the Blue Mountains, heading for Newcastle or other destinations. I can provide the Illawarra freight train services on notice. Most of them are steel from Kembla. The Bomaderry link uses a lot of freight. But I will give you that detail on notice.

Answer

I am advised:
I refer you to my response to supplementary question 69 to 71.

Question 26

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Transport for NSW has acquired 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia, for the purpose of providing depot, maintenance and stabling facilities for the Parramatta Light Rail, has it not? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will have to check the exact home address of the facilities in Camellia. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Is Mr Staples in a position to answer? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will have to check the exact status of that acquisition, given the significant number of acquisitions we are making to build public transport infrastructure in the city because when the Labor Party was in government nothing was done. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Can Mr Staples or any other official confirm that Transport for NSW has acquired 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia for the purpose of providing depot, maintenance and stabling facilities for the Parramatta Light Rail? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: As I said, we will take on notice the exact property acquisition status. But we are going to need stabling facilities in Camellia. You are on the money there; you have uncovered something. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: On what date was 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia, acquired? Mr STAPLES: We will have to take that question on notice once we confirm that that is the property to which you are referring.

Question 27

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Sure. What was the acquisition cost of 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia? Mr STAPLES: To the extent we can make that available, we will provide that information as part of the response to the question on notice. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Was it \$53.5 million? Mr STAPLES: I think I have answered that question. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: From whom was it acquired? Mr

STAPLES: We are yet to confirm the address. Once we have gone through the process of confirming the address, which we obviously can, we can confirm the ownership.

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Was it acquired from a property developer?

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Are you inferring something?

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: No, I am asking you directly.

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: There is no inference. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Was it acquired from a property developer? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I think we are going to check the property address you are asking about, and we have indicated that we will check its acquisition status. We are happy to come back to the Committee, being mindful of the commercial nature of this issue.

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: In an out-of-session meeting of the Finance and Investment Committee convened on 13 May 2016, the committee authorised the purchase of the site for \$53.5 million, did it not? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I said we would take that question on notice. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Perhaps Mr Staples can confirm that. He was on that committee. Mr STAPLES: Yes, I am on the Finance and Investment Committee of Transport for NSW. At the time you refer to I was quite focused on the delivery of Sydney metro program. But I think we need to go back to the original question on notice, which is to confirm the property address. On the premise of that we can provide the details the member wants in relation to other aspects.

Question 28

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: I will ask the question again: 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia, is contaminated, is it not? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Through you if I may, Mr Chair. May I answer the question? The CHAIR: Yes, certainly. Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I indicated that we are unaware of the exact location of the street address to which Mr Mookhey is referring. We will endeavour to come back to the Committee in relation to that property. That answer stands for every other line of questions about this matter.

Question 29

Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: As I said, we will take the questions about the address to which you have referred on notice. We have a significant process around property acquisitions through Transport for NSW. We will take any questions in relation to this property on notice. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: In May you awarded Venture a \$121 million contract to clean up 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia. You issued a press release about it; it is on the Transport for NSW website. That is true, is it not, Mr Staples? Mr STAPLES: I am happy to go and confirm that. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: So clarifying that there was a \$121 million contract to remediate 6 Grand Avenue, Camellia, might settle this issue of whether or not you bought the property. I can only presume that you would not have issued a press release announcing that you were paying to clean it up if you had not bought it. Mr STAPLES: As we said, we will confirm—it was the first question you asked—whether or not that property was part of the Camellia site. We will confirm that and then we are able to confirm the other aspects of the question you have asked. I think we need to be clear around valuations and processes that there is clearly a process that we go through when we acquire sites. That is complicated by legacy contamination. It is something that all of us have to deal with on many sites. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Indeed, particularly on Camellia. Mr STAPLES: I have had to confront

that on many occasions on projects. We have a job to clean those up. That is factored in to the acquisition price at the time. As part of the negotiation there is an independent valuation process that is undertaken for the sites, as a general approach. I am very confident that we will have documentation to support what we have done in that area. The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Thank you, Mr Staples. I look forward to seeing it. Minister, do you wish to take this opportunity to explain how we have managed to go from the developer paying to clean up the site to the taxpayers paying \$121 million to clean up the site in the span of one year? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I stand by my first answer. I will go and check the address.

Answer

I am advised:

(26) – (29) I refer you to my response to supplementary question 202.

Question 30

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: How much money is budgeted for programs to reduce emissions in the transport sector over the next four years? You might have to take that on notice. Mr STAPLES: Yes, we would have to take that on notice.

Answer

I am advised:

Information on sustainability and emission initiatives are available on the Transport for NSW website.

Question 31

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: How much money has the New South Wales Government spent on programs to reduce emissions in the transport sector since 2011? This may be another one you have to take on notice. Mr STAPLES: We will take it on notice. The only thing I will say is that sometimes these costs are contained within an overall procurement. The metro is a good example of that where the direct cost related to that element of the works may not be absolutely available to the extent to which we can extract those costs or payments. We will certainly look to do that.

Answer

I am advised:

This is a matter for the Minister for the Environment.

Question 32

Ms CATE FAEHRMANN: What is the proportion of the electricity that the metro uses compared with the rest of the network? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will have to take that on notice.

Answer

I am advised:

Sydney Metro has an initiative to offset operational carbon emissions through a renewable energy project and biodiversity offsets through securing NSW BioBanking sites.

Question 33

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: I turn to Newcastle buses. Changes to Newcastle bus timetables have been controversial, and I understand there has been a review of the network. Has that review been completed? Mr TROUGHTON: The review has been completed. We have asked Keolis Downer to keep engaging with the community and reviewing how the network is functioning. As you are aware, with the new network we have the fast and direct services that service key parts of Newcastle. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Has the review been publicly released? If not, is it going to be publicly released? Mr TROUGHTON: I think the changes that are planned have been publicly released, and certainly they will be. We need to tell people, and trip planners and the like will be available. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: As you know there was a loud community outcry as a result of change to the buses and then there was a review to take on board, hopefully, the concerns of the community. You said the review is complete. Is that document going to be released to the public? Mr TROUGHTON: I think it already has been released. I will take on notice to confirm.

Answer

I am advised:

Newcastle Transport consulted with the community including disability groups, elderly residents, youth groups, resident action groups and the local business chamber from 30 January 2018 to 23 April 2018, as part of the network review. Refinements to the Newcastle network following this review were implemented on 29 July 2018.

Newcastle Transport will continue to monitor the network and make improvements where necessary over the duration of its contract.

Question 34

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Terrific, thank you. Can you explain why buses to Northcote Drive have not been reinstated? Northcote Drive is one of Newcastle's busiest and most important as well as steepest roads. Cuts to this bus service mean people cannot use that road. Can you explain why that feedback has not been incorporated? Mr TROUGHTON: I have no specific notes here on Northcott Drive, so I will take that on notice.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to my response to supplementary question 213.

Question 35

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: The other issue is for people who live in Redhead, Whitebridge and Dudley, who finish work after 5.00 p.m. in the Newcastle central business district and are now no longer able to get home by a public transport because there is not a bus service that is servicing their area. Can you explain why that has not been incorporated into changes to the bus network? Mr TROUGHTON: I do not have notes on those either. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: I am happy for you to take that on notice. Mr TROUGHTON: I am also happy for you to provide that information to me and I will take it up directly with Keolis Downer and get an answer for you. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: As you can imagine, it is a big deal if you cannot get back out of work after 5 o'clock. The CHAIR: Take it up with whom? Mr TROUGHTON: Keolis Downer, Newcastle Transport and my own staff.

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: A meeting is great. The issue is that the services used to be there. They are no longer there and people are stranded, and not able to get to work. This is really an issue for the Minister rather than you, Mr Troughton, in relation to the impact of privatisation in Newcastle and people who are wanting to get to and from work. Do you want to respond to that, Minister? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: We have undertaken review since we introduced the franchise. They need to constantly re-evaluate the services like any operator does. In terms of specific questions around those bus routes, we are happy to take them on notice for you.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to my response to supplementary question 214.

Question 36

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: That would be great. Minister, will you be able to provide the Committee with the figures in relation to the number of jobs that will need to be cut in the agency as a result of the efficiency dividend job cuts. I am happy for you to do that as individual jobs and/or equivalent full-time [EFT]. Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: Sure, I am happy to do that. I am happy to provide you any response in terms of question on notice, but I would make the observation that we are growing our bus drivers, we are growing our train drivers, and we are growing our captains on the harbour fleet. We are constantly investing in frontline services and frontline staff.

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Thanks. I wonder how many jobs are going to be lost as a result of the efficiency dividend. Minister, it is my understanding that transport is by far the largest employer of contingency labour in New South Wales. The figures that I am aware of are that approximately \$350 million is spent on contingency labour. Can you confirm that? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I am happy to take that on notice.

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Can anyone else confirm that? Mr Staples? Mr STAPLES: We do have a number of contingent labour workforce within the organisation. We tend to use those where we have short-term needs or changes in our operating requirements. We bring those people in to fill those gaps. I do not have an exact dollar figure on how much we spend. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Would you be able to provide the numbers, preferably for individuals and EFT? The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: By a labour-hire firm. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: By a labour-hire firm. Are you able to provide those figures to the Committee? It is a large number and we are trying to understand how big it is. Preferably if you can provide it over the past three years. Mr STAPLES: Are you saying that you have the number already?

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: No, I am asking you to provide the number. Mr STAPLES: Yes, but I think I took the question on notice.

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: No, I am asking you to provide the number. Mr STAPLES: Yes, but I think I took the question on notice.

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: No, I am asking you to provide the number. Mr STAPLES: Yes, but I think I took the question on notice.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to my response to supplementary question 181 to 183.

Question 37

The Hon. DANIEL MOOKHEY: Are you able to tell us whether or not any of the contingent labour that has been working for Transport for NSW has been working as contingent labour for so long that they should have the right under the Fair Work Act

to convert to formal employee award? Mr STAPLES: I would have to take that on notice.

Answer

I am advised:

The Transport Cluster uses Labour Hire firms, in accordance with NSW Public Service policies to cover temporary vacancies as required. There are no central records maintained, with operations authorised to make such arrangements, subject to their overall labour expense cap.

Question 38

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Minister, I want to talk about your IT programs. Is the budget for the Making IT Work For You IT program \$425 million? Mr ANDREW CONSTANCE: I will take that on notice.

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Mr Staples?

Mr STAPLES: Yes, that is correct.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to the response to supplementary questions 186 and 187.

Question 39

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Was this the original budget, or has it increased? Mr STAPLES: When that program started, I was busy building the Sydney Metro project for Rouse Hill to Bankstown, so I am not familiar with the details. I am happy to clarify. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Can you also clarify that if there has been change in budget, whether there has also been a change in scope?

Mr STAPLES: There certainly have been reviews and adjustments in the scope. Like any IT project that runs over a period of five years, where in the background even the technology changes, the organisational operation changes along the way, scope has to be adjusted. That is not unusual for an IT project of the scale that was undertaken. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: That is fine. I am wondering whether, when you provide the answer on notice, you can provide the changes in scope that have happened rather than just saying, "Yes, there has been a change." Mr STAPLES: I can certainly confirm that there have been changes in scope, but I can also say that we have been keeping in close touch with the business case that was put up for the expenditure of that money and we have delivered on the benefits of the business case.

The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Has there had to be a reduction in the scope of the project to fit within the budget, given the overruns?

Mr STAPLES: There have been adjustments to the scope. But as I just said, there has been a delivery of the overall benefits of the business case. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: That is terrific. Are you committing to providing us with the information about the actual changes to the scope that have happened as a result of the budget adjustments? Mr STAPLES: I think we can provide a summary of the adjustments to the scope. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Has the project had overruns, delays or underestimates? Mr STAPLES: As I said earlier, I was not familiar with the project until I started in the role earlier this year. There have been adjustments to the delivery of the program schedule to manage the risks along the way. As I foreshadow, we will give you the detail on the adjustments to the scope and the

delivery of the program. But what we now have is a significant part of the transport cluster having been brought on to an integrated server with far more robust backup of our systems and protection of our systems from attacks such as cybersecurity. A lot more of the workforce are on a consistent email and information sourcing database, so there are some significant positive outcomes for the cluster that we have been able to deliver with that program. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: Can you confirm that the original program started off being called NGIS? I do not know what the actual acronym stands for. Mr STAPLES: I would have to take that on notice to confirm. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: I am confident that NGIS was the beginning of the project before it was renamed to Making IT Work For You. When you do that, will you be able to provide to the Committee the original budget for that project and what the final costs will be? Mr STAPLES: Yes. The Hon. PENNY SHARPE: The original acronym will also be useful.

Answer

I am advised:

I refer you to my response to supplementary question 187 to 193.