Inclusion of Donor details on the Register of Births (Inquiry) LPCLR: Responses to Questions on Notice

1. Is there any legislative basis for regarding the interests of the child or donor-conceived person as greater than the interests of other parties?

Article 3(1) of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, to which Australia is a signatory, states that:

"In all actions concerning children, whether undertaken by public or private social welfare institutions, courts of law, administrative authorities or legislative bodies, the best interests of the child shall be a primary consideration."

Whilst the Convention is not binding in domestic law, this principle has been incorporated in several areas of domestic legislation, for example:

- Section 60CA of the Family Law Act 1975 (Cth) states that "[i]n deciding whether to make a particular parenting order in relation to a child, a court must regard the best interests of the child as the paramount consideration." This is so even where the Court makes a parenting order with the consent of the parties¹. Similarly, the Court must regard the best interests of the child as the paramount consideration when considering whether to make a variety of other orders under that Act, such as recovery orders (s67V) and welfare orders (s67ZC);
- The Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act 1998 provides the statutory framework for the child protection system in NSW. Section 9 of the Act provides that "[t]his Act is to be administered under the principle that, in any action or decision concerning a particular child or young person, the safety, welfare and well-being of the child or young person are paramount";
- Section 8 of the Adoption Act 2000 states "[i]n making a decision about the adoption of a child, a decision maker is to have regard (as far as is practicable or appropriate) to the following principles: (a) the best interests of the child, both in childhood and in later life, must be the paramount consideration...";
- Section 3 of the Surrogacy Act 2010 states that "[t]his Act is to be administered by reference to the principle that, in relation to any surrogacy arrangement, the best interests of the child of the surrogacy arrangement are paramount";
- The Child Protection (International Measures) Act 2006 implements the Hague (Child Protection) Convention² in NSW. Section 3 states that an object of the Act is to recognise that "a child's best interests are a primary consideration in relation to a measure for protecting the person of the child or a measure for protecting the child's property"; and
- The Children (Education and Care Services) National Law (NSW) lays the legislative foundation for nationally consistent standards to ensure quality education and care is provided by long day care, family day care, preschool and outside school hours care services. Section 3(3) of that Act states that "[t]he

Reid v Lynch (2010) 44 Fam LR 141: [2010] FamCAFC 184; BC201050893 at [212]-[213].

² The Hague Convention on Jurisdiction, Applicable Law, Recognition, Enforcement and Co-operation in respect of Parental Responsibility and Measures for the Protection of Children.

- guiding principles of the national education and care services quality framework are as follows— (a) that the rights and best interests of the child are paramount;...".
- 2. Does LPCLR have a position on whether a donor conceived child should be provided with information that identifies their donor prior to a prescribed age in certain circumstances, such where there is a medical need or the child is sufficiently mature?

LPCLR does not wish to pre-empt the findings of the Committee, and therefore does not have a formal position on whether information that identifies a donor should be provided to donor-conceived children prior to a prescribed age.

Jurisdictions in Australia that have established Assisted Reproductive Technology Registers differ in relation to when a donor-conceived child may access this information. This information is summarised in the table at Annexure A³.

³ This table is prepared on the basis of the prospective operation of the relevant legislation. In all relevant jurisdictions the legislation has a limited retrospective effect (generally on the basis of information voluntarily provided).

Annexure A: Access to information identifying donor

A child cannot acce parent of a child c necessary to save psychological health way. If based on expertise in mental b A child can access i (i) If the child's pa (ii) A counsellor ha child is sufficier A parent can access In all cases donor counselling When consent of all identifying informati their behalf ⁸ . Appro	State	Legislation	Age	Circumstances allowing access to information identifying donor prior to prescribed age
Assisted Reproductive Reproductive Technology Act 2007 (NSW) Is Assisted Treatment Act 2008 Treatment (Vic) Technology Reproductive (Vic) Technology Reproductive Technology Act 1991 Technology Reproductive Technology Act 1991 Technology Reproductive Technology Act 1991 Technology Reproductive Technology Technology Reproductive Technology Technology Reproductive Technology Technology Reproductive Technology Technology WMA Act 1991 Technology Technol			child	
Reproductive parent of a child c Technology Act 2007 (NSW) Assisted Assisted Treatment Act 2008 (i) If the child's part (ii) A counsellor had (iii) A counsellor had (iii) A parent can access in the child's part (iii) A counsellor had (ivic) Act 2008 Act 2009 Act 2008 Act 2009 Act 1991	NSW	Assisted	18	A child cannot access identifying information about their donor prior to turning 18, however the legal
Technology Act 2007 (NSW) (NSW) Assisted Assisted Treatment Act 2008 (Vic) Human Act 2008 Aparent can access in the child's particier (Vic) Aparent can access in the child's particier (Vic) Aparent can access in all cases donor counselling Counselling Technology Act 1991 (NSW)		Reproductive		parent of a child can access such information if the disclosure of that information is reasonably
Act2007psychological health(NSW)way. If based onAssisted18A child can access isReproductive(i) If the child's paTreatment(ii) A counsellor hisAct2008A parent can access(Vic)A parent can accessnHuman16When consent of allaReproductiveidentifying informatiTechnologytheir behalf*. Appro(WA)		Technology		necessary to save the life of the child or to prevent serious damage to the child's physical or
(NSW) Assisted Assisted Reproductive Treatment Act 2008 (Vic) Human Act 1991 Assisted Achild can access is the child's parameter (i) If the child's parameter (ii) A counsellor has child is sufficiented (iii) A counsellor has child is sufficiented (ivic) Act 2008 Aparent can access in mental by the child's parameter (ivic) Aparent can access in mental by the child is sufficiented (ivic) Aparent can access in mental by the child's parameter (ivic) Aparent can access in mental by the child's parameter (ivic) Act 2008 Aparent can access in mental by the child's parameter (ivic) Act 2008 Aparent can access in mental by the child's parameter (ivic) Aparent can access in a child's parameter (ivic) Aparent can access in				psychological health, and the information cannot reasonably be obtained by the parent in any other
Assisted Assisted Reproductive Treatment Act 2008 (Vic) Human Reproductive (i) If the child's pa (ii) A counsellor ha child is sufficien child is sufficien A parent can access In all cases donor counselling ⁷ When consent of all identifying informatia their behalf ⁸ . Appro		(NSN)		way. If based on psychological grounds a certificate from a registered medical practitioner with
Assisted 18 A child can access is Reproductive (i) If the child's parament 2008 (ii) A counsellor has child is sufficient (Vic) A parent can access In all cases donor counselling counselling Technology (WA)				
Reproductive (i) If the child's pa Treatment (ii) A counsellor hat child is sufficient (Vic) (Vic) A parent can access In all cases donor counselling counselling deproductive (When consent of all their behalf. Approductive (WA)	Victoria	Assisted	18	A child can access identifying information about their donor prior to turning 18 if:
Treatment Act 2008 (Vic) (Vic) Human Reproductive Technology Act 1991 (ii) A counsellor ha child is sufficier A parent can access In all cases donor counselling ⁷ A parent can access In all cases donor counselling ⁷ (When consent of all identifying information and counselling inf		Reproductive		(i) If the child's parent or guardian has consented to the making of the application; or
Act2008child is sufficier(Vic)A parent can accessIn all cases donor counsellingHuman16When consent of all identifying information their behalfs. ApproactTechnologytheir behalfs. ApproactAct1991(WA)		Treatment		
(Vic) A parent can access ln all cases donor counselling? Human 16 When consent of all reproductive identifying information and their behalfs. Approximately (WA)				child is sufficiently mature to understand the consequences of the disclosure
Human 16 When conselling 7 Counselling 7 Counselling 7 Counselling 7 Counselling 7 I 6 When consent of all identifying information and their behalf 8. Approved their behalf 9. Approved (WA)		(Vic)		A parent can access donor identifying information if the donor consents ⁶ .
Human 16 When consent of all Reproductive identifying information Act 1991 (WA)				In all cases donor identifying information may only be disclosed if the applicant has received
Human 16 When consent of all Reproductive identifying information Technology their behalf ⁸ . Approduct Act 1991 (WA)				
Reproductive Technology Act 1991 (WA)	Western	Human	16	When consent of all parties is obtained. A child under the age of 16 cannot consent to the release of
nology 1991	Australia	Reproductive		identifying information - although a parent or a person with parental responsibility could consent on
		Technology		their behalf ⁸ . Approved counselling must be undertaken before the release of identifying information.
(WA)				
		(WA)		

⁴ Assisted Reproductive Technology Act 2007 (NSW), section 38. An 'appropriate person' may obtain this information in lieu of the parent in certain circumstances. ⁵ Assisted Reproductive Treatment Act 2008 (Vic), section 58.
⁶ Assisted Reproductive Treatment Act 2008 (Vic), section 61.
⁷ Assisted Reproductive Treatment Act 2008 (Vic), section 61.
⁸ Human Reproductive Technology Act 1991 (WA), section 49.