

**Supplementary  
Submission  
No 38a**

**INQUIRY INTO PROPOSED AERIAL SHOOTING OF  
BRUMBIES IN KOSCIUSZKO NATIONAL PARK**

**Name:** Mr Grant Holman  
**Date Received:** 16 September 2023

---

## **New South Wales Legislative Council Inquiry**

### **Proposed aerial shooting of brumbies in Kosciusko National Park**

**Dear Committee,**

Thank you for the opportunity to make a submission into this very important issue. Whilst the issue is the proposed shooting or killing of the remaining brumbies in the Kosciusko National Park. The events of late have shone a light upon the proponents of killing the brumbies and the malfeasance in public office by Minister Sharpe, The National Parks and Wildlife Service especially Atticus FINCH and her State Counterparts. Has this become an ICAC issue? My view is that it has. Whilst there are two areas in which the committee are dealing with at present the following submission tries to keep it to the issue of the number of the wild horses or brumbies which has become a common term.

#### **Kosciusko National Park and the Brumby Numbers**

Minister Sharpe, the Invasive Species Council, the New South Wales National Parks and Wildlife Service are responsible for the greatest fraud in the History of New South Wales and Australian National Parks. It has been quiet evident and promoted by Minister SHARPE, the NSW National Parks and Wildlife service led by Atticus FINCH , Invasive Species Council and the like that there are upwards of 20,000 brumbies in the Kosciusko National Park. The numbers seem to change with these groups and unfortunately Minister Sharpe and Atticus FINCH are at the forefront.

#### **The 2021 Inquiry, by the New South Wales Senate, into the Health and Well-being of Kangaroos and Macropods. (Wallaroes)<sup>1</sup>.**

The reader may ask what have Kangaroo/Wallaroo's got to do with Wild Horses/Brumbies (I will use the terms Wallaroo and Brumbies for the rest of the submission. The report has a lot to do with the situation that is now faced by the Minister and the Committee, **Atticus FINCH** and the National Parks and wildlife Service as well as Stuart CAIRNS being employed by the government.

Without going into detail the findings at points 3, 8,9,10,11,12,15 are very astonishing as they relate to use of technology, video counts, growth rate and plain English explanations of the methodology used in population surveys and the scientific rationale for setting harvest quotas.

Why are these points and alleged plain English explanations a problem for the committee, especially the minister? Well they were presented with evidence from an independent expert biostatistician **Clare GALEA** that clearly showed that the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment and the Minister, now this may have had former Minister Matt Kean's involvement and therefore he may have some issues with ICAC to answer as well.

**Clare GALEA** had completely shone the light on what appears to be a method of counting numbers of Wallaroos greatly increases the numbers and her expert opinion is and was that

---

<sup>1</sup> [www.parliament.nsw.gov.au/lcdocs/inquiries/2707/Government%20response%20-%20Health%20and%20wellbeing%20of%20kangaroos%20and%20other%20macropods%20in%20NSW.pdf](http://www.parliament.nsw.gov.au/lcdocs/inquiries/2707/Government%20response%20-%20Health%20and%20wellbeing%20of%20kangaroos%20and%20other%20macropods%20in%20NSW.pdf)

the modelling of these numbers by Stuart CAIRNS of the University of New England is greatly flawed<sup>2</sup>.

### **The Current Inquiry into the Brumb Numbers in Kosciusko National Park 2023**

On 25 May 2023 an article published by the invasive species Council with Minister went to the Kosciusko National Park with the Invasive Species Council to view the alleged damage to the land and all of these wild horses. Yet the Invasive Species Council in the article says that they came across a group of 40 horses but no real evidence was shown. Looking at the photograph there are lucky to be five brumbies in the photo. That fraudulent modelling is working again.

The Invasive species council then admit they still use the **Cairns Modelling** which has been found to be flawed<sup>3</sup>. Even after the damning findings of the New England Area of New South Wales Kangaroo and Wallaroo failures by the National Parks and Wildlife Service and Stuart CAIRNS.

Still the Invasive Species Council, NSW National Parks, Stuart CAIRNS manufacture the numbers. The picture and story attached to this submission shows that the Local member for Wagga Wagga Joe McGirr. Dr McGirr's electorate takes in the western part of Kosciuszko National Park. He had been very outspoken during the election campaign about the issue. He even made it clear that action on feral horses would be a condition of his support in the event of a hung parliament. So what does this mean? Does this raise questions of Misfeasance in public office because surely Dr McGirr has conducted independent research into the brumby numbers? It seems not and he believes wrongly the fraudulent and proven to be fraudulent brumby numbers.

Minister Sharpe clearly knows that the modelling is flawed and the numbers are wrong as she is quoted in the Inquiry into Kangaroo numbers and the modelling used as not accurate whatsoever.

I have even mentioned the large scale bush fires caused by the very poor management of the NSW National Parks by the NSW National Parks and Wildlife service. We of course still do not know the extent of brumbies, pigs, deer and wildlife lost in these fires. According to the modelling not one brumby died in the fires of a dreadful death which is just not correct and cannot be because thousands of animals died in those fires.

In recent independent scientific reports by **Claire GALEA** and aired on the Ray Hadley Morning Show on the 8 August 2023 it is clear that Minister Sharpe may be guilty of Misfeasance in public office or even criminal offences and so to **Stuart CAIRNS** as he is paid by the government.

"It doesn't matter what the animal is" is what the Minister stated in the Kangaroo/Wallaroo Inquiry in the Northern Tablelands. Of course what Minister Sharpe is saying here is that the methodology and hence the science is flawed because it is the method of counting the numbers to dramatically increase the numbers that is not the true number.

<sup>2</sup> Clare Galea, Ray Hadley Morning Show, 8 August 2023.

<sup>3</sup> <https://invasives.org.au/blog/hope-for-kosciuszko/accessed> on line 5 September 2023(attached)

This has been supported by **Equine Scientist Joanne Canning** where she stated on the Ray Hadley Morning Show on 15<sup>th</sup> August 2023. As a result she obtained information from the NSW National Parks and Wildlife Service which paint a very bad picture. It appears they have deliberately used the **Cairns modelling to greatly inflate the numbers**. Ms Canning has informed all Members of Parliament about the real numbers that are biologically impossible but she alleges that there would be lucky to be 2000 brumbies. However for some reason she has been ignored. Why is that?

As a result of the fraudulent methodology, this has caused breaches of the Cruelty to Animals Act and possibly the Crimes Act 1900 equivalent offences. I discuss this in depth in my other submission into "aerial Shooting". My view is that there would be a Congo line of accused people and government departments in the firing line in relation to the these offences including the contracted shooter.

### **.THE CORROBOREE FROG and DAMAGE TO THE PARK**

There are a number of reasons why I say this. Firstly let's have a look at the Invasive Species Council to which Minister SHARPE is heavily involved creating a conflict of interest on her part that I submit she may not have tabled and their claims that along with the NSW National Parks that Brumbies are responsible for the destruction of the corroboree frog.

There have been many environmentalists out there that put this forward such as the NSW National Parks and Invasive Species Council but they disregard the science. They seem to conveniently forget that the frog has other enemies such as a fungus. The main habitat for the frog is sphagnum moss and wetlands. The brumbies avoid these areas like the plague because it is like quick sand and many brumbies and other horses have been lost due to these conditions.

**Equine Scientist Joanne Canning** has completed a number of studies over the last years which confirm that Brumbies are not responsible for the Corroboree frog issues and in fact there is video evidence that shows that the Corroboree Frog has been using brumby or deer marks in the water used when a deer or brumby drinks from the creek in the breeding cycle of the frog.

In a most recent research paper<sup>4</sup> by David Berman & Anor, he states, "The combined impacts associated with the sign of deer, feral pigs, fire and humans were large compared to that of feral horses. Management of feral horses to reduce their direct impact is unlikely to be beneficial without complementary management to reduce the effects of these other agents of impact".

The findings of the current and up to date research indicates " where horse densities exist below this threshold, considerably more expense and control effort (resulting from the difficulties related to control at low density) is likely to make very little difference to an already low level of direct impact"<sup>5</sup>by brumbies to the High Country Habitat.

---

<sup>4</sup> Use of density-impact functions to inform and improve the environmental outcomes of feral horse management David McKenzie Berman , Jill Pickering , Deane Smith and Benjamin L. Allen 2023.

<sup>5</sup> Use of density-impact functions to inform and improve the environmental outcomes of feral horse management David McKenzie Berman , Jill Pickering , Deane Smith and Benjamin L. Allen 2023.

What this leads to is that the NSW National Parks and Wildlife Service led by **Atticus FINCH** as he is a public officer just like all of the other NSW National Parks Service employees, government departments involved in these fraudulent acts, perhaps being liable to misfeasance in public office<sup>6</sup> or worse. Not to mention the various other offences that not only the Minister but a long list of politicians and government employees.

Despite this it really is appalling that Minister Sharpe continues to allow and direct the inhumane shooting of the horses that were and have been in the park well before the National Park came into existence. The question is why Minister Sharpe did not suspend all killing of the horses whilst a real scientific count was conducted. Is it that hard?

Kind regards

Grant Holman

---

<sup>6</sup>Bathurst CJ stated in *Obeid v Lockley* (2018) 98 NSWLR 258 at [103]: