



LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

**QUESTIONS  
AND  
ANSWERS**

No. 136

WEDNESDAY 22 NOVEMBER 2017

(The Questions and Answers Paper published for the first sitting day in each week will contain, by number and title, all unanswered questions, together with questions to which answers have been received on the previous sitting and any new questions. On subsequent days, new questions are printed, as are questions to which answers were received the previous day. Consequently the full text of any question will be printed only twice: when notice is given; and, when answered.)

Notice given on date shown

<b>Publication of Questions</b>	<b>Answer to be lodged by</b>
Q & A No. 130 (Including Question Nos 1828 to 1840)	22 November 2017
Q & A No. 131 (Including Question Nos 1841 to 1843)	23 November 2017
Q & A No. 132 (Including Question Nos 1844 to 1844)	06 December 2017
Q & A No. 132 (Including Question Nos 1845 to 1865)	19 December 2017
Q & A No. 133 (Including Question Nos 1866 to 1876)	20 December 2017
Q & A No. 134 (Including Question Nos 1877 to 1885)	21 December 2017
Q & A No. 135 (Including Question Nos 1886 to 1909)	26 December 2017
Q & A No. 136 (Including Question Nos 1910 to 1926)	27 December 2017

**18 OCTOBER 2017**

(Paper No. 130)

\*1828 TRANSPORT AND INFRASTRUCTURE—NEXT GENERATION INFRASTRUCTURE SERVICES (NGIS) PROJECT—Dr Faruqi asked the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Minister for Transport and Infrastructure—

- (1) Will the original project budget of \$425 million that was stated in the business case for the Next Generation Infrastructure Services (NGIS) project remain as \$425 million by the time this project is completed?
  - (a) If not, what will be the final cost to complete the full remaining scope of the project?
  - (b) Have any further requests for funding been made for the NGIS project?
- (2) Will the original budget of \$425 million deliver the full scope as set out in the original business case?
  - (a) If not, please provide details of what has been left out of the original scope.
  - (b) If not, please provide details of what was added on to the original scope.
- (3) What is the current spend to date on the NGIS project?
- (4) Please provide a breakdown of the contingency budget spend to date, and how much of this is still remaining.
- (5) Answers previously provided on 29 June 2017 state that the project is due for completion in late 2018. Is this later than the delivery date originally planned for this project?
- (6) What is the name of the appointed assurance partner for this project?

Answer—

I am advised:

- (1) to (5) Information above and beyond that provided in response to LC 1604 is available on the Transport for NSW website.
- (6) Frazer Walker

\*1829 FAMILY AND COMMUNITY SERVICES—WOMEN'S REFUGES—Dr Faruqi asked the Minister for Early Childhood Education, Minister for Aboriginal Affairs, Assistant Minister for Education representing the Minister for Family and Community Services, Minister for Social Housing, and Minister for the Prevention of Domestic Violence and Sexual Assault—

- (1) Has the Minister received any complaints or concerns, written or otherwise, about women's refuges being unable to or unwilling to accept women who are unable to make financial contributions towards their stay?
- (2) Are there any refuges in New South Wales that have adopted a policy of turning away women who are unable to make financial contributions towards their stay?
- (3) Are women who are on visas that do not allow them to qualify for Centrelink payments being rejected by some refuges because they are unable to make payments towards their accommodation?
  - (a) If yes, what is the Minister doing to resolve this issue?
  - (b) Has the Minister made representations to the Federal Government about this issue?
    - (i) If not, why not?
    - (ii) If yes, what has been the Federal Government's response?
- (4) How many refuges in New South Wales accept women who are unable to make financial contributions 100 per cent of the time?
  - (a) How many refuges in New South Wales have ever turned women away because they do not have a residency visa status and/or cannot make financial contributions?
    - (i) How many women have been turned away since 2014?

Answer—

I am advised that Specialist Homelessness Services providers actively assist women to access benefits for

which they are eligible.

If you have examples of women who are unable to make a financial contribution being turned away from FACS funded refuges please bring them to my attention.

Information on Specialist Homelessness Services is available on the FACS website at: [www.facs.nsw.gov.au](http://www.facs.nsw.gov.au).

The Australian Institute of Health and Welfare (AIHW) reports on the clients of specialist homelessness services. Information on the clients of specialist homelessness services is available on the AIHW's website at [www.aihw.gov.au/](http://www.aihw.gov.au/)

**\*1830 TRANSPORT AND INFRASTRUCTURE—TRANSPORT FOR NSW NEW TIMETABLE INFORMATION—**Dr Faruqi asked the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Minister for Transport and Infrastructure—

- (1) Concerns have been raised by people who use guide dogs and their caretakers about timetable changes announced only two weeks before the changes being implemented. This does not give enough time to train guide dogs. What is Transport for New South Wales' (TfNSW) plan to deal with this issue?
  - (a) Is TfNSW considering implementing any changes to their announcement schedule for new timetables in order to accommodate people who use guide dogs?
- (2) In new announcements on Sydney Trains, will passengers travelling north from Campbelltown be instructed to change at Cabramatta for a faster trip to the city?
  - (a) If yes, why are passengers being directed to change there, when it may not mean a faster trip to the city?

Answer—

I am advised:

- (1) Your assertion that concerns have been raised by people who use guide dogs about timetable changes has no basis nor provides any evidence to suggest this is the case. Indeed, it is regrettable that the member has implied that the NSW Government would not consider the needs of those with a disability, especially those who are vision impaired, as we implement that greatest uplift in services across the network in the history of NSW.

Transport for NSW has been working closely with community groups and peak organisations, including Guide Dogs Australia, seniors associations, hospitals and schools since August this year. Feedback has helped to develop the public information campaign that launched on October 15 - six weeks before timetable changes on 26 November.

Transport for NSW recently held face-to-face briefings with orientation and mobility specialists from Guide Dogs, Vision Australia and Blind Citizens and offered guided walks through key stations where there will be changes to customers' journeys.

Station staff will be out on platforms and concourses before and after the changes on 26 November to assist customers. Transport for NSW will continue stakeholder engagement to ensure customers can continue to move around the network easily and conveniently from 26 November and beyond .

- (2) No.

**\*1831 TRANSPORT AND INFRASTRUCTURE—OPAL CARD COST—**Dr Faruqi asked the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Minister for Transport and Infrastructure—

- (1) Considering the Government will now manage ticketing services on behalf of privately owned and operated ferry services, are there plans for the ferry operators to pay an amount to the Government to cover some of those costs?

Answer—

I am advised:

Your question proceeds on a false premise. Private ferry operators will continue to manage their ticketing

services.

\*1832 TRANSPORT AND INFRASTRUCTURE—SYDNEY METRO SAFETY—Dr Faruqi asked the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Minister for Transport and Infrastructure—

- (1) What is the job description of Customer Service Assistants who will be on Sydney Metro trains and stations?
  - (a) Please list the main responsibilities of these Customer Service Assistants.
- (2) Will Customer Service Assistants on Sydney Metro be a replacement for guards such as the ones currently employed by Sydney Trains?
  - (a) If not, will Sydney Metro trains have guards like Sydney Trains have at the moment?
  - (b) If yes, what sort of training will these Customer Service Assistants get?
- (3) Will Customer Service Assistants on Sydney Metro trains and stations perform any functions that are similar to guards on Sydney Trains?
  - (a) If yes, what are these functions?
- (4) How many Customer Service Assistants will be present on each Sydney Metro train at all times?
  - (a) If none, how will a situation like assault be stopped, and the victim helped?
- (5) How many Customer Service Assistants will be present after midnight on each Sydney Metro train?
  - (a) If none, how will a situation like assault be stopped, and the victim helped?
- (6) In the absence of guards, will the footage from CCTV cameras placed inside Sydney Metro trains be monitored constantly by people employed by Transport for NSW?
  - (a) If not, how will the camera footage be monitored?
  - (b) How will emergencies be handled?
- (7) How many passenger emergency help points will be on board each Sydney Metro train car?

Answer—

I am advised:

This information is publicly available on the Sydney Metro website.

\*1833 ENVIRONMENT—DRAFT INDUSTRIAL NOISE GUIDELINE—Dr Faruqi asked the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Minister for the Environment, Minister for Local Government, and Minister for Heritage—

In relation to the Minister's answers to supplementary questions 123-125 in Budget Estimates 2017-2018 Portfolio Committee No. 6 Planning and Environment:

- (1) Is the Draft Industrial Noise Guideline Technical Background paper based on the Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (UK) report Procedure for the Assessment of Low Frequency Noise Complaints?
  - (a) Did a key author of the report, Mr David Waddington, expressly state "Our Low Frequency Noise research cannot be used to justify environmental noise limits and to attempt to do so demonstrates a lack of understanding of the science and the scope of the project"?
  - (b) If so, does the Minister stand by his comments that changes to the industrial policy are based on the best available science as set out in the Draft Industrial Noise Guidelines Technical Background paper?
- (2) Is the Draft Industrial Noise Guideline Technical Background paper based on the Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (UK) report Procedure for the Assessment of Low Frequency Noise Complaints?
  - (a) Does page 3 of the UK report state that: "The procedure is intended to assist in the evaluation of existing problems. It is not intended as a means of predicting when disturbance might occur, for example in a planning situation, and would not be reliable for use as such"?

- (b) If so, does the Minister stand by his comment that changes to the industrial policy are based on the best available science as set out in the Draft Industrial Noise Guidelines Technical Background paper?
- (3) Were the EPA recommended Low Frequency Noise conditions in Hunter Valley Operations South MP 06\_0261 MOD 5 based on the DEFRA (Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (UK)) report Procedure for the Assessment of Low Frequency Noise Complaints?
  - (a) Does the UK report state that "The procedure is intended to assist in the evaluation of existing problems. It is not intended as a means of predicting when disturbance might occur, for example in a planning situation, and would not be reliable for use as such"?
  - (b) If so, on what basis were the EPA recommendations made?

Answer—

I am advised:

- (1) The Draft Industrial Noise Guideline Technical Background draws on a range of scientific research and papers. The Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs research has not been adopted as limits in the Noise Policy for Industry. The Environment Protection Authority (EPA) liaised with the lead author of the Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs low frequency noise study, Professor Andy Moorhouse of Salford University, about assessing complaints about low frequency noise.
- (2) See response to Question 1.
- (3) No. The low frequency noise conditions recommended by the EPA were based on the information provided by the proponent through the planning assessment process.

\*1834 SKILLS—JOBS FOR NEW SOUTH WALES—Mr Field asked the Minister for Primary Industries, Minister for Regional Water, Minister for Trade and Industry representing the Deputy Premier, Minister for Regional New South Wales, Minister for Skills, and Minister for Small Business—

- (1) How many projects were funded in each of the following electorates (if electorate data is not available, how many projects were funded in financial year 2016-17 for each Local Government Areas covering these electorates):
  - (a) Bega?
  - (b) South Coast?
  - (c) Kiama?
  - (d) Shellharbour?
  - (e) Wollongong?
  - (f) Tweed?
  - (g) Ballina?
  - (h) Lismore?
  - (i) Clarence ?
  - (j) Coffs Harbour?
- (2) How much money was allocated to projects that were funded in financial year 2016-17 in each of the following electorates (if electorate data is not available, how many projects were funded in each Local Government Areas covering these electorates):
  - (a) Bega?
  - (b) South Coast?
  - (c) Kiama?
  - (d) Shellharbour?
  - (e) Wollongong?
  - (f) Tweed?
  - (g) Ballina?
  - (h) Lismore?
  - (i) Clarence ?
  - (j) Coffs Harbour?

- (3) How many jobs were created as a result of projects that were funded in financial year 2016-17 in each of the following electorates (if electorate data is not available, how many projects were funded in each Local Government Areas covering these electorates):
- (a) Bega?
  - (b) South Coast?
  - (c) Kiama?
  - (d) Shellharbour?
  - (e) Wollongong?
  - (f) Tweed?
  - (g) Ballina?
  - (h) Lismore?
  - (i) Clarence ?
  - (j) Coffs Harbour?
- (4) How many people aged 15-24 were employed as a result of jobs created by projects that were funded in financial year 2016-17 in each of the following electorates (if electorate data is not available, how many projects were funded in each Local Government Areas covering these electorates):
- (a) Bega?
  - (b) South Coast?
  - (c) Kiama?
  - (d) Shellharbour?
  - (e) Wollongong?
  - (f) Tweed?
  - (g) Ballina?
  - (h) Lismore?
  - (i) Clarence ?
  - (j) Coffs Harbour?
- (5) How many programs are currently funded, in the electorates of:
- (a) Bega?
  - (b) South Coast?
  - (c) Kiama?
  - (d) Shellharbour?
  - (e) Wollongong?
  - (f) Tweed?
  - (g) Ballina?
  - (h) Lismore?
  - (i) Clarence ?
  - (j) Coffs Harbour?

Answer—

Please note the response to the following questions relate to the Jobs for NSW Fund only.

- (1)
- (a) 1
  - (b) 4
  - (c) Nil
  - (d) 1
  - (e) Nil
  - (f) 1
  - (g) 1
  - (h) 1
  - (i) 6
  - (j) Nil

- (2)
  - (a) to (j) Projects are allocated funding according to individual contract terms, which are agreed to upon successful application for funding. Funding for each 12 month period is allocated differently across grants and loans contracts.
- (3)
  - (a) to (j) Job creation occurs as a result of funding and project implementation by the business and will occur over the period of time outlined in each individual contract.
- (4) Information on employee age groups is not held.
- (5)
  - (a) 1
  - (b) 2
  - (c) Nil
  - (d) 1
  - (e) 1
  - (f) 1
  - (g) 4
  - (h) 1
  - (i) 2
  - (j) 1

\*1835 TREASURER—GAMBLING TAXES IN BUDGET—Mr Field asked the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Treasurer, and Minister for Industrial Relations—

In the 2017-18 Budget Supplementary Papers, there is discrepancy between poker machine profit and revenue figures for the 2015 and 2016 financial years when compared to the 2016-17 Budget Supplementary Papers. What is the reason for the difference in these figures?

Answer—

All forecasts contain some level of uncertainty and are subject to changes due to a number of factors. The differences between the 2016-17 Budget and 2017-18 Budget estimates for club and hotel gaming device taxation revenue reflect collections year-to-date at the time of the revisions.

\*1836 PREMIER—RISING WARRAMGAMBA DAM WALL COSTS—Mr Field asked the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Premier—

In regard to the Government's proposal to raise Warragamba Dam Wall by 14m:

- (1) What is the current cost estimate to complete the raising of Warragamba Dam? For this estimate, how is that broken down in terms of:
  - (a) Other costs?
  - (b) Construction costs?
  - (c) Planning and approval costs?
- (2) How much money has been allocated to this project for each of the following years and for what elements of the project has that money been allocated for the following financial years:
  - (a) 2016-17
  - (b) 2017-18
  - (c) 2018-19
  - (d) 2019-20
- (3) How much money for the project will be sourced from the Climate Change Fund for each of the following years:
  - (a) 2016-17
  - (b) 2017-18



- (c) 2018-19
- (d) 2019-20
- (4) How much money has been allocated for high-level escape routes and flood preparedness for flood prone urban expansion areas in the North West Sector?
  - (a) Is this funding incorporated in funding indicated in question 2, or is this additional funding?

Answer—

The Warragamba dam wall raising is estimated to cost about \$690 million (2015 dollars).

In Phase One of the Hawkesbury-Nepean Valley Flood Risk Management Strategy (Flood Strategy), \$30 million has been allocated to undertake detailed planning and environmental assessments for raising the Warragamba Dam wall by around 14 metres to provide flood mitigation only.

All of the funding (\$30 million) for the current Phase One of the Flood Strategy including the allocation to undertake detailed planning and environmental assessments for the proposed Warragamba Dam Raising- is being sourced from the Climate Change Fund.

A recommendation for funding the construction will form part of the final business case to be provided to the NSW Government at the end of Phase One (2016-2020).

The Hawkesbury-Nepean Valley Flood Risk Management Strategy (Flood Strategy) is an integrated package of infrastructure and non-infrastructure actions designed to reduce flood risk across the entire floodplain. For further information on evacuation road upgrades can be found on the Infrastructure NSW website at [insw.com](http://insw.com).

A key element of the Flood Strategy is a project to upgrade around 40 priority local evacuation roads to improve access to major evacuation routes. This project, led by Roads and Maritime Services, is currently in progress. A separate funding source is being sought for these upgrades.

Roads and Maritime Services is also undertaking a project to upgrade regional evacuation signage to support the NSW State Emergency Service and help protect lives during a flood evacuation.

\*1837 PREMIER—RAISING WARRAGAMBA DAM WALL AND FLOOD RISKS—Mr Field asked the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Premier—

In regard to the Government's proposal to raise Warragamba Dam Wall by 14m:

- (1) What is the current proposed timeline for completion of the project including:
  - (a) release of an environmental assessment?
  - (b) finalisation of a business case?
  - (c) federal approvals?
  - (d) start of construction?
  - (e) finalisation of construction?
- (2) What federal approvals would be required to enable this project to proceed?
- (3) Given the impact on the Blue Mountains World Heritage Listed Area by flooding areas of listed forests, what actions will the Government take in regards to United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) and International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN)?

Answer—

- (1)
  - (a) The environmental impact assessment process is being undertaken between 2017-2019.
  - (b) The business case is scheduled to be finalised during 2019-2020.
  - (c) Expected in 2019 but subject to Australian Government assessment processes and timeframes.
  - (d) Commencement of construction expected in 2020/2021 pending the environmental and final business case approvals.
  - (e) Warragamba Dam wall raising construction is anticipated to take approximately four years.
- (2) The project will be assessed as a controlled action under the Australian Government's Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999 in relation to World heritage, National heritage and listed threatened species and communities.

- (3) The proposal to raise Warragamba Dam wall for temporary flood storage is considered a controlled action under Section 75 of the Australian Government's Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999 (EPBC Act) due to the potential impact on matters of national environmental significance including:

- World Heritage properties (the Greater Blue Mountains World Heritage Area and National Heritage Place)
- National Heritage places
- Listed threatened species and communities.

The EIS assessment will be undertaken through the Bilateral Agreement between the NSW and Australian governments.

- \*1838 FAMILY AND COMMUNITY SERVICES—EX-STATE WARDS—Mr Shoebridge asked the Minister for Early Childhood Education, Minister for Aboriginal Affairs, Assistant Minister for Education representing the Minister for Family and Community Services, Minister for Social Housing, and Minister for the Prevention of Domestic Violence and Sexual Assault—

Does the Department apply the model litigant policy when it is being sued by ex-state wards?

Answer—

I am advised that the Model Litigant Policy for Civil Litigation and the Guiding Principles for Civil Claims for Child Abuse are available at:

<http://arp.nsw.gov.au/m2016-03-model-litigant-policy-civil-litigation-and-guiding-principles-civil-claims-child-abuse>.

- \*1839 PLANNING—LOW FREQUENCY NOISE—Mr Shoebridge asked the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Minister for Planning, Minister for Housing, and Special Minister for State—

- (1) Were conditions of consent regarding low frequency noise as recommended by the EPA in Hunter Valley Operations South MP 06\_0261 MOD 5 based on the DEFRA (Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (UK)) report Procedure for the Assessment of Low Frequency Noise Complaints?

- (a) If so will NSW Planning reject the adoption of the conditions of consent given it is not accepted government policy and the report itself states that "The procedure is intended to assist in the evaluation of existing problems. It is not intended as a means of predicting when disturbance might occur, for example in a planning situation, and would not be reliable for use as such"?

- (2) Were conditions of consent regarding low frequency noise as recommended by the EPA for the April 2017 approval for the Wilpinjong Extension based on the DEFRA (Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (UK)) report Procedure for the Assessment of Low Frequency Noise Complaints?

- (a) If so on what basis did NSW Planning support the adoption of the conditions of consent when it is not accepted government policy and the report itself states that "The procedure is intended to assist in the evaluation of existing problems. It is not intended as a means of predicting when disturbance might occur, for example in a planning situation, and would not be reliable for use as such"?

Answer—

I am advised:

- (1) Hunter Valley Operations South MP 06\_0261 MOD 5 is still under assessment by the Department of Planning and Environment. Draft conditions are currently being developed in consultation with the EPA.
- (2) The conditions of consent regarding low frequency noise for the Wilpinjong Extension Project are consistent with the recommendations of the EPA. Any questions about the EPA's consideration of the DEFRA procedure for the assessment of low frequency noise should be directed through to the Minister for the Environment.

\*1840 PREMIER—RAISING WARRAGAMBA DAM WALL AND FLOOD RISKS—Mr Field asked the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Premier—

In regard to the NSW Government's proposal to raise Warragamba Dam Wall by 14m:

- (1) How many hectares of urban land in the North West Growth Sector Area that are being developed by the Government are on flood prone land?
- (2) Will alternatives for flood management be considered in any business case prepared for the project including options to lower full supply levels?
- (3) Will the Government guarantee that the dam wall raising is to be used for flood mitigation and not water storage and that permanent storage will not occur above the current full supply level?

Answer—

- (1) Just over a quarter (28%) of the North West Priority Growth Area is on land not suitable for any further urban development due to flood risk. An additional 24% of the flood prone land has limited development potential in response to flood evacuation strategies.

Development in the North West Priority Growth Area is subject to current floodrelated development controls based on the 1 in 1 00 chance per year flood level.

- (2) An Environmental Impact Statement will be prepared for the project in accordance with Part 3 of Schedule 2 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Regulation 2000. The EIS will include an analysis of any feasible alternatives to the project and the options within the project. The Secretary's Environmental Assessment Requirements outline what must be investigated and are available on the Department of Planning and Environment website.
- (3) The Government has announced that raising Warragamba Dam by around 14 metres is for flood mitigation and temporary inundation only. The environmental impact assessments being undertaken under NSW and Australian Government legislation will assess the impacts of temporary flood inundation.

#### 19 OCTOBER 2017

(Paper No. 131)

\*1841 PREMIER—RAILCORP LAND AT DARLEY ROAD, LEICHHARDT—Ms Voltz asked the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Premier—

Did the Minister have any discussions with Peter Grimshaw about the lease of Railcorp land at Darley Road, Leichhardt, during 2011 and 2012?

Answer—

No, to the best of my knowledge or records.

\*1842 VETERANS AFFAIRS—VETERAN EMPLOYMENT PROGRAM—Ms Voltz asked the Minister for Primary Industries, Minister for Regional Water, Minister for Trade and Industry representing the Minister for Counter Terrorism, Minister for Corrections, and Minister for Veterans Affairs—

- (1) What definition for "Veteran" is the Government using for eligibility for defence personnel to apply for the Veteran Employment Program?
- (2) Is this definition consistent with the Federal Department of Veterans' Affairs definition being a Veteran is a person who has rendered eligible war service or is a member of the Defence Forces who on or after 31 July 1962 was outside Australia, but not on operational service, who was killed or injured by the action of hostile forces?

Answer—

For the purposes of the Veteran Employment Program, a 'veteran' is defined as anyone who has served in the Australian Defence Force in a full-time capacity or a reservist who has completed a period of continuous full-time service.

On 8 November 2017 the Veterans' Ministers Roundtable, chaired by The Hon. Dan Tehan MP, reached consensus on a common definition of veteran that is to be recognised by all jurisdictions. It was agreed that a 'veteran' would be defined as 'a person who is serving or has served in the ADF'.

\*1843 EMERGENCY SERVICES—BUNDEENA COAST ECO-LODGE AT 60-70 BOURNEMOUTH ST—Mr Shoebridge asked the Minister for Primary Industries, Minister for Regional Water, Minister for Trade and Industry representing the Minister for Police, and Minister for Emergency Services—

- (1) Is the Minister aware that Sutherland Shire Council has raised concerns that the site of the proposed Bundeena Coast Eco-Lodge at 60-70 Bournemouth St has "extreme bushfire danger"?
- (2) Is the Minister aware that the Bundeena Rural fire Brigade has raised serious concerns about the proposed development occurring on bushfire prone land, warning of "the disastrous consequences should this development go ahead and innocent lives are unnecessarily put at risk"?
- (3) Will the Minister ensure that the Bushfire Safety Authority issued by the Rural Fire Service for the proposed development will be revoked in order to ensure the protection of human life and property from the threat of bush fire at this location?

Answer—

- (1) In August 2016, the NSW RFS received a copy of the Statement of Facts and Contentions pursuant to section 97A(1)(c) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 (NSW) filed in the Land and Environment Court on behalf of Sutherland Shire Council.

The Statement raises concerns that the applicant may not be able to legally manage the conditions of the Bush Fire Safety Authority (BFSA) in perpetuity, which could subsequently lead to a bush fire safety risk.

- (2) In September 2013, Bundeena Rural Fire Brigade raised concerns about the development to the Sutherland Shire Rural Fire District. The District considered these concerns as part of their comments to the NSW RFS Planning and Environment Services (PES).

The District's comments were considered by PES as part of the overall assessment and conditioning of the applications.

- (3) The NSW RFS does not have the legislative ability to revoke a BFSA under the Rural Fires Act 1997 (NSW) and the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 (NSW).

The development is currently the subject of Land and Environment Court proceedings to determine the suitability of the development.

# 1 NOVEMBER 2017

(Paper No. 132)

\*1844 ENERGY AND UTILITIES—BLACKOUT AND POWER OUTAGE REPORTING—Mr Mookhey asked the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council—

- (1) In 2016, how many blackouts or power outages did Essential Energy report in:

- (a) Wentworth Shire?
- (b) Balranald Shire?
- (c) Carrathool Shire?
- (d) Griffith City?
- (e) Murrumbidgee Council?
- (f) Hay Shire?
- (g) Murray River Council?
- (h) Berrigan Shire?
- (i) Edward River Council?
- (j) Bland Shire?
- (k) Narranderra Shire?
- (l) Coolamon Shire?

- (m) Junee Shire?
  - (n) Cootamundra-Gundagai Regional Council?
  - (o) Harden Shire?
  - (p) Young Shire?
  - (q) Temora Shire?
  - (r) Weddin Shire?
  - (s) Cowra Shire?
- (2) In 2016, how many blackouts or power outages did Endeavour Energy or Ausgrid report in:
- (a) Sydney City?
  - (b) Inner West Council?
  - (c) Randwick?
  - (d) Woollahra?
  - (e) Waverly?
  - (f) Bayside Council?
  - (g) Mosman Council?
  - (h) Manly Council?
  - (i) Canada Bay Council?
  - (j) North Sydney Council?
  - (k) Blacktown City Council?
  - (l) Parramatta Council?
  - (m) Cumberland Council?
  - (n) Fairfield City Council?
  - (o) Liverpool Council?
  - (p) Penrith City Council?

Answer—

All electricity networks experience interruptions from time to time. Each network must meet reliability standards as set out in their licence conditions and these are monitored by IPART. In relation to disruptions on the network, there are a number of factors which can impact the local power supply, such as trees contacting power lines, car accidents, weather conditions, vandalism and acts of third parties.

In the IPART 2015/16 Annual licence compliance report the overall performance of all networks including with their licence reliability conditions was found to be good

I am advised that the numbers for Essential Energy are as follows:

Essential Energy- Local Government Area	Unplanned power outages in 2016
Balranald Shire Council	1662
Berrigan Shire Council	1119
Bland Shire Council	3058
Carrathool Shire Council	2806
Coolamon Shire Council	563
Cootamundra Gundagai Regional Council	1946
Cowra Shire Council	3919
Edward River Council	2649
Griffith City Council	1801
Harden Shire Council	889
Hay Shire Council	876
Junee Shire Council	687
Murray Shire Council	206

.	.
Murrumbidgee Shire Council	242
Narrandera Shire Council	665
Temora Shire Council	818
Weddin Shire Council	3660
Wentworth Shire Council	1674
Young Shire Council	2429

I am advised that the numbers for Endeavour Energy are in the following table. It needs to be noted that there were local government boundary changes during 2016 affecting Cumberland and City of Parramatta councils. In these cases the data for the local councils predominantly covered by these areas prior to the boundary changes for example, Holroyd for Cumberland and Parramatta City for City of Parramatta (which now also picks up parts of The Hills Shire).

Endeavour Energy- Local Government Area	Unplanned Power Outages in 2016
Blacktown	416
Cumberland	138
Fairfield	283
Liverpool	308
Parramatta	209
Penrith	361

I am advised that the numbers for Ausgrid are as follows:

Ausgrid Local Government Area	Unplanned power outages in 2016
Sydney City	7
Inner West Council	63
Randwick	33
Woollahra	24
Waverly	13
Bayside Council	55
Mosman Council	16
Manly Council	26
Canada Bay Council	3
North Sydney Council	37

**22 NOVEMBER 2017**

(Paper No. 136)

1910 ATTORNEY GENERAL—INFRASTRUCTURE/CONSTRUCTION PROJECT FATALITIES—Mr Primrose to ask the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Attorney General—

- (1) How many employee deaths have occurred on an infrastructure/construction project undertaken by or on behalf of the Department of Justice since 2010?
- (2) Where have these construction projects been located?
- (3) On what dates did these deaths occur?

- 1911 EMERGENCY SERVICES—INFRASTRUCTURE/CONSTRUCTION PROJECT FATALITIES—Mr Primrose to ask the Minister for Primary Industries, Minister for Regional Water, Minister for Trade and Industry representing the Minister for Police, and Minister for Emergency Services—
- (1) How many employee deaths have occurred on an infrastructure/construction project undertaken by or on behalf of Emergency NSW since 2010?
  - (2) Where have these construction projects been located?
  - (3) On what dates did these deaths occur?
- 1912 TRANSPORT AND INFRASTRUCTURE—INFRASTRUCTURE/CONSTRUCTION PROJECT FATALITIES—Mr Primrose to ask the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Minister for Transport and Infrastructure—
- (1) How many employee deaths have occurred on an infrastructure/construction project undertaken by or on behalf of Transport for NSW since 2010?
  - (2) Where have these construction projects been located?
  - (3) On what dates did these deaths occur?
- 1913 HEALTH—INFRASTRUCTURE/CONSTRUCTION PROJECT FATALITIES—Mr Primrose to ask the Minister for Primary Industries, Minister for Regional Water, Minister for Trade and Industry representing the Minister for Health, and Minister for Medical Research—
- (1) How many employee deaths have occurred on an infrastructure/construction project undertaken by or on behalf of Department of Health since 2010?
  - (2) Where have these construction projects been located?
  - (3) On what dates did these deaths occur?
- 1914 ROADS, MARITIME AND FREIGHT—INFRASTRUCTURE/CONSTRUCTION PROJECT FATALITIES—Mr Primrose to ask the Minister for Primary Industries, Minister for Regional Water, Minister for Trade and Industry representing the Minister for Roads, Maritime and Freight—
- (1) How many employee deaths have occurred on an infrastructure/construction project undertaken by or on behalf of Roads and Maritime since 2010?
  - (2) Where have these construction projects been located?
  - (3) On what dates did these deaths occur?
- 1915 PLANNING—INFRASTRUCTURE/CONSTRUCTION PROJECT FATALITIES—Mr Primrose to ask the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Minister for Planning, Minister for Housing, and Special Minister for State—
- (1) How many employee deaths have occurred on an infrastructure/construction project undertaken by or on behalf of Department of Planning and Environment since 2010?
  - (2) Where have these construction projects been located?
  - (3) On what dates did these deaths occur?
- 1916 EDUCATION—INFRASTRUCTURE/CONSTRUCTION PROJECT FATALITIES—Mr Primrose to ask the Minister for Early Childhood Education, Minister for Aboriginal Affairs, Assistant Minister for Education representing the Minister for Education—
- (1) How many employee deaths have occurred on an infrastructure/construction project undertaken by or on behalf of Department of Education since 2010?
  - (2) Where have these construction projects been located?
  - (3) On what dates did these deaths occur?

- 1917 EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION—COBAR CHILDCARE—Mr Mookhey to ask the Minister for Early Childhood Education, Minister for Aboriginal Affairs, Assistant Minister for Education—
- (1) What is the number of children between three to five years old in childcare in Cobar?
  - (2) How many childcare places for children between three to five years are required in Cobar to meet current demand?
  - (3) What is the number of long day-care places for children in Cobar?
  - (4) How many long day-care places for children are required in Cobar to meet current demand?
- 1918 HEALTH—NYNGAN HEALTH SERVICE—Mr Mookhey to ask the Minister for Primary Industries, Minister for Regional Water, Minister for Trade and Industry representing the Minister for Health, and Minister for Medical Research—
- (1) What is the Government doing to ensure the Nyngan Health Service has an adequate number of locally based health professionals to meet community health needs?
  - (2) What is the average number of hours per week that a General Practitioner is taking visits at Nyngan Health Service?
- 1919 HEALTH—WARREN HEALTH SERVICES—Mr Mookhey to ask the Minister for Primary Industries, Minister for Regional Water, Minister for Trade and Industry representing the Minister for Health, and Minister for Medical Research—
- (1) In 2016-17 what was the average number of years that a registered nurse at Warren Health Service was living in Warren?
  - (2) How will the Government and the Western Area Health District ensure that the Warren Shire has the required number of health professionals living in the community?
  - (3) What is the Health Department's policy on local government offers to build housing for health staff on the condition that the Local Health District will enter into a long term lease agreement for said housing?
- 1920 ROADS, MARITIME AND FREIGHT—LOCAL GOVERNMENT FUNDING FOR PREVENTATIVE FLOOD WORKS—Mr Mookhey to ask the Minister for Primary Industries, Minister for Regional Water, Minister for Trade and Industry representing the Minister for Roads, Maritime and Freight—
- (1) What funding is available to local governments for preventative flood works such as culvert construction?
  - (2) Will the Government consider providing a dedicated fund or grant program for local governments to perform preventative flood works?
    - (a) If not, why not?
- 1921 SPORT—FAR WEST ACADEMY OF SPORT GOVERNMENT FUNDING—Mr Mookhey to ask the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Minister for Western Sydney, Minister for WestConnex, and Minister for Sport—
- (1) What is the value of Government funding that the Far West Academy of Sport received in:
    - (a) 2016-17?
  - (2) What is the value of Government funding that the Far West Academy of Sport will receive in:
    - (a) 2017-18?
    - (b) 2018-19?
    - (c) 2019-20?
- 1922 SPORT—FAR WEST ACADEMY OF SPORT GOVERNMENT—Mr Mookhey to ask the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Minister for Western Sydney, Minister for WestConnex, and Minister for Sport—



- (1) Does the Government have any plans to decrease the real value of public funding to the Far West Academy of Sport over time?
- (2) Will Government funding to the Far West Academy of Sport increase with the academy's expenditure over time?
- (3) Will the Government make funding to the Far West Academy of Sport contingent on non-government sector sponsorship?

1923 ENVIRONMENT—SPRING GULLY BUNDEENA—Dr Faruqi to ask the Minister for Resources, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Arts, Vice-President of the Executive Council representing the Minister for the Environment, Minister for Local Government, and Minister for Heritage—

- (1) Regarding the "Review of Environmental Factors Bundeena Coast Eco Lodge request alternative right of way (Review of Environmental Factors)" as exhibited by the National Parks and Wildlife Service (NPWS):
  - (a) Why are the site diagrams on pp 47-50 in the Dropbox version of the Bushfire Assessment document and hyper-linked to on page 76 of the Review of Environmental Factors missing from the version of the Bushfire Assessment document placed on the NPWS public exhibition web page and placed on exhibition at Bundeena Library and the Audley Visitor Centre?
  - (b) Why was the author meta-data removed from document properties of the "Bushfire Assessment" exhibited on the NPWS public exhibition web page?
  - (c) Why was the document referred to as "Site Plan PR124192SW\_P13q.pdf" on page 30 of the "Review of Environmental Factors" and hyper-linked to on page 76 in the Review of Environmental Factors (as hosted on the Dropbox file sharing platform) which comprises large format site drawings and a tree schedule, not exhibited on the NPWS public exhibition web page or in hard copy format at the other exhibition locations?
- (2) What were the dates and the specific times on those dates during which the public were able to access the following documents during opening hours at Bundeena Library:
  - (a) "Ecological Impact Assessment For: RVA Australia", Cumberland Ecology, February 2016 (Annexure AI).
  - (b) "Bushfire Assessment and Recommendations Proposed 'Eco-Tourism' Development Bundeena Coast Eco Lodge (RVA Australia Pty Ltd) Lot 3 Deposited Plan 213924 60 70 Bournemouth Street Bundeena NSW 2230", Sydney Bushfire Consultants, February 2016 (Annexure AL).
  - (c) "Royal and Heathcote National Parks and Garawarra SCA Fire Management Strategy 2016", NPWS, November 2016 (Annexure AM).
  - (d) "Your right to use Sussex Street", Letter of Aaron Gadiel, Gadens Lawyers, Sydney, dated 30 September 2015 (Annexure AP).
  - (e) The plans (pp12-16) contained in "Report on Upgrading Shared Access to Public Road Standard and Design of Access Road at Lot 3 DP213924 60-70 Bournemouth Street Bundeena NSW", Lyle Marshall & Partners Pty Ltd, January. 2016 (Annexure AD).
  - (f) "Current Use Shared Access Recreation Camp for Eco Tourism 60-70 Bournemouth Street, Bundeena", RVA Australia Pty Ltd. (REF Annexure BB), dated February 2016.
- (3) Were any of these documents placed on exhibition only a few days before submissions closed?
  - (a) If yes, why?
- (4) Was the entire application, including all documents submitted by the applicant, exhibited for the period of time as required by Section 2.6 of the Guidelines for preparing a Review of Environmental Factors, Office of Environment and Heritage (OEH), August 2016?
- (5) Did the amount of time that these documents were available for public viewing at Bundeena Library satisfy Section 2.6 of the Guidelines for preparing a Review of Environmental Factors, OEH, August 2016 and specifically the stated aim of public exhibition to "raise awareness of the proposed activity and to assist the determining authority to assess the significance of likely environmental impacts" and the duty of the determining authority to "examine and take into account to the fullest extent possible all matters affecting or likely to affect the environment" under section 111 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979?

- (6) Does the Minister stand by her answer to Budget Estimates 2017-2018 Supplementary Question 133 that the Review of the Environmental Factors was still being assessed, in light of the fact that the approval was announced just a day later?
- (a) Had the NPWS made an assessment of the presence of endangered ecological communities, threatened species and/or protected species relevant to the proposed activity prior to the publishing of the answers to Supplementary Questions?
- (b) What date was this assessment made?
- (7) Has the NPWS commissioned any external parties to conduct any ecological assessments in making its assessment of the Review of Environmental Factors?
- (a) If yes, please advise of the name(s) of these parties and the dates on which their reports were received by NPWS.
- (8) Will the Minister ensure the protection of the values of the Royal National Park, Australia's first National Park, and refuse the road access proposal under section 153C of the National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974?
- 1924 REGIONAL WATER—NSW WATER SENIOR EXECUTIVES—Ms Voltz to ask the Minister for Primary Industries, Minister for Regional Water, Minister for Trade and Industry—
- (1) How many senior executive in the Department of Primary Industries (DPI) Water have completed the Public Service Commission's Executive Essentials training program?
- (2) What proportion of DPI Water's senior executives have completed the Public Service Commission's Executive Essentials training program?
- 1925 PRIMARY INDUSTRIES—DEPARTMENT OF PRIMARY INDUSTRIES SENIOR EXECUTIVES—Ms Voltz to ask the Minister for Primary Industries, Minister for Regional Water, Minister for Trade and Industry—
- (1) How many senior executives in the Department of Primary Industries have completed the Public Service Commission's Executive Essentials training program?
- (2) What proportion of the Department of Primary Industries senior executives have completed the Public Service Commission's Executive Essentials training program?
- 1926 PRIMARY INDUSTRIES—MIRALWYN PROPERTY INSPECTION—Ms Voltz to ask the Minister for Primary Industries, Minister for Regional Water, Minister for Trade and Industry—
- When was a compliance inspection of the Miralwyn property last undertaken to ensure compliance with all current water licences?

David Blunt  
Clerk of the Parliaments