

**Submission  
No 470**

## **INQUIRY INTO IMPACT OF THE WESTCONNEX PROJECT**

**Organisation:** Bodycorp SP44334

**Date Received:** 7 September 2018

---

# SUBMISSION of BODY CORPORATE–SP4434

## TO THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY COMMITTEE INQUIRY INTO THE IMPACT OF WESTCONNEX

BY MARIANNE DE SOUZA Chairman, &  
MICHAEL SELIG, Secretary

We are writing in regard to the relationship between Westconnex and other linked/satellite Toll Road Projects like the Western Harbour Tunnel and Beaches Link [WHT & BL] and the impacts of these, specifically the Western Harbour Tunnel coming from Rozelle & Beaches Link, on our wider community in Cammeray.

We represent residents & owners who live and own properties @ approx. 300m of the area of greatest impact on the Warringah Freeway, and near to a new Primary School, Anzac Park Primary Public School, less than 300m from the proposed Western Harbour Tunnel & Beaches Link combined Exhaust Stack at Ernest St Cammeray. We are greatly concerned about:

- ***DANGEROUS DOUBLE STACK in one location @CAMMERAY:*** The decision to place a “Monster” i.e. a Double *Unfiltered* Stack in one location very near to a new Primary School, Anzac Park Primary Public School, on Anzac Ave., Cammeray poses a disastrous health and safety risk to the schoolchildren nearby and all residents and workers.
- Children will sleep, go to school and play sport in the unfiltered tunnel stack zone 24 hrs per day. Whether this double ventilation outlet is visually housed in one ventilation stack or two it will be venting from two outlets and disperse the emissions load from half the volume of both tunnels.

- ***NO STUDIES DONE /AVAILABLE:*** The fact that there has been no evidence available to show that the Beaches link is the best solution.no studies, no tests, no credible data or analysis. What about the Light Rail as an alternative solution to a tunnel that will only bring a far greater increase of cars onto all connecting roads.
- RMS having no operating experience of long road tunnels (5,000 m or longer) & has provided no air quality information from operating unfiltered all vehicle tunnels of that length. RMS relies on models to justify their prior existing choice not to consider filtration – models based on assumptions not revealed & in the absence of local air pollution data & ignoring how long urban road tunnels are built overseas.
- ***TRANSVERSE TUNNEL CONSTRUCTION IS SAFER:*** That If these Tunnels do proceed with unfiltered stacks, then it is imperative that they be constructed with either more stacks along the length OR “Transverse Ventilation” throughout their whole length which is the safest for communities at the exits.
- The RMS’ preferred system of “Longitudinal Ventilation” is fundamentally wrong– as it results in the deliberate poisoning of everyone living and working and schooling near each of the Tunnel exits along its route.
- ***TUNNELS NEED MORE STACKS:*** The evidence from many countries overseas where long urban road tunnels have been installed is that any urban Tunnel longer than 5km needs to have at least 1x other Stack along the route in addition to the end Stacks. We also have concerns for provision for an escape shaft. . [Refer below to the Stockholm Tunnel]
- ***FILTRATION IS A MUST:*** Getting this State Government to realise that it must ensure that any Smokestacks [Exhaust Vents] must be filtered and must never be located within 1km of any school.

We actually live in a large Educational Precinct with 11 schools in the North Sydney area.

- The RMS have told us that their unfiltered WHT & BL design is "similar" to the E4 Stockholm tunnel, but that Tunnel will have 10 unfiltered stacks on an 18km length, plus an extra emergency air release vent, significantly diluting pollutants in the tunnel and spreading the emissions burden across the community at a level similar to the 2.3 km Sydney Harbour Tunnel and not burdening few localities with a heavy pollution load. RMS have also claimed an unnamed "French" tunnel that is similar but urban French tunnels are either only for light vehicles, & have extra ventilation measures or are shorter than 5,000m.
- The 2010/11 M5 East filtration trial that the RMS may tell you was a "failure" was not a trial of filtration of Exhaust/Ventilation Stack air. Instead a small quantity of tunnel air only was filtered and then returned to the polluted tunnel. The RMS own evaluation reports actually show the filters did remove particles (around 70%) and gases (55%) from the air that was filtered in a trial with underpowered filters operating only 4 hrs per day. The cost analysis also unfairly evaluated fine particles by weight rather than quantity. Filtration systems designed into tunnels overseas show around 80–85% efficiency in particulate and gas removal –Madrid's Calle 30 Operating data, Tokyo Yamate Tunnel, etc.
- Ventilation stack filtration is our main concern raised by this design, but certainly the RMS should be looking at a properly ventilated and filtered design for the tunnel users benefit as well. It is irresponsible that they are not even including as much ventilation design to protect in –tunnel air quality for drivers as on the criticised 9 km Northconnex project.
- If the State Government do not filter the Stacks, they must either

add many more Stacks OR adopt the Transverse Tunnel Ventilation system design. It is more costly but that's what needs to happen. The Government cannot compromise on people's health and lives.

- ***HEAVY TRUCKS IN TUNNELS:*** The fact is that overseas if filters are not used on long urban road tunnels they ban Trucks, Buses & Heavy Vehicles from long urban road tunnels in order to minimise the build up of concentrated pollutions in the Tunnels for users & communities near the Stacks– this must be made to happen here in Sydney, NSW.
- ***NO PROPER OVERSIGHT:*** The fact that a project of this scale, funded by taxpayers should be subject to rigorous assessment and due checks and balances. But both the NSW Auditor-General and Infrastructure Australia have criticised the governance of these projects. Where are the Gateway Reviews for the Westconnex Project and why has the key rationale of the original Business Case to get to Port Botany & Sydney Airport not been achieved? Yet these projects are allowed to expand & seek approvals for other areas, what is the rush?
- ***DETRIMENTAL HEALTH & OTHER IMPACT ON COMMUNITIES IGNORED:*** That there has been no accounting of the significant health and other costs imposed on communities, especially our most vulnerable, and particularly the young 1000 children at Anzac Park Primary Public School, only 300m from most of the most dangerous and disruptive construction. And also affected will be Cammeraygul High Snr Campus on Ernest St [opens in 2019], & the nearby Cammeray Primary Public School.
- The impact on the school and children, neighbours & nearby residents of vibration and noise during construction, and the dispersal of toxic spoil in truck movements & drilling is also a serious concern for us all.

- Already affected schools like St Peters and Haberfield Public Schools have reported drastically increased levels of dangerous pollutants, as well as other impacts, such as heavy vehicle traffic, vibration, noise and other disruptions.
- Surely the best Precautionary principles should be applied to mitigate the impact on our communities like it is overseas where they adopt the principle that if you cannot afford to filter, you don't build it.

***REAL IMPACT ON LOCAL COMMUNITY:*** Government here proposes to locate a major infrastructure Project in the middle of high density areas like Cammeray's Warringah Freeway between Ernest & Miller streets and must be made to ensure that they mitigate the impacts of both construction & permanent effects on people living working & schooling in the immediate vicinity.

We ask that The Inquiry also gives serious attention and weight to:

- the impact of these Infrastructure Projects on residents,
- the stress to locals living with the high uncertainty and misleading information flowing to them,
- coupled with facing the detrimental impacts of the high risk of potential damage to homes from serious cracks, etc,
- the ensuing dangerous pollution from the short term construction noise, dust, traffic, health impacts of 24/7 horrendously loud construction noise over a 5 year period, unfiltered Stacks, and
- The long-term detrimental effects of pollution from Unfiltered Stacks, here a Double Stack in one location in front of them and a new primary school. we filter cigarettes yet the government believes that it is acceptable to allow the pumping out of 40 kms of particulate matter at the Proposed Double stack at Cammeray's Ernest St.

The key impact zones of Cammeray, Rozelle and Balgowlah do not want to face the horror experience that the good people of St Peters & Haberfield during the construction of Westconnex. Their experience gives us no faith in the privatised governance model that this State

government is using to negate their own responsibility for these taxpayer funded Infrastructure projects

***SALE OF SMC:*** If the RMS are not going to end up in control of the WHT&BL satellite projects of Westconnex:

- IF by selling 51% of the Sydney Motorway Corporation, the government will no longer have control of the project, how will future public concerns be addressed during the construction & operational phases? These are major government Infrastructure projects and the Government is abrogating its responsibility to the citizens who elect them.
- Matters arising during construction, which cannot be thought of/ envisaged prior to this stage, will mean that citizens will not be able to get action on their concerns or have them addressed as they would if they were government owned.

***WESTCONNEX UNRECOGNISABLE FROM ORIGINAL BUSINESS CASE***

- We are greatly concerned that these projects appear rushed, not properly planned & based on Westconnex' experiences, that this State Government is not adopting appropriate construction, and safety measures for the short term and long term.
- This Westconnex Project as currently developing with Stage 3 & satellite projects of the Western Harbour Tunnel & Beaches Link and the F6, is very different to that announced & bears little relationship to the one approved with the original Business Case for Stage 1.
- This Project still does not get to the Port or the Airport, which was its original impetus.
- There is no accountability to make the State Government stay on track.
- We request that The Inquiry calls to give evidence, all relevant Politicians and Bureaucrats involved to provide some feasible answers to you on behalf of all communities affected and all tax payers.

**FINAL REQUESTS TO THE ACCOUNTABILITY INQUIRY**

*We therefore respectfully strongly urge the Inquiry to Require the Government to take the following actions* as the future health and safety of thousands of school children, the elderly, the residents, the workers, and all the others in the many communities affected are depending on you.

1. We ask you to demand that the Business Case for each of these projects be produced. And that the Business Case for a Road over Rail solution for the Northern Beaches tunnel be produced. And that the benefits be reviewed for accuracy.
2. We ask that The Inquiry Calls to give evidence, all relevant Politicians and Bureaucrats involved to provide some answers to you on behalf of all communities affected and all tax payers.
3. We ask you to demand that the Office of Environment and Heritage do their job and measure the air quality in Sydney. That they accurately measure in realistic areas to produce real results of air quality in Sydney, in the city, in North Sydney, in urban areas, next to major roads, not in National Parks.
4. We ask that the cost benefit analysis of filtration be considered in the project design not just by the RMS and the NSW Chief Scientist, but in conjunction with NSW Health and experts in the field of health impact from pollution. It should not be left to the RMS and their self appointed experts to determine the health implications of 24 hour a day unfiltered pollution on a population.
5. We ask the Inquiry to please seek assurances from the State Government that these projects, the WHT&BL, the F6 etc. will not be transferred into the Sydney Motorway Corporation in future and not therefore fall under this inappropriate governance model where multimillion dollar tax payer funded projects are out of government control and should remain in such control.



We are not opposed to development, we just want it done right, for our children and our community, and without unnecessary harm to our most vulnerable members, the sick, the very young and the aged as well as for all members of our communities.

Yours Sincerely,

**MARIANNE DE SOUZA**

**MICHAEL SELIG**

On behalf of SP 4434

**7 September 2018**