

The Hon. Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council Minister for Roads and Ports

GENERAL PURPOSE STANDING COMMITTEE NO 3 BUDGET ESTIMATES HEARINGS QUESTION ON NOTICE

Hearing Date:

28 October 2011

Asked by:

Ms Amanda Fazio

Question:

1. Could the minister please confirm that KPMG has been engaged as an independent consultant to assess the commercial terms of the M5 West widening project between the Roads Traffic Authority and Interlink Roads?

a. Could the minister please confirm the fees paid KPMG to provide this advice?

b. Could the minister please confirm when the KPMG report will be made public and where it will be published?

c. Could the minister please confirm what final advice was provided by KPMG in relation to the M5 Widening?

- 2. What did the modelling conducted as part of the M5 widening environmental assessment conclude in relation to the impact of traffic movements on the M5 and surrounding roads? What did the modelling find in relation to the percentage increase in vehicles expected on the following roads: Canterbury Road, King Georges Road, Forest Road, Stoney Creek Road, Punchbowl Road, Moorefields Road, Kingsgrove Road, Belmore Road and Fairford Road?
- 3. What is the amount of money that has been spent on getting advice and using consultants on the M5 widening since March 2011?
- 4. Could the minister confirm when the final M5 widening project costs will be made public?
- 5. Could the minister confirm the start date for the M5 widening project?
- a. Could the minister confirm the completion date for the M5 widening project?

Answer:

I am advised:

- (1) Yes.
- 1(a) The cost of the KPMG engagement will be published in the next annual report.
- 1(b) The assessment report prepared by KPMG will not be made public, as it is commercial-in-confidence.
- 1(c) Refer to 1(b)
- (2) This information is available on Roads and Maritime Services website.

- (3) The cost of consultants and professional services contractors used by RMS to assist in the commercial negotiations process for the M5 West Widening project over the period from April 1 2011 to November 3 2011 was \$281,650, excluding GST.
- (4) The contract summary, including project costs for the M5 West Widening project will be made available after a contract is agreed.
- (5) The start of the construction of the project is dependent on achieving a commercial agreement that represents value for money. We would hope to commence construction in the first half of 2012.
- 5(a) The completion of the project would be approximately two years after start of work.

Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council

Minister for Roads and Ports



The Hon. Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council Minister for Roads and Ports

GENERAL PURPOSE STANDING COMMITTEE NO 3 BUDGET ESTIMATES HEARINGS QUESTION ON NOTICE

Hearing Date:

28 October 2011

Asked by:

Ms Amanda Fazio

Question:

6. How many mobile speed cameras are currently operating?

a. How many mobile speed cameras were operating in February 2011?

Answer:

I am advised:

There are six mobile speed cameras currently operating. The number of mobile speed cameras has not changed since the re-introduction of the NSW Mobile Speed Camera Program in July 2010.

7. How many hours are mobile speed cameras contracted to operate at this time? a. How many hours were mobile speed cameras contracted to operate in February 2011?

Answer:

I am advised:

Mobile speed cameras are contracted to operate 216 hours per week.

In February 2011, mobile speed cameras were contracted to operate 216 hours per week.

8. What is the number and value of infringements issued by mobile speed cameras in 2011 compared to 2010?

Answer:

I am advised this information is available on the Office of State Revenue website.

9. How many extra mobile speed cameras will be rolled out over the next 5 years?

Answer:

I am advised:

The Government is still considering decisions about refinements, the expansion or contraction of speed camera programs. Any decisions will be made on a road safety basis.

10. What is the extra number of contracted hours mobile speed cameras are planned for the next 5 years?

Answer:

I am advised:

The Government is still considering decisions about refinements, the expansion or contraction of speed camera programs. Any decisions will be made on a road safety basis.

11. How many mobile speed cameras currently operate in the school safety zones?

Answer:

I am advised mobile speed camera locations are available on the Roads and Maritime Services website.

- 12. How many contracted hours for mobile cameras are currently spent in school safety zones?
- a. How many contracted hours for mobile cameras were spent in school safety zones in February 2011?

Answer:

I am advised:

Currently no mobile speed cameras have enforced during school zone hours.

13. Given the findings of the Audit Office Performance Report into speed cameras in July 2011 could you explain the Government position on fixed speed cameras?

14. How many fixed speed cameras have been shut down or removed since April 2011?

Answer:

I am advised:

The Government agrees with the NSW Auditor-General's position on fixed speed cameras as documented in the audit report.

While fixed speed cameras have a positive road safety impact overall, the results for individual cameras varied, with the number of crashes decreasing at some location but not at others.

The fixed speed cameras which did not deliver the expected road safety benefit at 38 locations have been deactivated. Of the 38 locations, six had already had their cameras deactivated due to road infrastructure improvements and a further four have been removed. The four are the fixed speed cameras on the New England Highway at Tilbuster, Quirindi and Llangothlin and the fixed speed camera on the Princes Highway at Angleside.

The remaining locations are now being assessed to identify alternative road safety treatments, with three of these placed back into warning mode following significant community concern.

The NSW Centre for Road Safety will continue to assess the effectiveness of fixed speed cameras.

Question
14a. Were any of these cameras in school safety zones?

Answer:

Yes

14 b. At these sites where fixed speed cameras have been removed or shut down, what is the subsequent data in regards to (a) accident rate, (b) injury and (c) fatality rate in each of those locations, before the cameras were installed and after the cameras were installed?

Answer:

I am advised this information is available on the Roads and Maritime Services website.

14c. At each of the sites where fixed cameras were shut down or removed, what was the value of infringements issued for speeding before the cameras were installed and the fines issued at each of those sites since they were removed?

Answer:

I am advised:

The requested data is currently not readily available as it is from periods when there was no active camera at the location.

The infringement data requested will only include infringement notices issued by the NSW Police Force as part of their speed enforcement. Data available on the State Debt Recovery Office website of speed infringement notices issued by the NSW Police Force can only be narrowed down to the Local Area Command level of location detail. This does not provide the level of detail in relation to infringement notices issued at decommissioned fixed speed camera locations.

It is unlikely that there are a large number of infringement notices issued at these locations due to the infrequent police presence at these camera locations.

14d. At each of the sites where you have shut down or removed the cameras, what alternative safety measures have be installed?

Answer:

I am advised:

The 38 fixed speed cameras were deactivated because they were deemed not to have delivered the expected road safety results in these locations. Alternative road safety measures to address existing road safety risks are being investigated and developed for these locations.

The safety review of decommissioned fixed speed camera locations has commenced and the final alternative safety measures have not yet been determined.

These alternative road safety treatments may involve improved signage, road works, traffic facilities, speed zoning reviews and targeted communications. The safety review will investigate the best and most efficient way to improve road safety for these locations.

The alternative road safety treatment to be delivered at each location will be dependent on the road safety risks identified through location inspection and community engagement activities.

14e. If alternative safety measures have not been installed when will they be?

Answer:

I am advised:

The Centre for Road Safety is conducting safety review of the 38 decommissioned fixed speed camera locations to investigate what alternative road safety measures can be introduced to address existing road safety risks at these locations.

The review of the 38 fixed camera locations has commenced and a program of works will be developed for approval by March 2012.

15. Will the impact of the removal of the cameras be assessed?

a. When will the impact of the removal of the cameras be assessed?

Answer:

I am advised:

As part of the safety review of decommissioned fixed speed camera locations, an evaluation of the effectiveness of the program of alternative road safety treatment works has been incorporated as part of the project. Program evaluation will occur after the delivery of alternative road safety treatment at the decommissioned fixed speed camera locations. This will include analysis of speed surveys, crash data and crash trends for each location.

The impact of the camera removal and the effectiveness of alternative road safety measures at each of the decommissioned fixed speed camera will generally be evaluated 12 months after the delivery of alternative road safety treatment.

16. At each of the sites where fixed cameras have been shut down or removed, what is the rate of (a) accidents (b) injury and (c) fatalities since the cameras were removed/shut down?

a. If the rate of (a) accidents (b) injury and (c) fatalities increase at the sites where cameras have been removed, will the cameras be reinstalled?

Answer:

16) I am advised:

Due to the recent de-activation in July, sufficient crash data is not available.

Transport for NSW will continue to monitor deactivated camera sites across NSW.

a)I am advised:

No

The fixed speed cameras that were switched off following the Auditor General's report were deemed not effective in improving road safety.

- 17. Has an assessment been undertaken of the crash impact of existing fixed speed cameras for a minimum of 5 years post installation?
- a. What were the findings of the assessment?
- b. If the assessment has not yet been done when will it be done?
- c. Will the assessment be made public and when?
- d. If not why not?

Answer:

I am advised:

A further crash analysis of existing fixed speed camera locations has been completed using five years of before and after crash data, where available.

The five year analysis had similar results to the earlier three year analysis and demonstrated a 27 per cent reduction in total crashes and a 25 per cent reduction in the total number of casualties across all 128 fixed speed cameras locations (including a 62 per cent reduction in fatalities).

The NSW Centre for Road Safety is currently conducting a road safety assessment of all fixed digital speed camera locations that were deemed to be ineffective, which will aim to identify alternative road safety treatments. This will be completed in March 2012.

18. How many safety cameras are currently in operation?

Answer:

I am advised:

At present there are safety cameras installed at 91 intersections:

- safety cameras at 46 intersections are issuing infringements for both red-light and speeding offences; and
- safety cameras at 45 intersections are enforcing red-light and high level speeding offences only and issuing warning letters for low level speeding offences.

19. How many safety cameras were operating in February 2011?

Answer:

I am advised:

At the end of February 2011, safety cameras were operating at 57 intersections.

20. At the sites where safety cameras have been installed, what does the data show in relation to (a) crashes, (b) injuries and (c) fatalities before and after the cameras were installed?

Answer:

I am advised:

A review of safety cameras at 57 intersections in NSW has identified that they have resulted in a statistically significant 26 per cent reduction in crashes and a 34 per cent reduction in injuries.

21. How many safety cameras will be installed over the next 5 years?

Answer:

I am advised:

The Government is still considering decisions about refinements, the expansion or contraction of speed camera programs. Any decisions will be made on a road safety basis.

22. What is the funding allocation provided for the installation and operation of safety cameras in the 2011-2012 financial year?

Answer:

I am advised:

The funding allocation provided for the installation of safety cameras in the 2011-2012 financial year is \$10.6 million. This may not be spent, depending on the Government's decision about possible refinements to the program.

23. What was the funding allocation provided for the installation and operation of the safety cameras in 2010-2011?

Answer:

I am advised:

The funding allocation provided for the installation of the safety cameras in 2010-2011 was \$7.5 million.

24. What funding allocation is being provided for the installation and operation of safety cameras over the next five years?

Answer:

I am advised:

The funding allocation will be determined as part of the usual budgetary process.

Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council Minister for Roads and Ports



The Hon. Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council Minister for Roads and Ports

GENERAL PURPOSE STANDING COMMITTEE NO 3 BUDGET ESTIMATES HEARINGS QUESTION ON NOTICE

Hearing Date:

28 October 2011

Asked by:

Ms Amanda Fazio

Question:

25. What is the cost of engaging consultants to develop the road maintenance contestability strategy and modelling?

26. What are the terms of engagement for the consultants conducting and developing the strategy and modelling for road maintenance contestability?

27. Given that the Government expects road maintenance contestability will cut road maintenance costs by 5 – 20 per cent, what is the expected impact overall on jobs?

a. How many of the job losses will impact on (a) the RTA (b) rural and regional roads

(c) Sydney metropolitan Council jobs (d) Hunter Council jobs and (e) Illawarra

(c) Sydney metropolitan Council jobs (d) Hunter Council jobs and (e) Illawarra Council jobs?

28. What guarantees will be provided if the modelling demonstrates job losses as a result of road maintenance contestability?

Answer:

I am advised:

- (25) Halcrow Pacific Consultants have been engaged to undertake the initial options report. The final payment will be published in the next annual report.
- (26) Halcrow has been asked to prepare a preliminary report on broad options for increasing maintenance contestability across State roads in NSW. Report will cover:
 - Overview of current road maintenance delivery in Roads and Maritime Services (RMS)
 - Internal benchmarking results for maintenance costs
 - Options on forms of contracts and activities
 - · Geographical options for contracts
 - Proposed staging
 - Implementation timeframe
 - Risks and issues.

(27a) It is not possible to predict overall impact on jobs at this stage depending on the option that the government chooses to pursue and the detailed design of arrangements which will be the subject of further work. The relative impact on rural employment will be a key consideration in the options report.

(b) As per (a).

- (c) Sydney metropolitan council jobs are not impacted as they are not involved in road maintenance delivery for RMS.
- (d) As per (a).
- (e) As per (a). Shellharbour City Council is the only council undertaking road maintenance works for RMS currently in the Illawarra on approximately 30 kilometres of State Roads.
- (28) The relative impact on employment (both for RMS staff and other maintenance providers) will be a key consideration in the development of options. Regardless of the procurement model adopted, there will still be the need to utilise local expertise and knowledge in the delivery of road maintenance if efficiencies are to be realised.

Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council

Minister for Roads and Ports



The Hon. Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council Minister for Roads and Ports

GENERAL PURPOSE STANDING COMMITTEE NO 3 BUDGET ESTIMATES HEARINGS QUESTION ON NOTICE

Hearing Date:

28 October 2011

Asked by:

Ms Amanda Fazio MLC

Question:

29. What does the research and data available to the Centre for Road Safety indicate in relation to the effectiveness of fixed speed cameras in reducing accidents, injuries and fatalities?

Answer:

I am advised this information is available on the RMS website.

30. What does the research and data available to the Centre for Road Safety indicate in relation to the effectiveness of reducing speed and increasing safety in school zones?

Answer:

I am advised this information is available on the RMS website.

- 31. Does the Centre for Road Safety have research or data in relation to speed limits and its effectiveness on road safety?
- 32. What does the research/data indicate about the contribution of speed to accidents, injuries and fatalities and what is the effectiveness of reducing speed and a road safety tool?

Answer:

I am advised this information is available on the RMS website.

Question:

33. Is there research or data on the impact of increasing the speed limit from 100 km/h to 110 km/h? What does the research/data say?

Answer:

I am advised:

Yes there is a wide range of national and international research in relation to changing speed limits.

Generally the application of speed limits is based on crash risk and road condition. A higher quality of road can support an increased speed limit.

34. Based on the best available research and evidence, what more could be done to improve road safety – should we be using more fixed, mobile or safety cameras? Should we be reducing speed across the network?

Answer:

I am advised:

There is no one safety measure that is definitive in improving road safety across the road network.

As acknowledged in the National Road Safety Strategy 2011-2020, speed management is not just about speed limit enforcement and compliance. It is about using all available measures – speed limits, infrastructure treatments, enforcement and driver assist technologies, and driver education – to achieve safe traffic speeds across the road network.

The NSW Centre for Road Safety will continue to investigate the full range of road safety initiatives to improve road safety in NSW.

35. Is there research, data or any evidence that shows 70 km/h & 90 km/h speed zones have a negative impact on road safety?

Answer:

I am advised information about setting speed limits is contained in the NSW speed zone guidelines which are available on the RMS website.

36. What precedent is there in Australia or overseas for increasing speed limits? What was the impact on road safety?

Answer:

I am advised:

Speed limits have been increased or decreased both in NSW and across Australia. Sometimes these changes have related to a specific road or section or road, whilst at other times they have related to default or maximum speeds for the State (such as the change in NSW of the default urban speed limit from 60 km/h to 50 km/h in 2003).

A fundamental principle in setting speed limits for a particular length of road is that the established speed limit should reflect the road safety risk to the road users while maintaining mobility & amenity.

Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council

Minister for Roads and Ports



The Hon. Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council Minister for Roads and Ports

GENERAL PURPOSE STANDING COMMITTEE NO 3 BUDGET ESTIMATES HEARINGS QUESTION ON NOTICE

Hearing Date:

28 October 2011

Asked by:

Ms Amanda Fazio MLC

Question:

37. On what basis – research, accident data, advice from the Centre for Road Safety – was the decision to increase the speed limit on the Newell Highway made?

Answer:

I refer you to my answer LC 325 and answer of 11 August in Question Time on this question. I have tabled the advice and reports.

38. Between December 2009 and February 2011, what road upgrades and/or safety works have been done on the Newell Highway?

Answer:

I refer you to the Question on Notice LC 0185

39. What was the cost of that work?

Answer:

I refer you to Question on Notice LC 0185

40. Since April 2011 what road upgrade and/or safety work has been done on the Newell Highway?

Answer:

I refer you to Question on Notice LC 0185

41. What funding has been allocated to the Newell Highway in the 2011-2012 financial year?

Answer:

I refer to Question on Notice LC 0185.

42. How much funding has been allocated in 2011-2012 to the Newell Highway south of Jerilderie to bring it up to standard to increase the speed limit?

Answer:

I am advised:

While this section of road meets the speed zoning guidelines for 100 km/h, the major constraint preventing it from meeting the guidelines for 110km/h are intersections with local roads and property accesses. No funding has been provided to make changes to the road network and it is unlikely that it would be cost-effective.

43. When will the impact of increasing the speed limit on the Newell Highway be assessed? When will it be assessed?

Answer:

I am advised:

Roads and Maritime Services and Transport for NSW regularly monitor the road network and crash patterns to assess need for changes in speed limits or other measures that should be implemented.

44. Will the speed limit be reduced if there is an increase in accidents, injuries or fatalities?

Answer:

I am advised:

Crashes are one of the parameters used in assessing the need for a speed limit change.

45. Is the Government planning to increase any more 100 km/h speed zones to 110km/hr and if so where and when?

Answer:

I am advised this information is on the Roads and Maritime services website.

46. On what research and or advice did the Government make the decision to "restrict" 70 km/hr and 90 km/hr speed zones?

Answer:

On 21 June 2011 the NSW Government announced the commencement of an audit of speed zones across NSW.

A key element of the audit was the review of the NSW Speed Zoning Guidelines. The review also looked at the elimination of 70 km/h and 90 km/h speed limits in order to ensure less confusing speed zone changes for motorists.

ARRB Group Ltd (ARRB) was engaged by Transport for NSW (NSW Centre for Road Safety) to undertake a detailed review of the proposed new policies as part of the review of the NSW Speed Zoning Guidelines.

The findings from the ARRB report indicated that 70 km/h and 90 km/h speed zones had a role to play in the speed management regime, when the road environment was not suitable for a higher speed limit of 80 km/h or 100 km/h.

The NSW Government recognises that 70km/h and 90km/h speed limits have a role in the speed management regime, however in line with our commitment to make speed zones simpler for motorists, the future use of 70km/h and 90km/h speed limits will be restricted.

The NSW Government aims to decrease the amount of confusing speed zone changes for motorists. The new guidelines adopt a route based approach to speed zoning and more consistent zoning along the route when possible.

47. Where have 70 km/hr & 90 km/hr speed zones been altered?

Answer:

I am advised this information is available on the Roads and Maritime services website.

48. At these locations have you increased or decreased the speed limits and what is the new speed limit at each of these locations?

Answer:

I am advised this information is available on the Roads and Maritime services website.

49. Will the impact of removing the 70 km/h & 90km/h speed zones be assessed?

Answer:

I am advised:

As noted in question 46 above, there has been no blanket removal of 70 km/h and 90 km/h speed zones, despite media reports to the contrary. As such, no assessment is proposed.

50. When will the assessment be undertaken?

Answer:

See question 49 above.

51. If the assessment finds any increases in crashes, injuries or fatalities will you reinstate the 70 km/hr and 90 km/hr speed zones?

Answer:

See question 49 above.

Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council



Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council Minister for Roads and Ports

GENERAL PURPOSE STANDING COMMITTEE NO 3 BUDGET ESTIMATES HEARINGS QUESTION ON NOTICE

Hearing Date:

28 October 2011

Asked by:

Ms Amanda Fazio

Question:

52. Why has Macarthur been removed from the Western Sydney roads budget?

Answer:

I am advised:

This Government recognises the importance of the Macarthur region and has therefore elevated its status. In recognition of the region's elevated status, the Government provided a release for Macarthur separately from Western Sydney.

Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council



Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council Minister for Roads and Ports

GENERAL PURPOSE STANDING COMMITTEE NO 3 BUDGET ESTIMATES HEARINGS QUESTION ON NOTICE

Hearing Date:

28 October 2011

Asked by:

Ms Amanda Fazio

Question:

53. When will work on the Victoria Bridge in Penrith start? When is the project expected to be complete?

Answer:

I am advised:

\$1 million has been provided in 2011-12 budget towards this project as part of a 4 year, \$20 million commitment.

Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council



Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council Minister for Roads and Ports

GENERAL PURPOSE STANDING COMMITTEE NO 3 BUDGET ESTIMATES HEARINGS QUESTION ON NOTICE

Hearing Date:

28 October 2011

Asked by:

Ms Amanda Fazio

Question:

54. What the funding allocation provided to Western Sydney roads in 2011-2012?

55. What specific Western Sydney roads projects does the 2011-2012 allocation cover?

56. How many of these Western Sydney roads project were started in the 2010-2011 financial year – either planning, design or construction was started in 2010-2011?

57. When will each these Western Sydney projects be completed?

58. How much funding was allocated to Western Sydney roads in 2010-2011?

59. How much funding has been allocated to Western Sydney roads across the forward estimate period?

Answer:

I am advised that \$348 million has been allocated to Western Sydney roads and \$94 million to Macarthur roads in 2011-2012. The total is \$442million in 2011-12 for Western Sydney including Macarthur. Details of major road construction projects across the state, including those in Western Sydney are included in Budget Paper 4. This includes the amount of funding allocated during 2011-12 as well as the start dates and expected completion dates of each project.

In relation to 2010-11 funding for roads in Western Sydney, I refer you to the former Minister's media release of 8 June 2010.

In relation to how much funding has been allocated to Western Sydney roads across the forward estimates period, this information is not available at the level of detail requested.

The allocation of funds to specific future projects is finalised as part of the budget process and released in Budget Paper 4.

Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council



Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council Minister for Roads and Ports

GENERAL PURPOSE STANDING COMMITTEE NO 3 BUDGET ESTIMATES HEARINGS QUESTION ON NOTICE

Hearing Date:

28 October 2011

Asked by:

Ms Amanda Fazio

Question:

60. What funding has been provided to fix black spots in 2011-2012 towards fixing black spots?

61. What funding was allocated in 2010-2011?

62. Where and to what projects has the black spot funding been provided?

63. When will work on these projects begin?

64. What funding has been provided to black spots in 2012-2012, 2013-14 and 2014-2015?

Answer:

I am advised:

(60)

In 2011-2012, \$24.1 million was allocated to NSW in the Federal Black Spot Program and \$16.4 million was allocated in the NSW Budget for black spot treatments.

(61)

In 2010-2011, \$22.6 million was allocated to NSW in the Federal Black Spot Program and \$15.5 million was allocated in the NSW Budget for black spot treatments.

(62 and 63)

A table was provided in relation to LC 741 on the same question.

(64)

Funding allocations will be determined in the formulation of the 2012-2013, 2013-2014 and 2014-2015 Budgets.

Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council



Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council Minister for Roads and Ports

GENERAL PURPOSE STANDING COMMITTEE NO 3 BUDGET ESTIMATES HEARINGS QUESTION ON NOTICE

Hearing Date:

28 October 2011

Asked by:

Ms Amanda Fazio

Question:

65. By what percent has the cost of road construction, materials and maintenance increased since 2010-2011?

66. What is the average annual increase – as a percentage – in road construction, material and maintenance – over the last 10 years?

Answer:

I am advised:

As measured by the Road Cost Index (RCI), the cost of road construction, materials and maintenance has increased by 2.1 percent since 2010-2011.

The annual average percentage increase in the RCI for the 10 year period 2001-02 to 2010-11 is 3.6 percent.

Duncan Gay MLC

Deputy Leader of Government in the Legislative Council