



**The Hon. Adam Marshall MP**  
Minister for Tourism and Major Events  
Assistant Minister for Skills

## **Budget Estimates 2017-18 – Monday 4 September 2017**

### **Portfolio Committee No. 3 – Education**

#### **Tourism and Major Events, Assistant Minister for Skills**

## **TOURISM AND MAJOR EVENTS**

### **Growing tourism and pressure on infrastructure**

1. Many local councils in NSW, such as Byron Shire Council are facing growing pressures on local infrastructure from a booming tourism industry.
  - (a) Will the Government permit NSW councils to implement a tourism levy or 'bed tax' to support visitor-related infrastructure, such as landscaping, road maintenance, public amenities, better lighting and improved transport?
  - (b) What is the NSW Government doing to support councils in monitoring and implementing compliance programs in relation to residential dwellings being illegally used for tourism purposes, which can deprive local communities of stable accommodation through unregulated 'holiday-letting'?
  - (c) Does the NSW Government have any commitment to expend its tourism budget on projects other than destination marketing campaigns so that income generated by tourism can be re-invested back into local infrastructure?

### **ANSWER**

- (a) The NSW Government is committed to growing tourism across rural and regional NSW and delivering a tourism framework that supports tourism operators, jobs and local economies. Local infrastructure and amenity issues relating to the impacts of tourism are the responsibility of each local government area.
- (b) As part of its response to the NSW Parliamentary Committee Report on the Adequacy of Regulation of Short Term Holiday Letting, the NSW Government has released an Options Paper for Short-Term Holiday Letting in NSW.
- (c) Destination NSW's budget includes money for event acquisition, marketing, partnerships, regional tourism marketing and product development. All campaign activities and funding programs drive results for the tourism industry and the visitor economy more broadly, which contribute to achieving the Government's goal of doubling overnight visitor expenditure by 2020.

The NSW Government has a number of funding programs in place to support development and improvement of tourism-related infrastructure across the State. The

NSW Government has recently announced a \$1.3 billion Regional Growth Fund to support infrastructure projects to help regional economies expand to improve amenities for local communities.

Within this Fund is the \$300m Regional Growth – Environment and Tourism Fund, which is available for infrastructure projects that will grow the visitor economy in Regional NSW.

Additionally, the \$110m Regional Tourism Infrastructure Fund is available for projects such as airports, rail trails and cruise infrastructure.

The Tourism Demand Driver Infrastructure Program also funds infrastructure projects, in partnership with the Federal Government.

### **Use of artificial intelligence**

2. What current uses of artificial intelligence does the department undertake?  
Note: Please include all uses of AI including uses for resource allocation and administrative support, big data analysis, replacement and assistance of experts and researchers, procedural matters, or summarising diverse data – for reference this might include:
- Chatbots for customer service or advice
  - Customer management systems
  - Scanning legal documents to find relevant case law
  - Categorising and searching documents
  - Directing petitions efficiently
  - Translation
  - Document drafting

### **ANSWER**

As outlined in the Digital Government Strategy, the NSW Government will continue to explore the use of cognitive and machine learning, and related Artificial Intelligence technologies, to simplify processes, eliminate duplication, and improve customer experience

3. What planned uses does the department have for artificial intelligence?

### **ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q2

4. What policy guidelines, if any, guide the exploration and use of artificial intelligence by the department?

### **ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q2

5. What research, if any, has the department undertaken regarding the use of AI in Government services?

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q2

**Destination NSW international offices**

6. What is the budget allocation for 2017-18 for each of the following Destination NSW offices, broken down into employee costs, office costs (such as rent and office expenses), travel costs (such as transport, accommodation, attendance at events), and other costs:
- (a) New Zealand
  - (b) Hong Kong
  - (c) Shanghai
  - (d) Beijing
  - (e) Chengdu
  - (f) Guangzhou
  - (g) Korea
  - (h) North America
  - (i) United Kingdom and Europe
  - (j) Germany
  - (k) Japan
  - (l) Singapore
  - (m) India

**ANSWER**

<b>FY 2017-18</b>	<b>Office costs (rent and office expenses) \$000</b>	<b>Travel costs \$000</b>	<b>Other costs \$000</b>	<b>Employee costs \$000</b>
New Zealand	46	5	26	202
Hong Kong	54	16	28	231
Shanghai	129	15	28	244
Beijing	37	7	17	49
Chengdu	27	7	23	46
Guangzhou	24	7	17	50
North America	65	20	25	275
UK and Europe	41	5	28	195
Germany	14	3	11	112
Japan	84	5	27	253
Singapore	56	15	27	276
India	115	15	25	143

Destination NSW also has a representative office in Korea.

7. What was the amount spent for each of the previous years 2011-12, 2012-13, 2013-14, 2014-15, 2015-16, and 2016-17 for each of the following Destination NSW offices, broken down into employee costs, office costs (such as rent and

office expenses), travel costs (such as transport, accommodation, attendance at events), and other costs:

- (a) New Zealand
- (b) Hong Kong
- (c) Shanghai
- (d) Beijing
- (e) Chengdu
- (f) Guangzhou
- (g) Korea
- (h) North America
- (i) United Kingdom and Europe
- (j) Germany
- (k) Japan
- (l) Singapore
- (m) India

### ANSWER

<b>FY 2016-17</b>	<b>Office costs (rent and office expenses) \$000</b>	<b>Travel costs \$000</b>	<b>Other costs \$000</b>	<b>Employee costs \$000</b>
New Zealand	44	6	25	198
Hong Kong	63	9	27	227
Shanghai	117	9	27	239
Beijing	-	-	-	-
Chengdu	30	7	22	45
Guangzhou	-	-	-	-
Korea	-	-	-	-
North America	57	27	24	270
UK and Europe	40	8	27	191
Germany	-	-	-	-
Japan	78	6	26	248
Singapore	58	7	26	271
India	105	9	24	141

<b>FY 2015-16</b>	<b>Office costs (rent and office expenses) \$000</b>	<b>Travel costs \$000</b>	<b>Other costs \$000</b>	<b>Employee costs \$000</b>
New Zealand	45	6	24	195
Hong Kong	69	9	27	227
Shanghai	53	9	27	289
Beijing	-	-	-	-
Chengdu	26	7	22	45
Guangzhou	-	-	-	-

Korea	-	-	-	-
North America	53	27	23	263
UK and Europe	50	8	27	187
Germany	-	-	-	-
Japan	66	6	25	240
Singapore	50	7	25	262
India	75	9	23	135

<b>FY 2014-15</b>	<b>Office costs (rent and office expenses) \$000</b>	<b>Travel costs \$000</b>	<b>Other costs \$000</b>	<b>Employee costs \$000</b>
New Zealand	39	6	23	202
Hong Kong	59	9	26	175
Shanghai	56	9	26	288
Beijing	-	-	-	-
Chengdu	33	7	21	40
Guangzhou	-	-	-	-
Korea	-	-	-	-
North America	45	27	23	229
UK and Europe	45	8	26	176
Germany	-	-	-	-
Japan	66	6	25	219
Singapore	43	7	25	215
India	55	8	23	102

<b>FY 2013-14</b>	<b>Office costs (rent and office expenses) \$000</b>	<b>Travel costs \$000</b>	<b>Other costs \$000</b>	<b>Employee costs \$000</b>
New Zealand	32	6	22	192
Hong Kong	56	9	26	175
Shanghai	58	9	26	261
Beijing	-	-	-	-
Chengdu	37	7	21	40
Guangzhou	-	-	-	-
Korea	-	-	-	-
North America	41	27	22	201
UK and Europe	33	6	26	215
Germany	-	-	-	-
Japan	68	6	25	215

Singapore	34	7	25	211
India	35	9	22	95

<b>FY 2012-13</b>	<b>Office costs (rent and office expenses) \$000</b>	<b>Travel costs \$000</b>	<b>Other costs \$000</b>	<b>Employee costs \$000</b>
New Zealand	33	5	21	188
Hong Kong	28	4	25	149
Shanghai	44	9	25	257
Beijing	-	-	-	-
Chengdu	-	-	-	-
Guangzhou	-	-	-	-
Korea	-	-	-	-
North America	35	25	21	197
UK and Europe	33	5	24	169
Germany	-	-	-	-
Japan	71	5	24	210
Singapore	31	5	24	206
India	38	7	21	93

<b>FY 2011-12</b>	<b>Office costs (rent and office expenses) \$000</b>	<b>Travel costs \$000</b>	<b>Other costs \$000</b>	<b>Employee costs \$000</b>
New Zealand	29	5	14	221
Hong Kong	-	-	-	-
Shanghai	36	5	13	190
Beijing	-	-	-	-
Chengdu	-	-	-	-
Guangzhou	-	-	-	-
Korea	-	-	-	-
North America	54	5	13	181
UK and Europe	23	5	11	161
Germany	-	-	-	-
Japan	69	5	11	218
Singapore	24	5	13	201
India	-	-	-	-

8. What is the current annual salary for the following positions and any other unlisted Manager, Director, or Executive positions in each international office of Destination NSW:
- (a) New Zealand – Country Manager, and Marketing Executive;
  - (b) Hong Kong – Regional Director, North Asia;
  - (c) Shanghai - Regional Manager, Marketing Executive, and Business Development Manager;
  - (d) Beijing – Business Development Manager;
  - (e) Chengdu – Business Development Manager, Western China;
  - (f) Guangzhou – Business Manager, Southern China;
  - (g) Korea – Business Development Manager;
  - (h) North America – Regional Manager, USA;
  - (i) United Kingdom and Europe – Regional Manager, UK and Europe;
  - (j) Germany – Business Development Manager;
  - (k) Japan – Country Manager, and Marketing Executive;
  - (l) Singapore – Regional Director; and
  - (m) India – Country Manager, Business Development Manager, and Administration Executive?

#### ANSWER

Country	Position	Annual Salary AUD \$000
New Zealand	Country Manager	123
New Zealand	Marketing Executive	69
Hong Kong	Regional Director, North Asia	209
Shanghai	Regional Manager, China	158
Shanghai	Business Development Manager	51
Shanghai	Marketing Executive	-
Beijing	Business Development Manager	45
Chengdu	Business Development Manager, Western China	44
Guangzhou	Business Development Manager, Southern China	46
Korea	No Office, Representation only	-
North America	Regional Manager, USA	157
North America	Marketing Executive	102
UK and Europe	Regional Manager, UK and Europe	108
Germany	Business Development Manager	112
Japan	Country Manager	174
Japan	Marketing Executive	72
Singapore	Regional Manager, South East Asia	178
Singapore	Marketing Executive	61
Mumbai	Country Manager	54

Mumbai	Business Development Manager	28
Mumbai	Administration Executive	14

9. What reporting and accountability measures does the Government undertake regarding key performance indicators and evaluation of objectives and outcomes of each of the 13 international offices of Destination NSW?
- (a) Will the Government make this reporting publicly available (with any commercial-in-confidence information removed)?
- (b) If so, when?
- (c) If not, why not?

### **ANSWER**

(a-c) Annual business plans are developed for each priority international market focused on developing partnerships with airline and travel trade partners to increase the promotion and sale of travel to Sydney and regional NSW destinations, experiences and events.

Partnership activities seek to raise awareness of Sydney and regional NSW destinations and events to drive visitation and increase overnight visitor expenditure. All activities are undertaken on a matched dollar for dollar investment model and are based on commercial return on investment for Destination NSW and the partner. Agreed targets are set in terms of the total bookings and estimated incremental bookings activities aim to generate.

All partnership marketing program results are commercial-in-confidence. Campaign results are reviewed against the targets and incremental visitor expenditure generated, with return on investment reported internally.

International Managers complete an annual performance review where the key performance indicators are agreed for the next twelve months.

(a) Destination NSW's annual report provides an overview of its achievements, including international offices, however it excludes commercial-in-confidence information.

10. What is the current annual salary for each Chair, Director, and General Manager of the following Destination Networks:
- (a) Destination Riverina Murray;
- (b) Destination Southern NSW;
- (c) Destination North Coast;
- (d) Destination Country and Outback NSW;
- (e) Destination Sydney Surrounds North; and
- (f) Destination Sydney Surrounds South?

### **ANSWER**

All Destination Networks Chairs are remunerated at \$20,000 per annum and Directors are remunerated at \$10,000 per annum.



General Managers are appointed and employed by the Destination Networks, who set their salary rates. As the Destination Networks are independent entities, requests for details of employee salaries would need to be directed to them.

11. What is the Government's formal plan or policy for Accessible Tourism, particularly for the tourism industry in regional NSW? Please provide details.

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government recognises the importance of accessible tourism and is committed to ensuring Sydney and NSW's status as inclusive and accessible destinations for visitors with a disability now and in the future is sustained.

Destination NSW's consumer websites Sydney.com and visitNSW.com provide information to visitors searching for accessible travel experiences in NSW. Destination NSW works with event partners, landowners and other government agencies, to increase accessibility to events and has been actively engaged in the Accessible Tourism Project, established by the Department of Family and Community Services.

As part of the review of the tourism blueprint, the NSW Visitor Economy Industry Action Plan, the Government will consider accessible tourism. The review will commence shortly.

12. What resources or tools are currently available from the Government regarding Accessible Tourism, particularly for the tourism industry in regional NSW?

**ANSWER**

Destination NSW, supports initiatives to assist the tourism industry in how to make attractions, destinations and events accessible to people of all ages and abilities - helping to promote maximum participation and enjoyment for all visitors to NSW.

The NSW Government supported the \$140,000 Local Government NSW Enabling Accessible Tourism project in 2016/17 under the Commonwealth Tourism Demand-Driver Infrastructure program. The project, which is delivered in the South Coast, Northern Rivers and Central West, will improve the provision of information on tourism services, attractions and activities in regional NSW destinations for people with disability, their family and their carers.

Destination NSW is supporting the Local Government NSW project by making changes to the accessible dataset in the Australian Tourism Data Warehouse database for the collection of this information, based on Local Government NSW's extensive research. Destination NSW has provided funding of \$7,500 for the development of the criteria for assessment and the tagging of Australian Tourism Data Warehouse listed products providing accessibility information to enable a consumer requiring this information to determine if it is suitable for them.

Destination NSW is also presenting at workshops around regional NSW organised by Local Government NSW to promote the Get Connected program and Australian Tourism Data Warehouse distribution channel and how this platform provides a solution to the collection and distribution of inclusive tourism content.

13. On what date was the NSW Government's bid to host the Logies Awards submitted?

**ANSWER**

29 May 2017.

14. Was the proposition that the NSW Government place a bid to host the Logies Awards initiated and proposed by Destination NSW, the office of the Minister for Tourism and Major Events, or another source? Please provide details.

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government, through Destination NSW, presented an Expression of Interest to the Nine Network to host the TV Week Logie Awards in NSW from 2018 to 2020. The proposal was for the Logie Awards to be held in regional NSW, with Tamworth, Dubbo and Albury suggested as three possible locations.

15. Has the Minister visited Newcastle in 2017?  
(a) If so, on what date and what official activities were undertaken?

**ANSWER**

All meetings are disclosed in accordance with Ministerial guidelines.

**Mount Keira Summit Park**

16. Has the Minister had specific discussions regarding:  
(a) Mount Keira Summit Park Re-Development  
(b) Work of Destination Wollongong  
(c) The arrival of cruise ships at Port Kembla

**ANSWER**

All meetings are disclosed in accordance with Ministerial guidelines.

17. If yes, for any of the above projects, what was the outcomes and actions that the Government reached, so that these initiatives can be advanced?

**ANSWER**

Wollongong City Council successfully applied for and received \$650,000 funding in the 2016/17 round of the Commonwealth Government's Tourism Demand Driver infrastructure Fund program, administered by the NSW Government. The funding was sought to assist in the redevelopment of Mt Keira Summit Park including:

- Construction of a kiosk, services and carpark upgrade
- Visitor facilities including shelter, furniture and fencing
- A scoping study in regards to using the Mt Keira Summit Park for mountain bike riding.

The redevelopment project is due for completion by June 2018.

Wollongong/Port Kembla saw visits from four cruise ships last season and has another three scheduled this year. Destination NSW has worked closely with Destination Wollongong, ground handlers, local industry and event partners to maximise the economic benefit and visitor experience during the inaugural cruise season for Wollongong and the Illawarra.

18. What funding applications have been made to the NSW Government to assist in the redevelopment of the Mount Keira Summit Park in the following years:
- (a) 2012
  - (b) 2013
  - (c) 2014
  - (d) 2015
  - (e) 2016

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q17

19. Has the Minister sought briefings from Destination Wollongong in relation to tourism on Mount Keira?
- (a) If so, when were these briefings held?

**ANSWER**

All meetings are disclosed in accordance with Ministerial guidelines.

20. What funding applications have been made to the NSW Government for the following forms of active infrastructure in the Keira electorate to assist in supporting regional tourism?
- (a) Cycling
  - (b) Walking
  - (c) Bushwalking

**ANSWER**

Wollongong City Council successfully applied for \$650,000 funding in the 2016/17 round of the Tourism Demand Driver infrastructure Fund program to commission a scoping study in regards to using the Mt Keira Summit Park for mountain bike riding.

**Supercars**

21. When will the noise management plan for the Newcastle 500 be released?
- (a) Has the noise management plan been reviewed by Safe NSW?
  - (b) Has the noise management plan been reviewed by the EPA?
  - (c) Has the noise management plan been reviewed by NSW Health?

**ANSWER**

Supercars Australia released its Noise Management Plan on Monday 11 September 2017. It is currently being reviewed by SafeWork NSW, the Environment Protection Authority, NSW Health and Destination NSW.

22. Will the noise management plan and mitigation measures be independently reviewed?

**ANSWER**

Yes, it was independently audited and ratified for Supercars Australia by Waves Consulting and is currently being reviewed by an independent member of the Australian Acoustics Society for Destination NSW.

23. Will the noise management plan be released to the public?  
(a) If not, why not?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q21.

24. Will it be safe for residents who live along the Newcastle 500 track to stay in their homes during the race?

**ANSWER**

According to the Supercars Australia Noise Management Plan, noise levels will fall below guidelines with the adoption of the noise management strategies as set out in the Plan.

25. When will residents impacted by the Newcastle 500 be given access to the Noise Management Plan for the Newcastle 500 Supercars race?

**ANSWER**

The plan was made available to residents on Monday 11 September 2017 and is also available online at: <http://www.supercars.com/newcastle/community/noise-management-plan/>. Residents of any properties where Supercars Australia expects noise levels to be particularly high will be contacted by Supercars Australia directly.

26. Why did the Government decide not to provide compensation for claims of economic loss (including loss of business) resulting from the Newcastle Supercars event?  
(a) What support has the NSW Government provided to businesses impacted by the Newcastle 500?

**ANSWER**

As per the *Motor Racing (Sydney and Newcastle) Act 2008* and in particular sections 32 and 33, compensation is not payable by Destination NSW, Supercars Australia and other nominated parties.

Supercars Australia Community Engagement Manager and Destination NSW Community Liaison Officer are able to take enquiries from businesses regarding operations.

27. When will the accreditation process for residents be finalised?

**ANSWER**

Supercars Australia is managing accreditation of residents.

28. What is the budget for the Newcastle 500 Co-ordination Office for each of the following years:
- (a) 2017;
  - (b) 2018;
  - (c) 2019;
  - (d) 2020; and
  - (e) 2021?

**ANSWER**

The budget for the Newcastle 500 Co-ordination Office is absorbed within the recurrent staffing and administration costs of Destination NSW. As a result, there is no stand-alone budget for the Newcastle 500 Coordination Office.

29. How many staff work in the Newcastle 500 Co-ordination Office as at 6/9/17?

**ANSWER**

Two.

30. What has been the cost of the Newcastle 500 Co-ordination Office since it commenced operating?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q28.

31. Has the Minister visited Newcastle since the civil works for the Newcastle 500 commenced?
- (a) If not, why not?

**ANSWER**

All meetings are disclosed in accordance with Ministerial guidelines.

32. The NSW Government correspondence policy states “We aim to open all correspondence within one business day of receipt, and respond where required, within 20 working days of receipt”, what percentage of correspondence in your office is responded to within 20 working days?

**ANSWER**

My office remains committed to ensuring that we effectively engage with all community members and stakeholders who write to me in a prompt and comprehensive manner.

33. How many residents have been offered to be relocated during the Newcastle 500?

### **ANSWER**

As per the *Motor Racing (Sydney and Newcastle) Act 2008* and in particular sections 32 and 33, compensation is not payable by Destination NSW, Supercars Australia and other nominated parties.

34. What is the cost of the Newcastle 500 to the NSW Government?

### **ANSWER**

The total cost of the Newcastle 500 to the NSW Government is commercial-in-confidence.

### **Office Administration**

35. How many staff are in your ministerial office?

(a) What was the average salary for staff members in your office during 2016-17?

(b) What is the estimated average salary for a ministerial staffer in your office in 2017-18 based on current appointments?

### **ANSWER**

Ministers' staff numbers and salary bands are available on the DPC website. Refer to:

[http://www.dpc.nsw.gov.au/about/publications/premiers\\_and\\_ministers\\_staff\\_numbers](http://www.dpc.nsw.gov.au/about/publications/premiers_and_ministers_staff_numbers)

36. How many blackberries/iphones/smart phones are assigned to your staff?

(a) For each phone, how much was each bill in 2016-17?

(b) How many phones have been lost or replaced due to damage in your office?  
i. What is the cost of replacing those phones?

### **ANSWER**

There were 240 smart phones allocated across the Ministerial Offices in 2016-17. The total usage cost of these smart phones and other mobile devices (including iPads) was \$269,644, a 53.4% per cent reduction on the 2008-09 expenditure of \$578,691. The cost of replacing any lost or stolen devices is claimed through the NSW Treasury Managed Fund. Repairs are funded by the Department of Premier and Cabinet, Corporate and Ministerial Services.

37. How many iPads or tablets has DPC assigned to your Ministerial office and to whom have they been issued?

(a) What was the cost of providing iPads or tablets to your Ministerial Office in 2016-17?

(b) How many iPads or tablets have been replaced due to lost or damage in 2016-17?

i. What was the cost of replacing these devices?

There were 139 iPads in use across the Ministers' IT network in 2016-17. The cost of replacing any lost or stolen devices is claimed through the NSW Treasury Managed

Fund. Repairs are funded by the Department of Premier and Cabinet, Corporate and Ministerial Services.

38. Has any artwork been purchased or leased for display in your ministerial office in 2016-17?  
(a) What is the cost of this?

Artwork in the Premier's and Ministerial offices includes art donated at no cost and artwork on loan from the Art Gallery of NSW for which the Gallery charges a nominal subscription fee.

39. Have any floral displays or indoor plants or potplants been hired or leased for display in your ministerial office in 2016-17?  
(a) If so, what was the cost of these items?

**ANSWER**

Floral arrangements purchased by the Ministry are managed within the office's budgets.

40. Have any floral displays or indoor plants or potplants been purchased for display in your ministerial office in 2016-17?  
(a) If so, what was the cost of these items?

**ANSWER**

Floral arrangements purchased by the Ministry are managed within the office's budgets.

41. What was the total cost of all subscriptions by you and your staff to online news services, newspapers, magazines, journals and periodicals in 2016-17?  
(a) What are these services/newspapers/magazines/journals/periodicals?  
i. Who is the subscriber for each of these?

**ANSWER**

The Minister's office subscribes to a modest number of publications, the cost of which is managed within the office's budget.

42. What was the total amount your office spent on stationery?

**ANSWER**

Expenditure on stationery in 2016-17 across the Ministry was \$146,596. This includes the cost of printed stationery (business cards and letterheads).

43. What was the total value of all gifts purchased for use by you and your office in 2016-17?

- (a) What were the gifts purchased?  
i. Who were they gifted to?

**ANSWER**

Gifts are presented to dignitaries during overseas missions and to dignitaries visiting NSW.

44. Do you purchase bottled water or provide water coolers for your office?  
(a) What is the monthly cost of this?

**ANSWER**

No

45. What non-standard features are fitted to your ministerial vehicle?  
(a) What is the cost of each non-standard feature?

**ANSWER**

Ministers, the Leader of the Opposition, other nominated public office holders and certain former office holders are provided with official cars and drivers. During 2016-17 all costs associated with these vehicles were paid from the relevant office's budget.

46. What was the total bill for your office in 2016-17 for:  
(a) Taxi hire  
(b) Limousine hire  
(c) Private hire care  
(d) Hire car rental  
(e) Ridesharing services

**ANSWER**

Expenditure on taxis, hire cars and ride share services in 2016-17 across the Ministry was \$82,771, down from \$99,463 last year. This compares with 2009-10 expenditure of \$175,776.

47. Were any planes or helicopters chartered by you or your office and paid for with public money in 2016-17?  
(a) If yes, will you please detail each trip, the method of transport and the cost?

**ANSWER**

Expenditure on charter flights for the Ministry totalled \$6,921 in 2016-17, down from \$28,706 last year. This compares with expenditure in 2009-10 of \$281,567

**Hospitality**



48. How much did your ministerial office spend on hospitality, including catering and beverages, in 2016-17?

**ANSWER**

Expenditure on hospitality across the Ministry totalled \$32,021 in 2016-17- which includes catering for stakeholder meetings and courtesy calls with visiting dignitaries.

49. How much did your Department/agency spend on hospitality, including catering and beverages, in 2016-17?

**ANSWER**

Costs are managed within each agency's recurrent budget.

**Labour Hire Firms**

50. Do any Departments/agencies within your portfolio responsibilities utilise the services of Labour Hire Firms? If yes, please advise in table form for 2016-17:
- (a) The names of the firms utilised
  - (b) The total amount paid to each firm engaged
  - (c) The average tenure period for an employee provided by a labour hire company
  - (d) The longest tenure for an employee provided by a labour hire company
  - (e) The duties conducted by employees engaged through a labour hire company
  - (f) The office locations of employees engaged through a labour hire company
  - (g) The highest hourly or daily rate paid to an employee provided by a labour hire company

**ANSWER**

The Industry Cluster uses Labour Hire firms, in accordance with NSW Public Service policies to cover temporary vacancies as required. There are no central records maintained, with operations authorised to make such arrangements, subject to their overall labour expense cap.

**Media and Public Relations**

51. How many media or public relations advisers are employed for each of your portfolio agencies and what is the total cost to employ these advisers?

**ANSWER**

Agency staff numbers are included in Annual Reports.

52. What is the forecast for the current financial year for the number of media or public relations advisers to be employed and their total cost?

**ANSWER**

Agency staff numbers undertaking media or public relations activities are commensurate with need and can go down or up as required.

53. What is the total cost of media monitoring services used by Departments/agencies within your portfolio responsibilities?

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government purchases all commercial media monitoring centrally through the Department of Premier and Cabinet which delivers significant savings through aggregated procurement.

54. By how much has the number of media or public relations advisers employed for each of your portfolio agencies increased since 2011-12 to the current date?

**ANSWER**

Agency staff numbers are included in Annual Reports.

55. By how much has the expenditure on media or public relations advisers employed for each of your portfolio agencies increased since 2011-12 to the current date?

**ANSWER**

Agency staff numbers are included in Annual Reports

56. Have you had media training or speech training?  
(a) If yes, who paid for it?  
(b) If paid by taxpayers, what was the amount paid in 2016-17?

**ANSWER**

No

**Facebook**

57. How much did your ministerial office spend on Facebook advertising or sponsored posts in 2016-17?

**ANSWER**

No taxpayer money has been spent on Facebook advertising or sponsored posts.

58. How much did your Department/agency spend on Facebook advertising or sponsored posts in 2016-17?

**ANSWER**

Where appropriate social media is used by agencies alongside other forms of advertising as a cost effective medium of communication.

**Overseas Trips**

59. Were any of your overseas trips in the last financial year paid for in part or in full by using public money?  
(a) If so, did any of your relatives or friends accompany you on these trips?

**ANSWER**

Details of overseas travel including costs are published on the Department of Premier and Cabinet's website.

60. Have you undertaken any official overseas travel that was privately funded?  
(a) If so, what was the nature of these trips?  
(b) Who paid for these trips?

**ANSWER**

Details of overseas travel including costs are published on the Department of Premier and Cabinet's website.

**Department/Agency Travel**

61. What was the total expenditure in 2016-17 by Departments/agencies within your portfolio on:  
(a) Taxi hire  
(b) Limousine/private car hire  
(c) Hire car rental  
(d) Ridesharing services

**ANSWER**

All Departments' travel in 2015-16 was accordance with NSW Treasury and Finance Circular OFS-2014-07.

2016-17 agency expenditure for the following categories is as follows:

- a) Taxi Hire - \$578,148
- b) Limousine/private care hire – \$5,000
- c) Hire car rental - \$1,397,403
- d) Ridesharing services – Nil

62. Do any senior executive service employees in your Departments/agencies have a driver that is paid for by the Departments/agencies? If so, what is the number of senior executive service employees that have a driver and which senior executive service employees have a driver?  
(a) How much was spent on these drivers in 2016-17?

**ANSWER**

No

- (a) N/A

**Consulting**

63. How much did the Department/agencies under your portfolio responsibility spend in legal costs in 2016-17?  
(a) For what specific purposes or matters was legal advice sought?

**ANSWER**

Financial statements, including expenditure on consultants, are available in agency annual reports.

64. Have Department/agencies under your portfolio engaged any consultants to provide the following services or advice in 2016-17:
- (a) Social media
    - i. And the cost of these services
  - (b) Photography
    - i. And the cost of these services
  - (c) Acting training
    - i. And the cost of these services
  - (d) Ergonomics
    - i. And the cost of these services

**ANSWER**

Financial statements, including expenditure on consultants, are available in agency annual reports.

**Department/Agency Staffing**

65. What was the number of senior executive service employees employed by Departments/agencies within your portfolio in 2016-17?
- (a) How much was this number in 2011-12?

**ANSWER**

Public Service Senior Executive (PSSE) numbers are reported in the Annual Reports of each agency within the Premier and Cabinet Cluster.

66. What was the expenditure on senior executive service employees employed by Departments/agencies within your portfolio in 2016-17?
- (a) How much was this number in 2011-12?

**ANSWER**

Public Service Senior Executive (PSSE) numbers are reported in the Annual Reports of each agency within the Premier and Cabinet Cluster.

67. What was the number of internal legal counsel employees employed by Departments/agencies within your portfolio in 2016-17?
- (a) How much was this number in 2011-12?

**ANSWER**

Staff numbers and their cost are managed within the agency's Labour Expense Cap, as part of the sector's Budget Controls.

68. What was the expenditure on internal legal counsel employees employed by Departments/agencies within your portfolio in 2016-17?
- (a) How much was this number in 2011-12?

**ANSWER**

Staff numbers and their cost are managed within the agency's Labour Expense Cap, as part of the sector's Budget Controls.

69. How many redundancies were processed by Departments/agencies within your portfolio responsibilities during 2016-17?

(a) Of these redundancies, how many were:

i. Voluntary

ii. Forced

(b) What was the total cost of all redundancies?

**ANSWER**

Voluntary redundancies are a component for agencies to achieve their efficiency dividends. Redundancy figures across the sector for 2016/17 are anticipated to be in the order of 1,222, totalling 12,999 Since July 2011. The Labour Expenses Cap introduced in the 2012-13 Budget also continues to give Secretaries as much flexibility as possible to achieve these savings in the most appropriate ways to meet the service requirements of their agencies. Nurses, police officers and teachers in schools have been quarantined from this measure.

70. Have any staff who received a redundancy in the last two years undertaken any paid work or provided any paid services for the agency with which they were formerly employed?

(a) What was the nature of these works/services?

(b) What was the total cost of these works or services?

**ANSWER**

Voluntary redundancies are a component for agencies to achieve their efficiency dividends. Redundancy figures across the sector for 2016/17 are anticipated to be in the order of 1,222, totalling 12,999 Since July 2011. The Labour Expenses Cap introduced in the 2012-13 Budget also continues to give Secretaries as much flexibility as possible to achieve these savings in the most appropriate ways to meet the service requirements of their agencies. Nurses, police officers and teachers in schools have been quarantined from this measure.

71. Are any staff formerly employed by your ministerial office now employed by Departments/agencies under your portfolio responsibility?

**ANSWER**

Staffing decisions made within individual agencies are a matter for that agency.

72. How many staff were dismissed from Departments/agencies under your portfolio responsibilities in 2016-17?

(a) What were the reason/s for each dismissal?

**ANSWER**

Staffing decisions made within individual agencies are a matter for that agency.

73. What was the total amount your Departments/agencies spent on stationery?

**ANSWER**

Stationary expenses are accounted for in agencies recurrent budgets.

**Smart Phone Accounts**

74. Do the Departments/agencies within your portfolio have an iTunes account?  
(a) What was the total expenditure in 2016-17 on iTunes?  
i. What applications/subscriptions/services were purchased through iTunes?

**ANSWER**

IT costs are managed within each agency's budget and are guided by NSW Government's ICT and procurement policies and frameworks.

75. Do the Departments/agencies within your portfolio have an Android account?  
(a) What was the total expenditure in 2016-17 on Android?  
i. What applications/subscriptions/services were purchased through Android?

**ANSWER**

IT costs are managed within each agency's budget and are guided by NSW Government's ICT and procurement policies and frameworks.

**Websites Visited**

76. What were the top 20 most utilised (by data sent and received) unique domain names accessed by your Ministerial office this year?

**ANSWER**

The configuration of the Ministers' IT network infrastructure by our third party service providers does not allow the determination of such data.

77. What were the top 20 most accessed (by number of times accessed) unique domain names accessed by your Ministerial office this year?

**ANSWER**

The configuration of the Ministers' IT network infrastructure by our third party service providers does not allow the determination of such data.

**Merchant fees**

78. Please provide a list of all transactions where customers need to pay a merchant fee on credit and/or debit card payments in your Department/agency.

**ANSWER**

All NSW Government agencies are required to impose surcharges to recoup their merchant interchange fees, pursuant to Treasury Circular TC12/13. Agencies do not accept payment for goods and services, so we do not impose merchant fees on our customers.

Agency staff only use their Pcards for the purchase of goods and services for official business purposes. If particular vendors elect to impose a merchant fee on card

transactions, that is an unavoidable cost of doing business. It would not be possible to determine fees charges to Departmental cards, as these would either be embedded in the individual transaction cost, or if separately disclosed would require each monthly card statement for each user to be reviewed.

79. Please provide the percentage and/or amount of the merchant fees applied to all credit and/or debit card payments/transactions in your Department/agency.

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q78.

80. What was the total amount paid in merchant fees on credit and/or debit card payments in your Department/agency in 2016-17?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q78.

**Probity Auditor**

81. Has your office or department used a Probity Auditor or Probity Advisors, or similar, in the past five years? If so please list the company and/or individual, the project, the engagement dates, and their total remuneration in tabular format."

**ANSWER**

In accordance with the NSW Procurement Board's Direction (PBD-2013-05), DPC has internal mechanisms in place to ensure that probity considerations are routinely taken into account in its procurement decisions, and the use of external probity advisers and auditors is the exception rather than the rule.

For TAFE NSW:

Program	Company	Engagement dates	Total value
Student Management Services Program	O'Connor Marsden	July 2016 – June 2017	\$45,960

**Newcastle V8 Supercar Race – funding**

82. What NSW government funds are being provided to construct the Newcastle 500 racetrack and its related infrastructure?  
(a) How much is the contribution from Newcastle City Council?  
(b) How much is the contribution from Supercars?

**ANSWER**

The total cost of the Newcastle 500 to the NSW Government is commercial-in-confidence.

(a) Questions regarding the contribution from Newcastle City Council are best directed to Council.

(b) Questions regarding the contribution from Supercars Australia are best directed to Supercars Australia.

83. Minister Andrew Constance announced \$150 million to be directed to the Newcastle CBD revitalisation. How much of this is to be used for the Newcastle 500 Supercars racetrack construction?

**ANSWER**

Questions regarding the Newcastle CBD revitalisation project should be directed to Minister Constance.

84. What is the estimated value of lost economic activity in Newcastle East precinct resulting from the Supercars event, including:

(a) loss of income to local businesses due to lost access

(b) loss of community, sporting and major events in the Foreshore Park area

(c) any other foreseen losses?

**ANSWER**

The Newcastle 500 is expected to generate over \$57 million to the NSW visitor economy over five years.

Destination NSW is a Strategic Sponsor of the FIM Newcastle International Motocross event and is aware that this event was relocated from Foreshore Park to the Newcastle Showground over the weekend of 2-3 September 2017. This event was successfully relocated by the promoter.

Relocation of other community, sporting and other events from the Foreshore Park area as a result of Newcastle 500 activities is a question best directed to Newcastle City Council.

85. Have predicted costs for the event been exceeded to date?

(a) If so, by how much and who is paying for these additional costs?

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government's contribution to the event is capped. Any cost overruns are the responsibility of Supercars Australia.

86. Did an economic assessment of the race consider costs of personnel for:

(a) Newcastle City Council

(b) NSW Health

(c) Emergency services

(d) Transport for NSW

(e) Police and Local Area Command

(f) Office of Environment and Heritage



- (g) Port Corporation
- (h) Small business owners.

**ANSWER**

Destination NSW calculates the impact of an event to the NSW visitor economy. This standard methodology was used to assess the Newcastle 500 event.

It is noted that, as with other events, event related costs for personnel from the government agencies listed are the responsibility of Supercars Australia as per standard user charges policy for the provision of Government services.

87. Will the Government commission the Auditor-General to do a pre-race estimation of costs so that the estimated costs can be compared to the post-race costs?

**ANSWER**

This is a decision for the Auditor-General.

88. Will the Government commission the Auditor-General to do a post-race assessment of the race?

**ANSWER**

This is a decision for the Auditor-General.

89. Is there a Memorandum of Understanding between Destination NSW and Newcastle City Council?
- (a) If so, will this be publicly released?
  - (b) What are the terms of this agreement?

**ANSWER**

Yes.

(a-b) The Memorandum of Understanding between Destination NSW and Newcastle City Council is commercial in confidence.

**Newcastle V8 Supercar Race – consultation**

90. How many businesses have you directly consulted on noise impacts near the race track?
- (a) How many of these have been advised there are risks if they operate on race day?

**ANSWER**

Businesses located at properties where Supercars Australia expects noise levels to be particularly high will be contacted directly by Supercars Australia.

91. How many complaints from the community and businesses have you received?
- (a) How many of these have you responded to?

**ANSWER**

A total of 131 items of correspondence have been received.

(a) My office remains committed to ensuring that we effectively engage with all community members and stakeholders who write to me in a prompt and comprehensive manner.

**Newcastle V8 Supercar Race – health impacts**

92. What is considered an acceptable noise level for businesses to continue to practice?

**ANSWER**

This question should be directed to SafeWork NSW. However, small businesses within the vicinity of the race precinct are encouraged to contact SafeWork NSW and request a free work health and safety advisory visit.

93. What is the extent of the duty of care that DNSW has to Newcastle East residents before, during and after the race?

**ANSWER**

Destination NSW's duty of care is outlined in the *Motor Racing (Sydney and Newcastle) Act 2008* and conditions of consent.

94. Given that the *Work Health and Safety Act 2011* and associated regulations are not set aside through the Motor Racing Act (2008) and its amendment in 2017, h

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q95

95. Will the noise levels expected for the race be within the limits under the *Work Health and Safety Act 2011*?

(a) What duty of care does the NSW Government and Destination NSW have with regard to potential breaches of the safe limits set down in Work Health and Safety Regulation 2017 under the *Work Health and Safety Act 2011*, to persons in the precinct who will be affected?

**ANSWER**

Potential noise levels have been assessed against the guidelines contained in the NSW Work Health and Safety (WHS) regulations.

All noise levels will fall below guideline levels with the adoption of the noise management strategies. Residents of any properties where Supercars Australia expects noise levels to be particularly high will be contacted by Supercars Australia directly.

Destination NSW's duty of care is outlined in the *Motor Racing (Sydney and Newcastle) Act 2008* and conditions of consent.

96. Regarding businesses unable to operate on the race weekend:  
(a) How many are expected to be closed?  
(b) Will they be provided compensation for their loss?

**ANSWER**

Supercars Australia Community Engagement Manager and Destination NSW Community Liaison Officer are able to take enquiries from businesses regarding operations.

As per the *Motor Racing (Sydney and Newcastle) Act 2008* and in particular sections 32 and 33, compensation is not payable by Destination NSW, Supercars Australia and other nominated parties.

97. Has a Noise Management Plan and acoustics report been developed? If so, when will this be publicly released?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q23.

**Newcastle V8 Supercar Race – heritage impacts**

98. To date, has there been any removal or damage to heritage buildings, monuments, fences, kerbs and cobblestones?

**ANSWER**

Supercars Australia has been granted a Section 60 Heritage approval and will conduct any required civil works and restorations within the terms of that approval.

99. Are the Office of Environment and Heritage (OEH) conditions of consent for the Newcastle Coal River Precinct binding?  
(a) If so, have any fines or other enforcement activity occurred?

**ANSWER**

This question should be directed to the Minister for the Environment.

100. There have been reports of contractors beginning construction 22 days before approvals were granted, is this true?  
(a) If so, why was work not halted when residents alerted OEH to this breach?

**ANSWER**

This question should be directed to the Minister for the Environment.

**Newcastle V8 Supercar Race – civil works**

101. Do the civil works involved with the construction of this racetrack involve contracts between private construction companies and Supercars?  
(a) If so, why is Supercars responsible for infrastructure construction rather than council or state government?

(b) Is Supercars being paid any fees for its role in the infrastructure construction and contractor management?

**ANSWER**

Civil works involve arrangements between private construction companies and follow the appropriate Supercars Australia procurement process. Under the *Motor Racing (Sydney and Newcastle) Act 2008*, Supercars Australia is the race promoter who can undertake works.

102. Given that there are public funds being dedicated to civil works, how has the government protected itself and its taxpayers from any commercial risks associated with the performance of these works?

(a) Are there contractual or financial guarantees?

(b) What procurement controls are being applied?

**ANSWER**

Commercial-in-confidence contractual terms are in place and procurement controls are being applied.

103. Regarding the supply of bollards, temporary fencing, rental trucks and construction plant and equipment for the civil works:

(a) Who is engaged in the contract for rental of this equipment?

(b) Is there an exclusive supply agreement with Coates Hire?

**ANSWER**

Supercars Australia, as the event owner, conducts its own contracts for the provision of goods and services to undertake civil works.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER FOR SKILLS**

**TAFE facilities and classifications**

104. In the Budget Estimates Hearings, the Minister and Managing Director said that the Dapto TAFE facility was not a Connected Learning Centre but a "TAFE access point"

(a) What exactly is a TAFE access point?

i. What is the purpose of these access points?

ii. How of these access points are there in NSW?

iii. Where are the other 'access points' located?

(b) Can you provide a list of the all the TAFE campuses in NSW, along with their classifications (e.g. Connected Learning Centre, Access Point, College)

**ANSWER**

104.

(a) i., ii., iii. – (b)

Access Points are designed to be smaller, largely self-service facilities where students and the community can access information, support and training using

TAFE computers and facilities. TAFE NSW locations can be found at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/find-campus>.

## **Stage Two Connected Learning Centres**

105. Does the Government still have plans to replace Chullora TAFE with a Connected Learning Centre?  
(a) When will this TAFE campus, or part of it, be closed?

### **ANSWER**

A list of Connected Learning Centres is publicly available at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/why-tafe-nsw/centres-of-excellence/connected-learning-centres>.

106. Does the Government still have plans to replace Epping TAFE with a Connected Learning Centre?  
(a) When will this TAFE campus, or part of it, be closed?

### **ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q105.

107. Does the Government still have plans to replace Belrose TAFE with a Connected Learning Centre?  
(a) When will this TAFE campus, or part of it, be closed?

### **ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q105.

108. Does the Government still have plans to replace Vincentia TAFE with a Connected Learning Centre?  
(a) When will this TAFE campus, or part of it, be closed?

### **ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q105.

109. Does the Government still have plans to replace Scone TAFE with a Connected Learning Centre?  
(a) When will this TAFE campus, or part of it, be closed?

### **ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q105.

110. Does the Government still have plans to replace Maclean TAFE with a Connected Learning Centre?

(a) When will this TAFE campus, or part of it, be closed?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q105.

111. Does the Government still have plans to replace Corowa TAFE with a Connected Learning Centre?

(a) When will this TAFE campus, or part of it, be closed?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q105.

112. Does the Government still have plans to replace Narrandera TAFE with a Connected Learning Centre?

(a) When will this TAFE campus, or part of it, be closed?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q105.

113. Does the Government still have plans to replace Grenfell TAFE with a Connected Learning Centre?

(a) When will this TAFE campus, or part of it, be closed?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q105.

**Private VET providers**

114. How has this affected the number of Adult English Education teachers employed in the Illawarra region by TAFE NSW?

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW is committed to delivering industry-leading training in all areas of study, including Adult English, across all regions of NSW.

115. Have the overall enrolment figures for AMEP changed since the change of provider?

**ANSWER**

Information about overall enrolment figures for the Commonwealth-funded AMEP should be directed to the Commonwealth.

**TAFE enrolments and modernisation**

116. Why do the Budget Estimates 2017/18 forecast a decline in TAFE enrolments for 2017? What is the government's goal for future enrolments, say to 2020 in TAFE? Is it continuing decline?

### **ANSWER**

The NSW Government has a vision for TAFE NSW to increase capacity to support more students in qualifications that lead to jobs and be a significant provider in regional NSW, to indigenous Australians and to people facing disadvantage.

Forecast TAFE NSW course enrolments for 2017, including an explanation of changes from the previous year is provided in NSW Budget Paper No.3 2017-18, page 6-12. While the Commonwealth Government plans to further increase availability of funding to universities, and universities increase diploma-level courses, there will be further pressure on the TAFE system.

117. What is the cost of the TAFE modernisation program?

- (a) What are the main features of the programs?
- (b) How many enrolments is it predicted to produce?
- (c) What consultancy firms have been or are involved with the TAFE modernisation program?
  - i. What is their expertise in vocation and educational training?

### **ANSWER**

To ensure TAFE NSW remains a sustainable and commercial education business in a competitive and rapidly changing environment, the One TAFE strategy is expected to lead to significant cost-savings.

(a) The Modernisation Portfolio will establish the new One TAFE Operating Model comprising of TAFE Digital, five delivery regions, nine SkillsPoints and a single corporate office replacing 10 Institute corporate offices distributed across the state. One TAFE envisages a new, streamlined and standardised organisational structure outside of the Department of Education, consolidating back-office resources including replacing enrolment and student management systems, removing competition between institutes and focusing on providing accessible training in all NSW regions.

(b) The Modernisation Portfolio will establish TAFE NSW SkillsPoints which, despite increased completion from the university sector, is predicted to see an increase in demand for courses through innovative course development and industry collaboration.

(c) Information in relation to the engagement of consultants by TAFE NSW is included in the TAFE NSW Annual Report.

- i. All appointments of consultancy services were undertaken in accordance with NSW Government procurement policy requirements

### **Consultants and TAFE**

118. What is the estimated budget cost for the work of the consultancy firms?

### **ANSWER**

Financial statements, including expenditure on consultants, are available in the TAFE NSW Annual Report.

119. How many consultants are currently employed by TAFE NSW across all programs?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q118.

120. What is the total cost of all consultants employed by TAFE NSW?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q118.

**TAFE employees**

121. Budget Estimates 2017/18 (p6-12) indicate a decline in TAFE employees to 9,969 for 2017/18.

(a) Can the Minister provide a breakdown of TAFE positions:

i. Teaching, non-teaching and consultants for 2017 and their regional location?

(b) How does the budget allocation for skills development for employment of \$2.076 billion in Budget Estimates 2017/18 (p6-5) representing an increase of 1.6% with an average annual growth of 1.2% (from Budget Statement 2017/18 p5-16) compare with other states and territories?

(c) There is a 96.5% increase in capital expenditure from \$66.7 million in 2016/17 to \$131 million in 2017/18 for skills development for employment.

Could the Minister provide details of the key elements of this modest projected increase in capital expenditure from its very low base?

(d) Given the capital assets in TAFE NSW distributed throughout the state, can the Minister outline the number and location of buildings currently not in use?

(e) Is there a capital asset divestment plan for TAFE NSW? Could the Minister table details of this plan?

**ANSWER**

(a)

(i) No. The figure of 9,969 is a calculation of full time equivalent (FTE) employees for 2017-18. It is not a calculation based on the specific identification of persons or positions but rather the number of FTE staff, based on a macro calculation of the total salary budget dividend by the average salary amount.

(b) A comparison of NSW's estimated expenditure in 2017-18 for skills development for employment with other States and Territories is not available because of differences in how State and Territories present information in their budget papers.

(c) The list of new works and works in progress for the TAFE Commission is provided by NSW Budget Paper 2, Infrastructure Statement 2017-18, pages 5-22 to 5-24.

(d) and (e) TAFE NSW ensures the most effective and efficient use of its assets. Divestments will only occur at sites that are underused, vacant, not fit-for-purpose or unjustifiably expensive and the proceeds will be reinvested into modernising and improving TAFE NSW facilities and learning platforms for the benefit of students. TAFE NSW regularly assesses its facility requirements in line with course delivery to ensure that the needs of students, employers and the local community are met.

**Training for Refugees under Smart and Skilled**

122. How many students holding humanitarian visas have applied for fee-free scholarships under Smart and Skilled since 1 January 2017?

**ANSWER**



This question should be directed to the Minister for Skills who is responsible for Smart and Skilled.

123. How many students have accessed fee-free training under Smart and Skilled for qualifications up to Cert IV level since 1 January 2017?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q122.

124. How many students who are deemed asylum seekers have been eligible and applied for subsidised training in higher level qualifications under Smart and Skilled (as is the case for refugees) since 1 January 2017?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q122.

**Dapto TAFE**

125. How much rent is being collected at the former Dapto TAFE site?

**ANSWER**

Commencing Rental is \$97,000 per annum (excluding GST). The total value of the Licence Agreement over the 3-year term is \$302,795 (excluding GST).

126. How much did TAFE invest into the Dapto Connected Learning Centre?

**ANSWER**

There is no Connected Learning Centre in Dapto.

127. Is it true that students are unable to use the toilets at the Dapto connected learning centre?

**ANSWER**

No.

**TAFE**

128. What TAFE assets were recycled in the 16-17 financial year?

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW divested a site at Granville (South Street) and a site at Katoomba (Gang Gang Street) in the 16-17 financial year. The sale proceeds are being reinvested into modernising and improving TAFE NSW facilities and learning platforms for the benefit of students.

129. How many TAFE buildings have been leased since coming to government and how much rent has that generated?

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW manages its property portfolio in accordance with relevant NSW Government policy and the Technical and Further Education Commission Act 1990 (NSW).

### **Wollongong TAFE (Appendix B)**

130. Does West Wollongong TAFE offer courses in butchery?

#### **ANSWER**

Yes.

131. In which year did West Wollongong TAFE commence providing these courses?

#### **ANSWER**

Wollongong West Campus has provided butchery courses over an extended period of time. The most recent courses being conducted are from the Australian Meat Industry Training Package (MTM11) which commenced in 2011 and the Australian Meat Processing Training Package (AMP) in 2016.

132. How many students were enrolled in butchery courses at West Wollongong TAFE in (i) 2015, (ii) 2016 and (iii) 2017?

#### **ANSWER**

TAFE NSW operates in a competitive environment. Disaggregated data is not provided. TAFE NSW does provide enrolment data as part of its annual reporting.

133. Does the TAFE supply meat products needed for butchery students to train with?

#### **ANSWER**

Yes.

134. How much did West Wollongong TAFE spend on meat products in (i) 2015, (ii) 2016 and (iii) 2017?

#### **ANSWER**

2015 – \$15,835.48

2016 – \$15,939.24

2017 – Total payments for meat in 2017 will be known at the end of the current financial year.

135. Which companies supply meat products for West Wollongong TAFE?

#### **ANSWER**

Meat products are supplied by a Wollongong-based retailer.

136. How often are meat products purchased for use by students?

**ANSWER**

Meat products are purchased on an as-needs basis.

137. On what date were the meat products used in the Illawarra Mercury photograph in the article titled "Union 'cooked up' meat claims" (Illawarra Mercury, 24 August 2016) purchased?

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW encountered difficulties in its attempts to reconcile with certainty the specific small meat purchase in question against the relevant 2016 purchase order.

138. How much did the meat products that appeared in the Illawarra Mercury on 24 August 2016 cost?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q137.

139. Were other meat products purchased as part of the same order as those which appeared in the Illawarra Mercury on 24 August 2016?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q137.

140. When were these meat products which appeared in the Illawarra Mercury on 24 August 2016 used by students engaged in butchery training?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q137.

141. Does TAFE train its butchery students in the appropriate hygiene techniques for working with meat products?

**ANSWER**

Yes.

142. Does this training include reminders about the use of protective clothing when near or handling meat products?

**ANSWER**

Yes.

**Hunter TAFE**

143. Noting that enrolments in Hunter TAFE have dropped from 64,403 in 2012 to under 25 000 last year, what are the enrolment numbers for Hunter TAFE in 2017?

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW 2017 final enrolments will be available in mid-2018 after the release of national VET data by the National Centre for Vocational Education Research (NCVER).

144. Why have the enrolment numbers dropped by over 35000 students since 2012?

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW does not comment on enrolment figures by RTO.

145. As the Minister for Skills are you alarmed about the massive drop in enrolment numbers?

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW enrolments in 2016 were 543,309. As at August 2017, TAFE NSW data shows Smart and Skilled entitlement enrolments have increased by almost 25 per cent compared with the same time last year, with growth particularly strong in Certificate III courses.

**Granville TAFE (Appendix A)**

146. Granville TAFE used to be one of the largest in the state and has suffered cuts to courses and student numbers and sale of property

- (a) Minister, how many students from the cancelled Granville TAFE welding course transferred to the other welding courses at Mt Druitt and Campbelltown?
- (b) What was the sale price of Granville TAFE's South Street buildings which were described as "Premier Mixed-Use Development Site with Significant value-add potential".

**ANSWER**

- (a) I am advised that all but three students continued to study with TAFE NSW.
- (b) Information about the disposal of land is reported in the TAFE NSW Annual Report.

**Smart and Skilled**

147. How many private providers are operating on TAFE campuses? Where are they operating?

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW manages its facilities to ensure business requirements are met. A number of organisations operate from TAFE NSW locations under third party agreements, including Government bodies, community groups and the private sector.

148. What percentage of Smart and Skilled funding goes towards administration costs?

**ANSWER**

This question should be directed to the Minister for Skills who is responsible for Smart and Skilled.

149. Isn't it true under Smart and Skilled that students are charged to re-sit a unit of competency if they fail in the first instance?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q148.

150. This being the case, how much of this was collected in 16-17 from students resitting units of competency?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q148.

151. Can you confirm Smart and Skilled audits were conducted in March this year?  
(a) If so, why haven't these audits been released?  
(b) When will they be released?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q148.

**One TAFE**

152. I note that the latest stage of the roll out of "One TAFE" is a formal consultation process to align core training and educational capabilities with the new operating model. Is the current fee structure something that will be reviewed as part of this process? Will this consultation process result in campus closures?

**ANSWER**

No.

153. TAFE NSW has marked the dissolution of autonomous institutes around NSW as "a significant milestone". This has resulted in the creation of new regions – Belmont TAFE is now part of the North Region, which runs from Gosford up to the QLD border. Did the Minister consider accessibility for students when deciding to re-draw these boundaries?

**ANSWER**

Regional boundaries under the One TAFE operating model do not impact on student accessibility to training and or services. The One TAFE operating model ensures students across NSW access to standardised courses (unlike under the previous model) so as to ensure TAFE's training provides the best preparation for employment and meets the requirements of business

154. With such large boundaries, does the Minister consider it feasible to marry up skills with jobs available?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q153.

155. Will Belmont TAFE continue to offer face to face courses under the “One TAFE” model?

**ANSWER**

Yes.

156. I note that the Managing Director indicates that jobs will be affected by this restructure. How many of those jobs will be at Belmont TAFE?

**ANSWER**

Consideration is currently being given to the 4,000+ separate pieces of feedback received during consultation on the proposed structures. As such, the net impact on any particular location is not yet known.

157. The Managing Director notes that TAFE’s priority is delivering quality education and training. How does the Government intend to deliver on that priority after axing so many jobs, and losing so many students?

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW will deliver quality education through the reduction of duplication in administration roles and greater investment in teaching resources at the frontline.

158. I note that TAFE has refocused its energy into serving “customers” as opposed to students. Does this re-classifying as a customer, rather than a student mean that the focus is on profiteering as opposed to educating, and does the Minister acknowledge this may undermine employers’ confidence in the skills of workers?

**ANSWER**

No.

159. One of the senior positions in the new One TAFE management structure is “Manager Ideation” which is described as “leading a team specialising in idea management in products, capability, services, processes and paradigmatic models.” What does this mean in plain language?

**ANSWER**

The primary function of this role is to identify and leverage future education and training opportunities for TAFE NSW.

160. Can you supply an organisational chart for One TAFE showing all management positions and their relation to each other and the various segments of TAFE?

**ANSWER**

Details on the TAFE NSW structure under One TAFE NSW are available online at <https://www.tafensw.edu.au/about-tafensw>.

161. Can you supply detailed job descriptions for each management position in the One TAFE structure?

**ANSWER**

In relation to the Managing Director's job description, refer to section 14 of the *Technical and Further Education Commission Act 1990* (NSW).

The Chief Operating Officer is a key strategic leader and advisor reporting directly to the Managing Director. The role is responsible for enhancing the organisation's performance across key support areas, including the \$6 billion plus property portfolio and logistics.

The Chief Financial Officer is responsible for the provision of specialist financial services and business development to support the Board, Managing Director and Executive Leadership Team in meeting and satisfying its legislative, governance and regulatory requirements.

The Chief Information Officer provides vision and leadership for developing and assisting in the implementation of information technology initiatives that align with the business strategy and objectives. The role supports the planning and implementation of organisationally aligned ICT strategies and systems to enable the business process owners to improve operational effectiveness, service quality and maximise returns from ICT investments.

The Chief Education and Training Officer is the senior executive responsible for providing a systematic, consistent, TAFE NSW-wide approach to the provision of high-quality teaching and learning outcomes at all levels of coursework. The role requires leadership of TAFE NSW's teaching and learning strategies to ensure that training and academic requirements are at the forefront of technology and new and emerging employment opportunities.

Regional General Managers are responsible for managing TAFE NSW activities in the designated region by leading a cohesive, commercially-astute and customer-focused business team and engaging with business, stakeholders, community and customers to grow the regional economy and create thriving communities.

The General Manager People and Safety is responsible for leading the management and development of people and safety policies and procedures by providing guidance and resources on people expectations, procedures, industrial relations and safety matters to ensure the effective delivery TAFE NSW's services, in accordance with the agency's budget.

162. Were outside consultants involved in developing this organisational chart and coming up with job titles?

**ANSWER**

No.

163. What examples of international best practice in vocational education were consulted in developing this organisational structure?

**ANSWER**

TAFE NSW considered best-practice models from New Zealand, Germany, Finland, UK, and Canada.

## **Enrolments**

164. What is the percentage of TAFE NSW enrolments in skill sets rather than qualifications for young people with no previous qualification?

### **ANSWER**

The answer to this question would be subject to clarification of terminology used in the question.

165. Why do the Budget Estimates 2017/18 forecast a decline in TAFE enrolments for 2017?

### **ANSWER**

Forecast TAFE NSW course enrolments, including an explanation of changes from the previous year is provided in NSW Budget Paper No.3 2017-18, page 6-12.

166. What is the government's goal for future enrolments?

### **ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q165.

167. Where does the Government anticipate TAFE enrolments will be by 2020?

### **ANSWER**

Forecast TAFE NSW course enrolments is provided in NSW Budget Paper No.3 2017-18, page 6-12. Further, TAFE NSW forecasts an increase in future enrolments as, despite increased completion from the university sector, as result of innovative course development and industry collaboration

168. Why does the 2016 TAFE annual report omit any mention of the number of hours of training actually provided to TAFE students in that year, figures which have been previously included in annual reports?

### **ANSWER**

TAFE NSW Annual Report is prepared in accordance with legislative requirements.

169. How many Indigenous students are enrolled in TAFE? Is this number fewer than in 2012?

### **ANSWER**

TAFE NSW enrolment figures, including enrolments of Indigenous students, are available in NSW Budget Paper No.3 2017-18, page 6-12.

170. In 2012, TAFE enrolled more than 141,000 unemployed students, are you concerned that only 97,000 unemployed students are enrolled this year?

### **ANSWER**



The NSW Government has a vision for TAFE NSW to increase capacity to support more students in qualifications that lead to jobs and be a significant provider in regional NSW, to indigenous Australians and to people facing disadvantage. I am advised 2012 approximately 24 per cent of TAFE students identified as being unemployed this compares to 23 per cent in 2016. The unemployment rate in NSW decreased from 5.2 per cent in July 2012 to 5.0 per cent in July 2017.

171. Are you concerned there were only 161,000 students enrolled in TAFE from rural and regional NSW, compared to 225,000 students from rural and regional enrolled in a VET course NSW in 2011?

**ANSWER**

The NSW Government has a vision for TAFE NSW to increase capacity to support more students in qualifications that lead to jobs and be a significant provider in regional NSW, to indigenous Australians and to people facing disadvantage. I am advised that the percentage of students from rural and regional has remained relatively stable since 2011; approximately 37 percent of TAFE NSW students were from rural and regional NSW in 2011 compared to 36 per cent in 2016.

172. Why has the government cut apprenticeship funding for commercial cookery from \$10,480 to \$9,540, which is a cut of \$940 per student?

**ANSWER**

This question should be directed to the Minister for Skills who is responsible for Smart and Skilled.

**TAFE corporate (Appendix C)**

173. What is the estimated budget cost for the work of consultants and consultancy firms?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q118.

174. How many consultants are currently employed by TAFE NSW across all programs?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q118.

175. What is the total cost of all consultants employed by TAFE NSW? What is their salary range and average salary?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q118.

## **ANSWERS**

See responses Q35 – 47

## **Hospitality**

190. How much did your Department/agency spend on hospitality, including catering and beverages, in 2016-17?

## **ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q49.

## **Labour Hire Firms**

191. Do any Departments/agencies within your portfolio responsibilities utilise the services of Labour Hire Firms? If yes, please advise in table form for 2016-17:

- (a) The names of the firms utilised
- (b) The total amount paid to each firm engaged
- (c) The average tenure period for an employee provided by a labour hire company
- (d) The longest tenure for an employee provided by a labour hire company
- (e) The duties conducted by employees engaged through a labour hire company
- (f) The office locations of employees engaged through a labour hire company
- (g) The highest hourly or daily rate paid to an employee provided by a labour hire company

## **ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q50.

## **Media and Public Relations**

192. How many media or public relations advisers are employed for each of your portfolio agencies and what is the total cost to employ these advisers?

## **ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q51.

193. What is the forecast for the current financial year for the number of media or public relations advisers to be employed and their total cost?

## **ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q52.

194. What is the total cost of media monitoring services used by Departments/agencies within your portfolio responsibilities?

## **ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q53.

195. By how much has the number of media or public relations advisers employed for each of your portfolio agencies increased since 2011-12 to the current date?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q54.

196. By how much has the expenditure on media or public relations advisers employed for each of your portfolio agencies increased since 2011-12 to the current date?

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q55.

**Facebook**

Q198

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q57

199. How much did your Department/agency spend on Facebook advertising or sponsored posts in 2016-17?

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q58

**Overseas Trips**

Q200 – 201

**ANSWERS**

Refer to answer to Q59 - 60

**Department/Agency Travel**

202. What was the total expenditure in 2016-17 by Departments/agencies within your portfolio on:

- (a) Taxi hire
- (b) Limousine/private car hire
- (c) Hire car rental
- (d) Ridesharing services

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q61.

203. Do any senior executive service employees in your Departments/agencies have a driver that is paid for by the Departments/agencies? If so, what is the number of senior executive service employees that have a driver and which senior executive service employees have a driver?

- (a) How much was spent on these drivers in 2016-17?

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q62.

**Consulting**

204. How much did the Department/agencies under your portfolio responsibility spend in legal costs in 2016-17?  
(a) For what specific purposes or matters was legal advice sought?

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q63.

205. Have Department/agencies under your portfolio engaged any consultants to provide the following services or advice in 2016-17:  
(a) Social media  
i. And the cost of these services  
(b) Photography  
i. And the cost of these services  
(c) Acting training  
i. And the cost of these services  
(d) Ergonomics  
i. And the cost of these services

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q64.

**Department/Agency Staffing**

206. What was the number of senior executive service employees employed by Departments/agencies within your portfolio in 2016-17?  
(a) How much was this number in 2011-12?

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q65.

207. What was the expenditure on senior executive service employees employed by Departments/agencies within your portfolio in 2016-17?  
(a) How much was this number in 2011-12?

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q66.

208. What was the number of internal legal counsel employees employed by Departments/agencies within your portfolio in 2016-17?  
(a) How much was this number in 2011-12?

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q67.

209. What was the expenditure on internal legal counsel employees employed by Departments/agencies within your portfolio in 2016-17?  
(a) How much was this number in 2011-12?

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q68.

210. How many redundancies were processed by Departments/agencies within your portfolio responsibilities during 2016-17?  
(a) Of these redundancies, how many were:  
i. Voluntary  
ii. Forced  
(b) What was the total cost of all redundancies?

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q69.

211. Have any staff who received a redundancy in the last two years undertaken any paid work or provided any paid services for the agency with which they were formerly employed?  
(a) What was the nature of these works/services?  
(b) What was the total cost of these works or services?

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q70.

212. Are any staff formerly employed by your ministerial office now employed by Departments/agencies under your portfolio responsibility?

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q71.

213. How many staff were dismissed from Departments/agencies under your portfolio responsibilities in 2016-17?  
(a) What were the reason/s for each dismissal?

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q72.

214. What was the total amount your Departments/agencies spent on stationery?

**ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q73.

## **Smart Phone Accounts**

215. Do the Departments/agencies within your portfolio have an iTunes account?  
(a) What was the total expenditure in 2016-17 on iTunes?  
i. What applications/subscriptions/services were purchased through iTunes?

### **ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q74.

216. Do the Departments/agencies within your portfolio have an Android account?  
(a) What was the total expenditure in 2016-17 on Android?  
i. What applications/subscriptions/services were purchased through Android?

### **ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q75.

## **Websites Visited**

Q217 – 218

### **ANSWERS**

See responses Q76 - 77

## **Merchant fees**

219. Please provide a list of all transactions where customers need to pay a merchant fee on credit and/or debit card payments in your Department/agency.

### **ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q78.

220. Please provide the percentage and/or amount of the merchant fees applied to all credit and/or debit card payments/transactions in your Department/agency.

### **ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q79.

221. What was the total amount paid in merchant fees on credit and/or debit card payments in your Department/agency in 2016-17?

### **ANSWER**

Refer to the answer to Q80.

**Probity Auditor**

222. Has your office or department used a Probity Auditor or Probity Advisors, or similar, in the past five years? If so please list the company and/or individual, the project, the engagement dates, and their total remuneration in tabular format.

**ANSWER**

Refer to answer to Q81

**END**