

**Submission
No 511**

**INQUIRY INTO IMPACT OF THE WESTERN HARBOUR
TUNNEL AND BEACHES LINK**

Name: Ms Sandra Ellison

Date Received: 17 June 2021

17 June 2021

The Hon. Daniel Mookhey MLC
Chair
Public Works Committee
NSW Legislative Council
Parliament House
Macquarie Street
SYDNEY NSW 2000

Via: [Lodge a Submission \(nsw.gov.au\)](https://www.nsw.gov.au/submit)

Submission to the Inquiry into the Impact of the Western Harbour Tunnel and Beaches Link

Dear Members of the Public Works Committee,

Thank you for facilitating this inquiry regarding these projects. I hope the findings and recommendations are taken into consideration and implemented by the NSW Government.

I strongly object to the Western Harbour Tunnel (including Warringah Freeway Upgrade) and the Beaches Link (including Gore Hill extension) projects and request you recommend that the NSW Government abandon both projects.

I live at 26 Warringah Road Cammeray. I have lived in this home for the last 10 years. This home along with one of the neighbouring properties 20 Warringah Road originally belonged to my grandparents and have been in my family for over 85 years. I am very familiar with the local and surrounding areas and the evolution. Including the original loss of the golf course for the Warringah Freeway.

As a dog owner and someone who enjoys walking and nature, I regularly use a good majority of the green space and bush areas in the North Sydney LGA including but not limited to Green Park, Cammeray Golf Course, St Thomas Rest Park, Primrose Park, Tunks Park, Flat Rock Gully, St Leonards Park, Forsyth Park, Milson Park and Bradfield Park. When I am not working from home, I am out and about in my beautiful local area shopping, exercising, medical, social etc. I also frequently drive to and from the Sydney CBD, my surrounding local suburbs of Kirribilli, Neutral Bay, Cremorne, Mosman, Crows Nest, Lane Cove, Northbridge, Castle Crag, Castle Cove, Roseville and to the Northern Beaches. My experience driving in these areas is bad but bearable in peak hour and when there is an incident. At other times during the day, it is ok. My experience commuting via public transport to the Sydney CBD from Cammeray is shocking, taking up to and over one hour. Surprising given its proximity to the city!

These projects are so wrong on so many levels. There are too many unanswered questions and issues with the content of the propaganda given to the community and taxpayers along with lack of transparency in the projects, community consultation and lack of business case.

You do not need to be an Urban Planner or Traffic Engineer to know that putting more cars into the biggest pinch point in Sydney's road network, the Warringah Freeway (and Gorehill Freeway) is not a solution to transport or traffic issues for the Northern Beaches and Sydney CBD road network. Especially over and above any other solution. None of which have been publicly disclosed.

Nor do you need to be a health expert to understand that digging up toxic waste material and leaving it exposed to the elements and also trucking it through Sydney suburbs and waterways, plus reducing the green space available to a community whilst covering it, along with resident's homes and local schools with cancer causing pollution and particulates is a health hazard.

It concerns me greatly that lessons from previously poor Government planning have not been taken into consideration including The Cross City Tunnel, M5, M1, NorthConnex and WestConnex not even the recommendations from the Parliamentary Inquiry into and report on the impacts of the WestConnex project in December 2018.

I believe in relation to these projects the people/taxpayers of the Willoughby electorate have not been represented (at all) and that their local member The Hon. Gladys Berejiklian as Premier of NSW has a direct conflict of interest.

Specific to the Terms of Reference for the Inquiry:

- a) the adequacy of the business case for the project, including the cost benefits ratio.
- b) the adequacy of the consideration of alternative options
- c) the cost of the project, including the reasons for overruns,

The business case has not been made available to the public, nor cost benefit analysis, alternative options. This is unacceptable governing. These documents need to be made available and public.

The projected time delays and cost overruns (based on previous projects) need to be made available to the public.

- d) the consideration of the governance and structure of the project including the use of a 'development partner' model,

My understanding of the private (51%) public (49%) model here means that corporations/investors (some not based on this country) are the financial beneficiaries of this project. The NSW taxpayers has to pay for the road both through tax and also use. I am also of the belief that once considered paid off roads i.e Harbour Bridge will have a new South bound toll introduced to pay for the new WHT and NBT. Is this triple dipping?

We the taxpayer need complete understanding and transparency of the project financials including costs, profits and revenue streams.

- f) the consultation methods and effectiveness, both with affected communities and stakeholders

The community of Cammeray were not adequately consulted. There were limited public meeting which were badly communicated/advertised. Responses from government officials were standard regurgitated propaganda and inconsiderate of community intelligence and emotions.

As stated above in my letter the community had no local representation on this at all with the local member being the Premier. The local member would not even accept the community petition to present to Parliament. An opposition member of Parliament needed to be found to present the petition to parliament. This is not acceptable.

- j) the impact on the environment, including marine ecosystems,

There are various references throughout the EIS documenting evidence of the environmental destruction of these projects. I believe that further studies on the environment need to be done including air quality as there is no base data nor adequate / realistic traffic projections.

- k) the adequacy of processes for accessing and responding to noise, vibration and other impacts on residents, during construction and operationally,

I have been waiting for over a week to hear back following a discussion with a community consultation call regarding removal of trees and changes to local traffic during the preliminary works. This is unacceptable. The process for responding to residents along with the accountability for impacts on residents during construction and operationally needs to be defined. Additionally, the Government should cover costs for structural surveys for houses ahead of construction. Residents should not need to afford the costs of expensive engineering surveys for damage from works determined, organised and implemented by the government.

- m) any other related matter.

- Out of date traffic studies and modelling.
- Impact on local traffic in and out of Cammeray during construction? Cammeray has only a few access points and all of them are adversely affected by major construction in the first 6-8 years. It would be bad enough to close one arterial line to a suburb however if you look at the impact on local roads during construction the residents of Cammeray have no non congested/impacted access to their homes/suburb. Including but not limited to Miller Street, Ernest Street, Falcon Street, Warringah Freeway, Sailors Bay Road, Flat Rock Drive, Brook Street, West Street, Eastern Valley Way, Cammeray Road, Military Road, Park Ave. This construction not only blocks local traffic in and out of their suburb but also increases the traffic through construction workers vehicle movements and heavy vehicle movements. If this project continues access to and from Cammeray streets needs to be accessed as a matter of priority, on a wholistic level not individual street basis.
- No filters of the pollution stacks. The 2018 WestConnex Parliamentary Inquiry even recommended that all existing and future pollution stacks be fitted with filters. What is the cost and why is the cost so prohibitive? Or what is the objection to the cost of public health and concern?
- Concern for loss of green space in Cammeray and surrounding areas.
- Concern for destruction of amazing bush land so close to Sydney CBD.
- Concern and impact of environment (bush, green and marine) and the loss of trees. Impact on Flat Rock Gully and also Tunks Park, Northbridge baths. Additionally, what is the impact on Clontarf and Balmoral Beaches of contaminated spoil falling from a barge as it is transported past these areas to it's unknown or undisclosed location.
- Speed of preliminary work and progress of work including land clearing regardless of this inquiry.
- Hidden unemployment or jobs creation?
- Disclosure of the money trail and what are the cost/profit kept in Australia?

In the absence of a business case to review the feasibility of the other transport alternatives and costs this project needs to be reassessed. This never-ending infrastructure project consuming

suburbs and people's lives for the sake creating jobs (or hidden unemployment) and private profits needs to stop.

Sydney is a peninsular city. It is unrealistic to think that everyone can get to the city by car within 30 minutes, or by public transport. There is no better example of this than Cammeray. It is 6.2km from the city. In peak hour it takes approximately 20-25 minutes, non peak by car 10-15minutes. By bus and/or bus/train in peak hour up to/over an hour and non peak 25+ minutes.

One thing that might make a difference to Eastern Valley Way, Miller Street, Military Road would be no parking along these roads and pull-in (off road) bus stops (not sure the technical term). Additionally, a review of Metro alternatives for Military Road and Northern Beaches along with rail alternatives for Northern Beaches.

I am happy to have my name published.

Your sincerely

Sandy Ellison

Warringa Road, Cammeray