

Submission
No 21

INQUIRY INTO HUMAN TRAFFICKING

Organisation: NorMAC

Date received: 24 February 2017



Email: admin@normac.org.au
Website: www.normac.org.au

Wednesday the 22nd February 2017

COMMITTEE SECRETARY
LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL
SELECT COMMITTEE ON HUMAN TRAFFICKING
PARLIAMENT HOUSE,
6 MACQUARIE STREET,
SYDNEY, NSW 2000

To the Secretary of the Select Committee on human trafficking.

NorMAC is a secular organisation directed by and for survivors of commercial sexual exploitation in Australia, a harmful cultural practice that we seek to end.

Whilst NorMAC recognises that human trafficking does take a number of forms including forced labour. We are responding to your Inquiry into Human Trafficking in the hope that you will take note of the correlation between trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation and by extension, the trafficking of persons into the sex trade.

Trafficking of women into debt-bonded prostitution is the major reported form of human-trafficking in Australia. The Victorian Government's 2010 report titled *Inquiry into people trafficking for sex work*, revealed that the majority of women are trafficked from Thailand, South Korea and China. The report also suggested that Sydney was a main gateway for a mobile population of trafficked women readily shifted between states and through both the legal and non-legal sex trade.¹

It is worth noting that in June 2012 the US State Department identified Australia as a destination country for trafficked persons and stated the following – *'Australia is primarily a destination country for women subjected to forced prostitution and to a lesser extent, women and men subjected to forced labor. Child sex trafficking also occurs with a small number of Australian citizens, primarily teenage girls, exploited within the country, as well as some foreign victims. Some women from Thailand, Malaysia, South Korea, China, and, to a lesser extent, India, Vietnam, Eastern Europe, and Africa migrate to Australia voluntarily intending to work legally or illegally in a number of sectors, including the sex trade. Subsequent to their arrival, however, some of these women are coerced into prostitution in both legal and illegal brothels. There were news reports that some Asian organized crime groups recruit Asian women to migrate to Australia, sometimes on student visas, and then subsequently coerce them into the sex trade. The women and girls are sometimes held in captivity, subjected to physical and sexual*

¹

http://www.parliament.vic.gov.au/images/stories/committees/dcpc/Trafficking_Final_full_report_with_cover.pdf

*violence and intimidation, manipulated through illegal drugs, and obliged to pay off unexpected or inflated debts to their traffickers. Some victims of sex trafficking have also been exploited in domestic servitude.*²

- (a) the role and effectiveness of New South Wales law enforcement agencies in responding to human trafficking including:**
 - (i) how New South Wales law enforcement agencies respond to human trafficking, including slavery, slavery like practices such as servitude, forced labour, and people trafficking,**
 - (ii) the influence of organised crime in human trafficking in New South Wales,**

It is NorMAC's view that the current New South Wales model of sex industry legislation - the so-called 'decriminalisation' of the sex trade is an approach which has helped to hide the extent of criminality including human trafficking within the sex trade. The adoption of a laissez-faire approach to prostitution has entrenched exploitation and generally endangered the health, safety and wellbeing of persons in the sex trade. It has also perpetuated stigmatisation and prevented real justice, support and compensation for those who have been exploited by the sex trade.

A New South Wales police officer investigating sex trafficking commented on the effects of decriminalisation: "Although the intention was to provide a safe working environment for sex workers the reverse has occurred in that pimps and brothel operators were empowered and enriched".³

This is an important point when we consider that; Councils in New South Wales have been attacked for failing to act on an increasing illegal brothel sector.⁴ Australia has seen cases of women trafficked in legal brothels, how then can we be assured that this is not happening in the massively expanding illegal brothel sector?

A five year study published in 2012 and conducted by the University of Queensland and Sydney University found that victims of human trafficking in the Sydney region lacked access to government support. This was due mainly to the national focus being heavily concentrated on disrupting organised trafficking and noting that support services for trafficked persons were "sparse, uncoordinated and poorly funded."⁵

Co-researcher Associate Professor Julie Hepworth stated that governments and support organisations need to work together in providing health services, and other support such as

² <http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2012/192366.htm>

³ <http://www.smh.com.au/nsw/licensing-law-to-tighten-screws-on-brothel-chiefs-20111010-1lhm7.html>

⁴ <http://www.theage.com.au/nsw/brothel-barons-expand-as-councils-fail-to-act-on-illegal-activities-20131130-2yi9m.htm>

⁵ <http://www.uq.edu.au/news/article/2012/10/study-finds-sydney%E2%80%99s-trafficked-women-need-more-support>

trauma counselling. She said it is also important to understand how women ended up being trafficked, equally noting the impossible task of accurately identifying the number of persons trafficked due to the hidden nature of the problem.

In 2012 Dr Jennifer Burn, the director of Anti-Slavery Australia stated that since 2003, 324 investigations into human trafficking in Australia have identified 207 victims but claimed this was the tip of the iceberg and of 148 women in a support program for those trafficked into the sex industry, 119 were from New South Wales.⁶

A joint investigation by the Sydney Morning Herald and ABC's Four Corners in 2011 examined details regarding federal police investigations which found evidence of two legal Sydney brothels and three legal Melbourne brothels linked to international human trafficking. The Sex slavery syndicate convinces Asian women to come to Australia under the pretense of study; when they arrive here they are kept against their will, stripped of passports and forced to work as sex slaves in brothels. One member of the brothel syndicate was charged with killing a Melbourne man who was helping a Korean sex slave to escape. The investigation also found that state and local authorities responsible for approving legal brothels have taken no action, despite court documents in August 2011 detailing federal police allegations against brothels and their managers. Senior police sources said the links between organised crime, sex trafficking syndicates and legal brothels highlighted the need for stronger state regulation and criticised New South Wales and Victoria for their woeful oversight of the industry.⁷

The Sydney Morning Herald also reported that Victoria Police had launched an investigation into council officials who had been incriminated in taking tens of thousands of dollars in bribes to turn their backs on illegal brothels operating in their districts. Because of the increase in illegal brothels more women and children are being trafficked for sexual slavery. This same article reported the Brothel, Nadira in inner-city Sydney, specialising in Korean prostitutes as being closely linked to the Comanchero outlaw motorcycle club and senior Asian organised crime figures. Regarding House, in Heidelberg, Melbourne, where a sex slave allegedly worked in 2009. Was also highlighted with the owner of the premises being linked to a Chinese syndicate that runs illegal brothels.⁸

We also note that the United States State Department *Trafficking in Persons Report 2014*, notes Australia's modest anti-trafficking law enforcement efforts with minimal trafficking prosecutions and convictions. We highlight their recommendation that Australia "develop a

⁶ <http://www.smh.com.au/nsw/brothel-owner-charged-over-human-trafficking-20120202-1qvoo.html#ixzz1k01NQSCy>

⁷ <http://m.smh.com.au/national/legal-brothels-linked-to-international-sex-trafficking-rings-20111009-1lfxs.html>

⁸ <http://www.theage.com.au/victoria/councils-targeted-in-illegal-brothels-probe-20111015-1lqlk.html#ixzz1jPDK4crd>

targeted campaign to raise awareness among clients of Australia's legal sex trade about the links between prostitution and trafficking."⁹

(b) the prevalence of human trafficking in New South Wales,

NorMAC reminds the committee of the findings from the Parliamentary Joint Committee on the Australian Crime Commission Inquiry into the trafficking of women for sexual servitude in June 2004 and note that a number of these problems still remain.

"The Committee found that most of the trafficked women in Australia were recruited from South East Asia and China. Some of the women are recruited from within the sex industry and are aware of what they are required to do when they arrive in Australia, while others are deceived either as to the nature of the work they have contracted to do, or the conditions they will work under in Australia. In any case, they will typically incur a debt of \$35,000- \$40,000 to be brought into the country. The traffickers facilitate the women's entry to Australia by a range of fraudulent means, including providing visas (typically student or holiday), false passports and funds. Traffickers usually bring the women into Australia through Sydney before being farmed out to brothels in Melbourne, Perth and other area. The Committee remains concerned at the ease with which traffickers appear able to obtain entry visas for the hundreds of women they bring into Australia each year for the purpose of sex work, and accordingly recommends that the Australian Crime Commission focuses its investigations on the methods by which people traffickers are able to circumvent Australian immigration barriers through visa fraud."¹⁰

New South Wales has proven to be an unregulated minefield of exploitation and abuse with an ever expanding illegal sector associated with other criminal activities. Media reports over the past two years indicate that New South Wales has allowed criminals to run brothels in the state despite having criminal convictions recorded against them in other Australian states (specifically Victoria) for, amongst other things, employing under-age prostitutes.¹¹

Numerous cases have also been reported in the media of sex trafficking of Asian women, Sydney Morning Herald reported on an investigation which found that upon arriving in Australia on travel visas, dozens of women from Hong Kong and Thailand were met by brothel managers who lodged study visa applications on their behalf.¹²

⁹ <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/226845.pdf>

¹⁰ http://www.aph.gov.au/binaries/senate/committee/acc_ctte/completed_inquiries/2002-04/sexual_servitude/report/report.pdf

¹¹ <http://www.dailytelegraph.com.au/news/nsw/brothel-owners-banned-in-victoria-for-employing-underage-prostitutes-now-running-big-brothels-in-sydney/story-fni0cx12-1226848537447?nk=269f499e0d84b5af747fa64738b2bb94>

¹² <http://www.smh.com.au/nsw/trafficking-women-lured-with-student-visas-forced-into-sex-slavery-20140329-35q88.html#ixzz3iznZyeCO>



Email: admin@normac.org.au
Website: www.normac.org.au

In February 2013, consultancy firm Brothel Busters contacted two senior officials within Immigration's national investigation unit, identifying four Hong Kong women who were delivered to Australia to work in the sex industry. The girls were dispersed between two brothels in Blacktown and an associated parlour in Sydney's south. Brothel Busters head Chris Seage also provided a paper trail that demonstrated exactly how sex traffickers were utilising the student visa system. Three months later, a regular client of the Blacktown parlours became irate about prolific drug use on premises and turned whistle-blower. In a letter, dated May 19, 2013, to Blacktown Council mayor Len Robinson, he stated: "These working girls hardly speak a word of English ... are here on a student visa and are permitted limited hours per week to work (20 hours) but are forced to work up to 18 hours a day."¹³

Another case saw a brothel madam exposed for enslaving a group of Malaysian women and forcing them to work 17 hour shifts, including coerced unprotected sex acts.¹⁴

The reality for many women trafficked into Australia is that they are lured here under false promises and are forced to work in brothels against their will and often without pay. Many are forced into illegal brothels, but we cannot delude ourselves into believing that legal brothels play by the rules.

This was highlighted in the Sydney Morning Herald in February 2012 when they revealed that a legal brothel in the New South Wales suburb of Guildford was under investigation by the Australian Federal Police 'AFP' after three women (believed to be under-age) had their student visas confiscated by the brothel owner who forced them into prostitution. Glyn Lewis, the AFP's national co-coordinator of human trafficking operations, referred to the brothel as abhorrent and stated "It's our general experience that these women live under very harsh conditions, their freedom's restricted, they may be forced in various ways coercively, threatened with deportation by the owners and lied to. They often have poor language skills so they're really in a very frightened state when we get to meet them."¹⁵

Also in February 2013 the Daily Telegraph reported a court case investigating six young women on student visas were forced to work in a Sydney brothel in conditions of "sexual servitude" for up to 20 hours a day. Crown prosecutor Carolyn Davenport SC said the women reported to a boss called "Yoko", who told each one they needed to pay off a \$5000 debt for getting them into Australia before they could leave the Diamonds brothel in Willoughby where they would

¹³ <http://www.dailytelegraph.com.au/news/nsw/brothel-owners-banned-in-victoria-for-employing-underage-prostitutes-now-running-big-brothels-in-sydney/story-fni0cx12-1226848537447?nk=269f499e0d84b5af747fa64738b2bb94>

¹⁴ <http://www.smh.com.au/nsw/jail-for-brothel-keeper-who-enslaved-women-20130705-2phgf.html>

¹⁵ <http://www.smh.com.au/nsw/brothel-owner-charged-over-human-trafficking-20120202-1qvoo.html#ixzz1k01NQSCy>

be working.¹⁶

Another case from 2013 saw a brothel madam exposed for enslaving a group of Malaysian women and forcing them to work 17 hour shifts, including coerced unprotected sex acts.¹⁷

Also in 2013 an investigation by Fairfax media reported that 34 illegal brothels were operating within a five-kilometre radius on the north shore with 15 illegal brothels continuing to operate daily from premises across Chatswood, Willoughby and Artarmon despite having been issued with closure notices two years prior.¹⁸

Willoughby Council deserves further attention, it is reported to have hired private investigators on six occasions during the previous two years to aid court battles that have cost ratepayers \$60,000. "It is an extraordinary process of evidence gathering," said the council's acting general manager Greg Woodhams. "To use ratepayers funds for this exercise seems ridiculous. We don't like doing it, there would be a section of our community that disapproves of it ... but, until the system changes, we have no choice. We need to produce conclusive evidence."¹⁹

An Independent Commission Against Corruption 'ICAC' investigation into corruption at Willoughby Council. The inquiry found the council's building inspector Edward Karkowski had been accepting free sexual services at the Chatswood-based Oriana Bath House in return for his ongoing silence about the true nature of the business. In 2012, he was found guilty of five counts of corruptly receiving a benefit and sentenced to six months' jail, though he was deemed "suitable" to serve the term in home detention. The Land and Environment Court ordered the parlour be shut. However in September last year, *The Sun-Herald* found that an illegal vice den was again thriving at the same address under the guise of a "ladies only" Korean sauna, which was also offering private health insurance rebates on "remedial massages".²⁰

We need to keep in mind that there has been an ongoing connection between illegal brothels and Asian massage parlours in Australia. This was highlighted in 2013 when the ACTU's confidential 457 visa hotline exposed an establishment in Port Melbourne where 40% of workers were on 457 Visas. The workers understood they were being employed as Thai masseurs, but once here have been told if they don't have sex with clients they would be

¹⁶ <http://www.dailytelegraph.com.au/student-sex-slaves-recruited-overseas-to-work-in-a-sydney-brothel-a-jury-heard/story-e6freuy9-1226570011806>

¹⁷ <http://www.smh.com.au/nsw/jail-for-brothel-keeper-who-enslaved-women-20130705-2phgf.html>

¹⁸ <http://www.smh.com.au/nsw/new-redlight-zone-as-illegal-sex-trade-expands-north-20131116-2xnlb.html#ixzz3iz16vrwm>

¹⁹ <http://www.smh.com.au/nsw/councils-hire-sex-spies-to-catch-parlours-in-the-act-20140920-10jigg.html#ixzz3iz8iRklw>

²⁰ <http://www.smh.com.au/nsw/i-give-up-lawless-sex-industry-prompts-brothel-buster-to-call-it-quits-20150401-1mcswx.html#ixzz3izIJ44oF>

sacked.²¹

If these establishments are not being monitored how can we have any assurance that Asian women are not being trafficked through these illegal establishments?

The *Law and Sex Worker Health* (LASH) report of 2012, commissioned by the NSW health ministry and conducted by the University of NSW and the Kirby Institute, found that of 201 respondents involved in the sex trade, 46% stated that they would 'not feel comfortable' or would feel 'very uncomfortable' with reporting a sexual assault to a police officer. The LASH Report noted that two thirds of those in the sex industry were migrants and 46 percent had rated their English language skills as fair to poor.²² These statistics are deeply concerning and raise questions regarding potential coercion and trafficking of these individuals into the sex industry. Aside from the risk of exploitation of these individuals by the sex industry, problems are also posed by language barrier in terms of negotiating conditions, payment and safety.

(c) the effectiveness of relevant legislation and policies,

The problems of an illegal and unregulated sex industry are not unique issues to New South Wales. In 2011 WA was also highlighted as a trafficking destination with the West Australian reporting that – *'A prostitution racket operating between Perth and Hong Kong is flourishing under the cover of temporary visas promoted by the Australian and Chinese governments.'* The article went on to state that women are aged between 18 and 30 were being encouraged via websites, seminars and pamphlets in Hong Kong to take one-year working holidays to Western Australia. One female report from Hong Kong responded to the ad and spent almost a week at a massage business located in an eastern Perth suburb. She gathered evidence showing that the business allegedly operated as a brothel and claimed women were encouraged to offer "extra services" to earn more money and tips.²³

Problems of monitoring the sex industry were also raised in 2014 by Queensland's Legal Affairs and Community Safety Committee. Parliamentary Report No. 82 stated - *"it has been estimated that up to 90% of prostitution ultimately remains beyond the scope of the regulatory regime. This includes both the State's unlicensed (but legal) private operators and 'a thriving illegal prostitution sector' which, despite significant police activity, has persisted since the regime's introduction and operates 'largely with impunity'. Estimates as to the precise size of the illegal sector vary widely, and have often been subject to exaggeration. However, it is generally accepted that the number of illegal brothels exceeds the number of legal brothels in the State."*

²⁴

²¹ <http://workinglife.org.au/2013/04/22/fundamental-flaws-remain-in-457-visa-program/>

²² http://nothing-about-us-without-us.com/wp-content/uploads/2012/03/LASH_NSW-Sex-Industry-Report_2012.pdf

²³ <https://au.news.yahoo.com/thewest/latest/a/10076082/women-encouraged-to-come-to-wa-to-work-as-masseurs/>

²⁴ <http://www.parliament.qld.gov.au/documents/committees/LACSC/2014/CrimInquiry2014/rpt-082->

Finally, we note that the 2015 New South Wales government inquiry into the regulation of brothels made a number of important findings.

FINDING 8 - Sexual services are being provided on a large scale and on many occasions in premises that do not have planning approval to do so, affording the police insufficient visibility over the industry and the criminal elements that may operate within it.

FINDING 9 - Unapproved massage parlours and karaoke bars where sexual services are provided without planning approval and in an underground manner, allow significant potential for them to be affiliated with organised crime or human trafficking and sexual servitude especially compared with the approved sector of the sex services industry in NSW.

FINDING 11 - Successful sex slave prosecutions and evidence from both the Australian Federal Police and the NSW Police Force make it probable that:

- Sexual servitude occurs in NSW; and
- Criminal networks do operate in some parts of the NSW sex services industry.

RECOMMENDATION 29 - That because of the problems with sexual servitude and organised crime in the sex services industry, the NSW Police Force be the co-ordinating agency under any new system of regulation and that a dedicated unit within the NSW Police Force similar to the Victorian Police's Sex Industry Co-ordination Unit be established and appropriately resourced.²⁵

It is worth noting that despite numerous calls for change from local government jurisdictions, these findings and a number of recommendations, the government ultimately decided it would not make any legislative changes.

(d) the practical measures and policies including security measures to protect New South Wales identity documents that would address human trafficking in New South Wales, and

There are clear links between human trafficking and the exploitation of people within the sex industry, this was highlighted by Sigma Huda, UN Special Rapporteur on Trafficking; *"It is rare that one finds a case in which the path to prostitution and/or a person's experiences within prostitution do not involve, at the very least, an abuse of power or an abuse of vulnerability.....put simply, the road to prostitution and life within 'the life' is rarely one marked by empowerment or adequate options"*

NorMAC recommends that the best way to address trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation is to introduce legislation based on the Nordic Model. This legislation was pioneered in Sweden and culminated from decades of research, the legislation called the Kvinnofrid (Women's Peace/Security/Freedom) Law and was enacted in 1999 to address all forms of violence against women.

The effect of this legislation is four-fold;

- Decriminalising prostituted persons through abolition of solicitation offences.
- Ensures protection and support to all victims of trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation.
- Creates access to exit pathways out of prostitution.
- Discourages men (the primary client base for people in prostitution) from purchasing sex thereby making the sex trade less viable for third party exploiters which includes traffickers, pimps, brothel owners/managers.

Australia's current situation reflects the findings of a recent report, *Does Legalized Prostitution Increase Human Trafficking?*, (a collaboration between the London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE), the German Institute for Economic Research, and Heidelberg University) which described international human trafficking as 'one of the dark sides of globalisation'. The report explained that most victims of international human trafficking are women and girls, the vast majority of who end up being sexually exploited through prostitution. Domestic policy on prostitution in countries of destination, it says, has a marked effect. The researchers used a global sample of 116 countries and found that countries where prostitution is legal tend to experience a higher reported inflow of human trafficking than countries in which prostitution is prohibited.²⁶

The Swedish government report reviewing the effects of the legislation found that the law had acted as a barrier to trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation. The report also noted that prostitution in Sweden, unlike comparable countries, had not increased and street prostitution had halved in the decade since its introduction. Data shows the number of prostituted people in Sweden was roughly ten times lower per capita than in Denmark.²⁷

Legislative approaches based on Sweden's model have since been adopted in Norway (2009), Iceland (2009), Northern Ireland (2014), Canada (2014), France (2016) and the Republic of Ireland (2017). This approach is also under consideration in many other jurisdictions including Israel, Lithuania and Scotland.

²⁶ http://www.lse.ac.uk/geographyAndEnvironment/whosWho/profiles/neumayer/pdf/Article-for-World-Development_prostitution_anonymous-REVISED.pdf

²⁷ <http://www.government.se/content/1/c6/14/92/31/96b1e019.pdf>

Some countries such as the United Kingdom have partially adopted the Nordic Model by enacting legislation making it illegal to buy sex from a person who has been trafficked or pimped. This was legislated with the Policing and Crime Act 2009, which makes it an offence 'knowingly or unknowingly to pay for sexual services of a prostitute subjected to force'.

Other countries that have adopted the Nordic Model have also noted its success. In 2014, Norway conducted an independent 5-year evaluation of their laws, the findings stated – *"The prostitution market in Norway is, like the rest of Europe, characterized by an increasing share of immigrants... Most of these immigrants are women with few other real options than to entry into prostitution. Human trafficking is a part of this rotating market. The entry into prostitution is based on economic motives... Norway has a number of good social policies and charities targeting trafficking victims and prostitute."* And *'The enforcement of the law, in combination with the laws against trafficking and pimping, makes Norway a less attractive country for prostitution based trafficking than what would have been the case if the law had not been adopted.'* The results also showed a 20-25% reduction in prostitution, and street prostitution had nearly halved.²⁸

In April 2014 the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe called on member states to *"consider criminalising the purchase of sexual services, based on the Swedish model, as the most effective tool for preventing and combating trafficking in human beings."*²⁹

(e) other related issues.

NorMAC would like to raise concerns about campaigns in Australia by the sex industry lobby groups such as the Scarlet Alliance which have denied the reality of trafficking for the purposes of sexual servitude in Australia. In many cases these groups have attempted to re-frame women trafficked for the purposes of sexual exploitation as autonomous 'migrant sex workers' and have campaigned for measures such as the extension 457 visas as a way of reducing trafficking.

The Scarlet Alliance's current CEO Jules Kim has made questionable claims when interviewed in 2015. Ms Kim highlighted her denial of the reality of sexual exploitation in Australia when she stated; "Despite the widely held myth of migrant sex workers being tricked into the sex industry in Australia, none of the prosecuted trafficking cases that included sex work have involved deception or trickery of the fact the person would be sex working in Australia. The people in those cases had all known they would be sex working in Australia with many of them having sex worked before in their home country."³⁰

²⁸ <http://www.eu-norway.org/Global/SiteFolders/webeu/Evaluation.pdf>

²⁹ <http://assembly.coe.int/nw/xml/XRef/Xref-XML2HTML-en.asp?fileid=20559&lang=en>

³⁰ <http://www.altmedia.net.au/110143/110143>



Email: admin@normac.org.au
Website: www.normac.org.au

The assertion that “none of the prosecuted trafficking cases that included sex work have involved deception or trickery” is FALSE. An example includes 2010 case Trevor Mclvor and Kanakporn Tanuchit Their five victims were Thai women who were exploited in a NSW brothel owned by Mr Mclvor and co-managed by Ms Tanuchit. Mr Mclvor and Ms Tanuchit were charged with five counts of possessing a slave and five counts of exercising over a slave powers attaching to the right of ownership. According to evidence provided, four of the five exploited women were advised that their work in Australia would involve providing sexual service. The fifth woman ‘Yoko’ was told that she would be working as a masseuse. (McInnes & Wilson, 2012, P. 113)

Another case from 2003 saw charges laid against Mr Daniel Sweeseang Kwok, Ms Jenny Lai Chin Ong, her son Mr Raymond Aik Tong Tan, and Mr Hoseah Paryud Saputra Yoe. It was alleged that the accused conspired between themselves and others to bring up to eight Southeast Asian women to Australia between November 1, 2001 and June 14, 2003 to work in brothels in conditions that amounted to servitude or slavery. Statements made in court proceedings later revealed that the women arrived in Australia on tourist visas, that their passports and documents were confiscated after arrival. The women were allegedly required to perform approximately 800 sexual acts, for no payment and pursuant to a ‘contract debt’, reportedly set at AU\$ 45,000 for each woman. The investigation came about when three Indonesian women escaped from an apartment in Auburn, Sydney, and reported to the New South Wales Police. The women told the police that they had been deceptively recruited to travel to Australia to work in the catering or public relations industry.³¹

Despite the claims of the Ms Kim and the Scarlet Alliance it appears that there is a twilight zone between the working environment in which ‘sex workers’ and sexually exploited persons and sex slaves work. Neither work totally isolated from each other and their buyers are often none the wiser about the real differences.³²

We appreciate this opportunity to contribute to your inquiry and we are willing to participate in any further avenues of inquiry you pursue in our shared goal of best outcomes and protection for those persons currently exploited in the sex trade.

Do not hesitate to contact us if you wish to discuss our concerns further.

Yours sincerely

Simone Watson,
Director for NorMAC

³¹ [https://www.unodc.org/cld/case-law-](https://www.unodc.org/cld/case-law-doc/traffickingpersonscrimetype/aus/2005/r_v_kwok_2005.html?lng=en&tmpl=sherloc)

[doc/traffickingpersonscrimetype/aus/2005/r_v_kwok_2005.html?lng=en&tmpl=sherloc](https://www.unodc.org/cld/case-law-doc/traffickingpersonscrimetype/aus/2005/r_v_kwok_2005.html?lng=en&tmpl=sherloc)

³² <http://tasmaniantimes.com/index.php/article/working-against-the-global-sex-industry#sthash.SyuaxjF2.dpuf>