



LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

GENERAL PURPOSE STANDING COMMITTEE NO. 2

Budget Estimates 2016-2017



Report 45

December 2016

2

www.parliament.nsw.gov.au

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

Budget Estimates 2016-2017

Ordered to be printed 2 December 2016 according to Standing Order 231

New South Wales Parliamentary Library cataloguing-in-publication data:

New South Wales. Parliament. Legislative Council. General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

Budget estimates 2016-2017 / General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2 [Sydney, N.S.W.] : the Committee, 2016. [viii, 27] pages ; 30 cm. (Report no. 45 / General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2)

“December 2016”.

Chair: Hon. Greg Donnelly MLC.

ISBN 9781920788162

1. New South Wales. Parliament. Legislative Council. General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2—Appropriations and expenditures.
 - I. Donnelly, Greg.
 - II. Title.
 - III. Series: New South Wales. Parliament. Legislative Council. General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2. Report ; no. 45

328.94407 (DDC22)

Table of contents

Chapter 1	Introduction	1
	Referral of the 2016-2017 Budget Estimates	1
	Hearings	1
	Transcripts	1
	Questions on notice	1
Chapter 2	Issues raised during hearings	3
	Family and Community Services, Social Housing	3
	Roads, Maritime and Freight	3
	Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism	4
	Transport and Infrastructure	5
Appendix 1	Witnesses at hearings	7
Appendix 2	Minutes	10

Terms of reference

1. That upon tabling, the Budget Estimates and related papers for the financial year 2016 - 2017 presenting the amounts to be appropriated from the Consolidated Fund be referred to the General Purpose Standing Committees for inquiry and report.
2. That, notwithstanding the House's resolution of 6 May 2015 allocating portfolio responsibilities to the General Purpose Standing Committees, for the purposes of the 2016-2017 budget estimates inquiry General Purpose Standing Committee No. 3 is to examine the Legislature portfolio.
3. That the initial hearings be scheduled as follows:

Day One: Monday 29 August 2016

GPSC 2	Family and Community Services, Social Housing	9.00 am – 12.00 pm
GPSC 2	Roads, Maritime and Freight	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm
GPSC 3	Early Childhood Education, Aboriginal Affairs	9.00 am – 11.00 am
GPSC 3	The Legislature	11.15 am – 12.00 pm
GPSC 3	Education	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm

Day Two: Tuesday 30 August 2016

GPSC 2	Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism	9.00 am – 12.00 pm
GPSC 2	Transport and Infrastructure	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm
GPSC 3	Mental Health, Medical Research, Women, Prevention of Domestic Violence and Sexual Assault	9.00 am – 1.00 pm
GPSC 3	Health	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm

Day Three: Wednesday 31 August 2016

GPSC 4	Trade, Tourism and Major Events, Sport	9.00 am – 12.00 pm
GPSC 4	Planning	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm
GPSC 1	Finance, Services and Property	9.00 am – 12.00 pm
GPSC 5	Industry, Resources and Energy	2.00 pm – 5.00 pm

Day Four: Thursday 1 September 2016

GPSC 4	Justice and Police, Arts, Racing	9.00 am – 1.00 pm
GPSC 4	Attorney General	2.00 pm – 4.00 pm
GPSC 1	Treasury, Industrial Relations	9.00 am – 1.00 pm
GPSC 1	Premier, Western Sydney	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm
GPSC 6	Innovation and Better Regulation	4.15 pm – 6.00 pm

Day Five: Friday 2 September 2016

GPSC 5	Primary Industries, Lands and Water	9.00 am – 1.00 pm
GPSC 5	The Environment, Heritage	2.00 pm – 5.00 pm
GPSC 6	Local Government	9.00 am – 11.00 am
GPSC 6	Regional Development, Skills, Small Business	11.15 am – 1.00 pm
GPSC 6	Corrections, Emergency Services, Veterans Affairs	2.00 pm – 5.00 pm

4. That supplementary hearings be scheduled during the week of 4 to 7 October 2016.
5. That each scheduled day for the initial round of hearings will begin at 9.00 am and conclude by 6.00 pm.
6. That the committees must hear evidence in public.
7. That the committees may ask for explanations from Ministers in the House, or officers of departments, statutory bodies or corporations, relating to the items of proposed expenditure.
8. That ministers may not make an opening statement before the committee commences questions.
9. That the committees are to present a final report to the House by 16 December 2016.
10. That members may lodge supplementary questions with the committee clerk by 5.00 pm, within two days, excluding Saturday and Sunday, following the hearing.
11. That answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions be published, except those answers for which confidentiality is requested, after these answers have been circulated to committee members.

These terms of reference were referred to the committee by the House on 1 June 2016, see LC Minutes 1 June 2016, pp 935-938.

Committee membership

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

The Hon Greg Donnelly MLC	Australian Labor Party	<i>Chair</i>
The Hon Paul Green MLC	Christian Democratic Party	<i>Deputy Chair</i>
Dr Mehreen Faruqi MLC	The Greens	
The Hon John Graham MLC ¹	Australian Labor Party	
The Hon Matthew Mason-Cox MLC	Liberal Party	
The Hon Dr Peter Phelps MLC	Liberal Party	
The Hon Bronnie Taylor MLC	The Nationals	

Non-substantive members who attended the hearings

Mr Justin Field MLC	The Greens
Thee Hon Shaoquett Moselmane MLC	Australian Labor Party
The Hon Adam Searle MLC	Australian Labor Party
The Hon Penny Sharpe MLC	Australian Labor Party
The Hon Lynda Voltz MLC	Australian Labor Party

Website	www.parliament.nsw.gov.au
Email	budget.estimate@parliament.nsw.gov.au
Telephone	(02) 9230 3081

¹ The Hon John Graham MLC replaced The Hon Daniel Mookhey MLC as a member of the committee on 4 November 2016. Mr Mookhey replaced the Hon Sophie Cotsis MLC on the committee from 23 September 2016.

Chair's foreword

I am pleased to present this report on the Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2016-2017. This annual inquiry into the Budget Estimates ensures parliamentary oversight of the Budget, and provides an important mechanism for the accountability of the executive government to the Legislative Council.

The inquiry consisted of four hearings to examine the following portfolios:

- Family and Community Services, Social Housing
- Roads, Maritime and Freight
- Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism
- Transport and Infrastructure.

A supplementary hearing was also held for the Ageing, Disability Services portfolios.

On behalf of the committee, I would like to thank the Ministers and their officers who assisted the committee during this important inquiry. I am grateful to my fellow committee members and the secretariat staff for their contributions to the inquiry process.



The Hon Greg Donnelly MLC
Chair

Chapter 1 Introduction

Referral of the 2016-2017 Budget Estimates

- 1.1 On 1 June 2016, the Legislative Council resolved that ‘the Budget Estimates and related papers for the financial year 2016-2017 presenting the amounts to be appropriated from the Consolidated Fund be referred to the General Purpose Standing Committees for inquiry and report’.² The resolution (hereafter referred to as the Budget Estimates resolution) requires each committee to examine the Budget Estimates for the relevant portfolios and report to the House by 16 December 2016.³
- 1.2 The Budget Estimates resolution further stipulated that the initial hearings will be held in the week commencing 29 August 2016 and the initial round of supplementary hearings be scheduled during the week of 4 to 7 October 2016.⁴

Hearings

- 1.3 The committee held four public hearings as follows:
- Monday 29 August 2016 – Family and Community Services, Social Housing
 - Monday 29 August 2016 – Roads, Maritime and Freight
 - Tuesday 30 August 2016 – Ageing, Disability, Multiculturalism
 - Tuesday 30 August 2016 – Transport and Infrastructure.
- 1.4 The committee also held a supplementary hearing on Wednesday 5 October 2016 for the Ageing, Disability Services portfolios.

Transcripts

- 1.5 Transcripts of the hearings are available on the committee’s web page at: www.parliament.nsw.gov.au/gpsc2.

Questions on notice

- 1.6 Questions taken on notice and the answers to these questions are also available on the committee’s web page.

² *Minutes*, NSW Legislative Council, 1 June 2016, pp 935.

³ *Minutes*, NSW Legislative Council, 1 June 2016, pp 936.

⁴ *Minutes*, NSW Legislative Council, 1 June 2016, pp 935 - 938.

Chapter 2 Issues raised during hearings

This chapter provides a brief summary by portfolio of the key issues raised during the hearings.

Family and Community Services, Social Housing

2.1 A hearing examining the portfolios of Family and Community Services, Social Housing was held on Monday 29 August 2016. The following issues were raised during the committee's examination of the Family and Community Services, Social Housing portfolios:

- The department's response to circumstances surrounding death of 'Girl X' at a residential care facility
- Contractual arrangements with out-of-home care providers
- Accreditation as a child-safe organisation by the Children's Guardian
- Impact of the Going Home Staying Home program on women-only service providers
- Scope of men-only refuges and services available
- Caseworker numbers and increases in targets for face-to-face assessments
- Placement of women fleeing domestic violence into suitable temporary accommodation facilities
- Public housing situation at Millers Point and the Sirius Building
- Re-housing of patients in Cumberland Hospital
- Growth in the community housing sector
- Social housing for people with disability
- Administration of the Community Building Partnership Scheme.

Roads, Maritime and Freight

2.2 A hearing examining the portfolio of Roads, Maritime and Freight was held on Monday 29 August 2016. The following issues were raised during the committee's examination of the Roads, Maritime and Freight portfolio:

- M4 widening
- Death toll on roads
- Russell Review of compulsory acquisition laws

- Work proposed for the Nowra Bridge
- Bells Line of Road upgrades
- Westconnex
- Northconnex
- Design of the Sydney Gateway
- Sydney Motorway Corporation
- National clear air agreement and exhaust fumes
- Western Harbour Tunnel project
- Trial of various safety measures for cyclists
- Impact of changes to registration stickers for vehicles
- Safety standards for motorcycle helmets
- Freight network corridors
- Airport Gateway
- Bridges for the Bush initiatives
- Maritime Legislation Amendment Bill
- Pacific Highway Wollgoolga to Ballina upgrade
- Workplace diversity at Roads and Maritime Services
- Flashing lights at school crossings
- Transition to Service NSW.

Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism

2.3 A hearing examining the portfolios of Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism was held on Tuesday 30 August 2016. The following issues were raised during the committee's examination of the Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism portfolios:

- Elder abuse
- Ombudsman and disability reportable incidents

- Disability inclusion action plans
- Miller's Point communities and housing
- Ombudsman's report of reviewable deaths
- Employment enablement strategy
- Complaints about racial abuse recorded by Multiculturalism NSW
- Countering violent extremism program.

2.4 A supplementary hearing examining the portfolios of Ageing, Disability Services was held on Wednesday 5 October 2016. The following issues were raised during the committee's examination of the Ageing, Disability Services portfolios:

- Rollout of the National Disability Insurance Scheme in NSW
- Transfer of Ageing, Disability and Home Care services to non-government organisations.

Transport and Infrastructure

2.5 A hearing examining the portfolio of Transport and Infrastructure was held on Tuesday 30 August 2016. The following issues were raised during the committee's examination of the Transport and Infrastructure portfolio:

- Public transport fares
- Sydney Metro project
- CBD Light Rail project
- Transport for NSW contracts variations
- Bankstown to Sydenham line
- Intercity train fleet contract
- Opal card purchasing sites
- North West rail link
- Taxi industry awards.

Appendix 1 Witnesses at hearings

Family and Community Services, Social Housing – Monday 29 August 2016

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon Brad Hazzard MP	Minister for Family and Community Services, Minister for Social Housing
Mr Michael Coutts-Trotter	Secretary, Department of Family and Community Services
Ms Maree Walk	Deputy Secretary, Program and Service Design, Department of Family and Community Services
Mr Paul Vevers	Deputy Secretary, Southern Cluster, Department of Family and Community Services
Ms Deidre Mulkerin	Deputy Secretary, Western Cluster, Department of Family and Community Services
Ms Anne Skewes	Deputy Secretary, Land and Housing Corporation, Land and Housing Corporation
Mr Shane Hamilton	Chief Executive, Aboriginal Housing Office, Aboriginal Housing Office

Roads, Maritime and Freight – Monday 29 August 2016

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon Duncan Gay MLC	Minister for Roads, Maritime and Freight
Mr Tim Reardon	Secretary, Transport for NSW
Mr Ken Kanofski	Chief Executive, Roads and Maritime Services
Mr Dennis Cliche	Chief Executive Officer, Sydney Motorway Corporation
Ms Marg Prendergast	CBD Coordinator General, Transport for NSW
Mr Jeff McCarthy	Director, Infrastructure Development, Roads and Maritime Services
Mr Grant Gilfillan	Chief Executive Officer, Sydney Ports
Mr Bernard Carlon	Executive Director, Centre for Road Safety and Maritime Safety, Transport for NSW
Ms Clare Gardiner-Barnes	Deputy Secretary, Freight, Strategy and Planning, Transport for NSW

Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism – Tuesday 30 August 2016

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon John Ajaka MLC	Minister for Ageing, Minister for Disability Services, Minister for Multiculturalism
Mr Michael Coutts-Trotter	Secretary, Department of Family and Community Services
Mr Jim Longley	Deputy Secretary, Ageing, Disability and Home Care, Department of Family and Community Services
Ms Samantha Taylor	Executive Director, NDIS Implementation, Department of Family and Community Services
Ms Leonie King	Executive Director, Service Delivery Programs, Department of Family and Community Services
Ms Helen Rogers	Executive Director, Participation and Inclusion, Department of Family and Community Services
Ms Denise Dawson	Chief Financial Officer, Department of Family and Community Services
Mr Hakan Karman	Chief Executive Officer, Multicultural NSW
Mr Ross Hawkey	Chief Financial Officer, Multicultural NSW

Transport and Infrastructure – Tuesday 30 August 2016

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon Andrew Constance MP	Minister for Transport and Infrastructure
Mr Tim Reardon	Secretary, Transport for NSW
Mr Stephen Troughton	Deputy Secretary, Infrastructure Services, Transport for NSW
Mr Rodd Staples	Program Director, Sydney Metro, Transport for NSW
Ms Marg Prendergast	CBD Coordinator General, Transport for NSW
Mr Howard Collins	Chief Executive, Sydney Trains
Mr Rob Mason	Chief Executive, NSW TrainLink
Mr Jim Betts	Chief Executive, Infrastructure NSW

Ageing, Disability Services – Wednesday 5 October 2016 (supplementary hearing)

Name	Position and Organisation
Mr Jim Longley	Deputy Secretary, Ageing, Disability and Home Care, Department of Family and Community Services
Ms Samantha Taylor	Executive Director, NDIS Implementation, Department of Family and Community Services
Ms Anne Campbell	Executive Director, Service Delivery Programs, Department of Family and Community Services

Appendix 2 Minutes

Minutes no. 16

Monday 20 June 2016

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

Room 814/815, Parliament House, Sydney, at 10.05 am

1. Members present

Mr Donnelly, *Chair*

Mr Green, *Deputy Chair*

Ms Barham

Ms Cotsis

Mr Mason-Cox

Dr Phelps

Mrs Taylor

2. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2016-2017

The committee noted that the Budget Estimates timetable for 2016-2017 was agreed to by the House, with the following GPSC 2 hearings:

Date	Time	Portfolio	Room
Monday 29 August 2016	9.00 am – 12.00 pm	Family and Community Services, Social Housing (Hazzard)	Macquarie
	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm	Roads, Maritime and Freight (Gay)	Macquarie
Tuesday 30 August 2016	9.00 am – 12.00 pm	Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism (Ajaka)	Jubilee
	2.00 pm – 6.00 pm	Transport and Infrastructure (Constance)	Jubilee

2.1 Allocation of question time

The committee noted that under the resolution establishing General Purpose Standing Committees, the sequence of questions at hearings is to alternate between opposition, crossbench and government members, with equal time allocated to each, unless the committee decides otherwise.

2.2 Government questions

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That with no questions asked by government members:

- On Monday 29 August 2016, the portfolios of Family and Community Services, Social Housing be examined from 9.00 am until 11.00am
- On Monday 29 August 2016, the portfolio of Roads, Maritime and Freight be examined from 2.00 pm to 4.40 pm
- On Tuesday 30 August 2016, the portfolios of Ageing Disability Services, Multiculturalism be examined from 9.00 am to 11.00 am
- On Tuesday 30 August 2016, the portfolio of Transport and Infrastructure be examined from 2.00 pm to 4.40 pm.

2.3 Order for examination of portfolios: If portfolios are not to be considered concurrently

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Barham: That for the Family and Community Services, Social Housing hearing on Monday 29 August 2016 the portfolios be examined in this order:

- Family and Community Services from 9.00 am to 10.00 am
- Social Housing from 10.00 am to 11.00 am.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Green: That for the Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism hearing on Tuesday 30 August 2016 the portfolios be examined in this order:

- Ageing, Disability Services from 9.00 am to 10.30 am
- Multiculturalism from 10.30 am to 11.00 am

2.4 Witness requests

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Green: That members provide any additional witnesses, or changes to witnesses listed in last year's hearing notices to the secretariat by 1.00 pm on Wednesday 22 June 2016.

3. Inquiry into elder abuse**3.1 Public submissions**

The committee notes that the following submission was published by the committee clerk under the authorisation of the resolution appointing the committee: submission no. 109a.

3.2 Partially confidential submissions

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Phelps: The committee authorise the publication of submission no. 106a, with the exception of identifying and/or sensitive information which is to remain confidential, as per the request of the author.

3.3 Confidential submissions

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Phelps: That the committee keep confidential:

- submission nos. 51a and 74a, as per the recommendation of the secretariat, as they contain identifying and/or sensitive information and potential adverse mention
- submission nos. 118, 119, 121 and 121a, as per the request of the submission authors.

3.4 Consideration of the Chair's draft report

The Chair submitted his draft report entitled *Elder abuse in New South Wales*, which, having being previously circulated, was taken as being read.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That recommendation 1 be amended by:

- a) omitting 'develop and implement a strong and comprehensive new approach' and inserting instead 'embrace a comprehensive, coordinated and ambitious approach'. Further, that similar words be inserted instead of 'new approach' wherever it appears in the report.
- b) inserting a new dot point at the end:
 - 'an enhanced role for the NSW Elder Abuse Helpline and Resource Unit'.

Resolved, on the motion of Mrs Taylor: That paragraph 4.70 be amended by omitting 'simply' after 'Our view as a committee is that there'.

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Cotsis: That the second dot point in recommendation 2 be amended by inserting at the end 'and engagement with Multicultural NSW and Aboriginal Affairs NSW'.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That paragraph 5.4 be amended to insert after the second sentence: 'FACS subsequently advised that the steering committee had met on an almost monthly basis during 2013 and 2014.'

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox:

- a) That the first sentence in paragraph 5.85 be amended by omitting, 'The committee trusts that the meeting in February 2016, after a long delay, of the Steering Committee on the Prevention of Abuse of Older People' and inserting instead 'Noting that during 2013 and 2014 the NSW Steering Committee on the Prevention of Abuse of Older People met almost monthly, the committee trusts that the meeting in February 2016, after a long delay,'.
- b) That the following new recommendation be inserted after paragraph 5.86:

'Recommendation X

That the NSW Steering Committee for the Prevention of Abuse of Older People meet at least quarterly in order to enhance accountability and drive the implementation of government policy.'

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That Recommendation 3 be amended by:

- a) Inserting at the end of the first dot point 'including with regard to duty of care, reporting requirements in respect of a crime, and privacy and confidentiality'
- b) Omitting from the final dot point 'determine the most effective means by which to'.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That paragraph 5.92 be amended by omitting 'massive' before 'emotional demands'.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Green: That recommendation 5 be omitted: 'That the NSW Government expand the role of the NSW Elder Abuse Helpline and Resource Unit to include provision of case management and coordination, and that, as the government's comprehensive new approach to elder abuse develops, consideration be given to whether the Helpline should further expand to operate as a round-the-clock continuous service', and the following recommendation be inserted instead:

That the NSW Government expand the role of the NSW Elder Abuse Helpline and Resource Unit to include:

- provision of case management and coordination
- consideration of Helpline operating hours, based on an assessment of demand
- adequate provision for culturally and linguistically diverse and Aboriginal clients.

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Phelps: That paragraph 6.105 be amended by omitting 'is attracted to' and inserting instead 'notes that there is some support for'.

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Phelps: That paragraph 7.50 be amended by inserting as the second last sentence: 'This checklist should also address the issue of notification and/or non-notification of family members in relation to the wishes of the principal.'

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That paragraph 7.51 be amended by:

- a) omitting 'finds it extraordinary' and inserting instead 'notes'
- b) omitting 'Surely the time has come for law schools to carefully' and inserting instead 'Law schools could'.

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Barham: That the following new recommendation be inserted after paragraph 7.53:

'Recommendation X

That the NSW Government fund the NSW Elder Abuse Helpline and Resource Unit to conduct information sessions with financial institutions to raise awareness of financial abuse and promote online training tools for staff such as Capacity Australia's training program to identify financial abuse.'

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Cotsis: That paragraph 8.75 be amended by inserting at the end of the first sentence: ‘, noting that their role is aimed at improving responses to, and addressing barriers to justice for, older people, people with disability and other vulnerable groups.’

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That recommendation 8 be amended by:

- a) omitting ‘Local Area Command’ and inserting instead ‘regional command’
- b) moving ‘police response’ to after ‘training and support to front line officers’
- c) inserting ‘and other government agencies’ after ‘liaison with local service providers’.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That paragraph 8.80 be amended by omitting ‘is wholeheartedly supportive of’ and inserting instead ‘strongly supports’.

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Phelps:

- a) That paragraph 8.82 be omitted: ‘In making this recommendation, however, we consider that further consultation and thought is required as to who the target group for a Public Advocate’s Office in New South Wales should be.’
- b) That recommendation 10 be omitted: ‘That the NSW Government consult with relevant stakeholders to determine who the target group of a Public Advocate’s Office should be.’
- c) That recommendation 9 be amended to insert ‘along the lines of the Victorian model,’ after ‘establish a Public Advocate’s Office’.

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Barham: That recommendation 9 be amended to insert at the end, ‘Further, that the operation of the Office be reviewed after three years.’

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That paragraph 8.83 be omitted: ‘In respect of the timeliness of the Guardianship Division of NCAT’s hearings and decisions, like others, the committee acknowledges that the work of the division has increased significantly over recent years, and we have no doubt of the complexity of these matters, nor of the skills exercised in handling them. In light of the potentially disastrous consequences that may follow from delayed proceedings, the committee underscores the importance of the division doing all it can to ensure that it prioritises matters effectively and finalises them as expeditiously as possible.’

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Phelps: That:

- The draft report as amended be the report of the committee and that the committee present the report to the House
- The transcripts of evidence, submissions, tabled documents, answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, and correspondence relating to the inquiry be tabled in the House with the report
- Upon tabling, all unpublished attachments to submissions be kept confidential by the committee
- Upon tabling, all unpublished transcripts of evidence, submissions, tabled documents, answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, and correspondence relating to the inquiry, be published by the committee, except for those documents kept confidential by resolution of the committee
- The committee secretariat correct any typographical, grammatical and formatting errors prior to tabling
- The committee secretariat be authorised to update any committee comments where necessary to reflect changes to recommendations or new recommendations resolved by the committee
- That the report be tabled on Friday 24 June 2016, and that upon tabling the Chair hold a press conference at 12.00 pm.

4. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 12.50 pm, *sine die*.

Madeleine Foley

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes no. 18

Monday 29 August 2016

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

Macquarie Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 8.47 am

1. Members present

Mr Donnelly, *Chair*

Mr Green, *Deputy Chair*

Dr Faruqi (until 10.00 am)

Mr Mason-Cox

Dr Phelps (from 8.49 am)

Mrs Taylor

Ms Voltz (substituting for Ms Cotsis)

Mr Shoebridge (participating from 8.58 am to 9.37 am)

2. Draft minutes

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That draft minutes no. 17 be confirmed.

3. Correspondence

The committee noted the following items of correspondence:

Received:

- 7 July 2016 – Email from Ms Lee Dixon, Office of the Minister for Family and Community Services and Minister for Social Housing – providing the list of witnesses for the Budget Estimates hearing.
- 21 July 2016 – Email from Mr Angus Mckenzie-Wills, Office of the Minister for Transport – providing the list of witnesses for the Budget Estimates hearing.
- 29 July 2016 – Email from Ms Natalie Heazlewood, Office of the Minister for Roads and Maritime and Freight – providing the list of witnesses for the Budget Estimates hearing.
- 29 July 2016 – Email from Mr Michael Shaw, Office of the Minister for Ageing, Disability Services and Minister for Multiculturalism – providing the list of witnesses for the Budget Estimates hearing.
- 17 August 2016 – Email from Ms Natalie Heazlewood, Office of the Minister for Roads and Maritime and Freight – providing an updated list of witnesses for the Budget Estimates hearing.
- 24 August 2016 – Email from Mr Angus Mckenzie-Wills, Office of the Minister for Transport – providing an updated list of witnesses for the Budget Estimates hearing.

Sent:

- 1 July 2016 – Letter from Committee Director to the Hon Brad Hazzard MP, Minister for Family and Community Services and Minister for Social Housing – requesting witnesses for the Budget Estimates hearing.
- 1 July 2016 – Letter from Committee Director to the Hon Duncan Gay MLC, Minister for Roads and Maritime and Freight – requesting witnesses for the Budget Estimates hearing.
- 1 July 2016 – Letter from Committee Director to the Hon John Ajaka MLC, Minister for Ageing, Disability Services and Minister for Multiculturalism – requesting witnesses for the Budget Estimates hearing.

- 1 July 2016 – Letter from Committee Director to the Hon Andrew Constance MP, Minister for Transport – requesting witnesses for the Budget Estimates hearing.

4. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2016-2017

4.1 Public hearing: Budget Estimates 2016-2017 – Family and Community Services, Social Housing

Witnesses, the public and media were admitted.

The chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The chair noted that members of Parliament swear an oath to their office, and therefore do not need to be sworn prior to giving evidence before a committee.

Minister Hazzard MP was admitted.

The following witnesses were sworn and examined:

- Mr Michael Coutts-Trotter, Secretary, Family and Community Services, Department of Family and Community Services
- Ms Maree Walk, Deputy Secretary, Program and Service Design, Department of Family and Community Services
- Mr Paul Vevers, Deputy Secretary, Southern Cluster, Department of Family and Community Services
- Ms Deidre Mulkerin, Deputy Secretary, Western Cluster, Department of Family and Community Services
- Ms Anne Skewes, Deputy Secretary, Land and Housing Corporation, Land and Housing Corporation
- Mr Shane Hamilton, Chief Executive, Aboriginal Housing Office, Aboriginal Housing Office.

The chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolios of Family and Community Services, Social Housing open for examination.

The Minister and departmental witnesses were examined by the committee.

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public hearing concluded at 11.03 am.

The public and media withdrew.

4.2 Supplementary hearings

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Phelps: That the committee hold a further meeting to deliberate on whether to hold supplementary hearings for the portfolios of Family and Community Services, Social Housing on a date to be determined following receipt of answers to questions on notice.

5. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 11.05 am, until 1.45 pm, Monday 29 August 2016, Macquarie Room (*Roads, Maritime and Freight*).

Sharon Ohnesorge
Clerk to the Committee

Minutes no. 19

Monday 29 August 2016

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

Macquarie Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 1.56 pm

1. Members present

Mr Donnelly, *Chair*

Mr Green, *Deputy Chair* (left 3.50 until 4.18)

Dr Faruqi

Mr Mason-Cox

Mr Mookhey (substituting for Ms Cotsis)

Dr Phelps

Mrs Taylor

Ms Sharpe (participating)

2. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2016-2017

2.1 Public hearing: Budget Estimates 2016-2017 – Roads, Maritime and Freight

Witnesses, the public and media were admitted.

The chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The chair noted that members of Parliament swear an oath to their office, and therefore do not need to be sworn prior to giving evidence before a committee.

Minister Gay MLC was admitted.

The following witnesses were sworn and examined:

- Mr Tim Reardon, Secretary, Transport for NSW
- Mr Ken Kanofski, Chief Executive, Roads and Maritime Services
- Mr Dennis Cliche, Chief Executive Officer, Sydney Motorway Corporation
- Ms Marg Prendergast, CBD Coordinator General, Transport for NSW
- Mr Jeff McCarthy, Director, Infrastructure Development, Roads and Maritime Services
- Mr Grant Gilfillan, Chief Executive Officer, Sydney Ports
- Mr Bernard Carlon, Executive Director, Centre for Road Safety, Transport for NSW
- Ms Clare Gardiner-Barnes, Deputy Secretary, Freight, Strategy and Planning, Transport for NSW.

The chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio of Roads, Maritime and Freight open for examination.

The Minister and departmental witnesses were examined by the committee.

The Hon Daniel Mookhey MLC tendered the following documents:

- *Tolling escalation, embedded inflation protection* – Transurban FY16, 9 August 2016, p 54.

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public hearing concluded at 4.42 pm.

The public and media withdrew.

2.2 Tended documents

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Green: That the committee accept and publish the following documents tendered during the **Roads, Maritime and Freight** hearing held on **Monday 29 August 2016** :

- *Tolling escalation, embedded inflation protection* – Transurban FY16, 9 August 2016, p 54, tendered by The Hon Daniel Mookhey MLC.

2.3 Supplementary hearings

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Green: That the committee hold a further meeting to deliberate on whether to hold supplementary hearings for the portfolio of Roads, Maritime and Freight on a date to be determined following receipt of answers to questions on notice.

3. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 4.43 pm, until 8.45 am, Tuesday 30 August 2016, Jubilee Room (*Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism*).

Tina Higgins

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes no. 20

Tuesday 30 August 2016

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

Jubilee Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 8.57 am

1. Members present

Mr Donnelly, *Chair*

Mr Green, *Deputy Chair*

Ms Cotsis

Mr Field (substituting for Dr Faruqi until 10:30 am)

Mr Mason-Cox

Dr Phelps

Mrs Taylor

Dr Faruqi (from 10:30 am)

Mr Moselmane (participating)

2. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2016-2017

2.1 Public hearing: Budget Estimates 2016-2017 – Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism

Witnesses, the public and media were admitted.

The chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The chair noted that members of Parliament swear an oath to their office, and therefore do not need to be sworn prior to giving evidence before a committee.

The chair also reminded Mr Michael Coutts-Trotter that he did not need to be sworn, as he had been sworn at another Budget Estimates hearing.

Minister Ajaka MLC was admitted.

The following witnesses were sworn and examined:

- Mr Jim Longley, Deputy Secretary, Ageing, Disability and Home Care, Department of Family and Community Services
- Ms Samantha Taylor, Executive Director, NDIS Implementation, Department of Family and Community Services
- Ms Leonie King, Executive Director, Service Delivery Programs, Department of Family and Community Services
- Ms Helen Rogers, Executive Director, Participation and Inclusion, Department of Family and Community Services
- Ms Denise Dawson, Chief Financial Officer, Department of Family and Community Services
- Mr Hakan Harman, Chief Executive Officer, Multicultural NSW
- Mr Ross Hawkey, Chief Financial Officer, Multicultural NSW.

The chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolios of Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism open for examination.

The Minister and departmental witnesses were examined by the committee.

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The committee adjourned from 10:30 am to 10:35 am.

The public hearing concluded at 11:06 am.

The public and media withdrew.

2.2 Supplementary hearings

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Phelps: That the committee hold a further meeting to deliberate on whether to hold supplementary hearings for the portfolios of Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism on a date to be determined following receipt of answers to questions on notice.

3. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 11.07 am, until 1.45 pm, Tuesday 30 August 2016, Jubilee Room (*Transport and Infrastructure*).

Stewart Smith
Clerk to the Committee

Minutes no. 21

Tuesday 30 August 2016

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

Jubilee Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 1.50 pm

1. Members present

Mr Donnelly, *Chair*

Mr Green, *Deputy Chair*

Dr Faruqi

Mr Mason-Cox

Mr Mookhey (*substituting for Ms Cotsis*)

Dr Phelps

Mrs Taylor

Ms Sharpe (*participating*)

2. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2016-2017**2.1 Public hearing: Budget Estimates 2016-2017 – Transport and Infrastructure**

Witnesses, the public and media were admitted.

The Chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The chair noted that members of Parliament swear an oath to their office, and therefore do not need to be sworn prior to giving evidence before a committee.

The Chair also reminded Mr Tim Reardon and Ms Marg Prendergast that they did not need to be sworn, as they had been sworn at another Budget Estimates hearing.

Minister Constance MP was admitted.

The following witnesses were sworn and examined:

- Mr Stephen Troughton, Deputy Secretary, Infrastructure and Services, Transport for NSW
- Mr Rodd Staples, Program Director, Sydney Metro, Transport for NSW
- Mr Howard Collins, Chief Executive, Sydney Trains
- Mr Rob Mason, Chief Executive, NSW Trainlink
- Mr Jim Betts, Chief Executive, Infrastructure NSW

The chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio of Transport and Infrastructure open for examination.

The Minister and departmental witnesses were examined by the committee.

Mr Mookhey tendered the following documents:

- NSW eTender Contract Award Notice Detail View – 417193, Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu, published 21 January 2014
- NSW eTender Contract Award Notice Detail View – 417114, BackOffice Associates Australia Pty Ltd, published 16 January 2014
- Tender Contract Award Notice Detail View – 4000006239, Greythorn Pty Ltd, NSW e published 25 January 2016
- NSW eTender Contract Award Notice Detail View – 8000009669, Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu, published 29 August 2016.
- NSW eTender Contract Award Notice Detail View – 8000008583, Deloitte Touche Thomatsu, published 23 August 2016.

Mr Searle joined the meeting

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

Mr Searle left the meeting.

The public hearing concluded at 4.38 pm.

The public and media withdrew.

2.2 Tendered documents

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Phelps: That the committee accept and publish the following documents tendered by Mr Mookhey during the Transport and Infrastructure hearing held on Tuesday 30 August 2016:

- NSW eTender Contract Award Notice Detail View – 417193, Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu, published 21 January 2014
- NSW eTender Contract Award Notice Detail View – 417114, BackOffice Associates Australia Pty Ltd, published 16 January 2014
- Tender Contract Award Notice Detail View – 4000006239, Greythorn Pty Ltd, NSW e published 25 January 2016
- NSW eTender Contract Award Notice Detail View – 8000009669, Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu, published 29 August 2016
- NSW eTender Contract Award Notice Detail View – 8000008583, Deloitte Touche Thomatsu, published 23 August 2016.

2.3 Supplementary hearings

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Faruqi: That the committee hold a further meeting to deliberate on whether to hold supplementary hearings for the portfolio of Transport and Infrastructure on a date to be determined following receipt of answers to questions on notice.

3. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 4.40 pm *sine die*.

John Young
Clerk to the Committee

Minutes no. 26

Wednesday 5 October 2016

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

Macquarie Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 1.52 pm

1. Members present

Mr Donnelly, *Chair*

Mr Mason-Cox

Mr Mookhey

Dr Phelps

Mrs Taylor

2. Apologies

Mr Green

Dr Faruqi

3. Draft minutes

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Phelps: That draft minutes nos. 24 and 25 be confirmed.

4. Correspondence

The committee noted the following items of correspondence:

Received:

- 29 September 2016 – Letter from the Hon John Ajaka MLC, Minister for Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism confirming witnesses for the supplementary hearing on 5 October 2016.

Sent:

- 27 September 2016 – Letter from Committee Director to Hon John Ajaka MLC, Minister for Ageing, Disability Services, Multiculturalism – notifying the Minister of the supplementary hearing on 5 October 2016 to consider matters relating to the portfolios of Ageing, Disability Services.

5. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2016-2017**5.1 Public hearing: Budget Estimates 2016-2017 – Ageing, Disability Services**

Witnesses, the public and media were admitted.

The chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The chair reminded Mr Jim Longley and Ms Samantha Taylor that they did not need to be sworn, as they had been sworn at earlier Budget Estimates hearing of the committee.

The following witness was sworn and examined:

- Ms Anne Campbell, Executive Director, Service Delivery Programs, Department of Family and Community Services

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolios of Ageing, Disability Services open for examination.

The departmental witnesses were examined by the committee.

The committee adjourned from 3.00 pm – 3.05 pm.

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public hearing concluded at 4.00 pm.

The public and media withdrew.

5.2 Supplementary hearings

Resolved, on the motion of Mrs Taylor: That the committee hold no further hearings to consider matters relating to the portfolios of Ageing and Disability Services.

6. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 4.02 pm, until *sine die*.

Tina Higgins

Clerk to the Committee

Draft minutes no. 27

Monday 28 November 2016

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 2

Room 1136, Parliament House, Sydney, at 10.03 am

1. Members present

Mr Donnelly, *Chair*

Mr Green

Mr Mason-Cox (from 10.06 am)

Mr Mookhey

Dr Phelps

Mr Shoebridge

Mrs Taylor

2. Draft minutes

Resolved, on the motion of Mrs Taylor: That draft minutes no. 26 be confirmed.

3. Correspondence

The committee noted the following items of correspondence:

Received:

- 26 September 2016 – Email from Ms Cathy Murray to secretariat, regarding an individual child protection matter
- 29 September 2016 – Email from Ms Cathy Murray to committee, regarding an individual child protection matter
- 16 November 2016 – Email from Ms Sun-Jae An to committee, regarding the child protection inquiry
- 13 September 2016 – Letter from Ms Kerry Boland, NSW Children's Guardian, to the secretariat, providing clarifications to evidence provided on the 16 August 2016
- 4 October 2016 – Letter from Ms Fiona Hastings, General Manager, CatholicCare, to Chair, regarding evidence she provided at the hearing on 16 August 2016
- 4 October 2016 – Email from Ms Niki Norris, Vice Chair, National Child Protection Alliance, to secretariat, regarding clarifications in relation to her responses at the hearing of 26 September 2016
- 31 October 2016 – Email from Ms Rosemary Davidson, Executive Officer, Children's Court, to secretariat, regarding Judge Peter Johnstone's transcript of the 27 September 2016
- 28 October 2016 – Corrected transcript from Witness E clarifying evidence provided at the *in camera* hearing on 26 September 2016

- 22 November 2016 – Email from the Hon Shaoquett Moselmane, Opposition Whip, to secretariat, advising that the Hon Daniel Mookhey will substitute for the Hon John Graham for the duration of the inquiry into child protection.

4. **Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2016-2017 – Report deliberative**

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Phelps:

- That the draft report [as amended] be the report of the committee and that the committee present the report to the House;
- That the transcripts of evidence, tabled documents, answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, minutes of proceedings and correspondence relating to the Budget Estimates hearings be tabled in the House with the report;
- That upon tabling, all unpublished transcripts of evidence, tabled documents, answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, minutes of proceedings and correspondence relating to the Budget Estimates hearings, be published by the committee, except for those documents kept confidential by resolution of the committee;
- That the committee secretariat correct any typographical, grammatical and formatting errors prior to tabling;
- That dissenting statements be provided to the secretariat within 24 hours after receipt of the draft minutes of the meeting;
- That the report be tabled on Friday 2 December 2016.

5. **Inquiry into child protection**

5.1 **Confidential submissions**

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That the committee keep submission nos. 135 and 139 confidential, as per the request of the author, as they contain identifying and/or sensitive information.

5.2 **Closing date for submissions**

Resolved, on the motion of Mrs Taylor: That an alert be placed on the committee's webpage advising that submissions to the inquiry are no longer being accepted as the report is currently being drafted.

5.3 **Answers to questions on notice**

The committee noted the following answers to questions on notice:

- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, Mr Steve Kinmond, Community and Disability Services Commissioner and Deputy Ombudsman, Ombudsman NSW, received 4 November 2016
- answers to supplementary questions, Ms Wendy Foote, Deputy Chief Executive Officer, Association of Children's Welfare Agencies, received 4 November 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, Mr Steve Turner, Public Service Association of NSW, received 3 November 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, Judge Peter Johnstone, Children's Court of NSW, received 31 October 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, Ms Natalie Land and Ms Lyn Bevington, Australian Service Union, received 27 October 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, Mrs Moo Baulch, Chief Executive Officer, Domestic Violence NSW, received 27 October 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, Department of Family and Community Services, received 27 October 2016
- answers to questions on notice, Ms Dylan Kennedy, Team Leader, Brighter Futures, The Benevolent Society, received 26 October 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, Mr Peter Grace, State Coordinator, Student Wellbeing, Catholic Education Commission, received 26 October 2016

- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, Ms Mary Moore, Convenor, Alliance for Family Preservation and Restoration, received 24 October 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, Ms Katie Acheson, Chief Executive Officer, Youth Action, received 21 October 2016
- answers to questions on notice from Ms Fiona Hastings, General Manager, CatholicCare Sydney, received 4 October 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions from Ms Katrina Wong and Ms Nicola Callander, Legal Aid NSW, received 27 September 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions from Mr Tim Ireland, Chief Executive Officer, Aboriginal Child, Family and Community Care State Secretariat, received 22 September 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions from Ms Maria Le Breton, Director, Women's Domestic Violence Court Advocacy Service NSW, received 16 September 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions from Ms Liz Snell, Law Reform and Policy Coordinator, Women's Legal Services NSW, received 14 September 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions from Ms Kerryn Boland, NSW Children's Guardian, received 13 September 2016
- answers to questions on notice from Ms Lisa Townsend, NSW State Coordinator, CREATE Foundation, received 13 September 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions from Ms Deirdre Cheers, Chief Executive Officer, Barnardos Australia, received 12 September 2016
- answers to questions on notice from Ms Suellyn Tighe, Grandmothers Against Removals NSW, received 12 September 2016
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions from Ms Jackie Palmer, Executive Manager, Anglicare, received 12 September 2016

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That

- the answers to supplementary questions from Ms Julie Hourigan Ruse, Chief Executive Officer, Fams, received 11 November 2016, be published.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That

- Attachment 3 provided by the Public Service Association of NSW as part of their answers to supplementary questions be kept confidential, as it contains identifying and/or sensitive information
- the case study attached to the responses to questions on notice and supplementary questions provided by Domestic Violence NSW, be kept confidential as per the request of the author as it contains identifying and/or sensitive information.

5.4 Publication of in-camera transcript

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That the committee authorise the publication of the in camera transcript from 26 September 2016, excluding the redacted content which is to remain confidential.

5.5 Clarifications and corrections to transcripts

Dr Phelps moved: That the committee authorise the following corrections to transcripts:

- Judge Johnstone's evidence on 27 September 2016, be amended to replace 'that is at the interim phase' with 'that is at the establishment phase' on page 8 of the transcript, as requested by Judge Peter Johnstone, Children's Court NSW
- Witness E's evidence on 26 September be amended to omit 'sexually abused by her - ' and insert instead 'sexually abused by their older sibling during access that this carer had pushed for, believing they should have contact with them' on page 6 of the in camera transcript.

Question put and negatived.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That

- the transcript of Judge Johnstone’s evidence on 27 September 2016 be amended to include a footnote which clarifies that his response ‘that is at the interim phase’ should have been ‘that is at the establishment phase’, as was requested by Judge Peter Johnstone, Children’s Court NSW
- the transcript of Witness E’s evidence on 26 September 2016 be amended to include a footnote which clarifies that the response ‘sexually abused by her - ’ should have been ‘sexually abused by their older sibling during access that this carer had pushed for, believing they should have contact with them’, as was requested by Witness E.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That the committee authorise the publication of correspondence from:

- Ms Kerryn Boland, NSW Children’s Guardian, dated 13 September 2016, clarifying evidence she provided to the committee on 16 August 2016
- Ms Hastings, General Manager, CatholicCare, dated 4 October 2016, correcting evidence she provided to the committee on 16 August 2016
- Ms Niki Norris, Vice Chair, National Child Protection Alliance, dated 4 October 2016, clarifying evidence she provided to the committee on 26 September 2016.

5.6 Indigenous consultation summary report

The committee noted that the Indigenous consultation summary report was published by the committee clerk on the committee’s webpage.

5.7 Roundtable discussion on potential recommendations

The committee discussed potential report recommendation themes.

5.8 Private round table discussion

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Green: That a private roundtable discussion be held with selected stakeholders on the 13 February 2016.

5.9 Report deliberative

The committee noted that the report deliberative meeting will now be rescheduled from 13 February 2017 to a date in March 2017.

5.10 Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 12.05 pm, until Monday 13 February 2017, Room 1254, Parliament House.

Stephanie Galbraith
Clerk to the Committee

